THE STATE OF ARIZONA CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PUBLIC MEETING

Phoenix, Arizona
April 18, 2024
9:30 a.m.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC PO Box 513, Litchfield Park, AZ 85340 (P) 623-975-7472 (F) 623-975-7462 www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

Reported By: Angela Furniss Miller, RPR Certified Reporter (AZ 50127)

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 of 29 sheets Page 1 to 1 of 71

1	2 PUBLIC MEETING, BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS		3		
2	COMMISSION, convened at 9:30 a.m. on April 18, 2024, at the	1	PROCEEDING		
3	State of Arizona, Citizens Clean Elections Commission, 1110	2			
4	West Washington, Suite 250, Phoenix, Arizona, in the	3	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning. My name is Mark		
5 6	presence of the following Board Members: Mr. Mark S. Kimble, Chairman	4	Kimble.		
ľ	Mr. Galen Paton	5			
7	Ms. Christina Estes-Werther	6	on April 18th, 2024, and I call this meeting of the Citizens		
	Ms. Amy Chan (virtual)	7	Clean Elections Commission to order.		
8	Mr. Steve Titla (virtual)	8			
9	OTHERS PRESENT:		With that, we will take attendance. Commissioners		
		9	please identify yourselves for the record.		
10	Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director	10	COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Commissioner Werther.		
11	Paula Thomas, Executive Officer Mike Becker, Policy Director	11	COMMISSIONER PATON: Galen Paton.		
• •	Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director	12	COMMISSIONER CHAN: Amy Chan.		
12	Avery Xola, Voter Education Manager (virtual)	13	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla, I see you are		
42	Alec Shaffer, Web Content Manager (virtual)	14	present but muted. Can you hear us?		
13	Kara Karlson, Assistant Attorney General Emma Cone-Roddy, Osborn Maledon (virtual)	15	COMMISSIONER TITLA: Yeah, Steve Titla. Good		
14	Jessica Painter, KCA	16	morning.		
4-	Damien Meyer, Member of the Public (virtual)	17	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning, Steve.		
15		18	We have all five Commissioners with us this		
16		19	morning, thank you.		
17		20	Item II. I want to welcome Commissioner Christina		
18		21	Estes-Werther to the Commission. Governor Hobbs announced		
19 20		22	her her appointment with April 5th. Commissioner Werther		
21		23			
22		_	has an impressive résumé that includes deep and bipartisan		
23 24		24	experience as an attorney focused on elections and		
25		25	government. She has served as deputy general counsel to		
	Miller Certified Reporting, LLC		Miller Certified Reporting, LLC		
	www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com		www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com		
	4		5		
1	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a	1	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a		
1 2		1 2	-		
	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a		Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a		
2	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She	2	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity		
2	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of	2	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics.		
2 3 4	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan	2 3 4	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission		
2 3 4 5	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force.	2 3 4 5	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too.		
2 3 4 5 6	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts	2 3 4 5 6	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024,		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion?		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work."	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.)		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes?		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive contribution. So thank you all for the welcome.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes. Is there a second?		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive contribution. So thank you all for the welcome. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you very much; we're very	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive contribution. So thank you all for the welcome.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes. Is there a second?		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive contribution. So thank you all for the welcome. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you very much; we're very	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'll second.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive contribution. So thank you all for the welcome. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you very much; we're very happy to have you here.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Chan, for		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive contribution. So thank you all for the welcome. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you very much; we're very happy to have you here. I would also be remiss if I didn't acknowledge the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Chan, for seconding it.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive contribution. So thank you all for the welcome. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you very much; we're very happy to have you here. I would also be remiss if I didn't acknowledge the service of former Commissioner Damien Meyer who was on the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Chan, for seconding it. I will call the roll.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive contribution. So thank you all for the welcome. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you very much; we're very happy to have you here. I would also be remiss if I didn't acknowledge the service of former Commissioner Damien Meyer who was on the Commission for 10 years. I learned quite a bit from Damien, probably more than I learned from from anyone else here.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Chan, for seconding it. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Governor Brewer, state election director, and currently is a partner at a Phoenix law firm advising municipalities. She has served as general counsel for the Arizona League of Cities and Towns and served on Governor Hobbs' bipartisan Election Task Force. In announcing her appointment, Governor Hobbs said, "Christina Estes-Werther is among Arizona's foremost experts in election law and administration. With her years of practical experience and elections at the state, county, and local level, I'm confident she will bring valuable insight to the Commission as it continues its important work." I agree with that. Please welcome Commissioner Werther. Commissioner, is there anything you would like to say? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Yes. I'm just happy to be here; I've admired the work of the Commissioner for a long time. And so hopefully I will have a positive contribution. So thank you all for the welcome. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you very much; we're very happy to have you here. I would also be remiss if I didn't acknowledge the service of former Commissioner Damien Meyer who was on the Commission for 10 years. I learned quite a bit from Damien,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Damien also treated everyone with respect. He's really a good and a very fair individual, which is certainly a rarity in the world of politics. Damien has become a good friend. The Commission will miss him, and I will miss him, too. With that, we will move on to Item III. Discussion and possible action on minutes for the February 29th, 2024, meeting. Commissioners, you have the minutes from our March meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion? (No audible response.) CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a motion to approve the minutes? Mr COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to approve the minutes. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton has moved we approve the minutes. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Chan, for seconding it. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan.		

to roll that out on our -- on our website. There are local elections around the state, so please check the website.

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Also on May 7th, the oral argument will be held on the legislative leadership's appeal in the case called **Toma** versus Fontes, which is a case that concerns Proposition 211 and the sort of separation of powers type of arguments that

> Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 the legislative leadership is making.

2 I wanted to talk -- spend a little time on our 3 voter education and outreach update for the month. It's 4 been a very busy month.

7

9

5 Just to put what we're doing in context, right now 6 we are in the midst of ramping up the debate program as you 7 heard about last month. So that will be launching in 8 earnest -- the debates themselves on May 15. So that has 9 been -- and then we are also putting the Voter Education 10 Guide into production. So we are trying to track down a 11 handful of candidates who have not submitted their 12 statements yet in order to get them in the book, if we can, 13 before they -- before that time as we are completely out of 14 time.

So if you're listening to this, even if you're not actually attending via Zoom and you have clients who are candidates, please make sure they've submitted their statements. They're going to want to do it, and they're going to miss it later. So you can really earn some points with them.

I want to also talk a little bit about some of the activities specifically. You know, Avery was featured on a panel at the McCain Institute event sponsored by the McCain Institute and ASU's Cronkite School of Journalism on -called Defending the Democracy in this Disinformation Age.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

We just completed our pre-primary election poll,

R

His panel was about Arizona's impact on American democracy, and he was a panelist along with Maricopa County Supervisor Bill Gates and Don Henninger who is a -- who has been hired by the Carter Center. The moderator was Dawn Wallace of the Flinn Foundation.

So I thought that was a very exciting thing. I think that, again, demonstrates that, you know, our voter education program is operating in to a variety of different audiences and at a variety, and I think that's an important recognition.

As you see in the report you have, Gina is a co-author of the Arizona Town Hall report Voting and Elections in Arizona, which is attached to your report.

I think that you'll find that as you go through that report, that the work that Clean Elections has done over the course of the last -- of the last 10 years is featured quite prominently, including research that we've done in conjunction with the Morrison Institute and a vari- -- and citations and examples from our voter education program.

So I believe that was a very important report for folks to review. And it, again, demonstrates how our efforts in voter education and civic engagement are -- made us part of -- you know, important partner of different -- of different ways of reaching different populations on these

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com 1 issues.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2

17

18

19

20

21

3 our survey of voters. That's also attached. This is an 4 important document. We initiated this in 2022 as part of 5 our effort to -- to, as the Act talks about, trying to make 6 elections issue-based and provide issue-based discussions. 7 This -- this survey feeds directly into our debate program. 8 The information of the survey will be available to voters, 9 candidates, moderators to form a sort of common set of -- of 10 information about issues that matter to Arizonans from --11 and I think's it's one of the things that we're especially 12 proud of is the fact that we -- that we have been able to 13 break down to some extent regional issues and to -- to look 14 across different -- how different issues stack up in 15 different districts around the state. 16 As I mentioned the Voter Education Guide, we are

looking at the translation with the Arizona Commission for the Deaf and Hard of Hearing.

And Avery was also at U of A last week for a town hall where he was featured along with the Pima County Recorder and the Secretary of State.

22 We are -- Gina and I have been meeting with the 23 party leaderships of the two major parties so far who -- who have candidates debating to talk about the debate program 24 25 and will continue to do that.

> Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

3 of 29 sheets Page 6 to 9 of 71

8

9

10

11

12

13

scrutiny is a little odd.

13

```
1
             While we're on the topic of voter education,
 2
    we're -- we are, as you know, you approved the voter
 3
    education plan back in January. As part of that we -- you
 4
    approved and we recommended a couple of events that will be
 5
    coming up in the next few weeks and months. You know,
 6
    specifically as we have over the last 10 years tried to make
7
    sure that we are reaching every community and any community
8
    we can in all four corners of the state as
9
    Commissioner Titla says. And so to -- you know, we are
10
    working on getting approval through the Department of
11
    Administration for a couple of those sponsored events.
12
```

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

22

23

25

One is a -- the African American Conference on Disabilities hosted by the Arizona Center for Disability Law, which is now called I think Disability Rights Arizona. We have sponsored this event for some time. We have had it approved by DOA previously under the same exact terms. We're not entirely -- so this year we have run into, we're not quite sure yet what, but at least some additional scrutiny I guess would be the way I would put it. And then additionally we have you approved sponsoring the Navajo Voters Conference which again I think we've been present at since its inception in 2016 at D'yani College and now it is at the Twin -- Twin Arrows Facility on the Nation.

You know, again, we got -- we've tried to -- we have a meeting with a number of relatively high-ranking DOA Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 officials on Monday, which is sort of a little surprising. 2 These are not significant expenditures. These are -- one of 3 these is around \$10,000; the other one is \$2,500. So given 4 the state of -- you know, given our budget, given the 5 overall state budget, these are not significant 6 expenditures. Nevertheless, you know, the scrutiny. So the

We've asked DOA for some detail on what specifically they have issue with. So far we've only been provided a list of issues which really strike me as legal and policy issues that are dedicated to the Commission. They're not accounting issues that I can underst- -- as I understand them.

14 So the reason I wanted to mention this is because, 15 you know, look, we understand and we have always experienced 16 a heavy amount of scrutiny of our transactions over the 17 course of the last -- certainly the last 10 years and even 18 the last 25 years. But we do do, I think, a good job of 19 documenting our decision-making for anybody to see.

20 So, you know, we'll keep an eye on it. Again, it 21 wouldn't strike me as so odd except for the fact that one of 22 these was approved under the exact same circumstances one 23 year ago basically to the day. So we're not sure if there's 24 a policy change that's not expressly available to us, but 25 the -- you know, the -- the -- some of the issues that --Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

So -- so it's not an issue with the approval

12

1

the issue that we are -- so we'll see if that -- if that goes again.

But I did want to flag it because it was something that was directly approved by the Commission and -- and, you know, we want to make sure that obviously we want to be able to work effectively with DOA, but we also, at the end of the day, the policy and legal decision-making on these issues resides with the Commission. So we will see how that goes.

8 9 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman? 10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan. 11 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, Tom, okay, so ADOA has a rule in approving -- has a role in approving our voter ed program? Or can you --

12 13 14 MR. COLLINS: Sure. 15 COMMISSIONER CHAN -- explain that a little more? 16 MR. COLLINS: So, yes. Mr. Chairman, if I may? 17 Commissioner Chan, so there's a policy in what's 18 called the State Accounting Manual which is a manual that, 19 as far as I can tell, the authority is not expressed. It's 20 apparently implied by Title 35 and Title 41, and they have a 21

policy about of sponsorships which says if you want to sponsor something, you need to go through the following steps and provide us with a justification. Fair enough. We 24 submitted our -- submitted those memos to them I think last week for these events coming up in June.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com 2 itself, it's more of an issue of we're not quite sure why, 3 for example, one of them was approved last year under 4 essentially the same circumstances with the same process, 5 and this year, you know, we -- we have sort of a list --6 we've been given a list of topics to discuss in a half hour

7 on Monday that range everything from the gift clause to --8 to an implication there may be a conflict of interest

9 involved here. And we can't identify the basis for any of 10 those, and we haven't gotten very express information about 11 them.

12 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, Tom. I -- I just 13 want to say that I'm very concerned to hear about this and 14 I'm hoping that, you know, just because -- I'm not sure what 15 the reason for such a meeting would be, other than an issue 16 that ADOA is trying to raise suddenly. 17

But I am somewhat familiar with the State of

18 Arizona Accounting Manual and working for an agency have --19 have, you know, it's very voluminous, frankly, and adds just 20 a layer of -- I think it serves an important role, but it 21 does add a layer of things. But it sounds like we've 22 complied with the requirements, so I guess my main concern 23 is if -- if -- maybe you can provide a report, Tom, to us

24 via e-mail --

25 MR. COLLINS: Sure.

> Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

COMMISSIONER CHAN: -- would that be acceptable after the meeting on Monday so that we're -- we're able to get an update as soon as possible on that?

Because, frankly, if ADOA were to say that we couldn't sponsor these type of events anymore -- for those two conferences in particular, for example -- I think that would be very concerning and problematic from my perspective anyway as a Commissioner.

MR. COLLINS: Mr. -- Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Chan, yeah, we'll -- we'll -- we will -- I'm happy to report out as I do for any kind of, I mean whether it's for litigation or other things where I report out to you-all in writing as the events develop.

I don't want to -- I want to be clear, I'm not -- I'm not -- the reason I'm raising this now is because there's -- there's six weeks between now and the next meeting. So if this were to go badly, it would be -- the time lapse would be too long for me to properly inform you.

So what -- I'm sure -- my experience with state government tells me that generally agencies get angry or upset when you disclose that you have a dispute with them in public. But the way I do this job and the way that we have arranged our business here at this commission is that it's important for you to be fully informed about things as they develop. And so, you know, so there's a risk here that

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

maybe this -- you know, DOA will be unhappy that I've raised
 this with you-all, but it's my obligation to do that on a
 timeline that works for our schedule so that we -- we can
 get this -- get this squared away.
 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom, I -- I echo Commissioner

Chan's concerns, and I -- I hope that as soon as you know
 what happens, you'll let all of us know so that if there's a
 problem --

MR. COLLINS: Yeah.

10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- we don't have to wait six 11 weeks.

MR. COLLINS: And if it's a matter of I didn't

check a box on the -- on the memo, that is -- that's on the table, right? But the information we've been given thus far is not specific enough to say "you failed to check this box." Right? If it was a discrete issue like that, I think
I would -- we would have tried to resolve it, so -CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.

19 MR. COLLINS: -- again, it's -- it's one of those things.

I have just a couple of quick things I wanted to...
CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Anyone else have any comments on
before we move on?

23 before we move on?24 (No audible response.)

25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay, Tom.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

MR. COLLINS: Thank you very much.

I just wanted to mention, you know, we are continuing to see candidates at candidate workshops, and Mike has been working with candidates on a -- on a daily basis, too, as they move through the process.

And then obviously I mentioned the -- we have the three big Prop 211 cases, one of them May 7th is the argument; the other one is the Center or Arizona Policy has filed a motion to accelerate their appeal, that's pending. We filed a response this week, and then the Freedom -- or I'm sorry, Americans for Prosperity has filed an appeal in the Federal District Court.

So with that, I think that's all I had. There's some other information in the report, but I don't think we need -- unless anyone has any questions for me.

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any discussions or questions from members of Commission?

18 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a comment.19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.

COMMISSIONER PATON: I'm very glad that you met with -- you're meeting with the two -- two parties, I mean the two major parties about our debates and voter education.

That way we -- we can clear the air with either one of themso we don't have all the drama that we've had in the past

about the debates. Because I really think the debates are Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

very important that we could, you know, explain thecandidate, how the candidates feel about their various

3 issues and...

4 So anyway, that's what I have to say about that.

So I'm glad you -- you were anticipating gettingahold of these people.

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Paton.

8 Any other comments or questions from the9 Commission?

9 Commission?

(No audible response.)

11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.

12 Item V. Discussion and possible action on Advisory
13 Opinion Request 24-01 and Draft Advisory Opinion 24-03
14 relating to the application of the definition of campaign
15 media spending in A.R.S. 16-971 to public communications

16 involving candidates, elected officials, and parties.

Last month we discussed this advisory opinion request and initial draft; we received additional public comment and a revised draft. The new draft narrows the application of the so-called PASO standard -- which to those of us speaking English and not lawyers means promotes, supports, attacks, or oppose the standard -- to the public communications presented and expands on the reasoning regarding the term, quote, clearly identified candidate, end quote.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

```
1
              Tom is going to provide an overview of the issues
 2
     in the draft, and then we'll take questions.
 3
              Tom?
 4
              MR. COLLINS: Yes. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
 5
              Jessica, I think we're going to try to -- let's
 6
     see, see if this -- see if this works.
 7
               So this is the PowerPoint we did revise from last
 8
     time. I guess we can go to the first real -- next slide,
 9
     please. If we can.
10
              I don't know, do I have the clicker?
11
               Oh, yeah.
12
              Okay. So I wanted to sort of recap where we were
13
     last -- last month. The principal questions in front of the
14
     Commission were essentially the application of these three
15
     definitions of campaign media spending in the Voter's Right
```

You can see them there, the three sort of categories are: Promotes, supports, attacks or opposes within six months. So that's the PASO standard.

called Opportunity Arizona.

to Know Act to a set of public communications from a group

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

If you ever want to Google and you sort out all the "El Pasos," you get a lot of tourist information about El Paso first, but eventually you'll find some information about this legal standard.

And then this public communication that refers to a

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

clearly identified candidate within 90 days. And then an
 activity or public communication that supports the electoral
 prospects of an identified political party.

So those were the main three categories that we
were evaluating a set of several of public communications
regarding.

So, Jessica if we could...

So the question -- this is the first question, you
know, with the example be of a public communication that
promotes, supports, attacks, or opposes.

11 And then we can go to the next one. Thank you.

So the -- this slide here illustrates the change
that based on the feedback we got. So as you see in your

packet, the four comments we got from the regulatedcommunity on this: One from the Campaign Legal Center, one

16 from the Elias Law Group, one from Progress Arizona, and

17 then a last from Stand for Children Arizona. Those -- all,

18 all four of those, the consensus was that -- that -- that

19 the staff's proposed application of the -- of the standard

20 here was -- was too broad and was going to sweep in21 information that -- or I should say communications that,

22 that in the view of -- essentially the consensus was, was

not -- shouldn't be the reach of the -- of the standard.

And as we talked about at the last meeting, you know, we had proposed with this particular communication,

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

20

that perhaps because the Senator mentioned in the ad, you know, is under the facts presented, a candidate, that perhaps an express -- direct -- expressed mention of the candidacy was not required, rather that, you know, that this would support the candidate insofar as it is supportive of the Senator, right?

So the dichotomy here is between officeholder,

So the dichotomy here is between officeholder, what -- where you're talking about an officeholder, where you're talking about a candidate, you know, and -- and how that -- how that line gets drawn.

When we talked about this, Commissioner -Commissioners Paton and -- and Kimble, you both mentioned
that, you know, there was -- there is within that maybe too
much gray area and you wanted a clearer, more easily
applicable rule. So we think that this -- we think this
application satisfies that as well.

So in other words, this creates a -- a situation where if the -- if the public communication is within six months of the election is directed at the -- at the officeholder and not at the candidacy, that's not promoting, supporting, opposing or attacking the candidate.

So that's -- that's what -- that's -- we think that that's -- we think that that's -- you know, obviously as staff we -- we take the public comment we get very seriously and we also wanted to recognize that the Commissions, you Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

know, Commissioner Paton's and Commissioner Kimble's
 comments around wanting to have a -- an application that

folks would not need to spend too much time evaluating inorder to know where we're headed, and so we think that this

5 achieves -- achieves that.

COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question.

7 MR. COLLINS: Please.

8 COMMISSIONER PATON: So, so this thing that we're

9 looking at --

6

11

13

16

10 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER PATON: -- that would be -- if it's

12 within six months --

MR. COLLINS: Yeah.

14 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- that would be covered under

15 the -- our deal?

MR. COLLINS: This would be -- this would be not.

17 This would -- because this focus is on the Senator and their

18 legislative activity without any -- without any mention --

19 without any attack, promotion, support or opposition of them

20 as a candidate.

21 So -- so -- so we --

22 COMMISSIONER PATON: So even though they're an

23 officeholder --

24 MR. COLLINS: Right.

COMMISSIONER PATON: How does that -- how does that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

25

25

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 COMMISSIONER PATON: And some of this is -- but 2 that makes -- but that makes sense to me, so. 3 MR. COLLINS: Yeah. Yeah, no, that's -- that's 4 exactly what we're -- that's exactly what we're trying to 5 do. That's exactly what we're trying to do. 6 COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay. 7 MR. COLLINS: So, so --8 COMMISSIONER PATON: I'm happy with that then. 9 MR. COLLINS: Good, thanks. Wonderful. Good to 10 hear. 11 COMMISSIONER PATON: If that matters. 12 MR. COLLINS: No, it does -- well to me it matters 13 more than anything. 14 Okay. So Jessica, I can guess we can go to the 15 next one. 16 Again, same, same, same. All right? So this was 17 one, you know, where, you know, with the public comment, 18 same line; same line applies; yes. 19 And as the opinion itself mentions any of these, 20 especially if they refer to a candidate and it's 90 days, 21 you can get a different outcome. So you're trying -- we're 22 trying to tell the regulated community: At six months

you'll have Standard X, at 90 days you'll have Standard Y,

and that -- and that seems to be at least, you know --

obviously, there's folks that would prefer none of this --

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 none of this existed, but that's within the framework we 2 have that -- that seemed to be where the public comment 3 comes out and that seems -- that's fine with us. 4 Jessica, if we could... 5 Okay. So this one was just -- didn't have a 6 candidate at all. 7 Then we can go to the next slide, please. 8 This one just -- just to recapitulate, this was 9 unchanged. This is a -- the patch call. 10 So this was a scenario where a -- a person is 11 basically calling a list. I call you, I call Chairman 12 Kimble, I say, "Chairman Kimble, do you care about my 13 issue?" You say, "Yes"; I say, "Okay, I'm going to patch 14 you through to the -- your state senator right now or your 15 state lawmaker," and -- and after I go through and make sure 16 that you're -- you agree to that. 17 So we don't think that is a promote, support, 18 attack or oppose; and we didn't either the first draft 19 either. That is a direct solicitation to immediately 20 contact the elected official. 21 Okav, Jessica. 22 And then this one, you know, we -- we -- we 23 continue to believe is not a -- is not a -- does not meet

> Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

the promote, support, attack or oppose.

Okav.

Page 22 to 25 of 71

24

25

7 of 29 sheets

23

24

```
26
 1
             And so the second question we spent a little -- a
 2
     little time on in view of the -- and I wanted to actually if
 3
     I can, really quickly, I want to thank Austin Yost and Jim
 4
     Barton and Jon Berkon and his colleagues at Elias, and
 5
     Elizabeth Shimek and her colleagues at the Campaign Legal
 6
     Center for their very helpful comments on this draft.
 7
              CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: If I can clarify one thing, so
8
     these examples we've just gone through --
9
              MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
10
              CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- the issue here is the timing
11
     of when they are, not the content of the message?
12
              MR. COLLINS: So Mr. Chairman, that's a really good
```

question. It's -- it's a little of both. The timing tells you what statute you need to look at. So I am -- you know, there -- there's no way to not to do this without at least looking at the statute. And the statute sets forth three specific sort of places on the timeline where you are going to get -- where you're going to have to potentially -- you'll have to campaign media spending as defined by the Act.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

The first is if you have expressed advocacy which is a different legal standard. We're not really -- we're not called on to talk about here, but if you have expressed advocacy in -- in a campaign, that's always going to be -that's always going to be campaign media spending.

> Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 Then you have six months, you get a little broader, 2 and that's the promote, support, attack or oppose. And then 3 at 90 days, you get the reference, so.

4 Okay, so it's first thing you find yourself in the 5 timeline and then you're looking at what is the action.

6 Right? What is the verb? What is the action with respect 7 to the candidacy?

8 So to focus on the promote, support or attack 9 versus the reference to a clearly identified candidate, 10 promote, support, attack a candidate we think in order for 11 that -- for that verb to make sense in this context --12 proper sense, I think it makes sense under, you know -- to 13 make proper sense under this -- under this application, 14 you -- you wouldn't -- you're not promote -- you have to

16 And if you look at the dictionary definition of 17 "promote" in particular, the dictionary definition that we 18 relied on, the opinion, talks about how promote in the sense 19 of advertise or solicit business or have -- or have a 20 promotion at a business.

21 Well, if you are selling something at Target, you 22 know, you're -- you're going to need to promote "go to 23 Target," right? Not "go to a retail establishment" with 24 a -- or not "go shopping." Right? 25

So the idea here was that if you're going to Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

28

15

29

1 promote, you're going to promote the candidate, not just the 2 fact -- not a separate issue or the meet -- or -- or, you 3 know, just their office status, right? If you're promoting 4 a candidate, you're promoting the actual candidacy. 5 Clearly -- clearly identified candidate standard 6 talks about, as you see in the second bullet, refers to a 7 particularly identified candidate. "Refers" being -- being 8 a less active, less action than "promoting," right? So 9 you're referring to a person.

And there as we'll talk about in a moment, we get into a little bit different analysis around what the courts have said about, you know, what counts as reference and -and whether or not it needs to be expressed. The only thing that matters there is it's clear who you're talking about. Right?

So, for example, it would not be a clearly identified candidate if you were to say -- you would have to -- you're-- you're not talking about the candidacy, but you definitely have to be talking about the person.

19 20 So I hope that start -- that answers the question. 21 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a comment. 22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: It -- it does for now, yes. 23

MR. COLLINS: Okay. 24 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.

25 COMMISSIONER PATON: So you're going around circles

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com 1 so much that hopefully I don't get confused even more.

2 MR. COLLINS: No, you're --

make reference to the candidate.

3 COMMISSIONER PATON: So the way I'm seeing it now, 4 is six months out, you can say the officeholder's name, but 5 if you don't say that she's running re- -- she's running 6 again, then that's okay. Within 90 days if you say the 7 officeholder's name, you don't have to say that she's a 8 candidate --

9 MR. COLLINS: Yes, sir.

10 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- it's still -- it's against 11 this, you'd have to file.

12 MR. COLLINS: Yeah. Yeah, you got it.

13 COMMISSIONER PATON: Over the \$5,000, whatever the 14 thing is. So, is that correct?

15 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Paton,

16 that is -- that is exactly right.

17 COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay. So to me that -- that 18 clears the air kind of.

MR. COLLINS: Yeah.

20 COMMISSIONER PATON: It makes it to where

21 there's -- it's not subjective.

22 MR. COLLINS: Right.

23 COMMISSIONER PATON: The one that, the Burch

24 person --

25 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.

> Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

33

1 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- was the officeholder, but 1 2 2 didn't it say that he was running again? 3 3 MR. COLLINS: Right. 4 COMMISSIONER PATON: And -- but if it was 90 days, 4 5 5 that would -- they would have to file if they're spending 6 6 \$5,000 or more? 7 7 MR. COLLINS: Right; or whatever the appropriate 8 8 amount is. 9 COMMISSIONER PATON: So I'm okay with that, because 9 10 10 it's taken the subjectivity out. 11 11 I mean, if it doesn't say they're running then -- I 12 12 mean we know they're probably running, but maybe they're 13 13 just finishing out their term, correct? 14 14 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Paton, I 15 15 don't see -- I agree. I think that that analysis would 16 16 work. 17 17 I mean, that's how -- that's how we're proposing 18 it --18 19 19 COMMISSIONER PATON: So that makes -- that makes 20 20 sense to me and I think it's easier to -- because when 21 Commissioner Kimble is asking more questions, then that 21 22 22 starts to confuse me more, and -- and maybe he's not 23 23 confused on it, but I started to get confused -- and I 24 thought -- you know, in my mind I thought I was okay there. 24 25 So -- so I think if we have something like that, it 25 Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com 32 1 result. 1

makes sense even though it's kind of skirting, you know. But it makes sense. And it's all about the English that we're using, the copy, and it's easy for candidates and the people that are trying to promote them or -- or drag them down, it makes sense for everybody: Lawyer, nonlawyer. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Tom, continue. MR. COLLINS: So if we could Jessica, thanks. So -- so here we wanted -- so one of the things, this is -- this is going to get a little into the weeds. COMMISSIONER PATON: More so? MR. COLLINS: Yeah, I'm -- I'm sorry, but -- so we have this phrase in the statute "clearly identified candidate." It's not act- -- it's not defined in the Voters' Right to Know Act, but it is a term that is used in both Arizona and federal law with a definition. The definition that is in state statute that's applicable to every other communication that happens in campaigns in Arizona and the federal definition are consistent with the plain meaning of the terms "clearly identified candidates." In other words, the -- one of our public commenters, the Stand for Children organization says, "Hey, you know, given that there's not a specific definition of "clearly identified candidate" in the Voters' Right to Know Act, you should define it, essentially, however you think it should be and it should require a different -- a different Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

The staff's point of view on that is a couple of things. Number one, if a voter actually went through -- and maybe they did -- and Googled "clearly identified candidate," they're going to get a definition that sounds a lot like what you would intuit the terms "clearly identified candidate" means, right? So it's essentially an unambag- -an unambiguous reference to the person who is running for office. And in Arizona we know -- and in federal law we know that that does not require a reference to the candidacy.

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

That's this, in the Committee for Justice and Fairness case, for example, the folks who ran an ad against then-Superintendent Tom Horne while running for AG, didn't mention that he was running for AG, but it was very close to the election, close in time. So under this scenario, the 90 days is the operative issue, and so you wouldn't have to do that.

19 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question. 20 MR. COLLINS: Sure.

21 COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay. How is it to be 22 ambiguous that somebody is clearly identified a candidate? 23 Did they file for -- to run for office?

24 MR. COLLINS: So that's a good question. At 25 90 days, I would think that it would be -- it would be -- if Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

you wanted to -- to do an effective public communication, I 2 would think you would want to be clear.

3 COMMISSIONER PATON: Kara is nodding at me, so she 4 has something. 5

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

MR. COLLINS: You think we need to go in executive 6 session?

7 MS. KARLSON: I don't think so. 8 Chairman Kimble, can I respond? 9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Sure.

10 MS. KARLSON: Under current state law by -- well 11 before 90 days, you would have to be identified in order to 12 be a candidate on the general election ballot, and so I 13 think that should foreclose any question about whether 14 someone was a candidate for an office or not just because of 15 the deadlines. 16

COMMISSIONER PATON: Because they would have won 17 the primary.

18 MS. KARLSON: Yes. I mean, they would have at the 19 very least had all of their paperwork filed long before the 20 90-day mark. So they would absolutely be a candidate or 21

22 COMMISSIONER PATON: So the ambiguousness is not 23 there, correct?

24 MS. KARLSON: That's a different question. 25 I'm not trying to avoid you, Commissioner Kimble. Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

9 of 29 sheets Page 30 to 33 of 71

	38		39		
1	that would confirm that a person was, in fact, running as a	1	Opinion 24-03.		
2	candidate even you know, and so we so we've always	2	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Oh, okay. I'm sorry.		
3	done that. So I think that what every permeation of a	3	So I will entertain a motion to approve Advisory		
4	clearly identified candidate might be, we would we would	4	Opinion 24-03.		
5	certainly want to consider consider that, and that's a	5	And I just want to make sure that we're all on the		
	•	6	-		
6	good one that we can look at, so.	7	same page about what we're approving here, and in our		
8	I mean yeah, sorry.	8	material, I have a under Item V, I have a 12-page draft		
9	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are you done, Tom MR. COLLINS: I am.	9	from you dated April 18, 2024, Advisory Opinion 2024-03.		
10		10	This is what we're voting to approve if we get a motion; am		
11	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: with your presentation?	11	I correct?		
12	MR. COLLINS: I am, yeah.	12	MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, you are correct. We		
	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. So are there any other		will take the draft watermark off; we will apply your name		
13	questions or clarifications from members of the Commission?	13	to it, and we will publish it if you approve it.		
14	(No audible response.)	14	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. So with that		
15	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there any member of the public	15	clarification, any more comments or questions from members		
16	or any other interested parties who want to make a comment	16	of the Commission?		
17	on this?	17	COMMISSIONER PATON: So.		
18	(No audible response.)	18	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.		
19	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Hearing none.	19	COMMISSIONER PATON: So all of what we just		
20	Tom, I guess well, I'll entertain a motion to	20	discussed is is that draft?		
21	approve Advisory Opinion 24-01. And just to be clear, is	21	MR. COLLINS: Yes.		
22	this what we're talking about here?	22	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.		
23	MR. COLLINS: Yeah, I'm sorry, and I think I put	23	COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to		
24 25	the wrong number in there.	24 25	I'll have to see the exact number 24-03 that we would		
23	It's Advisory Opinion Request 24-01. It's Advisory	23	approve that motion.		
	Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com		Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com		
	www.iviiiier.cer.tinedr.eporting.com		www.iviiiler.Geruneur.eporung.com		
		l _	41		
1	(HAIRMAN KINKI E. HIST TO CIARITY (OMMISSIONAR	1 1	Commissioners we have an advisory oninion request		
1 2	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Just to clarify, Commissioner Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-032	1 2	Commissioners, we have an advisory opinion request		
2	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03?	2	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic		
	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct.	2	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do		
2 3 4	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to	2 3 4	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are		
2	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion	2 3 4 5	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending.		
2 3 4	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03?	2 3 4	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are		
2 3 4 5 6	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second.	2 3 4 5 6	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom?		
2 3 4 5 6 7	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03?	2 3 4 5 6 7	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one?		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly?		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly? MS. THOMAS: That's the one you sent yesterday.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Aye.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly? MS. THOMAS: That's the one you sent yesterday. MR. COLLINS: Okay. Then I sent the wrong one.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly? MS. THOMAS: That's the one you sent yesterday. MR. COLLINS: Okay. Then I sent the wrong one. There were two.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The Advisory Opinion 2024-03 is approved 5-to-zero.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly? MS. THOMAS: That's the one you sent yesterday. MR. COLLINS: Okay. Then I sent the wrong one. There were two. MS. THOMAS: Yeah, this is the second one.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The Advisory Opinion 2024-03 is approved 5-to-zero.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly? MS. THOMAS: That's the one you sent yesterday. MR. COLLINS: Okay. Then I sent the wrong one. There were two. MS. THOMAS: Yeah, this is the second one. MR. COLLINS: Okay, then I sent the wrong one.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The Advisory Opinion 2024-03 is approved 5-to-zero. Thank you. Item VI, discussion and possible action on Advisory	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly? MS. THOMAS: That's the one you sent yesterday. MR. COLLINS: Okay. Then I sent the wrong one. There were two. MS. THOMAS: Yeah, this is the second one. MR. COLLINS: Okay, then I sent the wrong one. Could we take a break so I can get the correct		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The Advisory Opinion 2024-03 is approved 5-to-zero. Thank you. Item VI, discussion and possible action on Advisory Opinion Request 24-02 and draft Advisory Opinion 24-02	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly? MS. THOMAS: That's the one you sent yesterday. MR. COLLINS: Okay. Then I sent the wrong one. There were two. MS. THOMAS: Yeah, this is the second one. MR. COLLINS: Okay, then I sent the wrong one. Could we take a break so I can get the correct PowerPoint?		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The Advisory Opinion 2024-03 is approved 5-to-zero. Thank you. Item VI, discussion and possible action on Advisory Opinion Request 24-02 and draft Advisory Opinion 24-02 relating to whether activities performed by an employee of a political party qualify as campaign media spending as defined in A.R.S. 16-971.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly? MS. THOMAS: That's the one you sent yesterday. MR. COLLINS: Okay. Then I sent the wrong one. There were two. MS. THOMAS: Yeah, this is the second one. MR. COLLINS: Okay, then I sent the wrong one. Could we take a break so I can get the correct PowerPoint? CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Let's take a five-minute break here. We're going to take a five-minute break. (Recess taken from 10:22 a.m. to 10:27 a.m.)		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Paton you're talking about Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER PATON: Correct. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a second to Commissioner Paton's motion to approve Advisory Opinion 2024-03? COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther. I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The Advisory Opinion 2024-03 is approved 5-to-zero. Thank you. Item VI, discussion and possible action on Advisory Opinion Request 24-02 and draft Advisory Opinion 24-02 relating to whether activities performed by an employee of a political party qualify as campaign media spending as	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	filed by the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee. This question has to do with how the parties should address activities that are included in the definition of campaign media spending. Tom will provide a brief overview. Tom? MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Thank you. So this is the second yes, the second the second prop yeah, Jessica, do we have that one? I wonder if I forgot to change the title card. Okay. All right, if we could go to the next slide 'cause I'm afraid we're yeah. So, okay, this isn't the this isn't the one. Do you have another one possibly? MS. THOMAS: That's the one you sent yesterday. MR. COLLINS: Okay. Then I sent the wrong one. There were two. MS. THOMAS: Yeah, this is the second one. MR. COLLINS: Okay, then I sent the wrong one. Could we take a break so I can get the correct PowerPoint? CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Let's take a five-minute break here. We're going to take a five-minute break.		

11 of 29 sheets Page 38 to 41 of 71

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Our meeting is resuming with Item VI, discussion and possible action on Advisory Opinion Request 24-02 and draft Advisory Opinion 2024-04.

4 MR. COLLINS: Correct. 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom.

1

2

3

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

6 MR. COLLINS: Okay. Thank you, Commissioners and 7 thank you for your indulgence.

So we have -- this is -- I guess we can go to the next page of this if we could, Jessica. Thank you.

Okay. So we received this request on April 3rd from the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee, and it -- the -- the request focuses on basically these two parts of the definition of "campaign media spending."

So campaign media spending is inclusive of an activity, not just a public communication, that supports the election or defeat of candidates of unidentified politic- -of an identified political party or the electoral prospects of an identified political party. And then it sets forth examples, including partisan voter registration, partisan get-out-the-vote activity or other partisan campaign activity.

Then there is another definition that talks about the preparation that goes into other campaign media spending. So that means the research, the design, the Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 production, polling, data analytics, and any other activity 2 that's conducted in preparation for or in conjunction with 3 these activities, so.

4 So we have two question -- the question really asks 5 us two things. Number one, if I hire an employee to do an 6 activity and that activity is -- includes, you know, 7 activities, you know, partisan voter registration or 8 get-out-the-vote activity, and if I hire someone who is 9 going to do the research or design or polling for -- in

10 preparation for or in conjunction with other activities in 11 the statute such as public communications, advertising or

12 the -- or also this partisan get-out-the-vote activity, 13 that's -- that's what we're -- that's the framework we're 14 talking about.

15 In other words, I pay a person to do something that 16 is covered under the Act, under what circumstances did that 17 become the kind of activity that needs to be reported or 18 accounted for under the Act.

Jessica, if we could; thank you.

So in an effort to provide some additional guidance around the terms "activities," we adopted a rule last year 22 that said that -- that said that we will not consider something campaign media spending if it's an activity like research, polling, et cetera, unless it's specifically 25 conducted in preparation for or in conjunction with those

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

44

19

20

21

23

11

13

15

16

17

other activities.

So part of the other question here is, well, what does this specifically mean?

What we had in mind and in -- in when we drafted 5 this rule and recommended it for your adoption was something along -- was something along the lines of -- and this is not an all-inclusive thing but just an example -- a person has a poll that says that voters -- that somebody did for in, you know, a prior year for some other purpose, they were doing something else. And then later on somebody, you know, pulls out that poll in the midst of doing their work getting ready for a campaign ad bot, right, that poll doesn't retroactively become a part of their campaign media spending preparation if it was done on another occasion for another purpose, so.

So that, that's just an example an illustration of what that rule does.

So Jessica, if we could; thank you.

So the question that the Arizona Democratic Party's Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee asked basically, you know, do -- if we hire employees and we pay their salary and benefits and other costs like training or coaching and travel, can that constitute campaign media spending? And does that turn on -- essentially does that, you know, does accounting for that require an evaluation of

> Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 the duties of the employee in question?

2 And so that's the question; and as you see in the 3 draft, we think the answer is to those questions is -- both 4 those questions -- is yes.

5 So, sorry. I'm sorry, Jessica, you're right. 6 You're on it.

7 So we -- the -- the letter lays out a factual 8 background. The party is already a covered person -- that's 9 my mistake on apostrophe there -- under the Voters' Right to 10 Know Act.

So what does it mean they're already a covered 12 person? It means that they have already spent more than \$25,000 or more than \$50,000 on a -- on a -- on a campaign 14 in Arizona.

So they're already subject to reporting of their original sources and -- and greater than \$5,000, you know, and -- and the range of -- of reports required by Prop 211.

18 They're going to do some hiring. The letter 19 articulates that, you know, the general -- the primary and 20 general election are approaching, the ADLCC is going to hire 21 staff for that purpose. The goal of that staff is to 22 support the general mission of electing Democrats to the 23 legislature, you know, the goal to helping elect Democrats.

24 The duties that these folks they're hiring may include crafting the messaging and design of a public Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

13

14

15

16

17

47

49

advertisming [verbatim] and the research related to that, 2 crafting the language of polling instruments, communications 3 and fundraising support, and organizing canvasses in 4 targeted areas to allow volunteers to go door to door in 5 support of Democratic candidates and policies.

So I thought that, you know, this -- this was, you know -- so this is a very clear picture of what -- of what -- of what the -- the circumstances under which these hires are being made, so we have that in mind.

And we'll now if we can go to the next one, Jessica.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So I wanted to break down. This is, again, this is the same language, the language from the statute that we talked about in the first, just a couple slides ago. So we can tick through how the activities that are discussed in the factual background, check off the boxes in the statute and activity -- we know, it's an activity, we know it's to support the election or defeat of candidates of the identified political party or the electoral prospects of the identified political party. That is laid out expressly in the letter. There's no dispute about that.

We also know partisan get-out-the the vote activity is expressly contemplated in the Act and expressly contemplated as one of the job duties here. We know that research is expressly contemplated in the Act where it's in

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com 1 service of other campaign media spending. Here we have 2 research for the purpose of developing advertisements. We 3 know polling, you know, is -- is -- is other, you know, is 4 going to be part of that, you know.

5 And additionally, depending upon the circumstances 6 of the fundraising and other communications where it could 7 be -- it could be, you know, design production and other 8 activities there, those could become campaign media spending 9 under certain circumstances, not all circumstances, and we 10 talk a little bit about that in the opinion as well, so.

So basically, but the point I'm trying to drive 12 home here is, that based on the terms of the letter we know it's activity, it's partisan, it's promoting the candidacy of the party's candidates or the party itself, and it includes activities that are specifically identified in the statute.

Jessica, if we can go to the next one.

18 So one of the things that the request talks about 19 is whether or not, you know, these would be specifically 20 conducted. In other words, you know, one way to look at 21 this would be, you know, if some activities in the view of 22 the ADP, the Arizona Democratic Party, might be -- might --23 might not be respectable under Arizona's regular campaign 24 finance code because they are either exceptions from the 25 definition of expenditure or -- or else are not actually in Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

48

1 service of -- of influencing the results of an election. 2 And so they -- the request discusses how that -- that, you

know, that we should be looking at this in that context to

3 more narrowly approach the issue -- to narrowly approach the issue.

We in looking at the activities here in view of the specifically conducted rule, so, you know, we say, first of all, it's an objective test. And so -- and there again you'll see the illustration we talked about earlier: Another poll, another purpose, another time, it doesn't retroactively become campaign media spending because someone later uses it, that information.

But it does mean for example here where you know the assignments they're hiring for and they're included in the statutes, then those activities are specifically conducted for those purposes.

So what we're concerned about there is, so let's say you -- you post a job ad that says the Commission -the -- "The People's Party of Arizona is hiring for people to do -- to do work during the campaign, duties to be assigned on an ad hoc basis." And -- and you know as a party, that you need to have people organizing canvases and you need to have people working on your advertising copy, but you don't refer to that in the ad and you just sort of on an ad hoc basis assignment, you know, it creates this

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com 1 sort of -- to Commissioner Paton's point on the other 2 matter, you know, it creates a kind of a semantic problem, 3 riaht?

4 Well, we don't think that the statute or the rule 5 could allow you to hire an employee to engage in these 6 activities and then -- and then -- and then say they weren't 7 hired specifically for that purpose because, well, we posted 8 this job ad that just said we're looking for employees and 9 we know in our minds what we're -- what we're doing for, we 10 know what our needs are, we kind of articulate them in this 11 letter but nevertheless we didn't -- we didn't say it, we 12 didn't write it down, and so we have some form of plausible 13 deniability about whether or not this was conducted for some 14 other purpose.

I think that that's why it has to be objective. It can't be based on, well, we didn't say the magic words in the hiring process to trigger that.

So that's -- that's the upshot of our analysis. The next, I guess the next slide please, Jessica. Now that doesn't mean -- and this is an important point -- that every activity that you hire somebody to do is necessarily going to be an activity that's going to count towards their campaign media spending. In other words, you know, an example you used in the draft is -- and I think this is true -- if you hire someone to do press relations

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

50 51 1 for a campaign, right, that person is not necessarily or MR. COLLINS: Right. 2 2 inherently going to be writing the ad copy for a mailer or COMMISSIONER PATON: -- is to promote candidates, 3 3 for a television, 30-second television spot. Those have whatever. So I -- I'm not sure how you parse that. 4 different audiences; they have different purposes and, 4 MR. COLLINS: Right, so. 5 5 COMMISSIONER PATON: I mean... therefore, they -- they could be treated differently under 6 6 the Act depending on what you did. MR. COLLINS: That -- that's --7 7 COMMISSIONER PATON: That sounds like a nightmare. If you put the press release in the television ad, 8 I mean, that might be an issue and -- and then, you know, 8 I mean, I hate to be a devil's advocate, but... 9 that that would be something that folks can look at. But as 9 MR. COLLINS: No. no. I think that --10 10 a general proposition, we know what the activities are, we CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Because I've been -- I've been 11 know -- you'll be able to delineate which activities you 11 involved in campaigns and -- and it's like being on a team, 12 12 assign people to are in the categories that are captured by you're -- everybody is involved, even the person doing the 13 13 scorebook and the ball -- the batboy or, you know, whatever. the Act. And if they're not captured in by the categories 14 14 of Act, then those activities are not part of totaling up That's -- everybody is involved in it, right? 15 15 that amount of money. So I'm not sure how you -- how you can parse that 16 Does everybody follow that so far? 16 out. 17 17 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a comment. MR. COLLINS: So Mr. Chairman, may I? 18 MR. COLLINS: Please. 18 So, so it's a good question. And -- and -- and 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. 19 two -- two answers of that, one of which is what we're doing 20 20 COMMISSIONER PATON: Almost everybody that works going to talk about here and one of which goes back to the 21 for either one of those parties, their purpose is to --21 earlier part of the statute, so I'll start there. 22 22 The first -- the first -- to answer the first MR. COLLINS: Right. 23 COMMISSIONER PATON: I mean everything they do --23 question is it's not -- from a staff's point of view, it's 24 MR. COLLINS: Right. not a decision, it's not a policy decision by the 25 25 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- on the job --Commission, it's the definition of the statute. The statute Miller Certified Reporting, LLC Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com 52 53 1 go- -- drills down and -- and takes certain specific types 1 anything about that in the opinion, but there's a 2 2 different -- there's a different analysis potentially of activities and says those are going to be reportable. **3** And so it's the statutes that's putting that on the covered 3 because some of the activity of the permanent staff, this 4 person, not a policy decision. 4 may -- it may be a wash, it may be more in the nature of, 5 5 And as -- and so that in the -- in the opinion, one you know, a very small percentage of what they're doing 6 of the things we do to avoid those circumstances, we do two 6 or -- you know, we just -- it's a different circumstance. 7 7 things. Number one, first we do not opine on what happens Because we -- we're not saying that every single --8 8 with the permanent staff of the -- of the Arizona Democratic this is the most important part. We're not saying that 9 9 Party or Arizona Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee every single thing that a party does is covered by the 10 because we know -- in this context they're asking about 10 statute. We are -- we are reading the statute by 11 people being staffed up for the election itself, right? 11 its own terms, we're not going past -- you know, we don't go 12 12 So there may be some different circumstances to past what it specifically talks about. 13 13 your point if it was their sort of permanent set of staff. So if it's a, you know -- and there are reasons in 14 14 So the first, so we're narrowing -- that narrows terms of how a party is set up why the activities of the 15 15 the group people we're talking about potentially depending permanent staff may turn out to be very different from and 16 on how that... 16 need to be distinguished from campaign media spending, but 17 17 that would be something, you know, someone could ask about Second we're saying --18 18 COMMISSIONER PATON: So -and we would do a full analysis on. But we want to make 19 MR. COLLINS: Yeah. 19 clear that, that we haven't flushed it out yet for purposes 20 20 COMMISSIONER PATON: Pardon me. of this. But we wanted to reserve that question to be asked 21 21 MR. COLLINS: No, please. at another time if someone wants to go down that road. 22 22 COMMISSIONER PATON: So that means the people that So we're saying -- so -- so to your point we're 23 23 are there all the time don't count? saying the statute does not reach everybody on the team, it 24 24 MR. COLLINS: Well, I think that to, Mr. Chairman, reaches the activities of people on the team. 25 25 to that point, I think that -- I don't -- we don't say And is there a -- is there a reporting, you know, Miller Certified Reporting, LLC Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

57

issue there in terms of, you know, how that affects the
 ability -- the terms under which the covered person does
 business? In the run of things, not very much because this
 is already a covered person. In other words, they're
 already having to disclose for the most part, you know, the
 original sources of their donations.

So what this really says is, if we're paying employees for activities that are included under the Act, can the -- can our donors for their salaries remain anonymous? That's really what this is about.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And -- and the answer to that under the Act is, if it's a defined term under the Act, that donor if the donor is paying for the activity, they're not entitled to that anonymity if they're above \$5,000 and they don't have some other reason to be granted that anonymity. So that's really what this comes down to.

I hire a bunch of employees; I want to essentially be in a position where I don't have to disclose who is paying for those employees' salary. Our answer to that is we're not saying you have to disclose every dollar that goes to their employees, but if there is a dollar, you know, that is being used for, you know, the partisan get-out-the-vote effort that the statute says has to be reported and it hits all the thresholds we've talked about, then that's gonna -- that's something that you got to keep track of.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 But it's the law. 2 COMMISSIONER PATON: But even the -- even the, I 3 mean, the chairman of the party, they're going door to door 4 getting people. You know, they're all doing it. I mean... 5 MR. COLLINS: Well... 6 COMMISSIONER PATON: Or else they wouldn't be a 7 team player. 8 MR. COLLINS: The bottom -- well, I mean. I think 9 that there may be -- I mean, there -- there -- that's -- I 10 think that that may be true, however I think --11 COMMISSIONER PATON: That's not their main job? 12 MR. COLLINS: Well, I think if we got a question 13 about the chairman of the party or executive director of the 14 party, we would analyze that potentially different. But 15 that's not the circumstances we're analyzing because we are 16 analyzing specific people who were picked up just for the 17 purposes of the election, and they're being told they're 18 going to do activities that are covered by the statute. 19

So this is narrower than your question. But that doesn't mean your question is a bad one. It's a good question; it's just we haven't had it presented to us yet.

So I -- there may be some room to -- to work
through that, but basi- -- but the bottom line here is, if
you're staffing up for the election cycle itself, you're
going to have people detailed to do the partisan

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

56

20

21

6

18

19

get-out-the-vote effort, that's a specific term that the statute talks about. You're going to have to keep track of that and -- and potentially report that if you get to a certain level.

I will say that most of the organizations, whether they're parties or 501(c)(4)s if they were involved in this somehow, most of these organizations have to keep track of that to some extent.

For example, if a party is -- is a state party is working for a federal party under the federal law, how the administrative overhead gets allocated depends upon what percentage of time they spend on federal races versus state races. So they already have to do those kinds of calculations anyways.

Similarly if you work for a 501(c)(4) with an affiliated 501(c)(3), you know, how you designate your activity -- just for example in our letters today -- not to this one, but the other one -- the Campaign Legal Center will say, "In this context we are talking as Campaign Legal Center the 501(c)(3), but when we worked on the campaign we were talking as Campaign Legal Center the 501(c)(4)," right.

So what that means is the attorneys -- it's the same attorney -- but that attorney is telling us that they're delineating their activities based on whether it's 501(c)(3) work or 501(c)(4) work.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

So in a sense although it does, you know, create a modicum of -- of additional work, it's not inconsistent with what we think they're probably going to have to do anyways.

4 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman and Tom, can I 5 just make a -- to that point?

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yeah, Commissioner Chan.

7 COMMISSIONER CHAN: And I hope I'm not wrong about8 this. But when Commissioner Paton was mentioning, you know,

9 the party chairman, there's two different entities here.

10 The party is registered as a political committee, and as

11 such I don't they're subject to Voters' Right to Know Act

12 because they're already reporting all of their things, all

13 of their campaign finance stuff, but the AZDLC is not a

14 committee and does not report that way, and that's why

15 they're subject to Voters' Right to Know Act because of

16 their activities that put them under that disclosure

17 requirement.

Am I oversimplifying or misstating?

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom.

MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Chan, theway I would put it is this, is that the parties are covered

under the Act up -- the difference between the way theparties report and the way that let's say a 501(c)(4) that

24 did campaign media spending money might have to report, is

that the parties aren't driven by the timelines that the

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

15 of 29 sheets Page 54 to 57 of 71

61

```
1
   501(c)(4)s are.
```

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

9

10

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

In other words it's 6972 I think or -973 talks about how, you know, a party that fulfills all of the other reporting requirements need only file on their regular filing schedule. So that's -- that's the main relief here.

You know, I -- I will be -- I will be candid, I -in this context, I don't know enough about -- and I didn't, I honestly didn't see a need to pursue an additional question of the ADP as to where the ADLCC in their view fits. What the opinion request letter says is that the Arizona Democratic Party has and -- and therefore by extension, or words to that effect, the Democratic Legislative Campaign Committee have recently become covered persons.

So, I mean, so I -- I think for purposes of this particular draft and the question raised, the proposed -the request itself doesn't delineate it in that way. Although that may be a delineation for other purposes.

I just, I'm not -- in other words what I'm trying -- what I'm saying is I don't know if you're -- I don't know if you're right or wrong for purposes of other circumstances, but for this purpose, I think that the request itself doesn't distinguish the two entities in a way that required us to unpack that.

> COMMISSIONER CHAN: Thank you. Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Chan. 2 MR. COLLINS: So, so I think if I may, 3 Mr. Chairman, I think that Commissioner Paton's question do

4 bring us to this slide which is about trying to get at how

5 do you address the concern that you raise about -- about,

6 you know, reporting and that being complicated. And, 7 obviously, you know, we're empathetic about to the extent

8 which the law may change the existing presumptions under

9 which -- which the party operates, but that's not a decision 10 for the Commission or for the Commission staff. It's a

11 decision the voters made.

12 So our recordkeeping standard. The standards that 13 the Commission articulated were a standard of 14 reasonableness. In other words, all -- if you were subject 15 somehow to some kind of enforcement around this, you know, 16 you base- -- you've got to just -- you've got to just keep 17 reasonable records. So we're just -- we're just saying, you 18 know, if you, you know, so basically like, look, if

19 you're -- and so presumably, again, fitting into your 20 existing framework, you may have with your interactions with

21 the federal party, state party, and the other tracking you

22 may have in place, you know we think that, you know, we just 23 want -- we want to be able to -- we just want to be able to

24 justify that your reports were -- were accurate.

25 And then the -- the Act mandates that, you know, if Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

7

8

15

16

17

18

25

staffers anonymous.

1 you're paying somebody \$10,000 or more during the election 2 cycle for activities that are covered by the statute, then 3 you're going to have to report that. So you have to keep 4 track of it somewhere. The statute says if you get to 10,000, it's going to be reportable, so. Now none of these 6 folks may ever get to 10,000, I mean that's possible, in 7 which case they're never going to get reported. But --8

COMMISSIONER PATON: They may be volunteers. MR. COLLINS: Oh, and absolutely. If they're volunteers, that's not -- they're not even contemplated here, right. This is paid -- paid staff for these purposes.

But, you know, so our -- so basically the tradeoff it seems to me that the statute alloc- -- allows is is the statute does not say that everything that a person does has 15 to be reported nor does it require the reporting of every single payment to a staff member. But, you know, where you know as we have in this case that you're hiring someone specifically for the election and you know that one of the duties that you need attended to is partisan get out the vote, then you should have some reasonable way of assuring yourself and the -- and the reporting in the reports that you've tracked that sufficiently so you know when they hit, if they hit, greater than \$10,000.

You know, that's --

COMMISSIONER PATON: In the aggregate. Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 MR. COLLINS: In the aggregate, yeah.

2 COMMISSIONER PATON: So I guess you're going to 3 have to get one person to keep track of all that for your 4 party from Bisbee to Lake Havasu.

5 MR. COLLINS: Well that is -- that is, 6 Mr. Chairman, that is true only insofar as you are trying to keep the folks who are paying the salary of your elections

9 So in other words, you know, if -- the issue here is the disclosure. So if you -- if you -- I mean, if 10 11 you're -- if you're comfortable, right, with your donors for 12 this activity being disclosed, then it's a moot point

13 because you don't really have to worry about it because you 14 would just allocate it effectively.

The real -- the crux of this is, if this is not campaign media spending somehow despite the -- you know, then that salary payment, the person who pays that salary would not be disclosed.

19 And -- and so -- but so -- so all the tracking here 20 is designed in a sense to -- to show the line where somebody 21 would be obligated to disclose the source of funds for that 22 activity, that employee's activity or not. And so this 23 really has nothing to do -- so the only -- what I'm trying 24 to say is, the only reason you would want to track this in

this way is because you have a group of donors to the Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

65

1 Democratic party who you do not want to disclose. Then if 2 you want -- if you want to carve out ways to pay those folks 3 that -- that -- that don't disclose -- that aren't 4 disclosed, you're free to do that in whatever reasonable way 5 you want, provided that you can under the rules allocate 6 the -- a source for those activities that are covered.

So you're really -- so the administrative burden here to the extent there is any is induced by, if a party choose to do this this way, a party's desire from my point of view to have some of its donors disclosed and other donors not disclosed.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

And that -- you know, that's fine, but that's not really -- but for the legal issue here is, the law doesn't particularly -- the law is not -- the law is telling us what activities trigger the disclosure.

So and -- and we think that if it's an activity covered by the Act, you know, ultimately if it hits the, you know, you're going to be -- you're going to have the disclosures, you know, is going to have to be made. That's just -- that's just what the -- that's just what the Act says.

If there's a -- you know, some of these things a people may have different views on and there are very clear -- and it seems to me when the Clean Elections Act passed, there were some efforts to, when people thought that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1 certain aspects of the Act were -- I'm looking at Mike 2 because he was here and involved in that, you know, things 3 that didn't work or might be unworkable, you know, it was 4 actually relatively comparatively easy to get a 5 three-quarter vote to -- to change them.

6 We haven't gotten to that point yet with -- with --7 in this legislative session. We probably won't this year. 8 But, you know, I think that the staff here is more than 9 happy to work with both parties on areas in which, you know 10 this -- that the law has created a tradeoff that's -- that 11 doesn't work for them and the public interest is -- is not 12 significant, you know, we're -- we have always throughout 13 the history of the agency been willing to make those -- make 14 those -- make to work on those kinds of legislative changes.

15 But -- but this case really has to do with what we 16 see as the specific activities that are currently in the 17 Act.

18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom, this is a request for an 19 advisory opinion and we have the draft here. Has the 20 Arizona Democratic Party had the opportunity to respond to 21 the draft? Do they have any comments that you're aware of? 22 MR. COLLINS: We -- we actually received no

comments about this request at all, I believe. In the request e-mail the party, you know, recognized that they're under a time crunch here because the Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

64

1 election itself is -- is under -- is underway. So what we 2 did here is we endeavored to get on this agenda because the 3 next -- the next -- the next meeting we have scheduled, now we could ultimately move that, is not 'til, you know, the last week of May.

So we haven't seen a specific response from -from -- from the Democratic Party. We sent this draft out the day after the public comment period closed. We haven't heard back from anybody and we never heard from anybody durina.

So -- so every other advisory opinion draft, every other advisory opinion request we've gotten, we received at least one, if not more, comments from the regulated community about the request itself. This one we did not 15 receive any. And we circulated this on -- on the 16th. We did not receive any immediate response and it doesn't look like -- I don't see anybody in attendance from the -- from the -- that represents the party.

So I don't have a -- I don't have an answer to that other than we haven't. Obviously, we could -- I mean -- let me put it this way.

The staff is not -- I mean, I would say I'm not adverse to if you want to do what we did last month and --24 and see if there's additional -- and solicit additional comments on this, that would be -- that would be -- that's

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com 1 fine with us.

23

24

25

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, I'm not -- I'm not fishing 3 for comments, on the other hand, I'm somewhat hesitant to 4 approve the --

5 MR. COLLINS: Sure.

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- the advisory opinion if -- if in a day or two, they're going to say, wait a minute.

8 MR. COLLINS: I think that's -- I mean, I think 9 that's up to your -- up to your discretion.

The best we could do -- the think we felt like we ought to do given the time circumstances as staff is give them as quickly as we could what the staff point of view was. I'm -- I'm not adverse to -- to -- and then if we get something faster or we need to expedite it, we might have to get you together, you know, before the 31st if necessary.

But I mean, you know -- I think your caution is fine, is perfectly reasonable under the circumstances so if we -- you know.

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, so when was this advisory opinion, this draft, available to the Democratic Party?

21 MR. COLLINS: Tuesday morning.

22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, knowing how lawyer's 23 operate two days seems like a tenth of a second.

24 MR. COLLINS: Well, we got it done in -- in record 25 time so far for us.

> Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

67 66 1 1 So let me -- hang -- bear with me real quick. I'm CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I'm interested in what my 2 2 checking to see -- okay. colleagues think. 3 3 COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Mr. Chairman? I just want to check to see... 4 4 All right. So at least three attorneys who purport CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. 5 5 to represent the Democratic Party, including the two whose COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I agree; I also just 6 6 name are on this, got this at around -- at 11:27 on the because I also I do recognize it's a very busy time for 7 7 16th. election attorneys this week and next with all the election 8 8 So I, again, Mr. Chairman I agree with you, at challenges, I would prefer also to just give a little more 9 least I think it's perfectly reasonable to -- to just 9 time to see if we get more public comment. 10 10 give -- give another, you know, period of time. MR. COLLINS: Sure. 11 11 Last -- last time we gave an additional week. You CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any of the other Commissioners 12 12 know, we could give more than a week here if you would like wish to weigh in? 13 13 because of various issues that, I know a lot of election Commissioner Chan. 14 14 lawyers, including Kara, are busy with nomination petition COMMISSIONER CHAN: I agree with that. 15 15 challenges. I don't have a... CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. So how -- what kind of 16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, I -- I'm interested in the 16 time frame should -- should we say we will give them, an 17 17 views of my colleagues, but to me I would -- I would rather additional week, an additional two weeks to respond or what, 18 18 give them plenty of time instead of -what, Tom, would be a reasonable --19 19 MR. COLLINS: Sure. MR. COLLINS: Just to deal with the issues that 20 20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- approving an opinion then Commissioner Werther mentioned and just make this whole 21 21 thing with Kara here, if we did the 2nd of May is two weeks having problems raised and then we have to unapprove it and 22 22 approve a new one. from today, so. And with appeals and everything, there may 23 23 And if we need to have a meeting earlier in May still be folks, but that should be enough time for folks to 24 24 instead of later in May, that can probably be arranged. be able to work through a response if they want to, so. 25 25 MR. COLLINS: Yeah. And then last month, what we asked was -- was that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com 68 69 1 1 we actually took a vote to accept additional public comment CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. Unanimously 2 through -- through the date we identified. So I'm 2 approved extension until May 3rd. 3 **3** thinking -- I guess we go to May 3rd, that's Friday. People Thank you, Tom. 4 like to get stuff done on Fridays rather than Thursdays, so. 4 MR. COLLINS: No, thank you. 5 5 May 3rd. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Where are we now? 6 6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: So is there a motion by any Item VII. This is the time for consideration of 7 7 member of the Commission to extend the comment period to comments and suggestions from the public. Action taken as 8 8 May 3rd for Advisory Opinion 2024-04? the result of public comment will be limited to directing 9 9 COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I'll staff to study the matter or rescheduling the matter for 10 10 further consideration and decision at a later date or make a motion to extend the comment period until May 3rd. 11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Werther. 11 responding to criticism. 12 12 Is there a second? Please limit your comment to no more than two 13 13 COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second. minutes. 14 14 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Seconded by Does any member of the public wish to make comments 15 15 Commissioner Paton. at this time? Anyone on Zoom? I don't see anyone on Zoom. I will call the roll on the motion to extend the 16 16 Anyone raising their hand or signaling they want to 17 17 be heard? comment period to May 3rd. 18 18 Commissioner Chan. (No audible response.) 19 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The public may also send comments 20 20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. to the Commission by e-mail at 21 21 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. ccec@arizonacleanelections.gov. 22 22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. Item VIII. Adjournment. At this time, I would 23 23 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. entertain a motion to adjourn. 24 COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll make a motion to adjourn. 24 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. 25 25 COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Ave. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Paton. Miller Certified Reporting, LLC Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

		1		71
	70	1	CERTIFICATE	/ 1
1	Is there a second?	2		
2	COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: I'll second.	3	STATE OF ARIZONA)) ss.	
3	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by Commissioner Werther.	5	COUNTY OF MARICOPA)	
4	I'll call the roll.	6	DE IT MAIOWAL House the Comment of t	
5	Commissioner Chan.	′	BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings were taken before me, Angela Furniss Miller, Certified Reporter	
6	COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.	8	No. 50127, all done to the best of my skill and ability;	
7	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.	9	that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter reduced to print under my direction.	
8	COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.		,	
9	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.	10	I CERTIFY that I am in no way related to any of the parties hereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome	
10	COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.	11	thereof.	
11	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther.	12	I FURTHER CERTIFY that I have complied with the	
12	COMMISSIONER ESTES-WERTHER: Aye.		requirements set forth in ACJA 7-206. Dated at Litchfield	
13	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The Chair votes aye.	13 14	Park, Arizona, this 23rd of April, 2024.	
14	We are adjourned until May. Thank you.	14	Locale All	
15	(Proceeding concludes at 11:08 a.m.)	15	Angela Furniss Miller, RPR, CR CERTIFIED REPORTER (AZ50127)	
16		16	CERTIFIED REPORTER (AZSU127)	
17		47	* * *	
18		17	I CERTIFY that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC, has	
19		18	complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-201 and	
20		19	7-206. Dated at LITCHFIELD PARK, Arizona, this 23rd of April, 2024.	
21		20	7.10 0	
22		21	Miller Certified Reporting, LLC	
23			Arizona RRF No. R1058	
24		22 23		
25		24		
	Miller Certified Reporting, LLC	25	MIL O UT ID UT IIO	
	www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com		Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com	

\$	4	26:20, 31:14, 31:24,	10:11	ambiguity [1] - 37:16
Ψ	- T	36:6, 37:25, 43:16,	administrative [2] -	ambiguous [2] -
\$10,000 [3] - 11:3,	40 [1] - 37:9	43:18, 45:10, 46:23,	56:11, 62:7	32:22, 34:6
60:1, 60:23	41 [1] - 12:20	46:25, 50:6, 50:13,	admired [1] - 4:17	ambiguousness [1] -
\$2,500 [1] - 11:3		50:14, 54:8, 54:11,	ADOA [3] - 12:12,	33:22
\$25,000 [1] - 45:13	5	54:12, 57:11, 57:15,	13:16, 14:4	American [2] - 8:1,
\$5,000 [4] - 29:13,		57:22, 59:25, 62:17,	adopted [1] - 43:21	10:12
30:6, 45:16, 54:14	5-to-nothing [1] - 6:8	62:20, 62:24, 63:1,	adoption [1] - 44:5	Americans [1] - 16:11
\$50,000 [1] - 45:13	5-to-zero [1] - 40:19	63:17	ADP [2] - 47:22, 58:9	amount [3] - 11:16,
	501(c)(3 [3] - 56:16,	act [1] - 31:13	adverse [2] - 64:23,	30:8, 50:15
1	56:20, 56:25	action [9] - 5:7, 6:9,	65:13	analysis [5] - 28:11,
	501(c)(4 [4] - 56:15,	17:12, 27:5, 27:6,	advertise [1] - 27:19	30:15, 49:18, 53:2,
10 [4] - 4:24, 8:16,	56:21, 56:25, 57:23	28:8, 40:21, 42:2,	advertisement [2] -	53:18
10:6, 11:17	501(c)(4)s [2] - 56:6,	69:7	34:6, 34:13	analytics [1] - 43:1
10,000 [2] - 60:5, 60:6	58:1	active [1] - 28:8	advertisements [1] -	analyze [1] - 55:14
10:22 [1] - 41:25		activities [29] - 7:22,	47:2	analyzing [2] - 55:15,
10:27 [1] - 41:25	6	40:23, 41:4, 43:3,	advertising [2] -	55:16
11:08 [1] - 70:15	20=0 =0 0	43:7, 43:10, 43:21,	43:11, 48:23	and [1] - 17:3
11:27 [1] - 66:6	6972 [1] - 58:2	44:1, 46:15, 47:8,	advertisming [1] -	angry [1] - 14:20
12-page [1] - 39:7	_	47:15, 47:21, 48:6,	46:1	announcements [1] -
120 [1] - 37:6	7	48:15, 49:6, 50:10,	advising [1] - 4:2	6:15
15 [1] - 7:8	74h roy 0:00 40 7	50:11, 50:14, 52:2,	Advisory [15] - 17:12,	announcing [1] - 4:6
16-971 [2] - 17:15,	7th [2] - 6:22, 16:7	53:14, 53:24, 54:8,	17:13, 38:21, 38:25,	anonymity [2] - 54:14,
40:25	_	55:18, 56:24, 57:16,	39:3, 39:8, 40:2,	54:15
16th [2] - 64:15, 66:7	9	60:2, 62:6, 62:15,	40:5, 40:19, 40:21,	anonymous [2] -
18 [1] - 39:8	90 [16] - 19:1, 23:13,	63:16	40:22, 42:2, 42:3,	54:10, 61:8
	23:15, 24:20, 24:23,	activity [25] - 19:2,	68:8	answer [5] - 45:3,
2	27:3, 29:6, 30:4,	21:18, 42:16, 42:21,	advisory [7] - 17:17,	51:22, 54:11, 54:19,
	32:17, 32:25, 33:11,	42:22, 43:1, 43:6,	41:1, 63:19, 64:11,	64:19
2016 [1] - 10:22	34:19, 35:21, 35:22,	43:8, 43:12, 43:17, 43:23, 46:17, 46:22,	64:12, 65:6, 65:19	answers [2] - 28:20,
2022 [1] - 9:4	35:24	47:13, 49:21, 49:22,	advocacy [2] - 26:21,	51:19
2024 [2] - 5:7, 39:8	90-day [1] - 33:20	53:3, 54:13, 56:17,	26:24	anticipating [1] - 17:5
2024-03 [4] - 39:8,	973 [1] - 58:2	61:12, 61:22, 62:16	advocate [1] - 51:8	anyway [3] - 14:8,
40:2, 40:6, 40:19	0.0[1] 00.2	actual [1] - 28:4	affects [1] - 54:1	17:4, 22:8
2024-04 [2] - 42:3,	Α	ad [11] - 20:1, 22:25,	affiliated [1] - 56:16	anyways [2] - 56:14,
68:8		32:13, 44:12, 48:18,	afraid [1] - 41:13	57:3
211 [3] - 6:24, 16:7,	a [1] - 66:15	48:21, 48:24, 48:25,	African [1] - 10:12	apologize [1] - 34:1
45:17	a.m [3] - 41:25, 70:15	49:8, 50:2, 50:7	AG [2] - 32:14, 32:15	apostrophe [1] - 45:9
21st [1] - 6:17	A.R.S [2] - 17:15,	add [1] - 13:21	Age [1] - 7:25	appeal [3] - 6:23, 16:9,
22nd [1] - 6:18	40:25	additional [12] -	agencies [1] - 14:20	16:11
24-01 [3] - 17:13,	ability [1] - 54:2	10:18, 17:18, 23:7,	agency [2] - 13:18,	appeals [1] - 67:22
38:21, 38:25	able [7] - 9:12, 12:5,	43:20, 57:2, 58:8,	63:13	applicable [2] - 20:15,
24-02 [3] - 40:22, 42:3	14:2, 50:11, 59:23,	64:24, 66:11, 67:17,	agenda [1] - 64:2	31:16
24-03 [4] - 17:13, 39:1,	67:24	68:1	aggregate [2] - 60:25,	application [7] -
39:4, 39:24	absolutely [2] - 33:20,	additionally [2] -	61:1	17:14, 17:20, 18:14,
24th [1] - 6:18	60:9	10:20, 47:5	ago [2] - 11:23, 46:14	19:19, 20:16, 21:2,
25 [1] - 11:18	accelerate [1] - 16:9	address [2] - 41:4,	agree [6] - 4:12,	27:13
29th [1] - 5:7	accept [1] - 68:1	59:5	25:16, 30:15, 66:8,	applies [1] - 24:18
2nd [1] - 67:21	acceptable [1] - 14:1	adds [1] - 13:19	67:5, 67:14	apply [1] - 39:12
2	accounted [1] - 43:18	adjourn [2] - 69:23,	agreement [1] - 35:17	appointment [1] - 4:6
3	accounting [2] -	69:24	ahold [1] - 17:6	approach [2] - 48:4
30-second [1] - 50:3	11:12, 44:25	adjourned [1] - 70:14	air [2] - 16:23, 29:18	approaching [1] -
31st [1] - 65:15	Accounting [2] -	adjournment [1] -	all-inclusive [1] - 44:7	45:20
35 [1] - 12:20	12:18, 13:18	69:22	allocate (2) 61:14	appropriate [1] - 30:7
3rd [7] - 42:10, 68:3,	accurate [1] - 59:24	ADLCC [2] - 45:20,	allocate [2] - 61:14,	approval [2] - 10:10, 13:1
68:5, 68:8, 68:10,	achieves [2] - 21:5	58:9	62:5 allocated [1] - 56:11	approve [11] - 5:13,
68:17, 69:2	acknowledge [1] -	administration [1] -	allow [2] - 46:4, 49:5	5:16, 5:18, 38:21,
,, <u>.</u>	4:22	4:8	allows [2] - 46:4, 49:5	39:3, 39:9, 39:13,
	Act [27] - 9:5, 18:16,	Administration [1] -	almost [1] - 50:20	39:25, 40:5, 65:4,
			annost [1] - 30.20	00.20, 40.0, 00.4,

66:22 approved [10] - 6:8, 10:2, 10:4, 10:16, 10:20, 11:22, 12:4, 13:3, 40:19, 69:2 approving [4] - 12:12, 39:6, 66:20 April [4] - 6:18, 39:8, 42:10 area [3] - 20:14, 22:1, 34.23 areas [2] - 46:4, 63:9 argument [2] - 6:22, 16:8 arguments [1] - 6:25 **Arizona** [29] - 4:3, 8:12, 8:13, 9:17, 10:13, 10:14, 13:18, 16:8, 18:17, 19:16, 19:17, 22:14, 22:16, 31:15, 31:18, 32:9, 41:2, 42:11, 44:19, 44:20, 45:14, 47:22, 48:19, 52:8, 52:9, 58:11, 63:20 Arizona's [3] - 4:7, 8:1, 47:23 Arizonans [1] - 9:10 arranged [2] - 14:23, 66:24 Arrows [1] - 10:23 articulate [1] - 49:10 articulated [1] - 59:13 articulates [1] - 45:19 aspects [1] - 63:1 assign [1] - 50:12 assigned [1] - 48:21 assignment [1] -48:25 assignments [1] -48:14 assuring [1] - 60:20 **ASU's** [1] - 7:24 attached [2] - 8:13, 9:3 attack [7] - 21:19, 22:21, 25:18, 25:24, 27:2, 27:8, 27:10 attacking [1] - 20:21 attacks [3] - 17:22, 18:19, 19:10 attendance [1] - 64:17 attended [1] - 60:19 attending [1] - 7:16 attorney [3] - 23:1, 56:23 attorneys [3] - 56:22, 66:4, 67:7 audible [6] - 5:11,

38:18. 69:18 audiences [2] - 8:9, 50.4 Austin [1] - 26:3 author [1] - 8:12 authority [1] - 12:19 available [3] - 9:8, 11:24, 65:20 Avery [2] - 7:22, 9:19 avoid [2] - 33:25, 52:6 aware [1] - 63:21 aye [20] - 5:25, 6:2, 6:4, 6:6, 6:7, 40:11, 40:13, 40:15, 40:17, 40:18, 68:19, 68:21, 68:23, 68:25, 69:1, 70:6, 70:8, 70:10, 70:12, 70:13 **AZDLC** [1] - 57:13 В

55:23

boxes [1] - 46:16

15:24, 17:10, 38:14,

break [5] - 9:13, 41:21, 41:24, 46:12 Brewer [1] - 4:1 brief [1] - 41:6 bring [2] - 4:10, 59:4 broad [1] - 19:20 broader [1] - 27:1 budget [2] - 11:4, 11:5 bullet [1] - 28:6 bunch [1] - 54:17 Burch [4] - 23:2, 23:3, 23:5, 29:23 burden [1] - 62:7 business [4] - 14:23, 27:19, 27:20, 54:3 busy [3] - 7:4, 66:14, 67:6 but.. [2] - 34:1, 51:8

47:14, 51:2 50:13 card [1] - 41:11 Carter [1] - 8:4 carve [1] - 62:2 63:15 cases [1] - 16:7 C ccec@ calculations [1] -

background [2] -56:14 45:8, 46:16 campaign [28] - 17:14, bad [1] - 55:20 18:15, 26:19, 26:24, badly [1] - 14:17 26:25, 40:24, 41:5, **ball** [1] - 51:13 42:14, 42:15, 42:21, ballot [2] - 33:12, 37:6 42:24, 43:23, 44:12, Barton [1] - 26:4 44:13, 44:23, 45:13, base [1] - 59:16 47:1, 47:8, 47:23, based [6] - 9:6, 19:13, 48:11, 48:20, 49:23, 50:1, 53:16, 56:20, 47:12, 49:16, 56:24 basi [1] - 55:23 57:13, 57:24, 61:16 Campaign [10] basis [4] - 13:9, 16:5, 48:21, 48:25 19:15, 26:5, 41:3, 42:12, 44:20, 52:9, batboy [1] - 51:13 56:18, 56:19, 56:21, bear [1] - 66:1 58:13 become [6] - 5:4, campaigns [2] -43:17, 44:13, 47:8, 31:17, 51:11 48:11. 58:13 candid [1] - 58:6 begins [1] - 6:18 candidacy [8] - 20:4, benefits [1] - 44:22 20:20, 23:11, 27:7, Berkon [1] - 26:4 28:4, 28:18, 32:11, best [1] - 65:10 47:13 better [1] - 35:9 candidate [37] - 16:3, between [4] - 6:16, 17:2, 17:24, 19:1, 14:16, 20:7, 57:22 20:2, 20:5, 20:9, big [2] - 16:7, 22:16 20:21, 21:20, 22:21, Bill [1] - 8:3 22:22, 24:20, 25:6, bipartisan [1] - 4:4 27:9, 27:10, 27:15, **Bisbee** [1] - 61:4 28:1, 28:4, 28:5, bit [4] - 4:24, 7:21, 28:7. 28:17. 29:8. 28:11, 47:10 31:13, 31:23, 32:5, black [2] - 23:9, 23:12 32:7, 32:22, 33:12, book [1] - 7:12 33:14, 33:20, 34:12, bot [1] - 44:12 36:3, 36:6, 36:10, bottom [2] - 55:8, 37:21, 38:2, 38:4 candidates [16] - 7:11, box [2] - 15:13, 15:16 7:17, 9:9, 9:24, 16:3,

16:4, 17:2, 17:16, 31:3, 31:19, 37:8, 42:17, 46:5, 46:18, canvases [1] - 48:22 canvasses [1] - 46:3 captured [2] - 50:12, care [2] - 25:12, 34:13 case [6] - 6:23, 6:24, 32:13, 60:7, 60:17, categories [4] - 18:19, 19:4, 50:12, 50:13 causing [1] - 34:22 caution [1] - 65:16 .gov [1] - 69:21

arizonacleanelections Center [8] - 8:4, 10:13, 16:8, 19:15, 26:6, 56:18, 56:20, 56:21 certain [4] - 47:9, 52:1, 56:4, 63:1 certainly [4] - 5:2, 11:17, 37:18, 38:5 cetera [1] - 43:24 Chair [5] - 6:7, 36:24, 40:18, 69:1, 70:13 CHAIRMAN [79] -4:20, 5:12, 5:17, 5:21, 6:1, 6:3, 6:5, 6:7, 12:10, 15:5, 15:10, 15:18, 15:22, 15:25, 16:16, 16:19, 17:7, 17:11, 26:7, 26:10, 28:22, 28:24, 31:6, 33:9, 34:2, 35:13, 35:19, 36:1, 36:21, 38:8, 38:10, 38:12, 38:15, 38:19, 39:2, 39:14, 39:18, 39:22, 40:1, 40:4, 40:8, 40:12, 40:14, 40:16, 40:18, 41:23, 42:1, 42:5, 50:19, 51:10, 57:6, 57:19, 59:1, 63:18, 65:2, 65:6, 65:19, 65:22, 66:16, 66:20, 67:1, 67:4, 67:11, 67:15, 68:6, 68:11, 68:14, 68:20, 68:22, 68:24, 69:1, 69:5, 69:19, 69:25, 70:3, 70:7, 70:9, 70:11, 70:13

chairman [3] - 55:3, 55:13, 57:9 Chairman [28] - 6:13, 12:9, 12:11, 12:16, 13:12, 14:9, 18:4, 25:11, 25:12, 26:12, 29:15, 30:14, 33:8, 34:3, 35:12, 37:3, 37:14, 39:11, 41:8, 51:17, 52:24, 57:4, 57:20, 59:3, 61:6, 66:8, 67:3, 68:9 challenges [2] -66:15, 67:8 CHAN [14] - 5:20, 5:25, 12:9, 12:11, 12:15, 13:12, 14:1, 40:11, 57:4, 57:7, 58:25, 67:14, 68:19, 70:6 Chan [12] - 5:21, 5:24, 12:10, 12:17, 14:10, 40:10, 57:6, 57:20, 59:1, 67:13, 68:18, 70.5 Chan's [1] - 15:6 change [5] - 11:24, 19:12, 41:11, 59:8, 63:5 changes [1] - 63:14 check [5] - 6:21, 15:13, 15:15, 46:16, 66:3 checking [1] - 66:2 Children [2] - 19:17, 31:21 **choose** [1] - 62:9 Christina [1] - 4:7 circles [1] - 28:25 circulated [1] - 64:15 circumstance [1] circumstances [13] -11:22, 13:4, 43:16, 46:8, 47:5, 47:9, 52:6, 52:12, 55:15, 58:22, 65:11, 65:17 citations [1] - 8:19 Cities [1] - 4:4 civic [1] - 8:23 clarification [1] -39:15 clarifications [1] -38.13 clarify [2] - 26:7, 40:1 clarifying [1] - 37:4 clause [1] - 13:7

Clean [3] - 8:15,

37:24, 62:24

clear [9] - 14:14,

16:23, 28:14, 33:2, 37:7, 38:21, 46:7, 53:19, 62:24 clearer [1] - 20:14 clearly [14] - 17:24, 19:1, 27:9, 28:5, 28:16, 31:12, 31:19, 31:23, 32:4, 32:6, 32:22, 37:12, 38:4 clears [1] - 29:18 clicker [1] - 18:10 clients [1] - 7:16 close [2] - 32:15, 32:16 closed [1] - 64:8 **co** [1] - 8:12 **co-author** [1] - 8:12 coach [1] - 23:20 coaching [1] - 44:23 code [1] - 47:24 colleagues [4] - 26:4, 26:5, 66:17, 67:2 College [1] - 10:22 COLLINS [100] - 6:12, 12:14, 12:16, 13:25, 14:9, 15:9, 15:12, 15:19, 16:1, 18:4, 21:7, 21:10, 21:13, 21:16, 21:24, 22:2, 22:4, 22:7, 22:9, 23:15, 23:18, 23:22, 23:25, 24:3, 24:7, 24:9, 24:12, 26:9, 26:12, 28:23, 29:2, 29:9, 29:12, 29:15, 29:19, 29:22, 29:25, 30:3, 30:7, 30:14, 31:7, 31:11, 32:20, 32:24, 33:5, 34:3, 34:11, 34:14, 34:16, 34:19, 34:21, 35:1, 35:8, 35:12, 35:14, 35:24, 36:2, 36:14, 36:20, 36:22, 37:14, 38:9, 38:11, 38:23, 39:11, 39:21, 41:8, 41:17, 41:20, 42:4, 42:6, 50:18, 50:22, 50:24, 51:1, 51:4, 51:6, 51:9, 51:17, 52:19, 52:21, 52:24, 55:5, 55:8, 55:12, 57:20, 59:2, 60:9, 61:1, 61:5, 63:22, 65:5, 65:8, 65:21, 65:24, 66:19, 66:25, 67:10, 67:19, 69:4 comfortable [1] -61:11 coming [4] - 6:16,

10:5, 12:25, 35:5 comment [16] - 16:18, 17:19, 20:24, 24:17, 25:2, 28:21, 38:16, 50:17, 64:8, 67:9, 68:1, 68:7, 68:10, 68:17, 69:8, 69:12 commenters [1] -31:21 comments [14] -15:22, 17:8, 19:14, 21:2, 26:6, 39:15, 63:21, 63:23, 64:13, 64:25, 65:3, 69:7, 69:14, 69:19 Commission [20] -4:11, 4:24, 5:4, 9:17, 11:11, 12:4, 12:8, 16:17, 17:9, 18:14, 37:23, 38:13, 39:16, 48:18, 51:25, 59:10, 59:13, 68:7, 69:20 commission [1] -14:23 Commissioner [61] -4:12, 4:14, 4:17, 4:23, 5:17, 5:21, 5:24, 6:1, 6:3, 6:5, 6:13, 10:9, 12:10, 12:17, 14:8, 14:9, 15:5, 16:19, 17:7, 20:11, 21:1, 28:24, 29:15, 30:14, 30:21, 33:25, 34:5, 36:3, 37:14, 37:17, 39:18, 40:1, 40:5, 40:8, 40:10, 40:12, 40:14, 40:16, 49:1, 50:19, 57:6, 57:8, 57:20, 59:1, 59:3, 67:4, 67:13, 67:20, 68:11, 68:15, 68:18, 68:20, 68:22, 68:24, 69:25, 70:3, 70:5, 70:7, 70:9, 70:11 **COMMISSIONER** [104] - 4:16, 5:15, 5:20, 5:25, 6:2, 6:4, 6:6, 12:9, 12:11, 12:15, 13:12, 14:1, 16:18, 16:20, 21:6, 21:8, 21:11, 21:14, 21:22, 21:25, 22:3, 22:5, 22:8, 23:13, 23:16, 23:19, 23:23, 24:1, 24:6, 24:8, 24:11, 28:21, 28:25, 29:3, 29:10, 29:13, 29:17, 29:20, 29:23, 30:1,

30:4, 30:9, 30:19,

31:10, 32:19, 32:21, 33:3, 33:16, 33:22, 34:9, 34:12, 34:15, 34:17, 34:20, 34:22, 35:2, 35:9, 35:18, 36:11, 36:15, 37:3, 39:17, 39:19, 39:23, 40:3, 40:7, 40:11, 40:13, 40:15, 40:17, 50:17, 50:20, 50:23, 50:25, 51:2, 51:5, 51:7, 52:18, 52:20, 52:22, 55:2, 55:6, 55:11, 57:4, 57:7, 58:25, 60:8, 60:25, 61:2, 67:3, 67:5, 67:14, 68:9, 68:13, 68:19, 68:21, 68:23, 68:25, 69:24, 70:2, 70:6, 70:8, 70:10, 70:12 Commissioners [6] -5:9, 6:13, 20:12, 41:1, 42:6, 67:11 Commissions [1] -20:25 committee [2] - 57:10. 57:14 Committee [6] -32:12, 41:3, 42:12, 44:20, 52:9, 58:13 **common** [1] - 9:9 communication [8] -18:25, 19:2, 19:9, 19:25, 20:18, 31:17, 33:1, 42:16 communications [8] -17:15, 17:23, 18:16, 19:5, 19:21, 43:11, 46:2, 47:6 community [5] - 10:7, 19:15, 24:22, 64:14 comparatively [1] -63:4 completed [1] - 9:2 completely [1] - 7:13 complicated [1] - 59:6 complied [1] - 13:22 concern [2] - 13:22, 59:5 concerned [2] - 13:13, 48:17 concerning [1] - 14:7 concerns [2] - 6:24, 15.6 concludes [1] - 70:15 conducted [6] - 43:2, 43:25, 47:20, 48:7,

confirm [1] - 38:1 conflict [1] - 13:8 confuse [1] - 30:22 confused [3] - 29:1, 30:23 conjunction [4] - 8:18, 43:2, 43:10, 43:25 consensus [2] -19:18, 19:22 consider [3] - 38:5, 43:22 consideration [3] -37:19, 69:6, 69:10 consistent [1] - 31:18 **constitute** [1] - 44:23 contact [1] - 25:20 contemplated [4] -46:23, 46:24, 46:25, 60.10 content [1] - 26:11 context [6] - 7:5, 27:11, 48:3, 52:10, 56:19, 58:7 continue [3] - 9:25, 25:23, 31:6 continues [1] - 4:11 **continuing** [1] - 16:3 contribution [1] - 4:19 copy [3] - 31:3, 48:23, 50.2 corners [1] - 10:8 correct [8] - 29:14, 30:13, 33:23, 39:10, 39:11, 40:3, 41:21, 42:4 correctly [1] - 34:4 costs [1] - 44:22 could.. [2] - 19:7, 25:4 counsel [1] - 4:3 count [3] - 34:18, 49:22, 52:23 counts [1] - 28:12 County [3] - 8:2, 9:20, 23:4 county [1] - 4:9 couple [6] - 6:15, 10:4, 10:11, 15:21, 32:2, 46:14 course [2] - 8:16, 11:17 Court [1] - 16:12 courts [1] - 28:11 covered [14] - 21:14, 43:16, 45:8, 45:11, 52:3, 53:9, 54:2, 54:4, 55:18, 57:21, 58:13, 60:2, 62:6,

10:12. 10:21

conferences [1] - 14:6

confident [1] - 4:10

62:17 covers [1] - 36:16 crafting [2] - 45:25, 46.2 create [1] - 57:1 created [1] - 63:10 creates [3] - 20:17, 48:25, 49:2 criticism [1] - 69:11 Cronkite [1] - 7:24 crunch [1] - 63:25 crux [1] - 61:15 current [1] - 33:10 cycle [2] - 55:24, 60:2 D

D'yani [1] - 10:22 daily [1] - 16:4 Damien [2] - 4:23, 4:24 damien [2] - 5:1, 5:4 data [1] - 43:1 date [2] - 68:2, 69:10 dated [1] - 39:8 **Dawn** [1] - 8:4 days [18] - 19:1, 23:13, 23:15, 24:20, 24:23, 27:3, 29:6, 30:4, 32:17, 32:25, 33:11, 34:19, 35:21, 35:22, 35:24, 37:6, 37:9, 65:23 deadline [2] - 6:17, 37:5 deadlines [1] - 33:15 Deaf [1] - 9:18 deal [5] - 21:15, 35:4, 36:16, 37:16, 67:19 debate [3] - 7:6, 9:7, 9:24 debates [4] - 7:8, 16:22, 16:25 debating [1] - 9:24 decision [8] - 11:19, 12:7, 51:24, 52:4, 59:9, 59:11, 69:10 decision-making [2] -11:19, 12:7 dedicated [1] - 11:11 defeat [2] - 42:17, 46.18 **Defending** [1] - 7:25 define [1] - 31:24 defined [4] - 26:20, 31:13, 40:25, 54:12 definitely [2] - 28:19, 35:16 definition [17] - 17:14, 22:17, 27:16, 27:17,

48:16, 49:13

Conference [2] -

31:15, 31:16, 31:18, 31:22, 32:5, 36:2, 36:5, 37:11, 41:5, 42:13, 42:23, 47:25, 51:25 definitions [1] - 18:15 delineate [2] - 50:11, 58:17 delineating [1] - 56:24 delineation [1] - 58:18 **Democracy** [1] - 7:25 democracy [1] - 8:1 Democratic [17] -41:2, 42:11, 44:19, 44:20, 46:5, 47:22, 52:8, 52:9, 58:11, 58:12, 62:1, 63:20, 64:7, 65:20, 66:5 Democrats [2] - 45:22, 45:23 demonstrates [2] -8:7, 8:22 deniability [1] - 49:13 Department [1] -10.10 design [4] - 42:25, 43:9, 45:25, 47:7 designate [1] - 56:16 designed [1] - 61:20 desire [1] - 62:9 despite [1] - 61:16 detail [1] - 11:8 detailed [1] - 55:25 develop [2] - 14:13, 14:25 developing [1] - 47:2 devil's [1] - 51:8 dichotomy [1] - 20:7 dictionary [2] - 27:16, 27:17 difference [1] - 57:22 different [24] - 8:8, 8:24, 8:25, 9:14, 9:15, 22:17, 24:21, 26:22. 28:11. 31:25. 33:24, 50:4, 52:12, 53:2, 53:6, 53:15, 55:14, 57:9, 62:23 differently [2] - 22:17, 50.5 difficult [1] - 36:19 direct [2] - 20:3, 25:19 directed [1] - 20:19 directing [1] - 69:8 directly [2] - 9:7, 12:4 director [2] - 4:1, 55:13 Director's [1] - 6:10 Disabilities [1] - 10:13 Disability [2] - 10:13,

54:5, 54:18, 54:20, 61:21, 62:1, 62:3 disclosed [5] - 61:12, 61:18, 62:4, 62:10, 62:11 disclosure [3] - 57:16, 61:10, 62:15 disclosures [1] -62:19 discrete [1] - 15:16 discretion [1] - 65:9 discuss [1] - 13:6 discussed [3] - 17:17, 39:20, 46:15 **discusses** [1] - 48:2 discussion [6] - 5:6, 5:10, 6:9, 17:12, 40:21, 42:2 discussions [2] - 9:6, 16:16 Disinformation [1] -7:25 dispute [2] - 14:21, 46:21 distinguish [1] - 58:23 distinguished [1] -53:16 District [1] - 16:12 districts [1] - 9:15 **DOA** [5] - 10:16, 10:25, 11:8, 12:6, 15:1 document [1] - 9:4 documenting [1] -11:19 dollar [2] - 54:20, 54:21 **Don** [1] - 8:3 donations [1] - 54:6 done [8] - 8:15, 8:18, 37:24, 38:3, 38:8, 44:14, 65:24, 68:4 donor [2] - 54:12 donors [5] - 54:9, 61:11, 61:25, 62:10, 62:11 door [4] - 46:4, 55:3 down [8] - 7:10, 9:13, 31:5, 46:12, 49:12, 52:1, 53:21, 54:16 **Draft** [1] - 17:13 draft [19] - 17:18, 17:19, 18:2, 25:18, 26:6, 39:7, 39:12, 39:20, 40:22, 42:3, 45:3, 49:24, 58:16, 63:19, 63:21, 64:7, 64:11, 65:20

10:14

disclose [7] - 14:21,

drafted [1] - 44:4 drag [1] - 31:4 drama [1] - 16:24 drawn [1] - 20:10 drills [1] - 52:1 drive [1] - 47:11 driven [1] - 57:25 during [3] - 48:20, 60:1, 64:10 duties [5] - 45:1, 45:24, 46:24, 48:20, 60:19

Ε

e-mail [3] - 13:24, 63:24, 69:20 earn [1] - 7:19 earnest [1] - 7:8 easier [1] - 30:20 easily [1] - 20:14 easy [2] - 31:3, 63:4 echo [1] - 15:5 ed [1] - 12:13 education [7] - 7:3, 8:8, 8:19, 8:23, 10:1, 10:3, 16:22 Education [2] - 7:9, 9:16 effect [1] - 58:12 effective [1] - 33:1 effectively [2] - 12:6, 61:14 effort [4] - 9:5, 43:20, 54:23, 56:1 efforts [2] - 8:23, 62:25 either [6] - 16:23, 25:18, 25:19, 37:20, 47:24, 50:21 **EI** [2] - 18:22, 18:23 elect [1] - 45:23 elected [2] - 17:16, 25:20 electing [1] - 45:22 election [23] - 4:1, 4:8, 6:16, 9:2, 20:19, 23:3, 32:16, 33:12, 35:23, 37:9, 42:17, 45:20, 46:18, 48:1, 52:11, 55:17, 55:24, 60:1, 60:18, 64:1, 66:13, 67:7 **Election** [1] - 4:5 Elections [4] - 8:13, 8:15, 37:25, 62:24 elections [5] - 4:9, 6:19, 6:21, 9:6, 61:7 electoral [3] - 19:2, 24:5, 29:16, 35:16,

Elizabeth [1] - 26:5 empathetic [1] - 59:7 employee [4] - 40:23, 43:5, 45:1, 49:5 employee's [1] - 61:22 employees [5] - 44:21, 49:8, 54:8, 54:17, 54:21 employees' [1] - 54:19 end [2] - 12:6, 17:24 endeavored [1] - 64:2 enforcement [1] -59:15 enforcements [1] -37:24 engage [1] - 49:5 engagement [1] - 8:23 English [3] - 17:21, 31:2, 34:23 entertain [3] - 38:20, 39:3, 69:23 entirely [1] - 10:17 entities [2] - 57:9, 58:23 entitled [1] - 54:13 especially [2] - 9:11, 24:20 essentially [8] - 13:4, 18:14, 19:22, 31:24, 32:7, 36:2, 44:24, 54:17 establishment [1] -27:23 Estes [1] - 4:7 **ESTES** [11] - 4:16, 6:6, 37:3, 40:7, 40:17, 67:3, 67:5, 68:9, 68:25, 70:2, 70:12 Estes-Werther [1] -4:7 **ESTES-WERTHER** [11] - 4:16, 6:6, 37:3, 40:7, 40:17, 67:3, 67:5. 68:9. 68:25. 70:2, 70:12 et [1] - 43:24 evaluating [2] - 19:5, 21.3 evaluation [1] - 44:25 event [2] - 7:23, 10:15 events [5] - 10:4, 10:11, 12:25, 14:5, 14:13 eventually [1] - 18:23 exact [3] - 10:16, 11:22, 39:24 exactly [6] - 24:4,

Elias [2] - 19:16, 26:4

example [11] - 13:3, 14:6, 19:9, 28:16, 32:13, 44:7, 44:16, 48:13, 49:24, 56:9, 56:17 examples [3] - 8:19, 26:8, 42:20 except [1] - 11:21 exceptions [1] - 47:24 exciting [1] - 8:6 executive [2] - 33:5, 55:13 **Executive** [1] - 6:10 existed [1] - 25:1 existing [2] - 59:8, 59:20 expands [1] - 17:23 expedite [1] - 65:14 expenditure [1] -47:25 expenditures [2] -11:2, 11:6 **experience** [2] - 4:9, 14:19 experienced [1] -11:15 experts [1] - 4:7 explain [2] - 12:15, 17:1 explains [1] - 22:15 express [2] - 13:10, 20:3 expressed [5] - 12:19, 20:3, 26:21, 26:23, 28:13 expressly [5] - 11:24, 46:20, 46:23, 46:25 extend [3] - 68:7, 68:10, 68:16 extension [2] - 58:12, 69:2 extent [4] - 9:13, 56:8, 59:7, 62:8 eve [1] - 11:20

F

Facility [1] - 10:23 fact [5] - 9:12, 11:21, 28:2, 36:7, 38:1 factors [1] - 37:25 facts [1] - 20:2 factual [2] - 45:7, 46.16 failed [1] - 15:15 fair [3] - 5:2, 12:23, 22.7 Fairness [1] - 32:13 falls [1] - 37:9 familiar [1] - 13:17

36:3

42:18, 46:19

far [6] - 9:23, 11:9, 12:19, 15:14, 50:16, 65:25 faster [1] - 65:14 featured [3] - 7:22, 8:17, 9:20 February [1] - 5:7 Federal [1] - 16:12 federal [7] - 31:15, 31:18, 32:9, 56:10, 56:12. 59:21 feedback [1] - 19:13 feeds [1] - 9:7 felt [1] - 65:10 few [1] - 10:5 file [4] - 29:11, 30:5, 32:23, 58:4 filed [11] - 16:9, 16:10, 16:11, 33:19, 34:24, 36:8, 36:13, 36:15, 37:7, 37:13, 41:2 filing [4] - 23:7, 34:10, 37:5, 58:5 finally [1] - 36:15 finance [2] - 47:24, 57:13 fine [5] - 25:3, 35:6, 62:12, 65:1, 65:17 finishing [1] - 30:13 firm [1] - 4:2 first [13] - 18:8, 18:23, 19:8, 25:18, 26:21, 27:4, 46:14, 48:7, 51:22, 52:7, 52:14 fishing [1] - 65:2 fits [1] - 58:10 fitting [1] - 59:19 five [2] - 41:23, 41:24 five-minute [2] -41:23, 41:24 flag [1] - 12:3 Flinn [1] - 8:5 flushed [1] - 53:19 focus [2] - 21:17, 27:8 focuses [1] - 42:13 folks [11] - 8:22, 21:3, 24:25, 32:13, 45:24, 50:9, 60:6, 61:7, 62:2, 67:23 follow [1] - 50:16 following [1] - 12:22 Fontes [1] - 6:24 Force [1] - 4:5 foreclose [1] - 33:13 foremost [1] - 4:7 forgot [1] - 41:11 form [2] - 9:9, 49:12 former [1] - 4:23

Foundation [1] - 8:5 four [3] - 10:8, 19:14, 19:18 frame [1] - 67:16 frames [1] - 22:18 framework [3] - 25:1, 43:13, 59:20 frankly [2] - 13:19, 14:4 free [1] - 62:4 Freedom [1] - 16:10 Friday [1] - 68:3 Fridays [1] - 68:4 friend [1] - 5:4 front [1] - 18:13 fulfills [1] - 58:3 full [1] - 53:18 fully [1] - 14:24 **fundraising** [2] - 46:3,

G

funds [1] - 61:21

47.6

Gates [1] - 8:3 general [7] - 4:3, 33:12, 35:22, 45:19, 45:20, 45:22, 50:10 generally [1] - 14:20 get-out-the [1] - 46:22 get-out-the-vote [5] -42:21, 43:8, 43:12, 54:22, 56:1 gift [1] - 13:7 Gina [2] - 8:11, 9:22 given [7] - 11:3, 11:4, 13:6, 15:14, 31:22, 65:11 glad [2] - 16:20, 17:5 goal [3] - 23:9, 45:21, 45:23 gonna [1] - 54:24 Google [1] - 18:21 Googled [1] - 32:4 government [1] -14:20 Governor [3] - 4:1, 4:4, 4:6 granted [1] - 54:15 gray [5] - 20:14, 22:1, 22:3, 22:5, 34:23 greater [2] - 45:16, 60:23 group [3] - 18:16, 52:15, 61:25 **Group** [1] - 19:16 guess [9] - 10:19, 13:22, 18:8, 24:14, 38:20, 42:8, 49:19, 61:2, 68:3

guidance [2] - 37:21, 43:20

Н

Guide [2] - 7:10, 9:16

hypothetical [1] -37:17

hundred [1] - 35:17

half [1] - 13:6 hall [1] - 9:20 Hall [1] - 8:12 hand [2] - 65:3, 69:16 handful [1] - 7:11 hang [1] - 66:1 happy [5] - 4:16, 4:21, 14:10, 24:8, 63:9 Hard [1] - 9:18 hate [1] - 51:8 Havasu [1] - 61:4 headed [1] - 21:4 hear [2] - 13:13, 24:10 heard [4] - 7:7, 64:9, 69:17 hearing [2] - 5:12, 38:19 Hearing [1] - 9:18 heavy [1] - 11:16 held [1] - 6:22 help [1] - 37:12 helpful [1] - 26:6 helping [1] - 45:23 Henninger [1] - 8:3 hesitant [1] - 65:3 high [1] - 10:25 high-ranking [1] -10:25 hire [8] - 43:5, 43:8, 44:21, 45:20, 49:5, 49:21, 49:25, 54:17 hired [2] - 8:3, 49:7 hires [1] - 46:9 hiring [6] - 45:18, 45:24, 48:14, 48:19, 44:7 49:17. 60:17 history [1] - 63:13 hit [2] - 60:22, 60:23 **hits** [2] - 54:23, 62:17 Hobbs [1] - 4:6 Hobbs' [1] - 4:4 hoc [2] - 48:21, 48:25 information [10] home [1] - 47:12 honestly [1] - 58:8 hope [3] - 15:6, 28:20, 57:7 hopefully [2] - 4:18, 29:1

ı idea [1] - 27:25 identified [21] - 17:24, 19:1, 19:3, 27:9, 28:5, 28:7, 28:17, 31:12, 31:19, 31:23, 32:4, 32:6, 32:22, 33:11, 38:4, 42:18, 42:19, 46:19, 46:20, 47:15, 68:2 identify [2] - 13:9, 37:12 III [1] - 5:6 illustrate [1] - 22:11 illustrates [1] - 19:12

illustration [2] - 44:16, 48.9 immediate [1] - 64:16 immediately [1] -25:19 impact [1] - 8:1

implication [1] - 13:8 implied [1] - 12:20 important [10] - 4:11. 8:9, 8:21, 8:24, 9:4, 13:20. 14:24. 17:1. 49:20, 53:8 inception [1] - 10:22

include [1] - 45:25 included [3] - 41:5, 48:14, 54:8 includes [2] - 43:6, 47:15

including [4] - 8:17, 42:20, 66:5, 66:14 inclusive [2] - 42:15,

inconsistent [1] - 57:2 individual [1] - 5:2 induced [1] - 62:8 indulgence [1] - 42:7 influencing [1] - 48:1 inform [1] - 14:18

6:19, 9:8, 9:10, 13:10, 15:14, 16:14, 18:22, 18:23, 19:21, 48:12

informed [1] - 14:24 inherently [1] - 50:2 initial [1] - 17:18

initiated [1] - 9:4 insight [1] - 4:10

insofar [2] - 20:5, 61:6 instead [2] - 66:18,

66:24 Institute [3] - 7:23, 7:24, 8:18 instruments [1] - 46:2 interactions [1] -59:20 interest [3] - 13:8, 36:9, 63:11 interested [3] - 38:16,

66:16, 67:1 intuit [1] - 32:6 involved [6] - 13:9, 51:11, 51:12, 51:14, 56:6. 63:2 involving [1] - 17:16

issue [19] - 9:6, 11:9, 12:1, 13:1, 13:2, 13:15, 15:16, 25:13, 26:10, 28:2, 32:17, 37:20, 48:4, 48:5, 50:8, 54:1, 61:9, 62:13

issue-based [2] - 9:6 issues [13] - 9:1, 9:10, 9:13, 9:14, 11:10, 11:11, 11:12, 11:25, 12:7, 17:3, 18:1, 66:13, 67:19 Item [8] - 5:6, 6:9, 17:12, 39:7, 40:21, 42:2, 69:6, 69:22 itself [9] - 13:2, 24:19,

47:14, 52:11, 55:24,

58:17, 58:23, 64:1,

64:14

IV [1] - 6:9

January [1] - 10:3 Jessica [14] - 18:5, 19:7, 24:14, 25:4, 25:21, 31:7, 41:10, 42:9, 43:19, 44:18, 45:5, 46:11, 47:17, 49:19 Jim [1] - 26:3 job [7] - 11:18, 14:22, 46:24, 48:18, 49:8, 50:25, 55:11 Jon [1] - 26:4 Journalism [1] - 7:24 June [1] - 12:25 Justice [1] - 32:12 justification [1] -12:23 justify [1] - 59:24

hoping [1] - 13:14

Horne [1] - 32:14

hosted [1] - 10:13

hour [1] - 13:6

House [1] - 23:4

forth [2] - 26:17, 42:19

K

Kara [3] - 33:3, 66:14,

KARLSON [4] - 33:7,

67:21

33:10, 33:18, 33:24 keep [8] - 11:20, 54:25, 56:2, 56:7, 59:16, 60:3, 61:3, 61:7 **KIMBLE** [79] - 4:20, 5:12, 5:17, 5:21, 6:1, 6:3, 6:5, 6:7, 12:10, 15:5, 15:10, 15:18, 15:22, 15:25, 16:16, 16:19, 17:7, 17:11, 26:7, 26:10, 28:22, 28:24, 31:6, 33:9, 34:2, 35:13, 35:19, 36:1, 36:21, 38:8, 38:10, 38:12, 38:15, 38:19, 39:2, 39:14, 39:18, 39:22, 40:1, 40:4, 40:8, 40:12, 40:14, 40:16, 40:18, 41:23, 42:1, 42:5, 50:19, 51:10, 57:6, 57:19, 59:1, 63:18, 65:2, 65:6, 65:19, 65:22, 66:16, 66:20, 67:1, 67:4, 67:11, 67:15, 68:6, 68:11, 68:14, 68:20, 68:22, 68:24, 69:1, 69:5, 69:19, 69:25, 70:3, 70:7, 70:9, 70:11, 70:13 Kimble [6] - 20:12, 25:12, 30:21, 33:8,

- 1

knowing [1] - 65:22

knows [1] - 35:10

33:25

63:14

Kimble's [1] - 21:1

29:18, 31:1, 37:12,

37:20, 43:17, 49:2,

49:10, 59:15, 67:15

kinds [3] - 36:9, 56:13,

kind [10] - 14:11,

laid [1] - 46:20 Lake [1] - 61:4 language [3] - 46:2, 46:13 lapse [1] - 14:18 last [22] - 7:7, 8:16, 9:19, 10:6, 11:17, 11:18, 12:24, 13:3,

17:17, 18:7, 18:13, 19:17, 19:24, 43:21, 64:5, 64:23, 66:11, 67:25 launching [1] - 7:7 law [13] - 4:2, 4:8, 31:15, 32:9, 33:10, 35:11, 55:1, 56:10, 59:8, 62:13, 62:14, 63:10 Law [2] - 10:14, 19:16 lawmaker [1] - 25:15 lawyer [1] - 31:5 lawyer's [1] - 65:22 lawyers [2] - 17:21, 66:14 layer [2] - 13:20, 13:21 lays [2] - 22:16, 45:7 leadership [1] - 7:1 leadership's [1] - 6:23 leaderships [1] - 9:23 League [1] - 4:3 learned [2] - 4:24, 4.25 least [7] - 10:18, 24:24, 26:16, 33:19, 64:13, 66:4, 66:9 Legal [5] - 19:15, 26:5, 56:18, 56:19, 56:21 legal [5] - 11:10, 12:7, 18:24, 26:22, 62:13 legislative [5] - 6:23, 7:1, 21:18, 63:7, 63:14 Legislative [5] - 41:3, 42:12, 44:20, 52:9, 58:13 legislature [1] - 45:23 less [2] - 28:8 letter [10] - 22:15, 22:16, 23:10, 23:12, 45:7, 45:18, 46:21, 47:12, 49:11, 58:10 letters [1] - 56:17 level [2] - 4:10, 56:4 likelihood [1] - 36:9 limit [1] - 69:12 limited [1] - 69:8 line [5] - 20:10, 24:18, 55:23, 61:20 lines [1] - 44:6 list [4] - 11:10, 13:5, 13:6, 25:11 listening [1] - 7:15 litigation [1] - 14:12 local [3] - 4:10, 6:15, 6:20 look [11] - 9:13, 11:15,

26:14, 27:16, 34:6,

36:23, 38:6, 47:20,

50:9, 59:18, 64:16 looked [1] - 37:25 looking [8] - 9:17, 21:9, 26:16, 27:5, 48:3, 48:6, 49:8, 63:1

M magic [1] - 49:16 mail [3] - 13:24, 63:24, 69:20 mailer [1] - 50:2 main [4] - 13:22, 19:4, 55:11, 58:5 major [2] - 9:23, 16:22 mandates [1] - 59:25 Manual [2] - 12:18, 13:18 manual [1] - 12:18 March [1] - 5:9 Maricopa [1] - 8:2 mark [1] - 33:20 material [1] - 39:7 matter [5] - 9:10, 15:12, 49:2, 69:9 matters [3] - 24:11, 24:12, 28:14 McCain [2] - 7:23 mean [31] - 14:11, 16:21, 30:11, 30:12, 30:17, 33:18, 34:7, 34:19, 34:20, 35:11, 36:11, 37:6, 37:8, 44:3, 45:11, 48:13, 49:20, 50:8, 50:23, 51:8, 55:3, 55:8, 55:9, 55:20, 58:15, 60:6, 61:10, 64:20, 64:22, 65:8, 65:16 mean.. [3] - 38:7, 51:5, 55:4 meaning [1] - 31:19 means [6] - 17:21, 32:7, 42:25, 45:12, 52:22, 56:22 media [19] - 17:15, 18:15, 26:19, 26:25, 40:24, 41:5, 42:14, 42:15, 42:24, 43:23, 44:13, 44:23, 47:1, 47:8, 48:11, 49:23, 53:16, 57:24, 61:16 meet [3] - 6:17, 25:23, 28:2 meeting [12] - 5:8, 5:10, 9:22, 10:25,

60:16, 68:7, 69:14 members [3] - 16:17, 38:13, 39:15 memo [1] - 15:13 memos [1] - 12:24 mention [5] - 11:14, 16:2, 20:3, 21:18, mentioned [5] - 9:16, 16:6, 20:1, 20:12, 67:20 mentioning [1] - 57:8 mentions [1] - 24:19 message [1] - 26:11 messaging [1] - 45:25 met [1] - 16:20 Meyer [1] - 4:23 midst [2] - 7:6. 44:11 might [8] - 38:4, 47:22, 47:23, 50:8, 57:24, 63:3, 65:14 Mike [2] - 16:4, 63:1 mind [4] - 30:24, 36:17, 44:4, 46:9 minds [1] - 49:9 minute [3] - 41:23, 41:24, 65:7 minutes [7] - 5:7, 5:9, 5:13, 5:16, 5:18, 6:8, 69.13 miss [3] - 5:5, 7:19 mission [1] - 45:22 misstating [1] - 57:18 mistake [1] - 45:9 moderator [1] - 8:4 moderators [1] - 9:9 modicum [1] - 57:2 moment [2] - 28:10, 36:24 Monday [3] - 11:1, 13:7, 14:2 money [4] - 36:5, 36:8, 50:15, 57:24 month [8] - 7:3, 7:4, 7:7, 17:17, 18:13, 23:6, 64:23, 67:25 months [11] - 10:5, 18:20, 20:19, 21:12, 22:19, 22:20, 23:10, 24:22, 27:1, 29:4, 34:18 moot [1] - 61:12 morning [1] - 65:21 Morrison [1] - 8:18 most [4] - 53:8, 54:5, 56:5, 56:7 motion [14] - 5:12, 5:15, 16:9, 38:20,

39:3, 39:9, 39:23,

member [4] - 38:15,

39:25, 40:5, 68:6, 68:10, 68:16, 69:23, 69.24 move [5] - 5:6, 15:23, 16:5, 22:13, 64:4 moved [1] - 5:17 MR [100] - 6:12, 12:14, 12:16, 13:25, 14:9, 15:9, 15:12, 15:19, 16:1, 18:4, 21:7, 21:10, 21:13, 21:16, 21:24, 22:2, 22:4, 22:7, 22:9, 23:15, 23:18, 23:22, 23:25, 24:3, 24:7, 24:9, 24:12, 26:9, 26:12, 28:23, 29:2, 29:9, 29:12, 29:15, 29:19, 29:22, 29:25, 30:3, 30:7, 30:14, 31:7, 31:11, 32:20, 32:24, 33:5, 34:3, 34:11, 34:14, 34:16, 34:19, 34:21, 35:1, 35:8, 35:12, 35:14, 35:24, 36:2. 36:14. 36:20. 36:22, 37:14, 38:9, 38:11, 38:23, 39:11, 39:21, 41:8, 41:17, 41:20, 42:4, 42:6, 50:18, 50:22, 50:24, 51:1, 51:4, 51:6, 51:9, 51:17, 52:19, 52:21, 52:24, 55:5, 55:8, 55:12, 57:20, 59:2, 60:9, 61:1, 61:5, 63:22, 65:5, 65:8, 65:21, 65:24, 66:19, 66:25, 67:10, 67:19, 69:4 **MS** [6] - 33:7, 33:10, 33:18, 33:24, 41:16, 41:19 municipalities [1] -4:2

Ν

name [5] - 29:4, 29:7, 37:6, 39:12, 66:6 narrower [1] - 55:19 narrowing [1] - 52:14 narrows [2] - 48:4 narrows [2] - 17:19, 52:14 Nation [1] - 10:23 nature [1] - 53:4 Navajo [1] - 10:20 necessarily [2] - 49:22, 50:1

13:15, 14:2, 14:17,

16:21, 19:24, 42:1,

64:3, 66:23

necessary [1] - 65:15 need [14] - 12:22, 16:15, 21:3, 26:14, 27:22, 33:5, 48:22, 48:23, 53:16, 58:4, 58:8, 60:19, 65:14, 66:23 needs [3] - 28:13, 43:17, 49:10 never [3] - 36:13, 60:7, nevertheless [2] -11:6. 49:11 new [2] - 17:19, 66:22 next [18] - 6:15, 6:16, 10:5, 14:16, 18:8, 19:11, 24:15, 25:7, 41:12, 42:9, 46:10, 47:17, 49:19, 64:3, 67:7 **nightmare** [1] - 51:7 **nomination** [1] - 66:14 none [5] - 5:12, 24:25, 25:1, 38:19, 60:5 nonlawyer [1] - 31:5 nothing [1] - 61:23 number [6] - 10:25, 32:3, 38:24, 39:24, 43:5, 52:7

0

objective [3] - 37:25, 48:8, 49:15 obligated [1] - 61:21 **obligation** [1] - 15:2 obviously [6] - 12:5, 16:6, 20:23, 24:25, 59:7, 64:20 occasion [1] - 44:14 odd [2] - 11:7, 11:21 offering [1] - 36:4 office [7] - 28:3, 32:9, 32:23, 33:14, 34:10, 34:15, 36:4 officeholder [6] -20:7, 20:8, 20:20, 21:23, 23:11, 30:1 officeholder's [2] -29:4, 29:7 official [1] - 25:20 officials [2] - 11:1, 17:16 one [54] - 9:11, 10:12, 11:2, 11:3, 11:21, 11:22, 13:3, 15:19, 16:7, 16:8, 16:23, 19:11, 19:15, 19:16, 24:15, 24:17, 25:5, 25:8, 25:22, 26:7,

29:23, 31:8, 31:20, 32:3, 35:19, 36:24, 38:6, 41:10, 41:14, 41:15, 41:16, 41:17, 41:19, 41:20, 43:5, 46:10, 46:24, 47:17, 47:18, 47:20, 50:21, 51:19, 51:20, 52:5, 52:7, 55:20, 56:18, 60:18, 61:3, 64:13, 64:14, 66:22 operate [1] - 65:23 operates [1] - 59:9 operating [1] - 8:8 operative [1] - 32:17 opine [1] - 52:7 Opinion [15] - 17:13, 38:21, 38:25, 39:1, 39:4, 39:8, 40:2, 40:5, 40:19, 40:22, opinion [14] - 17:17,

42:3, 68:8 24:19, 27:18, 41:1, 47:10, 52:5, 53:1, 58:10, 63:19, 64:11, 64:12, 65:6, 65:20,

66:20 opportunity [1] -63:20

Opportunity [1] -18:17 oppose [4] - 17:22, 25:18. 25:24. 27:2 opposes [2] - 18:19, 19:10

opposing [1] - 20:21 **opposition** [1] - 21:19 **oral** [1] - 6:22

order [6] - 7:12, 21:4, 22:11, 22:20, 27:10, 33:11

organization [1] -31:21 organizations [2] -

56:5, 56:7 organizing [2] - 46:3,

48:22 original [2] - 45:16, 54:6

ought [1] - 65:11 outcome [1] - 24:21 outreach [1] - 7:3 overall [1] - 11:5

overhead [1] - 56:11 oversimplifying [1] -57:18

overview [2] - 18:1, 41:6 own [2] - 37:23, 53:11

packet [2] - 5:10, 19:14 page [2] - 39:6, 42:9 paid [2] - 60:11 panel [2] - 7:23, 8:1 panelist [1] - 8:2 paperwork [2] - 33:19, 37:13 pardon [1] - 52:20 parse [2] - 51:3, 51:15 part [10] - 8:24, 9:4, 10:3, 44:2, 44:13, 47:4, 50:14, 51:21,

53:8, 54:5 particular [5] - 14:6, 19:25, 22:25, 27:17,

58:16 particularly [2] - 28:7, 62:14

parties [12] - 9:23, 16:21, 16:22, 17:16, 38:16, 41:4, 50:21, 56:6, 57:21, 57:23, 57:25, 63:9

partisan [10] - 42:20, 42:21, 43:7, 43:12, 46:22, 47:13, 54:22, 55:25, 60:19

partner [2] - 4:2, 8:24 parts [1] - 42:13 Party [8] - 47:22, 48:19, 52:9, 58:11, 63:20, 64:7, 65:20, 66:5

party [29] - 9:23, 19:3, 40:24, 42:18, 42:19, 45:8, 46:19, 46:20, 47:14. 48:22. 53:9. 53:14. 55:3. 55:13. 55:14, 56:9, 56:10, 57:9, 57:10, 58:3, 59:9, 59:21, 61:4, 62:1, 62:8, 63:24, 64:18

Party's [3] - 41:2, 42:11, 44:19 party's [2] - 47:14,

62:9 PASO [2] - 17:20, 18:20

Paso [1] - 18:23 Pasos [1] - 18:22 passed [1] - 62:25

past [4] - 16:24, 35:7, 53:11, 53:12 patch [2] - 25:9, 25:13

PATON [75] - 5:15, 6:4, 16:18, 16:20,

Р

21:6, 21:8, 21:11, 21:14, 21:22, 21:25, 22:3, 22:5, 22:8, 23:13, 23:16, 23:19, 23:23, 24:1, 24:6, 24:8, 24:11, 28:21, 28:25, 29:3, 29:10, 29:13, 29:17, 29:20, 29:23, 30:1, 30:4, 30:9, 30:19, 31:10, 32:19, 32:21, 33:3, 33:16, 33:22, 34:9, 34:12, 34:15, 34:17, 34:20, 34:22, 35:2, 35:9, 35:18, 36:11, 36:15, 39:17, 39:19, 39:23, 40:3, 40:15, 50:17, 50:20, 50:23, 50:25, 51:2, 51:5, 51:7, 52:18, 52:20, 52:22, 55:2, 55:6, 55:11, 60:8, 60:25, 61:2, 68:13, 68:23, 69:24, 70:10

Paton [19] - 5:17, 6:3, 16:19, 17:7, 20:12, 28:24, 29:15, 30:14, 34:5, 36:3, 39:18, 40:2, 40:14, 50:19, 57:8, 68:15, 68:22, 69:25, 70:9

Paton's [5] - 21:1, 37:17, 40:5, 49:1, 59.3

pay [3] - 43:15, 44:21, 62:2

paying [5] - 54:7, 54:13, 54:19, 60:1, 61:7

payment [2] - 60:16, 61:17

pays [1] - 61:17

pending [1] - 16:9 people [17] - 17:6, 31:4. 35:6. 48:19. 48:22, 48:23, 50:12, 52:11, 52:15, 52:22,

53:24, 55:4, 55:16, 55:25, 62:23, 62:25, 68:3

People's [1] - 48:19 percent [1] - 35:17 percentage [2] - 53:5,

56:12 perfectly [2] - 65:17,

66.9 performed [1] - 40:23 perhaps [2] - 20:1,

20:3 period [5] - 64:8, 66:10, 68:7, 68:10, 68:17

periods [1] - 35:22 permanent [4] - 52:8, 52:13, 53:3, 53:15 **permeation** [1] - 38:3 person [20] - 25:10, 28:9, 28:19, 29:24, 32:8, 35:10, 36:4, 38:1, 43:15, 44:7, 45:8, 45:12, 50:1,

51:12, 52:4, 54:2, 54:4, 60:14, 61:3, 61:17 persons [1] - 58:14 perspective [1] - 14:7

petition [1] - 66:14 Phoenix [1] - 4:2 phrase [1] - 31:12 picked [1] - 55:16 picture [1] - 46:7 Pima [1] - 9:20

place [1] - 59:22 places [1] - 26:17 plain [1] - 31:19

plan [1] - 10:3 plausible [1] - 49:12 player [1] - 55:7

plenty [1] - 66:18 point [16] - 22:10, 22:12, 32:2, 34:4, 47:11, 49:1, 49:21,

51:23, 52:13, 52:25, 53:22, 57:5, 61:12, 62:9, 63:6, 65:12

policies [1] - 46:5 policy [7] - 11:11, 11:24, 12:7, 12:17,

points [1] - 7:19

12:21, 51:24, 52:4 **Policy** [1] - 16:8 politic [1] - 42:17

political [7] - 19:3, 40:24, 42:18, 42:19, 46:19. 46:20. 57:10

politics [1] - 5:3 poll [5] - 9:2, 44:8, 44:11, 44:12, 48:10 polling [5] - 43:1, 43:9, 43:24, 46:2,

47:3 populations [1] - 8:25 position [1] - 54:18 positive [1] - 4:18 possibility [1] - 37:8 possible [7] - 5:7, 6:9,

14:3, 17:12, 40:21, 42:2, 60:6

possibly [1] - 41:15 post [1] - 48:18

posted [1] - 49:7 potentially [5] - 26:19, 52:15, 53:2, 55:14, 56:3 PowerPoint [2] - 18:7, 41.22 powers [1] - 6:25 practical [1] - 4:9 practice [1] - 37:23 practitioner [1] -22:23 pre [1] - 9:2 pre-primary [1] - 9:2 precisely [1] - 35:15 prefer [2] - 24:25, 67:8 preparation [5] -42:24, 43:2, 43:10, 43:25, 44:14 present [1] - 10:21 presentation [1] -38:10 presented [3] - 17:23, 20:2, 55:21 press [2] - 49:25, 50:7 presumably [1] -59:19 presumptions [1] previously [1] - 10:16 primary [4] - 9:2, 33:17, 35:25, 45:19 principal [1] - 18:13 problem [2] - 15:8, 49.2 problematic [1] - 14:7 problems [2] - 35:4, 66:21 Proceeding [1] -70:15 process [3] - 13:4, 16:5, 49:17 production [3] - 7:10, 43:1. 47:7 program [6] - 7:6, 8:8, 8:20, 9:7, 9:24, 12:13 Progress [3] - 19:16, 22:14, 22:15 prominently [1] - 8:17 promote [14] - 22:20, 25:17, 25:24, 27:2, 27:8, 27:10, 27:14, 27:17, 27:18, 27:22, 28:1, 31:4, 51:2 promotes [3] - 17:21, 18:19, 19:10 promoting [5] - 20:20, 28:3, 28:4, 28:8, 47:13 promotion [2] - 21:19,

prop [1] - 41:10 Prop [2] - 16:7, 45:17 proper [2] - 27:12, 27:13 properly [1] - 14:18 proposed [3] - 19:19, 19:25, 58:16 proposing [1] - 30:17 **Proposition** [1] - 6:24 proposition [1] -50:10 prospects [3] - 19:3, 42:18, 46:19 Prosperity [1] - 16:11 proud [1] - 9:12 provide [6] - 9:6, 12:23, 13:23, 18:1, 41:6, 43:20 provided [2] - 11:10, 62:5 public [28] - 14:22, 17:15, 17:18, 17:22, 18:16, 18:25, 19:2, 19:5, 19:9, 20:18, 20:24, 22:21, 24:17, 25:2, 31:20, 33:1, 38:15, 42:16, 43:11, 45:25, 63:11, 64:8, 67:9, 68:1, 69:7, 69:8, 69:14, 69:19 publish [1] - 39:13 pulls [1] - 44:10 purport [1] - 66:4 purpose [9] - 44:9, 44:15, 45:21, 47:2, 48:10, 49:7, 49:14, 50:21. 58:22 purposes [8] - 48:16, 50:4, 53:19, 55:17, 58:15, 58:18, 58:21, 60.11 pursue [1] - 58:8 put [7] - 7:5, 10:19, 38:23, 50:7, 57:16, 57:21, 64:21 putting [2] - 7:9, 52:3

27:20

Q

qualify [1] - 40:24 quarter [1] - 63:5 questions [10] - 16:15, 16:16, 17:8, 18:2, 18:13, 30:21, 38:13, 39:15, 45:3, 45:4 quick [4] - 6:15, 15:21, 36:23, 66:1 quickly [2] - 26:3, 65:12 quite [4] - 4:24, 8:17, 10:18, 13:2 quote [2] - 17:24, 17:25

R races [2] - 56:12, 56:13 raise [2] - 13:16, 59:5 raised [3] - 15:1, 58:16, 66:21 raising [4] - 14:15, 36:5, 36:8, 69:16 ramping [1] - 7:6 ran [1] - 32:13 range [2] - 13:7, 45:17 ranking [1] - 10:25 rarity [1] - 5:2 rather [3] - 20:4, 66:17, 68:4 re [2] - 23:3, 29:5 re-election [1] - 23:3 reach [2] - 19:23, 53:23 reaches [1] - 53:24 reaching [2] - 8:25, 10.7 reading [1] - 53:10 ready [1] - 44:11 real [5] - 18:8, 36:23, 37:22, 61:15, 66:1 really [16] - 5:1, 7:19, 11:10, 16:25, 26:3, 26:12, 26:22, 43:4, 54:7, 54:10, 54:15, 61:13, 61:23, 62:7, 62:13. 63:15 reason [6] - 11:14, 13:15, 14:15, 23:19, 54:15, 61:24 reasonable [6] -59:17, 60:20, 62:4, 65:17, 66:9, 67:18 reasonableness [1] -59:14 reasoning [1] - 17:23 reasons [1] - 53:13 recap [1] - 18:12 recapitulate [1] - 25:8 receive [2] - 64:15, 64:16 received [4] - 17:18, 42:10, 63:22, 64:12 recently [1] - 58:13 Recess [1] - 41:25 recognition [1] - 8:10 recognize [2] - 20:25,

recommended [2] -10:4, 44:5 record [1] - 65:24 Recorder [1] - 9:21 recordkeeping [1] -59:12 records [1] - 59:17 refer [2] - 24:20, 48:24 reference [6] - 27:3, 27:9, 27:15, 28:12, 32:8, 32:10 referenced [1] - 36:3 referring [1] - 28:9 refers [3] - 18:25, 28:6, 28:7 regarding [2] - 17:24, 19:6 regional [1] - 9:13 registered [1] - 57:10 registration [3] - 6:17, 42:20, 43:7 regular [2] - 47:23, 58:4 regulated [3] - 19:14, 24:22, 64:13 related [1] - 46:1 relating [2] - 17:14, 40:23 relations [1] - 49:25 relatively [2] - 10:25, 63:4 release [1] - 50:7 relied [1] - 27:18 relief [1] - 58:5 remain [1] - 54:9 remiss [1] - 4:22 report [15] - 6:10, 8:11, 8:12, 8:13, 8:15, 8:21, 13:23, 14:10, 14:12, 16:14, 56:3, 57:14, 57:23, 57:24, 60:3 reportable [2] - 52:2, 60:5 reported [4] - 43:17, 54:23, 60:7, 60:15 reporting [7] - 45:15, 53:25, 57:12, 58:4, 59:6, 60:15, 60:21 reports [3] - 45:17, 59:24, 60:21 represent [1] - 66:5 represents [1] - 64:18 Request [4] - 17:13, 38:25, 40:22, 42:3 request [14] - 17:18, 41:1, 42:10, 42:12, 47:18, 48:2, 58:10, 58:17, 58:23, 63:18, 63:23, 63:24, 64:12,

64:14 require [5] - 23:12, 31:25, 32:10, 44:25, 60.15 required [3] - 20:4, 45:17, 58:24 requirement [1] -57:17 requirements [2] -13:22, 58:4 rescheduling [1] -69:9 research [7] - 8:17, 42:25, 43:9, 43:24, 46:1, 46:25, 47:2 reserve [1] - 53:20 resides [1] - 12:8 resolve [1] - 15:17 respect [3] - 5:1, 27:6, 37:24 respectable [1] -47:23 respond [3] - 33:8, 63:20, 67:17 responding [1] -69:11 response [10] - 5:11, 15:24, 16:10, 17:10, 38:14, 38:18, 64:6, 64:16, 67:24, 69:18 rest [1] - 36:25 result [2] - 32:1, 69:8 results [1] - 48:1 resuming [1] - 42:1 retail [1] - 27:23 retroactively [2] -44:13, 48:11 review [1] - 8:22 revise [1] - 18:7 revised [1] - 17:19 Rights [1] - 10:14 risk [1] - 14:25 road [1] - 53:21 role [2] - 12:12, 13:20 roll [5] - 5:23, 6:20, 40:9, 68:16, 70:4 room [1] - 55:22 rule [8] - 12:12, 20:15, 35:11, 43:21, 44:5, 44:17, 48:7, 49:4 rules [3] - 23:21, 23:24, 62:5 run [6] - 10:17, 32:23, 36:5, 36:12, 36:13, 54:3 running [16] - 23:3, 23:4, 29:5, 30:2, 30:11, 30:12, 32:8, 32:14, 32:15, 34:10, 34:15, 34:25, 36:16,

recognized [1] - 63:25

67.6

38:1 **runs** [1] - 35:24

S

salaries [1] - 54:9 salary [5] - 44:22, 54:19, 61:7, 61:17 satisfies [1] - 20:16 scenario [2] - 25:10, 32:16 schedule [2] - 15:3, 58:5 **scheduled** [1] - 64:3 School [1] - 7:24 scorebook [1] - 51:13 scrutiny [4] - 10:19, 11:6, 11:7, 11:16 second [16] - 5:19, 5:20, 26:1, 28:6, 40:4, 40:7, 41:9, 41:10, 41:19, 52:17, 65:23, 68:12, 68:13, 70:1, 70:2 seconded [3] - 40:8, 68:14, 70:3 seconding [1] - 5:22 Secretary [1] - 9:21 see [22] - 8:11, 11:19, 12:1, 12:8, 16:3, 18:6, 18:18, 19:13, 28:6, 30:15, 39:24, 45:2, 48:9, 58:8, 63:16, 64:17, 64:24, 66:2, 67:9, 69:15 **see..** [1] **-** 66:3 seeing [1] - 29:3 selling [1] - 27:21 semantic [1] - 49:2 senator [1] - 25:14 Senator [9] - 20:1, 20:6, 21:17, 22:24, 23:2, 23:3, 23:5, 36:12 send [1] - 69:19 sense [13] - 23:16, 24:2, 27:11, 27:12, 27:13, 27:18, 30:20, 31:1, 31:2, 31:5, 57:1, 61:20 sent [4] - 41:16, 41:17, 41:20, 64:7 separate [1] - 28:2 separation [1] - 6:25 seriously [1] - 20:24 served [2] - 4:3, 4:4 serves [1] - 13:20 service [3] - 4:23, 47:1, 48:1 session [2] - 33:6,

63:7 set [5] - 9:9, 18:16, 19:5, 52:13, 53:14 sets [2] - 26:17, 42:19 several [1] - 19:5 shenanigans [1] -34:23 Shimek [1] - 26:5 shopping [1] - 27:24 **show** [1] - 61:20 signaling [1] - 69:16 significant [3] - 11:2, 11:5, 63:12 **similarly** [1] - 56:15 Sinema [1] - 36:12 single [3] - 53:7, 53:9, 60:16 situation [1] - 20:17 six [13] - 14:16, 15:10, 18:20, 20:18, 21:12, 22:19, 22:20, 23:6, 23:10, 24:22, 27:1, 29:4, 34:17 six-month [1] - 23:6 skirting [1] - 31:1 slide [6] - 18:8, 19:12, 25:7, 41:12, 49:19, 59:4 slides [1] - 46:14 **small** [1] - 53:5 So-and-So [1] - 22:25 so-called [1] - 17:20 **so.**. [1] - 34:20 solicit [3] - 27:19, 37:20, 64:24 solicitation [1] - 25:19 someone [7] - 33:14, 43:8, 48:11, 49:25, 53:17, 53:21, 60:17 somewhat [2] - 13:17, 65:3 **somewhere** [1] - 60:4 soon [2] - 14:3, 15:6 sorry [7] - 16:11, 31:11, 38:7, 38:23, 39:2, 45:5 sort [13] - 6:25, 9:9, 11:1, 13:5, 18:12, 18:18, 18:21, 22:16, 26:17, 37:9, 48:24, 49:1, 52:13 sound [1] - 22:5 sounds [4] - 13:21, 22:3, 32:5, 51:7 source [2] - 61:21, 62:6 sources [2] - 45:16, 54:6 speaking [1] - 17:21

specific [9] - 15:15,

26:17, 31:22, 37:21, 52:1, 55:16, 56:1, 63:16, 64:6 specifically [12] -7:22, 10:6, 11:9, 43:24, 44:3, 47:15, 47:19, 48:7, 48:15, 49:7, 53:12, 60:18 spend [3] - 7:2, 21:3, 56:12 spending [20] - 17:15, 18:15, 26:20, 26:25, 30:5, 40:24, 41:5, 42:14, 42:15, 42:25, 43:23, 44:13, 44:24, 47:1, 47:8, 48:11, 49:23, 53:16, 57:24, 61:16 spent [2] - 26:1, 45:12 sponsor [2] - 12:22, 14.5 sponsored [3] - 7:23, 10:11, 10:15 sponsoring [1] -10:20 sponsorships [1] -12:21 spot [1] - 50:3 squared [1] - 15:4 stack [1] - 9:14 staff [15] - 20:24, 45:21, 52:8, 52:13, 53:3, 53:15, 59:10, 60:11, 60:16, 63:8, 64:22, 65:11, 65:12, 69:9 staff's [3] - 19:19, 32:2, 51:23 staffed [1] - 52:11 staffers [1] - 61:8 staffing [1] - 55:24 Stand [2] - 19:17, 31:21 Standard [2] - 24:23 standard [10] - 17:20, 17:22, 18:20, 18:24, 19:19, 19:23, 26:22, 28:5, 59:12, 59:13 standards [1] - 59:12 start [2] - 28:20, 51:21 started [2] - 6:19, 30:23 starts [1] - 30:22 state [15] - 4:1, 4:9, 6:21. 9:15. 10:8. 11:4. 11:5. 14:19. 25:14, 25:15, 31:16, 33:10, 56:9, 56:12,

13:17 statement [1] - 36:8 statements [2] - 7:12, 7.18 status [1] - 28:3 statute [23] - 26:14, 26:16, 26:17, 31:12, 31:16, 43:11, 46:13, 46:16, 47:16, 49:4, 51:21, 51:25, 53:10, 53:23, 54:23, 55:18, 56:2, 60:2, 60:4, 60:13, 60:14 statutes [2] - 48:15, 52:3 steps [1] - 12:23 still [2] - 29:10, 67:23 strike [2] - 11:10, 11:21 **study** [1] - 69:9 stuff [2] - 57:13, 68:4 subject [4] - 45:15, 57:11, 57:15, 59:14 subjective [1] - 29:21 subjectivity [2] -30:10, 35:4 submitted [4] - 7:11, 7:17, 12:24 suddenly [1] - 13:16 sufficiently [1] - 60:22 suggestions [1] - 69:7 Superintendent [1] -Supervisor [1] - 8:2 support [12] - 20:5, 21:19, 22:21, 25:17, 25:24, 27:2, 27:8, 27:10, 45:22, 46:3, 46:5, 46:18 supporting [1] - 20:21 **supportive** [1] - 20:5 supports [5] - 17:22, 18:19, 19:2, 19:10, 42:16 surprising [1] - 11:1 survey [3] - 9:3, 9:7, 9.8 sweep [1] - 19:20 Т

table [1] - 15:14
talks [8] - 9:5, 27:18,
28:6, 42:23, 47:18,
53:12, 56:2, 58:2
Target [2] - 27:21,
27:23
targeted [1] - 46:4
Task [1] - 4:5
team [4] - 51:11,

53:23, 53:24, 55:7 television [3] - 50:3, 50.7 tenth [1] - 65:23 term [6] - 17:24, 22:6, 30:13, 31:14, 54:12, 56.1 terms [10] - 10:16, 31:19, 32:6, 37:19, 43:21, 47:12, 53:11, 53:14, 54:1, 54:2 test [1] - 48:8 that.. [1] - 52:16 themselves [2] - 7:8, 36:4 then-Superintendent [1] - 32:14 therefore [2] - 50:5, 58:11 they've [1] - 7:17 think's [1] - 9:11 thinking [1] - 68:3 **THOMAS** [2] - 41:16, 41.19 three [7] - 16:7, 18:14, 18:18, 19:4, 26:17, 63:5, 66:4 three-quarter [1] -63:5 thresholds [1] - 54:24 throughout [1] - 63:12 Thursdays [1] - 68:4 tick [1] - 46:15 timeline [3] - 15:3, 26:18. 27:5 timelines [1] - 57:25 timing [2] - 26:10, 26:14 Titla [5] - 6:1, 10:9, 40:12, 68:20, 70:7 TITLA [4] - 6:2, 40:13, 68:21, 70:8 title [1] - 41:11 Title [2] - 12:20 to.. [1] - 15:21 today [2] - 56:17, 67:22 together [1] - 65:15 Tom [22] - 6:11, 12:11, 13:12, 13:23, 15:5, 15:25, 18:1, 18:3, 32:14, 35:13, 36:21, 37:3, 38:8, 38:20, 41:6, 41:7, 42:5, 57:4, 57:19, 63:18, 67:18, 69:3 tom [1] - 31:6 Toma [1] - 6:23

took [1] - 68:1

topic [1] - 10:1

State [3] - 9:21, 12:18,

59:21

topics [1] - 13:6 totaling [1] - 50:14 tourist [1] - 18:22 towards [1] - 49:23 **Town** [1] - 8:12 town [1] - 9:19 Towns [1] - 4:4 track [7] - 7:10, 54:25, 56:2, 56:7, 60:4, 61:3, 61:24 tracked [1] - 60:22 tracking [2] - 59:21, 61:19 tradeoff [2] - 60:12, 63:10 training [1] - 44:22 transactions [1] -11:16 translation [1] - 9:17 travel [1] - 44:23 treated [2] - 5:1, 50:5 tried [3] - 10:6, 10:24, 15:17 trigger [2] - 49:17, 62:15 true [3] - 49:25, 55:10, 61:6 try [1] - 18:5 trying [14] - 7:10, 9:5, 13:16, 24:4, 24:5, 24:21, 24:22, 31:4, 33:25, 47:11, 58:20, 59:4, 61:6, 61:23 Tuesday [1] - 65:21 turn [2] - 44:24, 53:15 Twin [2] - 10:23 two [20] - 9:23, 14:6,

U

16:21, 16:22, 41:18,

42:13, 43:4, 43:5,

51:19, 52:6, 57:9,

58:23, 65:7, 65:23,

66:5, 67:17, 67:21,

type [2] - 6:25, 14:5

types [1] - 52:1

69:12

ultimately [2] - 62:17, 64:4 unambag [1] - 32:7 unambiguous [1] - 32:8 unanimously [1] - 69:1 unapprove [1] - 66:21 unchanged [1] - 25:9 under [35] - 10:16, 11:22, 13:3, 20:2, 21:14, 22:17, 27:12,

27:13, 32:16, 33:10, 37:10, 37:16, 37:19, 39:7, 43:16, 43:18, 45:9, 46:8, 47:9, 47:23, 50:5, 54:2, 54:8, 54:11, 54:12, 56:10, 57:16, 57:22, 59:8, 62:5, 63:25, 64:1, 65:17 underst [1] - 11:12 understood [1] -23:23 underway [1] - 64:1 unhappy [1] - 15:1 unidentified [1] -42:17 unless [2] - 16:15, 43.24 unpack [1] - 58:24 unworkable [1] - 63:3 **up** [15] - 6:16, 7:6, 9:14, 10:5, 12:25, 22:23, 35:5, 50:14, 52:11, 53:14, 55:16, 55:24, 57:22, 65:9 update [2] - 7:3, 14:3 upset [1] - 14:21 upshot [1] - 49:18 uses [1] - 48:12

V

valuable [1] - 4:10

vari [1] - 8:19

variety [2] - 8:8, 8:9 various [2] - 17:2, 66:13 verb [2] - 27:6, 27:11 verbatim [1] - 46:1 versus [3] - 6:24, 27:9, 56:12 **VI** [2] - 40:21, 42:2 via [2] - 7:16, 13:24 view [9] - 19:22, 26:2, 32:2, 47:21, 48:6, 51:23, 58:9, 62:10, 65:12 views [2] - 62:23, 66:17 **VII** [1] - 69:6 VIII [1] - 69:22 virtue [1] - 36:7 voluminous [1] -13:19 volunteers [3] - 46:4, 60:8, 60:10 vote [9] - 42:21, 43:8, 43:12, 46:22, 54:22, 56:1, 60:20, 63:5, 68:1

voter [12] - 6:17, 7:3, 8:7, 8:19, 8:23, 10:1, 10:2, 12:13, 16:22, 32:3, 42:20, 43:7 Voter [2] - 7:9, 9:16 Voter's [1] - 18:15 voters [4] - 9:3, 9:8, 44:8, 59:11 Voters [1] - 10:21 Voters' [6] - 31:14, 31:23, 36:6, 45:9, 57:11, 57:15 votes [4] - 6:7, 40:18, 69:1, 70:13 voting [2] - 6:18, 39:9 Voting [1] - 8:12

W

wait [2] - 15:10, 65:7

Wallace [1] - 8:4

wants [1] - 53:21

wash [1] - 53:4

watermark [1] - 39:12 ways [2] - 8:25, 62:2 website [2] - 6:20, 6.21 weeds [1] - 31:9 week [8] - 9:19, 12:25, 16:10, 64:5, 66:11, 66:12, 67:7, 67:17 weeks [5] - 10:5, 14:16, 15:11, 67:17, 67:21 weigh [1] - 67:12 welcome [3] - 4:12, 4:19, 6:13 well.. [1] - 55:5 Werther [13] - 4:7, 4:13, 6:5, 6:14, 37:14, 40:8, 40:16, 67:4, 67:20, 68:11, 68:24, 70:3, 70:11 **WERTHER** [11] - 4:16, 6:6, 37:3, 40:7, 40:17, 67:3, 67:5, 68:9, 68:25, 70:2, 70:12 whole [1] - 67:20 willing [1] - 63:13 window [1] - 23:6 wish [2] - 67:12, 69:14 won [1] - 33:16 wonder [1] - 41:11 wonderful [1] - 24:9 words [13] - 20:17, 31:20, 35:15, 43:15, 47:20, 49:16, 49:23, 54:4, 58:2, 58:12, 58:19, 59:14, 61:9

works [4] - 15:3, 18:6, 22:17, 50:20 workshops [1] - 16:3 world [1] - 5:3 worry [2] - 23:8, 61:13 write [4] - 37:8, 37:13, 37:21, 49:12 write-in [3] - 37:8, 37:13, 37:21 writing [3] - 14:13, 22:24, 50:2

Υ

year [8] - 10:17, 11:23, 13:3, 13:5, 37:22, 43:21, 44:9, 63:7 years [7] - 4:8, 4:24, 8:16, 10:6, 11:17, 11:18, 23:20 yesterday [1] - 41:16 Yost [1] - 26:3 you-all [2] - 14:12, 15:2 yourself [2] - 27:4, 60:21

Ζ

Zoom [3] - 7:16, 69:15