1	
2	
3	
4	
5	THE STATE OF ARIZONA
6	CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION
7	
8	
9	
10	REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PUBLIC MEETING
11	
12	Phoenix, Arizona October 23, 2025
13	10:00 a.m.
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	By: Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR Certified Reporter  CERTIFIED
25	Certificate No. 50666 TRANSCRIPT
	i

```
2..5
                                                   Page 2
                                                                                                                Page 4
               PUBLIC MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN
1
                                                             1 of August 28th, September 25th, and October 7th?
2 ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at 10:00 a.m. on October
                                                                          COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I move
3 23, 2025, at the State of Arizona, Clean Elections
                                                             3 to approve the meeting minutes for August 28th,
 4 Commission, 1110 West Washington, Conference Room,
                                                             4 September 25th, and October 7th, 2025.
5 Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the following
                                                             5
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
   Board Members:
                                                             6 Commissioner Werther.
              Mr. Mark Kimble, Chairman
                                                             7
                                                                          Is there a second?
 8
              Mr. Galen Paton
                                                             8
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.
              Ms. Christina Werther
                                                             9
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
9
              Mr. Sam Crump
                                                            10 Commissioner Paton.
10
11 OTHERS PRESENT:
                                                                          It's been moved and seconded that we approve
                                                            11
12
             Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director
                                                            12 the minutes for our meetings on August 28th,
              Paula Thomas, Executive Officer
                                                            13 September 25th, and October 7th. I will call the roll.
              Mike Becker, Policy Director
13
                                                            14
                                                                          Commissioner Werther.
              Shayna Stuart, Taft Law
                                                            15
                                                                          COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.
              Allie Karpurk, Osborn Maledon
14
              Cathy Herring, KCA
                                                            16
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
15
              Anna Abeytia, Member of the Public
                                                            17
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
16
                                                            18
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.
17
                                                            19
                                                                          COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.
18
                                                            20
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
19
20
                                                            21
                                                                          The minutes for those three meetings have --
21
                                                            22 are approved.
22
                                                            23
                                                                          Item III, discussion and possible action on
23
                                                            24 the Executive Director's Report.
24
                                                            25
                                                                          Tom.
25
                                                                                                                Page 5
                                                   Page 3
1
                     PROCEEDING
                                                                          MR. COLLINS: Yes. Thank you, Mr. Chairman,
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning. I'm Mark
 2
                                                             2 Members. I just wanted to highlight a few things.
3 Kimble.
                                                                          I think one thing that is, you know, is
             Agenda Item I is the call to order. It's
                                                             4 interesting and, you know, unclear what the
 5 10:00 a.m. on October 23rd, 2025. I call this meeting
                                                             5 ramifications will be, but the -- you may recall from
 6 of the Citizens Clean Elections Commission to order.
                                                             6 2024 there was the No Labels Party, which is a new
             With that, we'll take attendance.
                                                                party, that circulated petitions to get access to
 8 Commissioners, please identify yourselves for the
                                                             8 the ballot, and they are eligible for the ballot this
                                                             9 election cycle. They -- last week they renamed
9
  record.
10
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Commissioner Werther.
                                                            10 themselves the Arizona Independent Party. They have,
11
              COMMISSIONER PATON: Galen Paton.
                                                            11 according to the news reports that are cited there,
12
             COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Sam Crump.
                                                            12 they have some more organization than they had at the
13
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And I'm Mark Kimble.
                                                            13 local level and appear to be interested in having
             We have four of the five Commission Members
                                                            14 candidates at the -- at the state level potentially.
14
15 present, so we have a quorum.
                                                            15
                                                                          The reason I highlight it is because, you
16
             Item II, discussion and possible action on
                                                            16 know, they're a party, so they'd be -- the candidate
17 minutes for three meetings, on August 28th,
                                                            17 who ran as an Arizona Independent Party member would be
18 September 25th, and October 7th. Commissioners, you
                                                            18 eligible for -- for clean funding if they wanted to do
19 have the meetings from our -- minutes, excuse me, from
                                                            19 that, you know, and so -- so we'll see how that -- how
20 our past three meetings in your packets. Is there any
                                                            20 that -- how that happens. Smaller parties have not
                                                            21 generally for -- maybe one -- I think once, twice maybe
21 discussion?
22
                                                            22 really made an effort to qualify for funding, but -- so
```

24 one -- we'll vote on all of these in one motion. Is

25 there a motion to approve the minutes for the meetings

(No response.)

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, we'll vote on

23

23 really it kind of depends on their organization and

25 highlighting.

24 what they're trying to do, but I thought it was worth

I think the other thing worth highlighting 2 is, you know, we have a general election on

- 3 November 4th. There are local jurisdictions that have
- 4 elections happening. All that information is available
- 5 on our website. And the illustration comes out a
- 6 little small, but I just wanted to sort of -- it sort
- 7 of illustrates that I'm not yet the graphic design
- 8 genius I hope to become at one -- some point.
- But essentially the November 4th elections,
- 10 you know, we get a strong response on our -- on our
- 11 website from folks looking for information there, and
- 12 certainly we've been getting phone calls and we've
- 13 been -- we've been asked to talk about -- highlight
- 14 those, so -- so I think it really -- and we've
- 15 highlighted them in our own newsletter distribution.
- So, you know, part of our goal with the 16
- 17 website is to try to make it a central place that
- 18 anybody in the state can find what they're looking for,
- 19 because especially in these local elections -- I was on
- 20 the phone last night -- well, 4:00, I guess that's not
- 21 last night -- with a person from the West Valley who
- 22 wanted to find out more about the -- there's a current
- 23 technical district out there that is doing a bond issue
- 24 and doing a sale of some property, and so we spent a
- 25 little bit of time trying to -- trying to find some

## Page 8

Page 9

- 1 on just the -- Avery and Captain Activate were out in
- 2 Tempe last week. And I'll -- I have seen some photos
- 3 from that. I need to -- hopefully we can circulate
- 4 those to you. But it was a great event and, you know,
- 5 it was at the Tempe Clerk's Office at the City Hall
- 6 and really well attended and the photos were great. I
- 7 got -- there was a picture of Captain Activate and the
- 8 Mayor of Tempe, so I thought that's a -- you know, that
- 9 was pretty cool.
- 10 And tomorrow Gina will be presenting -- one
- 11 of the main presenters at the Strategic Partnerships
- 12 for Arizona Elections, which is a discussion among
- 13 tribal governments, county governments, and state
- 14 government officials around, you know, election issues
- 15 for 2026. And I thought it's really a great
- 16 recognition that, you know, that she'll be there
- 17 talking to them about voter education as -- you know,
- 18 as her -- and, you know, featured as their speaker on
- 19 that topic for the whole group, which I thought was
- 20 really cool.
- I think that -- I think the only other -- on
- 22 the Prop 211 matters we'll -- I think we haven't had a
- 23 real chance to talk about this. There's not too much
- 24 to talk about except that, you know, there's still one
- 25 case pending at the State Supreme Court, there is one

## Page 7

- 1 information on that.
- 2 So, you know, I think that's important,
- 3 again, because, for these smaller elections folks, they
- 4 don't get the publicity that they otherwise would, and
- 5 having a central hub for that is very important. And
- 6 Alec spends a considerable amount of time, I would
- 7 say -- he's -- that's actually why he's -- he's working
- 8 on it as we speak at home making sure that we're --
- 9 our -- the website is up to date.
- 10 So I did -- we are continuing with the
- 11 podcast, and I highlighted -- we highlighted the
- 12 elections -- these elections on the podcast. I also
- 13 just really liked this interview we did with Dr. Jurado
- 14 from Arizona State about the fiscal challenges of the
- 15 U.S. If you haven't had a chance to listen to it, it's
- 16 -- it's not uplifting, but it's interesting. And we
- 17 think that that's been -- that's -- we will have some
- 18 metrics as we get to the end of the year, but that --
- 19 we think that is also, again, trying to build out,
- 20 you know, places where, if someone comes to the Clean
- 21 Elections website, they can find information on
- 22 something that's relevant to them, that's going to get
- 23 them engaged, and ultimately hopefully help them to
- 24 vote informed.
- 25 A couple other things I wanted to highlight

- 1 case pending at the Ninth Circuit. And then the result
- 2 of the opinion that came out last month from the State
- 3 Supreme Court is that the Legislature will have an
- 4 opportunity to pursue on the merits its claim that
- 5 Prop 211 violates separation of powers issues sort
- 6 of -- sort of broadly speaking. That -- as you can see
- 7 there, there's a -- there'll be a conference on that
- 8 next week amongst the attorneys, so we'll see where
- 9 that goes.

10

- I think it -- you know, we highlighted a
- 11 couple of other cases here. I don't know -- unless you
- 12 have specific questions on those, I mean, just on their
- 13 other legal issues -- just to say that as we get closer
- 14 to 2026, there are going to be a bunch more decisions
- 15 around how elections are administrated. You know, most 16 of those are not going to directly affect us. You
- 17 know, even the -- even the case I mentioned on the sort
- 18 of last page about the -- where the Supreme Court is
- 19 looking at the federal law restricting party
- 20 coordination with federal candidates, I mean, that --
- 21 in Arizona that's already -- the current policy in
- 22 Arizona is that parties can, in fact, coordinate with 23 their candidates. So it's not an issue here, but, you
- 24 know, I think that they're the kind of things that I
- 25 think affect voters and voters call about, and we want

```
Page 10
                                                                                                              Page 12
1 to -- we want to be aware of them for sure.
                                                                         COMMISSIONER PATON: Right.
             I guess that's -- I guess that's -- that's
                                                                         MR. COLLINS: I mean --
                                                                         CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: But I guess people can call
 3 about it that I felt like I needed to highlight. But,
                                                             3
 4 you know, I think we're all pretty busy and, you
                                                             4 themselves whatever they want, but --
 5 know -- and hopefully we'll finish the year strong and
                                                             5
                                                                         MR. COLLINS: Right.
 6 next year will be very exciting.
                                                                         CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom, if I could go back to
                                                             7 questions or comments from --
8 the first item, No Labels Party, now called the Arizona
                                                                         COMMISSIONER PATON: Well, maybe there's --
                                                             9
9 Independent Party. I guess parties can call themselves
                                                                         CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
10 whatever they want, but this seems like it will confuse
                                                                         COMMISSIONER PATON: Maybe they're trying
                                                            10
11 people. Commissioner Werther and I are registered
                                                            11 to -- through the confusion hopefully they can sign
12 independents; we're not members of the Independent
                                                            12 more people up, basically. Why else would you do it, I
13 Party, though.
                                                            13 guess.
14
             MR. COLLINS: Right. I think --
                                                            14
                                                                         MR. COLLINS: Well, I mean, Mr. Chairman,
15 Mr. Chairman, I think that's true. And I think, you
                                                            15 Commissioner Paton, I mean, I think that as the story
16 know, we'll -- we will -- and as part -- I'm sure that
                                                            16 -- the coverage sort of sets it up that, yes, they
17 as part of our voter education effort this next year
                                                            17 see -- they see themselves as a party, as a place who
18 that's something we're going to have to address. How
                                                            18 -- for people who are not members of the Democratic or
                                                            19 Republican Party.
19 we choose to do that tactically, I don't know. And I
20 think that's going to be an issue also for county
                                                            20
                                                                         I think the confusion point, to both of your
21 election officials as well. That's something we'll
                                                            21 points, one of them will be regular folks, who are
22 probably be in communication with them about, because
                                                            22 currently independent, saying, am I now a part of this
23 you're exactly right.
                                                            23 party. In the primary that shouldn't be a big deal,
             Now, for a primary, unless they were to close
                                                            24 because they could request that ballot, but they may be
25 their primary, you could select the Arizona Independent
                                                            25 surprised with what they get, right, so that's part of
                                                 Page 11
                                                                                                              Page 13
1 Party as your party. And I think that, you know, that
                                                             1 them.
 2 that may be part of what their goal would be, would be
                                                                         So it's a real issue. I mean, don't get me
3 for folks to -- but that still would require you to
                                                             3 wrong, it is, but we just don't -- I don't think we've
 4 select it, you know, otherwise -- so, yeah, that will
                                                             4 had enough discussion with -- with the -- our
 5 be -- that will be interesting. I don't -- I don't
                                                             5 colleagues, you know, out there administering voter
 6 know. I haven't --
                                                             6 registration to understand how they see it and what
             I don't think this has gotten enough
                                                             7 steps might be taken to mitigate that.
8 attention yet in the real world to generate those
                                                                         COMMISSIONER PATON: So is this an issue for
9 questions at -- at a volume yet, but that will be an
                                                             9 the Secretary of State then?
10 issue. We have a meeting that we'll attend next week
                                                            10
                                                                         MR. COLLINS: Well, insofar as the -- sorry.
11 with the counties and the Secretary of State's Office
                                                            11 Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Paton, the Secretary of
                                                            12 State approved the name change, so I don't think -- so
12 about, among other things, this and to see where people
13 are identifying those issues. But, I mean -- so long
                                                            13 it -- I mean, whether it's an issue for them
14 story short, you're right, and we'll have to -- we'll
                                                            14 implementing it or not, I don't -- I suspect they don't
15 be looking at that.
                                                            15 have a lot of discretion around what they get to do in
             I don't know the process by which they
                                                            16 that context.
17 changed the name. I'm not -- I think you're right. I
                                                            17
                                                                         CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other questions or
18 guess you're right, because I didn't know about that
                                                            18 comments from Members of the Commission?
19 before it happened.
                                                            19
                                                                         COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman.
20
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, it seems designed
                                                            20
                                                                         CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther.
                                                                         COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Just, Tom, also, I
21 to --
22
             COMMISSIONER PATON: Yeah, it seems
                                                            22 guess I also see confusion the other way in that you
23 intentional.
                                                            23 might have someone who is currently a member of a
24
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yeah.
                                                            24 registered party who no longer wants to be affiliated,
25
             -- to cause confusion.
                                                            25 but thinks that they're signing up to just be party not
```

#### Page 14 Page 16 1 designated, but they're inadvertently becoming part of MR. COLLINS: Right. 2 the Independent Party. So just to --COMMISSIONER PATON: -- and now they're not MR. COLLINS: No, I think that's -- that's a 3 3 sure if they're part of this deal or not and then -- I 4 good point. 4 mean, I think it's not good. What we've done with some things like this 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other 6 is -- and maybe -- Gina is in Maricopa right now for 6 comments or questions for Tom on the Executive 7 the -- but the -- but the -- is done a chart or a 7 Director's Report? 8 click-through tool to figure out where you are, you (No response.) 9 know. That might be something we do. I mean, q CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Tom. 10 something -- something visual, something easy to grab MR. COLLINS: No, thank you. 10 11 that will, you know, tell people where they are, you CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Item IV, discussion and 12 know, based on, you know, my voter registration card 12 possible action on proposed amendment to Arizona 13 says X. You know, here is where I am. If I want to be 13 Administrative Code R2-20-702, use of funds by 14 here, I need to do this. If I want to stay here, I 14 candidates. In our discussions in the enforcement 15 need to do this. That kind of thing. 15 context and other rulemakings we have pending we've CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, I don't want to 16 discussed how to address issues with respect to 17 prolong this, but every year during the election during 17 perceived potential conflicts when a candidate hires a 18 the primaries we're bombard, I'm an independent, can I 18 vendor with a particular relationship. Staff has a 19 vote in the primary --19 proposal on that issue they are asking us to circulate 20 MR. COLLINS: Right. 20 for public comment. Staff also is asking us to address CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- and it's a lot of 21 a technical issue in the way our rules are currently 22 confusion. And I think this is just going to be one 22 presented in the Administrative Code. 23 more point of confusion. 23 Tom. 24 COMMISSIONER PATON: Yeah, I think that --24 MR. COLLINS: Thank you. Mr. Chairman, 25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. 25 Commissioners, I think we have a -- we have a little Page 15 Page 17 1 bit of a -- sort of a slide to try to illustrate for 2 everybody what the -- what we think the problem we're 3 trying to address as core is.

1	COMMISSIONER PATON: we may have to put
2	something like some kind of notice out, you know,
3	before the next primary or something saying, we don't
4	want you to be confused. This is this is the
5	situation. I don't know if we could do something to
6	every independent voter to explain.
7	MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman,
8	Commissioner Paton, I mean, well, that would be very
9	expensive and maybe not very effective, depending. But
10	I think this is all good for me personally in the
11	meetings that $\operatorname{Gina}$ and $\operatorname{I}$ will be at about this, this is
12	helpful for us to be able to say that you all have
13	identified some of these issues and that's so we'll
14	see what feedback we get and we'll keep an eye on it
15	and have and be able to, you know, I think be
16	constructive. So I appreciate the
17	COMMISSIONER PATON: Because here you've got
18	two people that are involved in elections
19	MR. COLLINS: Right.
20	COMMISSIONER PATON: that would possibly
21	be confused by it
22	MR. COLLINS: Right.
23	COMMISSIONER PATON: let alone the regular
24	voter that's trying to live their life and whatever,

```
This is the current state of things. If
5 you're a clean candidate, you can't use your clean
6 money for personal expenses, so that's -- that's, you
7 know --
             And then -- and then if you go to the -- if
9 we go to the next slide, I think there's the problem
10 we're trying to solve, which is a perception problem,
11 but nevertheless a real one, is -- there's a delay on
12 that. Well, it will show us that the problem we're
13 trying to solve is what happens if you share a
14 household with a -- with a consultant, whether it's a
15 spouse or any other -- or other person you share living
16 expenses with and, you know, how do we address that.
17
             So as the memo details, there's -- we looked
18 at -- we kind of talked about it, and I know there was
19 some discussion towards the end of our conversation
20 last month around put -- setting a percentage, you
21 know, and -- you know, we're open to talking about
22 that. The reason we kind of ended up going with sort
23 of a black and white rule is because it's easier to
24 administrate and it's not clear to us that the
25 percentage cutoff necessarily solves what the core of
```

25 and for whatever reason they want to be independent --

- $1\,\,$  the problem is, which is basically taking the money out
- 2 of -- the potential perception that money from --
- 3 passing from one person to another person within the
- 4 household would, you know, inevitably lead to some of
- 5 those dollars supporting the household rather than
- 6 campaign. So that's why we settled on what we settled
- 7 on.
- 8 We also included in that rule, however, a
- 9 proposal -- you know, you'd still get reimbursed for
- 10 things that are -- you know, that will reimburse. So
- 11 if somebody goes and buys, you know, pens for an event,
- 12 that's still going to be reimbursable, right. We're
- 13 talking about, you know -- we're talking about, you
- 14 know, expenditures like, you know, campaign
- 15 expenditures that are -- that are serious.
- 16 And then there's also a provision and it
- 17 says, if for some reason -- and this could happen,
- 18 because some vendors -- in some areas -- it's
- 19 conceivable this could happen that in some areas,
- 20 either because of where they are, the way the market
- 21 is, what the particular item is, there may not be
- 22 available competition, in other words, this may, you
- 23 know, restrict folks in a way that is -- that is
- 24 meaningful. You know, and we wanted to at least
- 25 account for that possibility.

#### Page 20

- 1 questions we haven't asked before. And we thought,
- 2 well, maybe -- or, certainly I thought; I don't know if
- 3 I'm speaking for we or not -- but we may as well, you
- 4 know, just make that clear, you know, that you could
- 5 not pay yourself a salary out of Clean Elections
- 6 dollars.
- 7 You know, there is -- there are arguments
- 8 that you can do that with state dollars at the state
- 9 level for candidates. And candidates at the county
- 10 level have, in fact, done that with their -- with their
- 11 own funds or their campaign funds, but -- but I think
- 12 that given where our policies are to begin with, it
- 13 would be very difficult to square that with what the
- 14 existing policies are. So that's -- that's the --
- 15 that's kind of how we approached it.
- I mean, I'll highlight just briefly there's
- 17 this kind of formal -- and not unserious, but formal
- 18 issue we haven't got completely -- and I don't think
- 19 we're going to ever get completely the -- well, we're
- 20 probably not going to effort to get the complete answer
- 21 to. At some point the subsection we're talking about
- 22 disappeared from the published code, and we don't know
- 23 precisely why. We may find -- find -- we may be able
- 24 to figure that out, but it's not very important for
- 25 present purposes because the more important thing, from

## Page 19

- You know, if that -- say there are maybe two
- 2 people who make 4-by-4 signs in the whole state, for
- 3 example, and you happen to be in a relationship with
- 4 one of them or -- you know, you wouldn't -- you know,
- 5 you wouldn't want to -- that would be a real problem
- 6 and that -- you wouldn't want that to necessarily 7 disqualify you, but you'd have to basically ask
- 8 permission.
- 9 I don't think it's likely, but at least it's
- 10 to the point that I think came up around a percentage.
- 11 It's a way of addressing the issue of not being overly
- 12 -- of being clear without being -- leaving no freedom,
- 13 essentially, if there was a circumstance that arose
- 14 that met that requirement. We base that on the Maine
- 15 statute. The Maine statute is -- basically says if
- 16 you're a candidate or a candidate's spouse you can't
- 17 pay yourself at all.
- 18 And, you know, there is a -- and that does
- $19\,\,$  bring in an issue we haven't directly addressed, which
- $20\,$  is specifically salaries, right. So there's this idea
- 21 that has been out there to have, you know -- what
- 22 happens as we do the analysis is sort of these issues 23 start to intertwine, right. Really once you're talking
- 24 about how the Clean Elections money is being utilized,
- 25 you know, you sort of -- you sort of get to some

- Page 21
- $1\,$  our point of view, is to -- we need to update the rule
- $2\,$  anyways. We have some things we want to address, we
- 3 think, or at least get feedback on. And so we'll have
- 4 time in the meantime, if we need to track that down
- 5 further, to do that, but -- because we're only asking
- $\ensuremath{\mathrm{G}}$  for public comment at this point, but we did want to --
- 7 you know, we did want to kind of flag that as a -- as
- 8 a -- as a thing that exists.
- 9 So that's kind of all I really -- I really
- 10 had. I don't -- you know, I think that the goal here,
- 11 just to restate, is just to try to get at the
- 12 perception, whether it's real or not, that if you are
- 13 in a position where, you know, you are hiring a person
- 14 with whom you share household expenses or you're in a
- 15 marriage with or whatever, that, you know, that that's
- 16 a potential end run around not using Clean Elections
- 17 money for personal use. And that's the core of the  ${\hbox{\scriptsize --}}$
- 18 what we want to do here.
- 19 We also left in place the ability to hire and
- 20 pay family members. That's -- that doesn't change
- 21 outside of these -- these provisions, right. So if
- 22 your son is a campaign guru and you want to hire him, 23 so long as you're not paying him above a market rate
- 24 and that's disclosed, that's still going to be fine.
- 25 It's really -- it's really about -- and it's, again, a

#### Page 22 Page 24 1 way of making sure that we're not being overly -- you 1 person available that could do it, which they would 2 know, overemphasizing. So -- so --2 have to prove. Other family members outside of the And then -- and then I just would say that 3 household would be -- still be able to be paid at a 4 because Maine and our model, although they have more 4 standard ordinary rate, which is -- so that's --5 funding available for candidates than we do, are So what this rule does is it exactly, we 6 similar, developed at the same time and basically by 6 think, meets what we think the issue that you've 7 the same people, I mean, the fact that they have this 7 identified is. I mean, the factual scenario you 8 in law I thought was a pretty good indicator that it 8 identified is illegal under this rule. If your, you 9 must be a decent, workable policy, so... 9 know, family member who is not a part of your household CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Initially, when we started 10 is -- works for your campaign, that's different because 11 talking about this, this seemed to be an easy fix, like 11 of what the -- you know, because of the living 12 you can't pay family members or spouses or significant 12 situation. And so the rule treats that differently. 13 others or whatever; but the more we get into it, I 13 So that's -- that's -- so we think we're -- we think 14 think you've identified that it's not that clear cut. 14 we're doing -- we think we're addressing precisely the 15 And so I think what you're proposing is a good 15 question you have. 16 compromise between appropriate spending and not 16 COMMISSIONER PATON: So I -- I don't want to 17 disadvantaging candidates unfairly. 17 get into minutia, but these people are going to come 18 MR. COLLINS: Yeah, I hope so. 18 before us. And so let's say your son doesn't live with 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. 19 you and lives in north Tucson, I live in east Tucson --COMMISSIONER PATON: So I'm not totally sure 20 20 MR. COLLINS: Sure. 21 I'm clear on really what the difference is. So what COMMISSIONER PATON: -- I'm the candidate. 22 I'm against is --22 Then I do a contract with him --23 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Can you put your mic 23 MR. COLLINS: Yeah. 24 on. COMMISSIONER PATON: -- and say, we'll pay 24 25 COMMISSIONER PATON: Oh, I'm sorry. 25 you \$5,000 to do this, this, this, and this. Page 25 Page 23 What I'm against is we give somebody \$52,000, MR. COLLINS: Yeah. 2 and they write a check for \$48,000 to their significant COMMISSIONER PATON: I mean, I would not be 3 other, basically. 3 opposed to something like that. MR. COLLINS: Yeah. MR. COLLINS: Correct. COMMISSIONER PATON: So are we just funding a COMMISSIONER PATON: But then they'd have to $\ensuremath{\mathsf{6}}$ lifestyle or are we funding the election matters of 6 do the contract or something --7 this person? And I understand it's hard to kind of pin 7 MR. COLLINS: Correct. 8 down all these things. And then when you talk about COMMISSIONER PATON: -- to explain what 9 he's doing. It's just not a \$5,000 check to Billy Bob 9 market rate, I mean, is there a market rate in Benson, 10 Arizona or -- so I -- I'm not sure exactly what we're 10 and -- they're election expenses. 11 achieving here. MR. COLLINS: That's correct. That is what MR. COLLINS: So no -- Mr. Chairman -- I 12 this rule says. 12 13 mean, Commissioner Paton, yeah. So the first issue, 13 COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay. I'm fine with 14 your -- your immediate problem is directly solved, in 14 that. 15 our view, by Section -- what will be (F)(5) of the rule 15 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman. 16 that says that a candidate shall not use funds in a 16 COMMISSIONER PATON: Not like I'm the arbiter 17 candidate campaign account to compensate the candidate, 17 here, but --18 the candidate's spouse, or a person with whom the 18 MR. COLLINS: You're an arbiter. 19 candidate shares household expenses, or to pay an 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther. 20 enterprise owned by such individuals. That's -- that's 20 Excuse me. Commissioner Werther. 21 a black and white no. COMMISSIONER WERTHER: So, Tom, I did -- I 22 So that transfer that you talked about, that 22 just wanted to kind of make sure that I understood how 23 \$48,000 to the household, basically, that is forbidden, 23 the rule was working. So under the new, I guess, 24 you know. The only time that there would be an 24 (F)(5) --25 25 exception is in this rare case where there's no other MR. COLLINS: Yeah.

#### Page 26 Page 28 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: -- so it's the 1 what (5)(b) is trying to allow, because it says does 2 candidate, candidate's spouse, and the person with whom 2 not prohibit reimbursement to those individuals for 3 they share household expenses --3 reasonable expenses. MR. COLLINS: Right. MR. COLLINS: If you had a -- if you had a --5 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: -- to kind of capture 5 I mean, we can make this clearer, but, I mean, 6 any other individuals. So that's the prohibition. 6 basically you can get reimbursed for gas, you can get 7 MR. COLLINS: Right. 7 reimbursed for -- you know, I mean, there are express COMMISSIONER WERTHER: But then Subsection 8 provisions of the rules that allow you to get 9 (b) says, of course, that you have -- I think it's kind 9 reimbursed for those kinds of things, gas and going out 10 of trying to note that current exception, right, about 10 and buying paper supplies and that kind of thing. 11 reimbursement --COMMISSIONER WERTHER: And Mr. Chairman, Tom, 12 MR. COLLINS: Right. 12 I guess -- and that's not limited to -- because like I 13 said, I see (F)(4), and that's only limited to family 13 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: -- for reasonable 14 expenses --14 member, which would not include someone who is not the 15 MR. COLLINS: Yes. 15 spouse who's just living -- sharing expenses. COMMISSIONER WERTHER: -- and again includes 16 MR. COLLINS: Correct. Correct. 16 17 the same people, candidate, candidate spouse, and the 17 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: So I didn't -- I just 18 person who is sort of living in the household. 18 wanted to make sure that, as we're doing this, that MR. COLLINS: Yes. 19 19 we're, I guess, treating everybody -- you know what I 20 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: But I guess that's 20 mean -- the same. If that exception exists that --21 where I'm not sure. Because are we only then kind of 21 would a person who's just sharing living expenses, I 22 trying to reference (F)(4), which is talking about sort 22 guess, be eligible for reimbursement under the rules, 23 of that fair market -- you know, as long as it's not 23 or do all the other times where it discusses 24 exceeding fair market value? 24 reimbursement only address family member, which would 25 not include --MR. COLLINS: That's -- I'm sorry. Yes.

## Page 27

```
COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Because that only
 2 replaced family members, and family member definition
3 doesn't seem like that encompasses someone who lives in
 4 the household who is not a spouse.
             MR. COLLINS: So, Mr. Chairman,
 6 Commissioner Werther, I mean, the not -- we think that
 7 the notwithstanding clause at the beginning says, we
 8 don't care about what it says about family members in
9 (F)(5). If you're in these three buckets, regardless
10 of family membership -- because that also gets at the
11 fact that we -- if we --
             The other -- the other way to do this, which
12
13 I think would actually be more complicated, would be to
14 get in and change the family member definition itself
15 and start to try to include, as family member, living
16 expenses. So we thought it was simpler and cleaner to
17 just say, okay, you're a family member, X, Y, and Z,
18 and then -- and then you go to -- and then the next
19 section says, forget all that. If you're in these
20 buckets, which are not all family members, you are --
21 you are -- you are out as a person who could get paid.
22 That's -- that's what we are trying to do.
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I have
23
24 another question.
25
             Okay. I guess maybe then I'm confused by
```

## Page 29

```
MR. COLLINS: Well, the thought would be by
 2 notwithstanding (F)(4), we're just -- the family member
 3 rule doesn't talk about reimbursement at all. It just
 4 talks about the sort of contract for campaign expenses.
             So the -- so if you think about it, what
 6 we're trying -- what we think the context is here for
 7 (F)(4) is, you know -- is, you know -- I mean, there's
 8 a fine difference, I suppose, but I think it is a
9 meaningful linguistic difference between payment and
10 reimbursement. Payment for services versus reimbursing
11 for expenses are not the same thing, at least under the
12 way that our rules treat them and certainly under the
13 way that our auditors treat them. So, for example, if
14 you -- our auditors can look and say, you reimbursed
15 for gas. That's -- that's going to be treated as a
16 reimbursement.
17
             I mean, we didn't -- I mean, we didn't
18 recapitulate the entire rule scheme here and -- or --
19 in terms of how every expense is accounted for between
20 the -- here, but -- so you have to sort of -- you don't
21 have to, but I'm urging you to take my word for it
22 that -- we could tighten it, and I think that's fair
23 game. What I -- what I -- but the premise that we're
24 operating from is that, you know, if you're -- if
25 you're paying for services from somebody, that is
```

#### Page 30 Page 32 1 different than if you're reimbursing them for gas that 1 just want to make sure. So when I look, then, at the 2 (5)(b) -- or, I'm sorry -- the (F)(5)(b), so 2 they use to, you know, run to the store because you 3 were at an event and they needed to go -- if you did 3 essentially it's only reimbursement to candidate's 4 spouse. So let's just focus on candidate's spouse, I don't know -- I mean, I don't know how much 5 because that's defined under family member. And 6 currently they, under (F)(4), would be allowed to have 6 reimbursement actually happens. I don't think a ton 7 anymore because it's -- the volunteer activities are 7 the provisions of goods and services. As long as it 8 mostly very clearly not contributions and there's --8 didn't exceed the fair market value, they could be 9 and there's lots of reasons why you wouldn't want to 9 paid; but now they will not be, a candidate's spouse? MR. COLLINS: Correct. 10 spend your money on that. 10 So the idea here was to try to -- try to find COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Okay. I think I just 11 12 a way to, again, not deal with the issue we're trying 12 wanted to make sure that I understood how that was 13 to deal with, which is a -- you know, the big payment 13 going to work. 14 to a -- to a spouse or spouse equivalent or house -- I 14 MR. COLLINS: Right. No, I mean -- yeah. 15 mean, for example, I mean, there are -- I mean, if you 15 Just to -- so, Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Werther, 16 -- I mean, there are all kinds of ways in which you can 16 right. So we wanted to carve out spouses and people 17 share living expenses, right. There's not just even 17 who are -- you're sharing your household expenses to 18 the relationship. This would mean if you are -- if 18 from the family member rule. The reason we're doing it 19 your son, who is a political consultant -- you know, if 19 with the notwithstanding clause is because spouse is 20 you all are in -- living together and sharing your 20 included in the family members. And we thought it was 21 expenses together, right, that counts, right. So that 21 easier to do it this way -- it may not be. It may not 22 -- so that's the bulk of what we're trying to get at. 22 be. But, I mean, we thought at least it would be So I think -- I guess if your real question 23 easier to do that rather than to go in and tinker with 24 -- I think -- I think I understand the question to be, 24 the family member definition, because the family member 25 does this exception eat the rule because it allows for 25 definition gets into who can give money and there's a

# Page 31

```
1 reimbursement. It would still have to be, I think --
                                                             1 bunch of other things that hinge off of that, so --
 2 from my perspective, we think that it would still have
                                                             2 potentially.
3 to -- it's supposed to be reasonable expenses otherwise
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: I have another comment.
 4 permitted under the Act. So it has to be a
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner --
 5 reimbursable expense under the -- under the -- under
                                                             5 Commissioner Paton.
 6 the Act or the rules and has to be reasonable.
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: So I would just ask
                                                             7 that, when we're giving these people classes on doing
             So that is a thing we can assess. We can --
8 we can -- we audit for that. We can say -- an auditor
                                                             8 this, that we have a series of proper examples and a
9 can say, your reimbursement of someone for going to
                                                             9 series of illegal examples --
10 pick up pizza -- let's say the pizza costs 10 bucks and
                                                            10
                                                                          MR. COLLINS: Sure.
11 you reimburse them for 30 bucks, right. That's --
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: -- so that we can -- so
12 that's why we think it's okay, because -- because we
                                                            12 we can address this with these people so we don't have
13 think that it has to be a reimbursement otherwise
                                                            13 so many people coming for penalize -- penalties and so
14 allowed, it has to be reasonable. And that, we hope,
                                                            14 on. I hate doing the penalties, but -- and if -- the
15 is clear enough to say that that's -- that's
                                                            15 more black and white it is, the easier for us to do.
16 distinguishable from a payment of, you know, thousands
                                                            16 But in their minds, so that we can go back and say,
17 of dollars for -- for campaign services.
                                                            17 look, we showed you these -- these two examples and you
             So it could -- could it be clearer? I mean,
                                                            18 were in the class, you signed off on this, so now --
19 I'm not saying it couldn't be. I mean, it could be. I
                                                            19 you know, and now you're pulling this.
20 mean, you know -- I mean, that's -- I'm certain that
                                                            20
                                                                          MR. COLLINS: Right. Right.
21 that's true, but I -- but I'm hopeful that the language
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: So I just think that if
22 is sufficiently clear to put folks on notice about --
                                                            22 we did something concrete like that --
23 that -- what's in and what's out.
                                                            23
                                                                         MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, so I
                                                            24
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: -- so we could try to
```

25 guess -- and it's really just for my understanding. I

25 make it more black and white to them --

```
Page 34
                                                                                                              Page 36
1
             MR. COLLINS: Yes.
                                                             1 they need to look at.
             COMMISSIONER PATON: -- then I think it will
2
                                                                         MR. COLLINS: Yes. Yes. I certainly -- so
 3 make all of our lives easier and then the public will
                                                             3 I'm putting that.
 4 think that everything is on the up and up, you know,
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other comments or
 5 which is -- a lot of this is what the public thinks
                                                             5 questions from Members of the Commission?
 6 about politics and elections, because we hear all these
                                                             6
                                                                          COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Mr. Chairman, I have
 7 extraneous things about how stuff is not on the up and
                                                             7 some questions.
 8 up.
                                                             8
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yes, Commissioner Crump.
                                                             9
                                                                          COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Thank you, Chairman.
9
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other comments or
                                                                          Director Collins, do -- do these proposed
10 questions on this issue for Tom?
                                                            10
11
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman.
                                                            11 restrictions exist for traditional candidates at
12
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther.
                                                            12 present?
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: I did have, I guess,
13
                                                            13
                                                                          MR. COLLINS: Not that I know of, no.
14 at least one. And as part of what Commissioner Paton
                                                            14
                                                                          COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Okay. And we -- we
15 is saying, I think -- and I recently had to do a
                                                            15 have -- we presently have -- a big part of what our
16 presentation explaining what notwithstanding clauses
                                                            16 Commission does and staff is we have an audit system to
17 mean, so maybe I'm just really sensitive to this right
                                                            17 look for inappropriate expenditures, right?
18 now. When I think someone who is looking at the
                                                            18
                                                                         MR. COLLINS: Correct.
                                                                          COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Okay. In doing just
19 funding reads (F)(4), they may think that they're able
                                                            19
20 to do something that is prohibited under (F)(5), but
                                                            20 kind of a quick search online about some of this stuff,
21 that's to that clarity, right, of making sure that they
                                                            21 I noticed a couple of interesting things, that there's
22 understand. And I don't know if it's helpful, and
                                                            22 a lot of variables that can go into this sort of action
23 maybe it's too redundant, but if we could put in (F)(4)
                                                            23 and analysis. For example, the FEC, I think just
24 like "except as provided in Subsection (5)," you know,
                                                            24 recently, it may have just been last year, allows
25 something to give them a clue that, oh, wait, it says
                                                            25 nonincumbent candidates for federal office, you know,
                                                 Page 35
                                                                                                              Page 37
1 you can do this, but there is actually a different
                                                             1 like Congress, to pay themselves a salary. And they
 2 prohibition.
                                                             2 did that because they believe that creates more
             MR. COLLINS: Sure. Yeah, that's -- so you
                                                             3 diversity and more access to office for less wealthy
 4 would -- I'm sorry. Mr. Chairman, so would you put
                                                             4 people.
 5 that -- something like in (4), like another -- an
                                                                          And I believe, if I'm not mistaken, if
 6 additional line that says something like for -- like do
                                                             6 Connecticut is also a clean elections participating
 7 we want to put this in (F)(4) or (F)(5)? Because I
                                                             7 state, they have this type of restriction and they made
 8 don't have any problem with doing --
                                                             8 it for any family member, and they have a full chart
9
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman,
                                                             9 that lays out all of the people that you could not do
10 Tom, I was thinking in (F)(4) --
                                                            10 this.
11
             MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
                                                            11
                                                                          So I'm just saying, there's a lot of ways
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: -- sort of a, yeah,
                                                            12 this could be sliced and diced, if that's what we chose
12
13 "except as provided in, you know, Subsection (5) of
                                                            13 to do; you've proposed one. I'm not a big fan of this,
14 this section," or however we --
                                                            14 as I think I mentioned during our last Commission
                                                            15 meeting, and I think the -- I'm concerned because I
15
             MR. COLLINS: Right.
16
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: -- want to word
                                                            16 think there's -- there could be quite a few appropriate
17 that --
                                                            17 and -- you know, appropriate expenses by a candidate
18
             MR. COLLINS: And leave the notwithstanding?
                                                            18 paying, for example, their spouse who might be a
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: -- and leave
19
                                                            19 printer, who might be a consultant, who might be an
20 everything else.
                                                            20 accountant, and all of a sudden now we have this
             MR. COLLINS: And leave the notwithstanding?
                                                            21 blanket prohibition on paying them for their services.
21
22
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Correct.
                                                            22 Whereas they might have been getting, you know, great
23
             MR. COLLINS: Yeah. Yeah. Okay. I'm --
                                                            23 services at a great price, now they have to go, you
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Just then it gives
                                                            24 know, out on the market, if you will.
                                                            25
25 like a clue that there's actually another provision
                                                                          And I -- so to -- so to have this blanket
```

## Page 38

```
1 prohibition to -- because of potential inappropriate
```

- 2 expenses or situations I think is sort of throwing the
- 3 baby out with the bathwater, to use that phrase. And I
- 4 think it's harmful and -- traditional candidates don't
- 5 have these restrictions, so I think it's harmful to
- 6 Clean Elections candidates to place these on them. So
- 7 I think we have an audit system in place to -- to watch
- 8 for inappropriate things, where it looks that
- 9 overpayments have been made and things like that. So I
- 10 wanted to share that -- those thoughts.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner. 11
- 12 Tom.
- MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner, 13
- 14 I -- I mean, I think that that's -- I mean, I certainly
- 15 think that that's all reasonable and I -- as a factual
- 16 matter, I certainly agree with you. I mean, this --
- 17
- I mean, for purposes of discussion at least,
- 18 right, which is what this is, I mean, we are -- what we
- 19 will do, just to sort of put this in some procedural
- 20 context, we -- if you were to approve this for public
- 21 comment, we would publish a notice in the
- 22 Administrative Register and, you know, we would have a
- 23 public comment period of at least 60 days and then we
- 24 would get comment and then we would come back.
- From my point of view and where to start, we

- Page 40
- 1 other proposals that are better, you know --Let me put it this way. We don't have to
- 3 start public discussion today either. I mean, if there
- 4 are other -- and we put this on the Agenda just in
- 5 case -- just to be clear to anybody who wanted to be
- 6 here that we might get directed to have additional
- 7 research done on additional proposals, so -- we don't
- 8 usually put it in, so we made -- we wanted to make sure
- 9 that everybody understood -- the public would
- 10 understand precisely what you're saying here, that we
- 11 might have direction to look at other things.
- 12 So I'm happy to take that direction and, you
- 13 know, it's really up to you all how you want to -- how
- 14 you want to -- you know, how you want to address that.
- 15 I don't have a -- I don't have a -- I don't have a
- 16 strong emotional commitment to the -- to the proposal,
- 17 although I did like my -- I did like my illustration.
- 18 Anyway, that's about -- but, you know, but everything
- 19 else, I take your point.
- 20 COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Mr. Chairman.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.
- 22 COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Director Collins, on
- 23 that point, since I've only been a Member for a short
- 24 while here, I'm just curious on the history of this.
- 25 Did the Commissioners ask you to come forward with this

## Page 39

- 1 definitely have -- I think we have to do the
- 2 recodification regardless. I think that that is
- 3 something that is just -- it just is going to keep
- 4 clean -- it's a clean-up issue, unless we can find a
- 5 better solution. But in the meantime, we have to start
- 6 that process.
- With respect to the merits of the proposal, I
- 8 mean, I think it sounds -- I mean, you all have a
- 9 discussion to have amongst yourselves as we get
- 10 feedback about that. I mean, my purpose here is really
- 11 to, you know, try to -- try to kick off the discussion
- 12 and have a proposal that I think we could work with and
- 13 that at least has some support with respect to other
- 14 programs.
- 15 But to your point, I mean, you know, yeah, I
- 16 mean, it is absolutely fair and within all of your
- 17 discretion to determine what you think the best
- 18 approach for the -- for the program is in
- 19 terms of how clean candidates are treated versus other
- 20 candidates. I certainly don't disagree with anything
- 21 you said. I just -- you know, we wanted -- we wanted
- 22 to start from a place where we were trying to, you 23 know, address the problem as we understand it, but
- 25 your decision ultimately. And happy to -- if there are
- 24 we're not married, as staff, to this. I mean, that's

- 1 proposal?
- MR. COLLINS: No. We divined, if you will --
- 3 from listening to the conversation we've had over the
- 4 course of the last several meetings, there was one
- 5 discussion about a rule that's pending that will be up
- 6 in November related to this problem of -- that we had
- 7 with several candidates stopping filing reports, right.
- 8 We had -- that was a problem we had come up with --
- 9 with a number of candidates. That was our initial
- 10 conversation.
- And during that process, I think, leading --
- 12 well, leading up to the rule proposal we made there and 13 then in that process we talked around this issue of
- 14 how -- how to address this -- this issue of where the
- 15 money goes, right. So they're two different issues.
  - We made a choice, as staff, the first
- 17 run-through to just focus on the reports, and so we
- 18 have a rule that will come back to you in November that
- 19 proposes to create a more teeth -- put more teeth in. 20 If you stop reporting, once you have been funded,
- 21 right, we will treat that more aggressively on the
- 22 front end.

16

- 23 So that's -- and as part of that discussion 24 and then the discussion last month we had around the
- 25 enforcement itself, you know, I -- you know, I -- no,

- $1\,$  this is -- this is initiated by me taking the input
- 2 that I've heard from everybody over the course of the
- 3 meetings we've had to try to address what I -- what
- 4 I -- I take to be a real policy issue that the
- 5 Commission -- that as a group there's interest in.
- 6 So, I mean, in that sense I -- so when I say
- 7 I don't have an emotional commitment on this, what I
- 8 mean is that, you know, I -- what I think we're
- 9 obligated to do, what we try to do as staff members is
- 10 hear what you all are saying in the meetings and try to
- 11 anticipate what policy direction you might be wanting
- 12 to move in and tee that up for a discussion so you all
- 13 can make decisions about it.
- 14 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: So, Tom, let me ask you one
- 15 other question before we talk about what to do.
- 16 There's been discussion nationally and statewide about
- 17 security --
- 18 MR. COLLINS: Sure.
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- for candidates. Is
- 20 security a reimbursable expense under our rules now?
- 21 MR. COLLINS: To the extent -- yeah. So,
- 22 Mr. Chairman, yes. So this is about what you can't do.
- 23 What you can do is things that are direct campaign
- 24 expenses. And so, you know, the test you would apply,
- 25 as we would for any number of expenses, would be, you

#### Page 44

- 1 They have said two things. One, they're not going to
- 2 look at a complaint related to security and spending
- 3 campaign money, period. So they don't care. They're
- 4 not -- they're -- and that's a -- that's
- 5 not necessarily a -- that's not necessarily a statement
- 6 of law. That's a statement of enforcement approach, if
- 7 that makes any sense, right. They're saying, don't
- 8 bring those complaints here. We don't want to hear
- 9 about them.
- 10 And then they say in the statement something
- 11 to the effect that paying for security is part and
- 12 parcel of every campaign, and therefore security
- 13 expenses, if you're a candidate, are all expenditures.
- 14 That has its own complicating factor in and of itself
- 15 because expenditures -- if it's an expenditure, it
- 16 can't be made by a company, it can't be made over
- $\ 17\ \ \$5,500$  for a statewide elected or for a -- as an
- 18 in-kind contribution.
- 19 So if they mean what they say there -- so
- 20 those are conflicting things. In other words, one
- 21 thing says, we're not going -- as a policy matter,
- 22 we're not going to look at these complaints, but as a
- 23 legal matter, these are all expenditures inherently.
- 24 If they're all inherently expenditures, that actually
- 25 makes it harder, if they mean that -- and I'm not sure

## Page 43

- 1 know, whether or not that security cost is associated
- 2 with the campaign and reasonable and therefore
- 3 appropriate. So this is a -- this is -- yeah. So we
- $4\,\,$  believe that security costs are -- there's no express
- ${\tt 5}\,$  authorization for security costs, but we believe that
- 6 the authorizations that exist for what you can spend 7 money on would include security costs already.
- 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And that would include
- 9 things like security upgrades to a residence, as well
- 10 as personal security? And do you feel like we should
- 11 spell that out, as I think the State has and the FEC
- 12 has?
- 13 MR. COLLINS: Well, so the Secretary of
- 14 State's Office and the FEC have said slightly different
- 15 things. The FEC has said something, I think, very
- 16 similar to what I have said, which is that you have to
- 17 be able to show a nexus between what you're -- the
- 18 campaign and the security costs you have. Now, if
- 19 there's a reason why your residential upgrades are --
- 20 have a nexus to the campaign, let's say that's your
- 21 campaign headquarters or you're doing events at your
- 22 home or et cetera, there is an argument there and I 23 think that we would look at that seriously.
- 24 What the Secretary of State's Office has said
- 25 is something a little bit -- a little bit different.

- Page 45
- 1 they do. If they mean that, that actually makes it 2 harder for traditional candidates to get that security
- 3 paid for, because it all has to be on the books, it all
- 4 has to be from an appropriate source at an appropriate
- 5 amount of money. And that actually makes it like more
- 6 complicated.
- 7 So I think that -- I think where the
- 8 Secretary comes out that matters for present purposes
- 9 is, we're not going to look at these at all. And I
- 10 think that's why, within our existing context, to
- 11 reference Commissioner Crump's point about the audits,
- 12 if somebody has an expense for security that we can
- 13 look at and we would scrutinize it, we would obviously
- 14 take into account the fact that the -- the enforcement
- 15 position of the Secretary is, we don't care about those
- 16 complaints, right, and we would look at it in view of
- 17 that.
- 18 But if we start to nail down -- if we were to
- 19 say that, for example, this is an expenditure that must
- 20 be paid with clean money, then -- then it's actually
- 21 making it harder for clean candidates, because if
- 22 it's -- if it's -- if it's not campaign, the clean
- 23 candidates can get the money from other places. It's
- 24 not an expenditure. You know, because we only deal 25 with expenditure -- contributions and expenditures.

```
So I hate to -- I know that's a complicated
answer, but it -- but it -- but what it's trying to get
at is, our approach, which -- and this does really
reflect what Commissioner Crump is saying about this
issue is, our approach generally is we look at are you,
```

- 6 as a candidate, making a reasonable business decision 7 with public money and that can withstand scrutiny of
- 8 our -- of our office. That's our way of looking at it. 9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. So, Tom, correct me
- 10 on this. It seems like we can go one of a number of
- 11 different directions. We can say we will circulate
- 12 this as amended with the language that you and
- 13 Commissioner Werther agreed upon. We can circulate
- 14 it -- we can say we want to discuss it more.
- 15 Commissioner Crump brought up a couple of concerns.
- 16 What -- what would be the best guidance to you of where
- 17 we go from here?
- 18 MR. COLLINS: Well, I think -- Mr. Chairman,
- 19 I think a couple things. I think -- I think -- I'm
- 20 happy to, you know, separately get together with
- 21 Commissioner Crump and we can talk about what we
- 22 might -- better hone in on the issue to make sure that
- 23 I -- you know, we have something to make -- to advance
- 24 that discussion at an additional meeting. And I'm
- 25 happy to do that.

#### Page 48

Page 49

- 1 me -- in just hearing what you all are saying, that, to 2 me, is the choice.
- 3 702 (F)(1) through (4) is the -- is the
- 4 status quo. We are recapitulating the status quo and
- 5 making sure that that -- we are fixing this -- this
- 6 codification glitch.
- 7 Adding (5), that's the new stuff, and it --
- 8 and this is the beauty of the notwithstanding clause --
- 9 and even people that -- yeah, I mean -- I, you know --
- 10 but is that it is like a pod, you can eject it, and the
- 11 rest of the -- the rest of the language stays the same,
- 12 so --
- 13 So that, to me -- based on listening to all
- 14 of you talk about this, that's really the question
- 15 right now is whether or not you want to -- if you're --
- 16 if you're not at a consensus or -- and you'll have to
- 17 vote on this, obviously -- but if you're not at a
- 18 consensus around what to do with (F)(5), there's no --
- 19 you could -- you could take that off here and we don't
- 20 lose anything in (F)(1) through (4) that's not an
- 21 existing rule.
- 22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Commissioner
- 23 Werther, do you want to make a motion? And I think
- 24 we've got to have some understanding that when we --
- 25 when this comes back to us or at some future point,

## Page 47

- 1 For present purposes, though, my -- I mean,
- 2 my recommendation would be, in part because I do want
- 3 to get the process of fixing this codification issue
- 4 done, I think it would be -- I think it would be good
- 5 to move ahead with this.
- 6 Now, that said, another way you could
- 7 structure it to address Commissioner -- and this is --
- 8 you all have to decide this, is you could advance
- 9 proposed 702(F) except (5), right. So the way (5) is
- 10 written, you can excise it, and everything else is
- 11 fine. You just get what was previously -- what was
- 12 previously codified, what we think -- you know, in,
- 13 right.
- 14 So that's -- so to sort of line this up, I
- 15 think for -- with respect to making sure that  ${\tt I}$
- 16 understand and am appropriately advising everybody and
- 17 assisting everybody, I can talk to Commissioner Crump,
- 18 if he's interested, I mean, about what we might do to
- 19 coordinate that. For discussion purposes of what we
- $20\,$  advance, the choice, it seems to me, that the four of
- 21 you have is do you do proposed 2-20-702(F)(1) through 22 (4) or do you do proposed 702(F)(1) through (5) with
- 23 the language -- with the additional language, "except
- 24 as provided, "you know, the additional language we
- 25 talked about with Commissioner Werther. So that, to

- 1 we've got to do something to address Commissioner
- 2 Crump's concerns, which I think are -- I agree with a
- 3 lot of them.
- 4 MR. COLLINS: Right. Well -- yeah.
- 5 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I guess
- 6 before I make a motion -- I mean, I understand the
- 7 concerns as well from Commissioner Crump, so I'm fine
- 8 excising (F)(5) at the moment, but I -- I think there
- 9 were legitimate concerns of why this was brought
- 10 forward, and I'm still not comfortable sort of having a
- 11 clean candidate basically pay somebody, you know, clean
- 12 money as what's happened recently. So I do still feel
- 13 like we need to address it at some point, but I'm fine
- 14 with that being reworked if Tom can talk with
- 15 Commissioner Crump. So, I mean, I'm fine with excising
- 16 (F)(5) for the moment to at least get the current rule
- 17 recodified, so I'm happy to make that motion.
  - So I just move to, I guess, approve --
- 19 MR. COLLINS: Well, it would be to circulate
- 20 for public comment 702(F)(1) through (4).
- 21 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: What Tom said, that's
- 22 the -- that's the motion.
- 23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. So Commissioner
- 24 Werther has moved that we circulate for public
- 25 comment --

18

	Page 50	5053				
1	COMMISSIONER WERTHER: R2-20-702(F) through		to seek or accept Clean Elections funding in any other			
2	(4), excising subsection (F)(5).	2	future election.			
3	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second to that?		3 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.			
4	COMMISSIONER CRUMP: I'll second that.		4 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any comments or			
5	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you,		5 questions from any Member of the Commission on this			
6	Commissioner Crump.		6 proposed conciliation agreement?			
7	So it's been moved and seconded that we		7 (No response.)			
8	I'm losing all my notes here that we circulate for	8	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Representative Abeytia, did			
9	public comment $R2-20-702$ , with the exception of $(F)(5)$ ,		9 you want to speak?			
10	and I will call the roll on that motion.	10	MS. ABEYTIA: Hello, can you hear me?			
11	Commissioner Werther.		CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yes, we can.			
12	COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.	12	MS. ABEYTIA: Oh, thank you. I just well,			
13	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.	13	for one, I want to apologize for not being in person.			
14	COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.	14	I have a 2-year-old. And I have been on Zoom with you			
15	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.	15	for most of this meeting, and it really would have been			
16	COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.	16	painful for all of us with my 2-year-old running around			
17	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.	17	in person. But I do not have childcare at the moment,			
18	It's approved 4-to-nothing.	18	so I just want to, one, thank you all for the option to			
19	That was painful. Thank you.	19	have Zoom available, because it does it does work			
20	Item V, discussion and possible action on	20	out for me and for my daughter. So, one, thank you.			
21	proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 25-02, Anna	21	Two, again, I just want to reiterate that I			
22	Abeytia, 2024 legislative candidate. The Executive	22	acknowledge that I wasn't responsible during the			
23	Director has recommended a conciliation agreement	23	election by reporting and I wasn't doing my part as far			
24	regarding Representative Abeytia. Tom will present his	24	as having communication with with Clean Elections			
25	recommendation and take questions.	25	even after, so and, yeah, I just I just want to			
	Page 51		Page 53			
1	Tom.	1	acknowledge my my lack of doing so and take			
2	MR. COLLINS: Mr Mr. Chairman,	١.				
3		2	accountability for that, so and since then I have			
	Commissioners, and Representative Abeytia is here, I	3	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to,			
4	Commissioners, and Representative Abeytia is here, I I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via	_				
		3	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to,			
4	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via	3 4	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from			
4 5	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that	3 4 5	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me			
4 5 6	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today,	3 4 5 6	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me			
4 5 6 7	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for	3 4 5 6	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks			
4 5 6 7 8	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through	3 4 5 6 7 8	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I			
4 5 6 7 8 9	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware			
4 5 6 7 8 9	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me. That's my recommendation to her.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher.  It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher.  It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I don't have much to add beyond what I what I said	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the Commission?  (No response.)			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher. It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I don't have much to add beyond what I what I said last time. And as I mentioned, the Representative is	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the Commission?			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher. It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I don't have much to add beyond what I what I said last time. And as I mentioned, the Representative is here via Zoom and available and but, you know, I	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the Commission?  (No response.)  (No response.)			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher. It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I don't have much to add beyond what I what I said last time. And as I mentioned, the Representative is here via Zoom and available and but, you know, I believe that this agreement has sufficient both financial penalties, the repayment order incorporated	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the Commission?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a motion to accept this conciliation agreement?			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher. It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I don't have much to add beyond what I what I said last time. And as I mentioned, the Representative is here via Zoom and available and but, you know, I believe that this agreement has sufficient both	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the Commission?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a motion to accept this conciliation agreement?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I move			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher. It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I don't have much to add beyond what I what I said last time. And as I mentioned, the Representative is here via Zoom and available and but, you know, I believe that this agreement has sufficient both financial penalties, the repayment order incorporated into it that for her, and also has a strong default	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the Commission?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a motion to accept this conciliation agreement?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher. It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I don't have much to add beyond what I what I said last time. And as I mentioned, the Representative is here via Zoom and available and but, you know, I believe that this agreement has sufficient both financial penalties, the repayment order incorporated into it that for her, and also has a strong default provision that, taken together, you know, make this	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the Commission?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a motion to accept this conciliation agreement?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 25-02.			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher. It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I don't have much to add beyond what I what I said last time. And as I mentioned, the Representative is here via Zoom and available and but, you know, I believe that this agreement has sufficient both financial penalties, the repayment order incorporated into it that for her, and also has a strong default provision that, taken together, you know, make this a an appropriate and, you know, reasonable public	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the Commission?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a motion to accept this conciliation agreement?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 25-02.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,			
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	I just want to say up front, I she is appearing via Zoom. I expressly said that that was I said that was the best idea. She has a childcare issue today, and coming down here with, you know sitting through that discussion, as edifying as it would have been for a kid, I think it was probably so that's on me.  That's my recommendation to her.  Anyways, we are back with the with an altered conciliation agreement. The major shift in terms is the stipulated fine is significantly higher. It is \$10,000. Everything else is the same. And so I don't have much to add beyond what I what I said last time. And as I mentioned, the Representative is here via Zoom and available and but, you know, I believe that this agreement has sufficient both financial penalties, the repayment order incorporated into it that for her, and also has a strong default provision that, taken together, you know, make this a an appropriate and, you know, reasonable public settlement.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	been in communication with Thomas and just trying to, you know, figure out what we're where we go from here.  So I just want to thank you all for giving me the opportunity to be in this process. I know it sucks for you all, and I apologize for that. But, again, I just I want to make sure that you guys are aware that I am apologetic of of the situation.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Representative.  No apologies necessary for attending on Zoom. We're happy to accommodate you.  Any comments or questions from Members of the Commission?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a motion to accept this conciliation agreement?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 25-02.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.			

#### Page 54 Page 56 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: It's been moved and 1 develop the conciliation the last time we had a 2 reporting issue like this, so not a non-file, but an seconded that we approve the conciliation agreement in 3 MUR 25-02. I'll call the roll. 3 insufficient file. The fine was about a thousand Commissioner Werther. 4 dollars. So we think a \$1,500 fine is appropriate. 5 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye. And like I said, this is a novel approach for 6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. 6 us. You know, again, what we're trying to do here both 7 COMMISSIONER PATON: Ave. 7 with -- how we've gone about it with Representative 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump. 8 Abeytia in terms of her not running clean. What we're 9 COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye. 9 doing here with Roberts is another novel approach, CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. 10 which is the -- we will -- if you're going to do this 10 The agreement is approved 4-to-nothing. 11 again, because he is going to run clean again, we are 11 12 Thank you for your time, Representative 12 going to say, you're -- you've got to -- you've got to 13 Abeytia. 13 provide us additional reports so that we know what 14 Item VI, discussion and possible action 14 you're doing. And we think that that will be -- now, 15 on proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05, 15 that's a little more work for us, but we think in the 16 Frank Roberts. 16 long run it's a better -- it's an appropriate approach. 17 Tom. 17 We think had we just switched over and said, MR. COLLINS: Yes. So, Commissioners --18 okay, pay the fine and just go on, without any 19 additional monitoring, I think that would have been --19 Mr. Chairman, Commissioners, and I think -- I don't --20 I'm not sure -- I don't believe Mr. Roberts is going to 20 I think that would have been -- that would be -- that 21 be here, but he did submit a written statement. 21 would have been too difficult for us to -- that would 22 I -- I think that -- so this candidate's 22 have left this hanging, right. We really wanted to 23 situation is slightly different. They filed reports, 23 have that additional monitoring. And so that's what 24 but the reports were, you know, kind of -- well, were 24 we're -- that's what we proposed here. 25 woefully incomplete. We were able to get the candidate And we do think that the candidate recognizes Page 57 Page 55 1 engaged with our auditors; I did file a complaint to 1 that. We think that, you know -- again, attendance

l	
2	prompt that ahead of that. The process has been slow,
3	but steady. And so we are now at a place you have the
4	audit report. The audit report, you know, demonstrates
5	that there's no substantial issues with the actual
6	expenditures. The candidate has agreed to hear
7	again, there's a distinction here because of the
8	responsiveness and because there were reports, albeit
9	reports that were not sufficient.
10	The thought here is that we would have this
11	candidate essentially on a form of probation, where
12	they're filing filing additional reports with staff
13	so that we can check in with them, rather in
14	addition to the reports they're required to file, and
15	that there and that there be a fine there as well.
16	So so that is the that is we think
17	that that you know, we are trying, as we talked $\ensuremath{I}$
18	spent a lot of time on this last time. I don't want to
19	recapitulate all my the thoughts we tried to put in
20	this. But what we're trying to do here is find a fair
21	outcome that takes into account, you know, the conduct
22	differences among not just this case, but not just
23	this set of cases this year, but the cases over time.
24	The last time we had a similar I looked at
1	

 $2\,\,$  here -- some of the -- most of the candidates have 3 other things and our schedule is fixed. Again, I don't 4 take anything -- I personally, you know, am not -- have 5 not been -- you know, I thought having the letter would 6 be sufficient. I mean, so I'm not -- I'm not as -- I'm 7 not as concerned about that, although I know it's a concern for Commissioners. So that's it. I guess I'll leave it there. 10 We think this is a fair resolution that -- consistent 11 with other -- in other settlements we've done on the 12 issue of not failure to file, but failure to 13 sufficiently report within the filing. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Tom. 14 15 Are there any questions or comments from 16 Members of the Commission? 17 COMMISSIONER PATON: I guess I have a 18 question, comment. 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. 20 COMMISSIONER PATON: In the -- we haven't had 21 these issues, that I can remember, in the seven or 22 eight years that I've been doing this. Is there some confusion in the classes that they don't understand that they have responsibilities to turn stuff in? I

this and, in fact, it's the very document I used to

25 don't understand what's going on here, I guess.

#### Page 58 MR. COLLINS: Well, Mr. Chairman, 1 reason for default if he stopped doing his monthly 2 Commissioner, I mean, the rule we have coming up in 2 reports. 3 November for final approval is a rule that says that if And then I also just wanted to clarify, 4 you didn't understand this going through, you didn't 4 because on the last page on Section 21 it says that 5 understand it when you read it from the Secretary of 5 these matters are terminated once completion of the 6 State's materials, you didn't understand it when you 6 requirements. So are we thinking completion of the 7 read it in our materials, you didn't understand it when 7 requirements is going to just be extended because of 8 Mike told you, and you didn't understand any of that, that reporting requirement, or is it --MR. COLLINS: Let me look. 9 if you don't file a report within five days after --10 when you have a report due and you've been funded, 10 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: -- when the fine is 11 we're going to initiate a repayment order. So that's 11 due? 12 the rule that will be up for a vote in November. 12 MR. COLLINS: Well, I mean, I would say this. So if there's some -- if there's some gap 13 Default, meaning would we collect the fines if they 14 that's been -- that's there, we think that that new 14 failed to -- default defined as would we go after more 15 rule, which says that when you get the notice from the 15 collection if he failed to file the report, that's 16 Secretary of State's Office that says you're late, you 16 right, we would not. We would -- we might -- I mean, 17 will also get a notice from us that says, and we're 17 we could probably demand specific performance. We 18 going to ask for the money back, that should be a 18 could -- you know, we could -- I mean, we could do --19 we could do some -- some -- I mean, they would be in 19 strong incentive for a clean candidate to file 20 promptly, you know, because it will be on the same 20 breach of contract. 21 calendar. So that's our goal, but we -- that's the 21 There's a -- difference being that, you know, 22 best way we can think of to try to put some teeth in 22 that because it's not a default, at least as I 23 beyond the fines that are there and stuff. We think --23 understand it, it would not mean we would immediately Because the issue here is, to your point, is 24 accelerate to an additional fine. But I don't know 25 to be on the front end of this, not on the back end of 25 that we would want to do that anyways. In other words Page 59

Page 61

```
2 there were two candidates who ran together, but their
3 cases are kind of separate. There were four candidates
 4 altogether in this boat. They are -- they are four
 5 different people. They're from different parts of the
 6 state. They're from different districts. They're from
 7 different backgrounds. They're from different parties.
8 I mean, there is no common thread that we've been able
9 to find
10
             I mean, we've had situations before where --
11 and this is true. We have had situations before where
12 we've had one treasurer do the same wrong thing in five
13 different candidate matters, right. And then we can
14 say, well, that's this, right. But we have not been
15 able to find anything that would relate these together
16 other than, you know -- other than, you know -- you
17 know, just a -- just -- I don't have -- so I don't have
18 an answer. But we do think that the rule -- going
19 forward, the rule we have up in November is designed to
20 address that, we hope.
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman.
21
22
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther.
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Tom, I just wanted to
24 get clarification about the extra report, so on Page 2
25 under (2)(b). So it doesn't look like that would be a
```

1 this. We have not figured out any common -- I mean,

```
{\tt 3}{\tt } the contract would mean that the contract was off and
 4 we could pursue that, it would just be -- we wouldn't
5 immediately accelerate. That's how I understand that.
6 You know, if that -- in other words, there are degrees
7 of -- of issue -- of issue here.
             I'm fairly confident that he's going to --
8
9 that he's going to do this. If, you know -- and if he
10 doesn't, he's in breach. And if he's in breach, then
11 the contract is breached and we would -- we just would
12 not accelerate the fines. We would have -- we would
13 have a process. But I think that recognizes the
14 difference between the financial and the reporting
15 issue, so -- I don't know. It's your -- it's your
16 decision, obviously. I think that that's a -- I think
17 that's a distinction with a difference.
18
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman -- so,
19 Tom, yeah, I'm just seeking clarification.
20
             MR. COLLINS: No. No. Of course. No. No.
21 T know
2.2
             COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah, especially on
23 the last. So let's say he pays all the fines, he pays
24 the $1,500, he's done. Is this agreement then
25 terminated, or is he still going to be required to
```

1 -- but they would be in breach, which -- what does that

2 mean in this case? It would mean that -- the breach of

	iic weeting				
	Page 62		Page 64		
1	report monthly?	1	COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.		
2	MR. COLLINS: He would not have completed the	2	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.		
3	requirements of the agreement.	3	COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.		
4	COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Okay.	4	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.		
5	MR. COLLINS: The it is it is perfectly	5	COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.		
6	reasonable, however, if you would like if you would	6	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.		
7	like to add in language. The way we could do this is	7	The motion is approved 4-to-nothing.		
8	in Paragraph 7 we could add in language that says, "any	8	Item VII, public comment. This is the time		
9	of the following," and then and then add, "(e)	9	for consideration of comments and suggestions from the		
10	Fails to" "fails to comply with any" "with any	10	public. Action taken as a result of public comment		
11	other provision of this agreement," and then authorize	11	will be limited to directing staff to study the matter,		
12	me to make that settlement with him with that term.	12	rescheduling it for further consideration, or		
13	And I would say, this is the this is the this is	13	responding to criticism. Please limit your comments to		
14		14	no more than two minutes.		
15	And then it's up to him if he wants to if	15	Does any member of the public wish to make		
16	he wants if that's a hangup for him. I suspect it's	16	comments at this time? There's no one here. Anyone on		
17	not, and I think that will be fine and because it's	17	Zoom wish to make comments?		
18	discrete, it seems like it would be discrete, I	18	(No response.)		
19		19			
	would I would be happy to take that back as a		CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, the public		
20	counteroffer, essentially, and say I'm authorized to	20	may also submit comments by e-mail at		
21	sign this under this condition and that's how we would	21	ccec@azcleanelections.gov.		
	do it.	22	Item VIII, adjournment. At this time, I		
23	COMMISSIONER WERTHER: I mean, Mr. Chairman,	23	would entertain a motion to adjourn.		
	it's more just for clarity, so you know, because if	24	COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chair, I move to		
2.5	obviously he doesn't file his reports, I just don't	25	adjourn.		
	Page 63		Page 65		
1	Page 63 want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following	1	Page 65 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,		
		1 2			
	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following		CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,		
2	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open $ \frac{1}{2} \int_{\mathbb{R}^{n}} \left( \frac{1}{2} \int_{R$	2	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner Werther.		
2 3 4	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.	2 3 4	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.		
2 3 4 5	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other	2 3 4 5	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.		
2 3 4 5 6	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?	2 3 4 5	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.		
2 3 4 5 6 7	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)	2 3 4 5 6 7	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e)	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Paton.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Paton.  It's been moved and seconded that we approve	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Paton.  It's been moved and seconded that we approve the conciliation agreement MUR 24-05 with an addition,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	want us to be in a weird limbo while he's not following it, but yet the fine is paid. And so I would be open to adding that that Subsection (e) to 7 if everybody else is okay with that.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other comments?  (No response.)  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther, do you want to make a motion that will include your addition?  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Yeah. Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the proposed conciliation agreement in MUR 24-05 with the addition of a new Subsection (e) under 7 on Page 3 that adds, under the default, that if the Mr. Roberts fails to comply with any other provision of this agreement.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Paton.  It's been moved and seconded that we approve the conciliation agreement MUR 24-05 with an addition, as as spelled out by Commissioner Werther, adding a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,  Commissioner Werther.  Is there a second?  COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I will call the roll.  Commissioner Werther.  COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.  COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Crump.  COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.  CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.  We are adjourned. Thank you.		

```
Public Meeting
                                                   Page 66
 1 STATE OF ARIZONA )
                      ) ss.
 2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA )
              BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings
 5 were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified
 6 Reporter of the State of Arizona; that the proceedings
 7 were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter
 8 transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that
 9 the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate
10 transcript of all proceedings had and adduced upon the
11 taking of said proceedings, all to the best of my skill
12 and ability.
13
14
              I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related
15 to nor employed by any of the parties hereto nor am \ensuremath{\text{I}}
16 in any way interested in the outcome hereof.
17
18
              DATED at Tempe, Arizona, this 27th day of
19 October, 2025.
20
21
22
                        Certified Reporter #50666
24
25
```

	<b>24-05</b> 54:15	achieving 23:11	<b>Alec</b> 7:6
\$	<b>25-02</b> 50:21 53:21 54:3	acknowledge 52:22 53:1	allowed 31:14 32:6
<b>\$1,500</b> 56:4	<b>25th</b> 3:18 4:1,4,13	<b>Act</b> 31:4,6	altered 51:12
<b>\$10,000</b> 51:14	<b>28th</b> 3:17 4:1,3,12	action 3:16 4:23 16:12	altogether 59:4
<b>\$48,000</b> 23:2,23		36:22 50:20 54:14	amended 46:12
<b>\$5,000</b> 24:25 25:9	3	Activate 8:1,7	amendment 16:12
<b>\$5,500</b> 44:17	<b>30</b> 31:11	activities 30:7	amount 7:6 45:5
<b>\$52,000</b> 23:1		actual 55:5	<b>analysis</b> 19:22 36:23
	4	<b>add</b> 51:15	<b>Anna</b> 50:21
(	<b>4-by-4</b> 19:2	Adding 48:7	anticipate 42:11
<b>(2)(b)</b> 59:25	<b>4-to-nothing</b> 50:18 54:11	addition 55:14	anymore 30:7
<b>(4)</b> 35:5 47:22 48:3,20 49:20 50:2	<b>4:00</b> 6:20	<b>additional</b> 35:6 40:6,7 46:24 47:23,24 55:12	apologetic 53:10
<b>(5)</b> 34:24 35:13 47:9,22	<b>4th</b> 6:3,9	56:13,19,23 60:24	apologies 53:12
48:7	6	address 10:18 16:16,20	<b>apologize</b> 52:13 53:8
<b>(5)(b)</b> 28:1 32:2	<b>60</b> 38:23	17:3,16 21:2 28:24 33:12 39:23 40:14 41:14 42:3	appearing 51:4
<b>(b)</b> 26:9	00 30.23	47:7 49:1,13 59:20	<b>apply</b> 42:24
<b>(F)(1)</b> 48:3,20	7	addressed 19:19	<b>approach</b> 39:18 44:6 46:3,5 56:5,9,16
<b>(F)(4)</b> 26:22 28:13 29:2,7 32:6 34:19,23 35:7,10	<b>702</b> 48:3	<b>addressing</b> 19:11 24:14	approached 20:15
<b>(F)(5)</b> 23:15 25:24 27:9	<b>702(F)</b> 47:9	administering 13:5	appropriately 47:16
34:20 35:7 48:18 49:8,16	<b>702(F)(1)</b> 47:22 49:20	administrate 17:24	approval 58:3
50:2,9	<b>7th</b> 3:18 4:1,4,13	administrated 9:15	
(f)(5)(b) 32:2		Administrative 16:13,22 38:22	<b>approve</b> 3:25 4:3,11 38:20 49:18 53:20 54:2
1	Α	advance 46:23 47:8,20	approved 4:22 13:12
<b>10</b> 31:10	<b>a.m.</b> 3:5	advising 47:16	50:18 54:11
	<b>Abeytia</b> 50:22,24 51:3	<b>affect</b> 9:16,25	<b>arbiter</b> 25:16,18
<b>10:00</b> 3:5	52:8,10,12 54:13 56:8	affiliated 13:24	<b>areas</b> 18:18,19
2	ability 21:19	Agenda 3:4 40:4	argument 43:22
<b>2</b> 59:24	absolutely 39:16	aggressively 41:21	arguments 20:7
<b>2-20-702(F)(1)</b> 47:21	accelerate 60:24	agree 38:16 49:2	<b>Arizona</b> 5:10,17 7:14 8:12 9:21,22 10:8,25
<b>2-year-old</b> 52:14,16	accept 52:1 53:17	agreed 46:13 55:6	16:12 23:10
<b>2024</b> 5:6 50:22	access 5:7 37:3 accommodate 53:13 account 18:25 23:17 45:14 55:21	agreement 50:21,23 51:12,18 52:6 53:18,20	<b>arose</b> 19:13
<b>2025</b> 3:5 4:4			assess 31:7
<b>2026</b> 8:15 9:14		54:2,11,15	assisting 47:17
<b>21</b> 60:4	accountability 53:2	agrees 51:25	attend 11:10
<b>21</b> 8:22 9:5	accountant 37:20	ahead 47:5 55:2 albeit 55:8	attendance 3:7 57:1
<b>411</b> 0.44 3.3	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		attended 8:6

October 23, 2025 Index: \$1,500..attended

October 23, 2025 Index: attending..Collins

attending 53:12 attention 11:8 attorneys 9:8 audit 31:8 36:16 38:7 55:4

auditor 31:8

**auditors** 29:13,14 55:1

**audits** 45:11

**August** 3:17 4:1,3,12 **authorization** 43:5

authorizations 43:6

Avery 8:1

aware 10:1 53:9

**aye** 4:15,17,19,20 50:12, 14,16,17 54:5,7,9,10

В

**baby** 38:3

**back** 10:7 33:16 38:24 41:18 48:25 51:11 58:18, 25

backgrounds 59:7

ballot 5:8 12:24

**base** 19:14

based 14:12 48:13

**basically** 12:12 18:1 19:7,15 22:6 23:3,23 28:6 49:11

bathwater 38:3

beauty 48:8

**begin** 20:12

beginning 27:7

Benson 23:9

**big** 12:23 30:13 36:15 37:13

Billy 25:9

**bit** 6:25 17:1 43:25

**black** 17:23 23:21 33:15, 25

blanket 37:21,25

**boat** 59:4

**Bob** 25:9

bombard 14:18

**bond** 6:23

**books** 45:3

breach 60:20

**briefly** 20:16

**bring** 19:19 44:8

broadly 9:6

brought 46:15 49:9

**buckets** 27:9,20

bucks 31:10.11

**build** 7:19

**bulk** 30:22

bunch 9:14 33:1

business 46:6

**busy** 10:4

**buying** 28:10

**buys** 18:11

С

calendar 58:21

**call** 3:4,5 4:13 9:25 10:9 12:3 50:10 54:3

called 10:8

calls 6:12

**campaign** 18:6,14 20:11 21:22 23:17 24:10 29:4 31:17 42:23 43:2,18,20,21 44:3,12 45:22

**candidate** 5:16 16:17 17:5 19:16 23:16,17,19 24:21 26:2,17 37:17 44:13 46:6 49:11 50:22 54:25 55:6,11 56:25 58:19 59:13

**candidate's** 19:16 23:18 26:2 32:3,4,9 54:22

**candidates** 5:14 9:20,23 16:14 20:9 22:5,17 36:11, 25 38:4,6 39:19,20 41:7,9

42:19 45:2,21,23 57:2 59:2.3

Captain 8:1,7

capture 26:5

**card** 14:12

care 27:8 44:3 45:15

carve 32:16

**case** 8:25 9:1,17 23:25 40:5 55:22

cases 9:11 55:23 59:3

central 6:17 7:5

**cetera** 43:22

Chair 4:20 50:17 54:10

Chairman 3:2,13,23 4:2, 5,9,16,18,20 5:1 10:7,15 11:20,24 12:3,6,9,14 13:11,17,19,20 14:16,21, 25 15:7 16:5,9,11,24 22:10,19 23:12 25:15,19 27:5,23 28:11 31:24 32:15 33:4 34:9,11,12 35:4,9 36:4,6,8,9 38:11,13 40:20, 21 42:14,19,22 43:8 46:9, 18 48:22 49:5,23 50:3,5, 13,15,17 51:2,24 52:4,8, 11 53:11,17,19,22 54:1,6, 8,10,19 57:14,19 58:1 59:21,22

challenges 7:14

chance 7:15 8:23

**change** 13:12 21:20

27:14

changed 11:17

chart 14:7 37:8

check 23:2 25:9 55:13

childcare 51:6 52:17

choice 41:16 47:20 48:2

**choose** 10:19

**chose** 37:12

Circuit 9:1

**circulate** 8:3 16:19 46:11,

13 49:19,24 50:8

circulated 5:7

circumstance 19:13

**cited** 5:11

Citizens 3:6

**City** 8:5

claim 9:4

clarification 59:24

clarify 60:3

clarity 34:21

**class** 33:18

**classes** 33:7 57:23

clause 27:7 32:19 48:8

**clauses** 34:16

**clean** 3:6 5:18 7:20 17:5 19:24 20:5 21:16 37:6 38:6 39:4,19 45:20,21,22 49:11 52:1,24 56:8,11 58:19

clean-up 39:4

cleaner 27:16

**clear** 17:24 19:12 20:4 22:14,21 31:15,22 40:5

clearer 28:5 31:18

Clerk's 8:5

click-through 14:8

close 10:24

closer 9:13

clue 34:25 35:25

code 16:13,22 20:22

codification 47:3 48:6

codified 47:12

colleagues 13:5

collect 60:13

collection 60:15

**Collins** 5:1 10:14 12:2,5, 14 13:10 14:3,20 15:7,19, 22 16:1,10,24 22:18 23:4, 12 24:20,23 25:1,4,7,11, 18,25 26:4,7,12,15,19,25 27:5 28:4,16 29:1 32:10,

October 23, 2025 Index: comfortable..disappeared

14 33:10,20,23 34:1 35:3, 11,15,18,21,23 36:2,10, 13,18 38:13 40:22 41:2 42:18,21 43:13 46:18 49:4,19 51:2 52:3 54:18 58:1 60:9,12

comfortable 49:10

**comment** 16:20 21:6 33:3 38:21,23,24 49:20,25 50:9 57:18

**comments** 12:7 13:18 16:6 34:9 36:4 52:4 53:14 57:15

**Commission** 3:6,14 13:18 36:5,16 37:14 42:5 52:5 53:15 57:16

Commissioner 3:10,11, 12 4:2,6,8,10,14,15,16,17, 18,19 10:11 11:22 12:1,8, 9,10,15 13:8,11,19,20,21 14:24,25 15:1,8,17,20,23 16:2 22:19,20,23,25 23:5, 13 24:16,21,24 25:2,5,8, 13,15,16,19,20,21 26:1,5, 8,13,16,20 27:1,6,23 28:11,17 31:24 32:11,15 33:3,4,5,6,11,21,24 34:2, 11,12,13,14 35:9,12,16, 19,22,24 36:6,8,9,14,19 38:11,13 40:20,21,22 45:11 46:4,13,15,21 47:7, 17,25 48:22 49:1,5,7,15, 21,23 50:1,4,6,11,12,13, 14,15,16 53:19,23,25 54:4,5,6,7,8,9 57:17,19,20 58:2 59:21,22,23 60:10

**Commissioners** 3:8,18 16:25 40:25 51:3 54:18,19 57:8

**commitment** 40:16 42:7

**common** 59:1,8

**communication** 10:22 52:24 53:3

company 44:16

compensate 23:17

competition 18:22

complaint 44:2 55:1

complaints 44:8,22

45:16

complete 20:20

**completely** 20:18,19

completion 60:5,6

**complicated** 27:13 45:6 46:1

complicating 44:14

compromise 22:16

conceivable 18:19

concern 57:8

concerned 37:15 57:7

concerns 46:15 49:2,7,9

**conciliation** 50:21,23 51:12 52:6 53:18,20 54:2, 15 56:1

concrete 33:22

conduct 55:21

conference 9:7

conflicting 44:20

conflicts 16:17

confuse 10:10

confused 15:4,21 27:25

**confusion** 11:25 12:11, 20 13:22 14:22,23 57:23

Congress 37:1

Connecticut 37:6

consensus 48:16,18

considerable 7:6

consistent 57:10

constructive 15:16

**consultant** 17:14 30:19 37:19

**context** 13:16 16:15 29:6 38:20 45:10

continuing 7:10

contract 24:22 25:6 29:4

60:20

contribution 44:18

contributions 30:8

45:25

conversation 17:19

41:3,10

**cool** 8:9,20

coordinate 9:22 47:19

coordination 9:20

core 17:3,25 21:17

**correct** 25:4,7,11 28:16 32:10 35:22 36:18 46:9

**cost** 43:1

costs 31:10 43:4,5,7,18

counties 11:11

**counts** 30:21

county 8:13 10:20 20:9

couple 7:25 9:11 36:21

46:15,19

Court 8:25 9:3,18

coverage 12:16

**create** 41:19

creates 37:2

**Crump** 3:12 4:18,19 36:6, 8,9,14,19 40:20,21,22

46:4,15,21 47:17 49:7,15 50:4,6,15,16 54:8,9

**Crump's** 45:11 49:2

curious 40:24

**current** 6:22 9:21 17:4

26:10 49:16

**cut** 22:14

**cutoff** 17:25

cycle 5:9

D

**date** 7:9

daughter 52:20

days 38:23 58:9

deal 12:23 16:3 30:12,13

45:24

decent 22:9

decide 47:8

decision 39:25 46:6

decisions 9:14 42:13

default 51:20 60:1,13,14,

22

defined 32:5 60:14

**definition** 27:2,14 32:24,

delay 17:11

demand 60:17

Democratic 12:18

demonstrates 55:4

depending 15:9

depends 5:23

design 6:7

designated 14:1

designed 11:20 59:19

details 17:17

determine 39:17

develop 56:1

developed 22:6

diced 37:12

difference 22:21 29:8,9

60:21

differences 55:22

differently 24:12

difficult 20:13 56:21

direct 42:23

directed 40:6

direction 40:11,12 42:11

directions 46:11

directly 9:16 19:19 23:14

**Director** 36:10 40:22

**Director's** 4:24 16:7

disadvantaging 22:17

disagree 39:20

disappeared 20:22

50:23

October 23, 2025 Index: disclosed..future

disclosed 21:24
discretion 13:15 39:17
discuss 46:14
discussed 16:16
discusses 28:23
discussion 3:16,21 4:23
8:12 13:4 16:11 17:19
38:17 39:9,11 40:3 41:5,
23,24 42:12,16 46:24
47:19 50:20 51:8 54:14
discussions 16:14
disqualify 19:7
distinction 55:7

distinction 55:7 distinguishable 31:16 distribution 6:15 district 6:23 districts 59:6 diversity 37:3 divined 41:2 document 55:25 dollars 18:5 20:6,8 31:17

due 58:10 60:11

56:4

# Ε

easier 17:23 32:21,23 33:15 34:3
east 24:19
easy 14:10 22:11

edifying 51:8 education 8:17 10:17

eat 30:25

effect 44:11

effective 15:9

eject 48:10

effort 5:22 10:17 20:20

elected 44:17

**election** 5:9 6:2 8:14 10:21 14:17 23:6 25:10

52:2,23

**elections** 3:6 6:4,9,19 7:3,12,21 8:12 9:15 15:18 19:24 20:5 21:16 34:6 37:6 38:6 52:1,24

**eligible** 5:8,18 28:22

emotional 40:16 42:7 encompasses 27:3

and 7:40.47:40.04:4

**end** 7:18 17:19 21:16 41:22 58:25

ended 17:22

**enforcement** 16:14 41:25 44:6 45:14

engaged 7:23 55:1

enterprise 23:20

entire 29:18

equivalent 30:14

**essentially** 6:9 19:13 32:3 55:11

event 8:4 18:11 30:3

**events** 43:21

examples 33:8,9,17

exceed 32:8

exceeding 26:24

**exception** 23:25 26:10 28:20 30:25 50:9

**excise** 47:10

**excising** 49:8,15 50:2

exciting 10:6

excuse 3:19 25:20

**Executive** 4:24 16:6 50:22

exist 36:11 43:6

existing 20:14 45:10

48:21

exists 21:8 28:20

**expenditure** 44:15 45:19,24,25

**expenditures** 18:14,15 36:17 44:13,15,23,24 45:25 55:6

**expense** 29:19 31:5 42:20 45:12

**expenses** 17:6,16 21:14 23:19 25:10 26:3,14 27:16 28:3,15,21 29:4,11 30:17, 21 31:3 32:17 37:17 38:2 42:24,25 44:13

expensive 15:9

**explain** 15:6 25:8

explaining 34:16

**express** 28:7 43:4

expressly 51:5

extended 60:7

**extent** 42:21

extra 59:24

extraneous 34:7

eve 15:14

# F

**fact** 9:22 20:10 22:7 27:11 45:14 55:25

factor 44:14

factual 24:7 38:15

failed 60:14,15

failure 57:12

**fair** 26:23,24 29:22 32:8 39:16 55:20 57:10

family 21:20 22:12 24:2,9 27:2,8,10,14,15,17,20 28:13,24 29:2 32:5,18,20, 24 37:8

fan 37:13

featured 8:18

**FEC** 36:23 43:11,14,15

**federal** 9:19,20 36:25

**feedback** 15:14 21:3 39:10

feel 43:10 49:12

felt 10:3

figure 14:8 20:24 53:4

figured 59:1

**file** 55:1,14 56:3 57:12 58:9,19 60:15

filed 54:23

filing 41:7 55:12 57:13

final 58:3

financial 51:19

**find** 6:18,22,25 7:21 20:23 30:11 39:4 55:20 59:9.15

**fine** 21:24 25:13 29:8 47:11 49:7,13,15 51:13 55:15 56:3,4,18 60:10,24

fines 58:23 60:13

finish 10:5

fiscal 7:14

fix 22:11

fixed 57:3

fixing 47:3 48:5

flag 21:7

focus 32:4 41:17

**folks** 6:11 7:3 11:3 12:21 18:23 31:22

forbidden 23:23

forget all 27:19

form 55:11

**formal** 20:17

**forward** 40:25 49:10 59:19

**Frank** 54:16

freedom 19:12

front 41:22 51:4 58:25

full 37:8

funded 41:20 58:10

**funding** 5:18,22 22:5 23:5,6 34:19 52:1

funds 16:13 20:11 23:16

future 48:25 52:2

G

**Galen** 3:11 **game** 29:23

**gap** 58:13

gas 28:6,9 29:15 30:1

general 6:2

generally 5:21 46:5

generate 11:8

genius 6:8

**Gina** 8:10 14:6 15:11

**give** 23:1 32:25 34:25

giving 33:7 53:6

glitch 48:6

**goal** 6:16 11:2 21:10 58:21

**good** 3:2 14:4 15:10 16:4 22:8,15 47:4

goods 32:7

government 8:14

governments 8:13

grab 14:10 graphic 6:7

great 8:4,6,15 37:22,23

group 8:19 42:5

**guess** 6:20 10:2,9 11:18 12:3,13 13:22 25:23 26:20 27:25 28:12,19,22 30:23 31:25 34:13 49:5,18 57:9,

guidance 46:16

**guru** 21:22

17,25

guys 53:9

Н

**Hall** 8:5

hanging 56:22

happen 18:17,19 19:3

happened 11:19 49:12

happening 6:4

**happy** 39:25 40:12 46:20, 25 49:17 53:13

**hard** 23:7

harder 44:25 45:2,21

harmful 38:4.5

hate 33:14 46:1

headquarters 43:21

**hear** 34:6 42:10 44:8 52:10 55:6

heard 42:2

hearing 3:23 48:1

helpful 15:12 34:22

**higher** 51:13

**highlight** 5:2,15 6:13 7:25 10:3 20:16

**highlighted** 6:15 7:11 9:10

highlighting 5:25 6:1

hinge 33:1

hire 21:19.22

hires 16:17

**hiring** 21:13

history 40:24

home 7:8 43:22

hone 46:22

hope 6:8 22:18 31:14

59:20

hopeful 31:21

house 30:14

household 17:14 18:4,5 21:14 23:19,23 24:3,9 26:3,18 27:4 32:17

**hub** 7:5

ı

idea 19:20 30:11 51:6

identified 15:13 22:14

24:7,8

identify 3:8

identifying 11:13

**II** 3:16

**III** 4:23

illegal 24:8 33:9

illustrate 17:1

illustrates 6:7

illustration 6:5 40:17

immediately 60:23

implementing 13:14

important 7:2,5 20:24,25

in-kind 44:18

inadvertently 14:1

inappropriate 36:17

38:1,8

incentive 58:19

include 27:15 28:14,25

43:7,8

included 18:8 32:20

includes 26:16 51:25

incomplete 54:25

incorporated 51:19

independent 5:10,17 10:9,12,25 12:22 14:2,18

15:6,25

independents 10:12

indicator 22:8

**individuals** 23:20 26:6

28:2

inevitably 18:4

**information** 6:4,11 7:1,

21

informed 7:24

**inherently** 44:23,24

initial 41:9

Initially 22:10

initiate 58:11

initiated 42:1

**input** 42:1

insufficient 56:3

intentional 11:23

interest 42:5

interested 5:13 47:18

interesting 5:4 7:16 11:5

36:21

intertwine 19:23

interview 7:13

involved 15:18

issue 6:23 9:23 10:20 11:10 13:2,8,13 16:19,21 19:11,19 20:18 23:13 24:6 30:12 34:10 39:4 41:13,14 42:4 46:5,22 47:3 51:6 56:2 57:12 58:24

**issues** 8:14 9:5,13 11:13 15:13 16:16 19:22 41:15 55:5 57:21

item 3:4,16 4:23 10:8 16:11 18:21 50:20 54:14

**IV** 16:11

J

Jurado 7:13

jurisdictions 6:3

Κ

kick 39:11

kid 51:9

Kimble 3:2,3,13,23 4:5,9, 16,18,20 10:7 11:20,24 12:3,6,9 13:17,20 14:16, 21,25 16:5,9,11 22:10,19 25:19 33:4 34:9,12 36:4,8 38:11 40:21 42:14,19 43:8 46:9 48:22 49:23 50:3,5, 13,15,17 51:24 52:4,8,11 53:11,17,22 54:1,6,8,10 57:14,19 59:22

**kind** 5:23 9:24 14:15 15:2 17:18,22 20:15,17 21:7,9 23:7 25:22 26:5,9,21 28:10 36:20 54:24 59:3

kinds 28:9 30:16 lose 48:20 27:2,14,15,17 28:14,24 29:2 32:5.18.24 37:8 Ν losing 50:8 40:23 52:5 nail 45:18 lot 13:15 14:21 34:5 36:22 members 3:14 5:2 10:12 37:11 49:3 55:18 Labels 5:6 10:8 nationally 42:16 12:18 13:18 21:20 22:12 lots 30:9 24:2 27:2,8,20 32:20 36:5 lack 53:1 **necessarily** 17:25 19:6 42:9 53:14 57:16 44:5 language 31:21 46:12 membership 27:10 M 47:23,24 48:11 needed 10:3 30:3 memo 17:17 late 58:16 made 5:22 37:7 38:9 40:8 news 5:11 41:12,16 44:16 mentioned 9:17 37:14 law 9:19 22:8 44:6 newsletter 6:15 51:16 **main** 8:11 lays 37:9 nexus 43:17,20 merits 9:4 39:7 Maine 19:14,15 22:4 lead 18:4 night 6:20,21 met 19:14 **major** 51:12 **leading** 41:11,12 Ninth 9:1 metrics 7:18 **make** 6:17 19:2 20:4 **leave** 35:18,19,21 57:9 non-file 56:2 25:22 28:5,18 32:1,12 mic 22:23 leaving 19:12 33:25 34:3 40:8 42:13 nonincumbent 36:25 Mike 58:8 46:22,23 48:23 49:6,17 north 24:19 **left** 21:19 56:22 51:21 53:9 **minds** 33:16 legal 9:13 44:23 **note** 26:10 makes 44:7,25 45:1,5 minutes 3:17,19,25 4:3, legislative 50:22 **notes** 50:8 12,21 making 7:8 22:1 34:21 45:21 46:6 47:15 48:5 Legislature 9:3 notice 15:2 31:22 38:21 minutia 24:17 58:15,17 Maricopa 14:6 legitimate 49:9 mistaken 37:5 noticed 36:21 **Mark** 3:2,13 let alone 15:23 mitigate 13:7 notwithstanding 27:7 market 18:20 21:23 23:9 letter 57:5 model 22:4 29:2 32:19 34:16 35:18,21 26:23,24 32:8 37:24 level 5:13,14 20:9,10 moment 49:8,16 52:17 marriage 21:15 **November** 6:3,9 41:6,18 life 15:24 money 17:6 18:1,2 19:24 married 39:24 58:3.12 59:19 21:17 30:10 32:25 41:15 lifestyle 23:6 43:7 44:3 45:5,20,23 46:7 materials 58:6,7 number 41:9 42:25 46:10 **limited** 28:12,13 49:12 58:18 matter 38:16 44:21,23 linguistic 29:9 **monitoring** 56:19,23 0 matters 8:22 23:6 45:8 listen 7:15 month 9:2 17:20 41:24 59:13 60:5 obligated 42:9 **listening** 41:3 48:13 monthly 60:1 Mayor 8:8 **October** 3:5,18 4:1,4,13 live 15:24 24:18,19 morning 3:2 meaning 60:13 office 8:5 11:11 36:25 lives 24:19 27:3 34:3 **motion** 3:24,25 48:23 37:3 43:14,24 46:8 58:16 meaningful 18:24 29:9 49:6,17,22 50:10 53:17 living 17:15 24:11 26:18 officials 8:14 10:21 meantime 21:4 39:5 27:15 28:15,21 30:17,20 **move** 4:2 42:12 47:5 online 36:20 meeting 3:5 4:3 11:10 49:18 53:19 local 5:13 6:3,19 37:15 46:24 52:15 open 17:21 moved 4:11 49:24 50:7 long 11:13 21:23 26:23 meetings 3:17,19,20,25 54:1 operating 29:24 32:7 56:16 4:12,21 15:11 41:4 42:3, **MUR** 50:21 53:20 54:3,15 opinion 9:2 longer 13:24 opportunity 9:4 53:7 meets 24:6 looked 17:17 55:24 opposed 25:3

member 5:17 13:23 24:9

option 52:18
order 3:4,6 51:19 58:11
ordinary 24:4
organization 5:12,23
outcome 55:21
overemphasizing 22:2
overly 19:11 22:1
overpayments 38:9
owned 23:20

Ρ

packets 3:20
paid 24:3 27:21 32:9 45:3, 20
painful 50:19 52:16
paper 28:10

part 6:16 10:16,17 11:2 12:22,25 14:1 16:3 24:9 34:14 36:15 41:23 44:11 47:2 52:23

participating 37:6

**parcel** 44:12

**parties** 5:20 9:22 10:9 59:7

Partnerships 8:11

**parts** 59:5

**party** 5:6,7,10,16,17 9:19 10:8,9,13 11:1 12:17,19, 23 13:24,25 14:2

passing 18:3

past 3:20

Paton 3:11 4:8,10,16,17 11:22 12:1,8,9,10,15 13:8, 11 14:24,25 15:1,8,17,20, 23 16:2 22:19,20,25 23:5, 13 24:16,21,24 25:2,5,8, 13,16 33:3,5,6,11,21,24 34:2,14 50:13,14 53:25 54:6,7 57:17,19,20

**pay** 19:17 20:5 21:20 22:12 23:19 24:24 37:1 49:11 56:18

paying 21:23 29:25 37:18,21 44:11

**payment** 29:9,10 30:13 31:16

penalize 33:13

penalties 33:13,14 51:19

**pending** 8:25 9:1 16:15 41:5

pens 18:11

**people** 10:11 11:12 12:3, 12,18 14:11 15:18 19:2 22:7 24:17 26:17 32:16 33:7,12,13 37:4,9 48:9 59:5

perceived 16:17

percentage 17:20,25 19:10

perception 17:10 18:2 21:12

performance 60:17

period 38:23 44:3

permission 19:8

permitted 31:4

**person** 6:21 17:15 18:3 21:13 23:7,18 24:1 26:2, 18 27:21 28:21 52:13,17

**personal** 17:6 21:17 43:10

personally 15:10 57:4

perspective 31:2

petitions 5:7

phone 6:12,20

**photos** 8:2,6

phrase 38:3

-

**pick** 31:10

picture 8:7

pin 23:7

**pizza** 31:10

**place** 6:17 12:17 21:19 38:6,7 39:22 55:3

places 7:20 45:23

pod 48:10

podcast 7:11,12

**point** 6:8 12:20 14:4,23 19:10 20:21 21:1,6 38:25 39:15 40:19,23 45:11 48:25 49:13 51:24 58:24

points 12:21

policies 20:12,14

**policy** 9:21 22:9 42:4,11 44:21

political 30:19

politics 34:6

position 21:13 45:15

possibility 18:25

possibly 15:20

potential 16:17 18:2 21:16 38:1

potentially 5:14 33:2

powers 9:5

**precisely** 20:23 24:14 40:10

premise 29:23

**present** 3:15 20:25 36:12 45:8 47:1 50:24

presentation 34:16

presented 16:22

presenters 8:11

presenting 8:10

presently 36:15

pretty 8:9 10:4 22:8

previously 47:11,12

price 37:23

primaries 14:18

**primary** 10:24,25 12:23 14:19 15:3

printer 37:19

probation 55:11

**problem** 17:2,9,10,12 18:1 19:5 23:14 35:8

39:23 41:6,8

procedural 38:19

**process** 11:16 39:6 41:11,13 47:3 53:7 55:2

program 39:18

programs 39:14

prohibit 28:2

prohibited 34:20

**prohibition** 26:6 35:2 37:21 38:1

prolong 14:17

prompt 55:2

promptly 58:20

Prop 8:22 9:5

proper 33:8

property 6:24

**proposal** 16:19 18:9 39:7,12 40:16 41:1,12

proposals 40:1,7

**proposed** 16:12 36:10 37:13 47:9,21,22 50:21 52:6 53:20 54:15 56:24

proposes 41:19

proposing 22:15

**prove** 24:2

provide 56:13

**provided** 34:24 35:13

47:24

**provision** 18:16 35:25 51:21,25

**provisions** 21:21 28:8 32:7

**public** 16:20 21:6 34:3,5 38:20,23 40:3,9 46:7 49:20,24 50:9 51:22

publicity 7:4 publish 38:21 published 20:22

pulling 33:19

purpose 39:10

purposes 20:25 38:17

45:8 47:1,19 recently 34:15 36:24 31:6 42:20 reports 5:11 41:7,17 49:12 54:23.24 55:8.9.12.14 pursue 9:4 run 21:16 30:2 56:11,16 56:13 60:2 recodification 39:2 **put** 15:1 17:20 22:23 run-through 41:17 Representative 50:24 recodified 49:17 31:22 34:23 35:4,7 38:19 51:3,16 52:8 53:11 54:12 running 52:16 56:8 40:2,4,8 41:19 55:19 recognition 8:16 56:7 58:22 S recognizes 56:25 Republican 12:19 putting 36:3 recommendation 47:2 request 12:24 salaries 19:20 50:25 51:10 Q require 11:3 salary 20:5 37:1 recommended 50:23 required 55:14 qualify 5:22 sale 6:24 record 3:9 **requirement** 19:14 60:8 Sam 3:12 question 24:15 27:24 redundant 34:23 30:23,24 42:15 48:14 requirements 60:6,7 scenario 24:7 57:18 reference 26:22 45:11 research 40:7 schedule 57:3 **auestions** 9:12 11:9 12:7 reflect 46:4 residence 43:9 13:17 16:6 20:1 34:10 **scheme** 29:18 Register 38:22 36:5,7 50:25 52:5 53:14 residential 43:19 scrutinize 45:13 57:15 registered 10:11 13:24 resolution 57:10 scrutiny 46:7 quick 36:20 registration 13:6 14:12 respect 16:16 39:7,13 search 36:20 quo 48:4 regular 12:21 15:23 47:15 **seconded** 4:11 50:7 54:2 quorum 3:15 reimbursable 18:12 31:5 response 3:22 6:10 16:8 **Secretary** 11:11 13:9,11 42:20 52:7 53:16 43:13,24 45:8,15 58:5,16 R responsibilities 57:24 reimburse 18:10 31:11 section 23:15 27:19 R2-20-702 16:13 50:9 reimbursed 18:9 28:6.7. responsible 52:22 35:14 60:4 9 29:14 R2-20-702(f) 50:1 responsiveness 55:8 **security** 42:17,20 43:1,4, reimbursement 26:11 5,7,9,10,18 44:2,11,12 ramifications 5:5 rest 48:11 28:2,22,24 29:3,10,16 45:2,12 ran 5:17 59:2 restate 21:11 30:6 31:1,9,13 32:3 seek 52:1 rare 23:25 reimbursing 29:10 30:1 restrict 18:23 **select** 10:25 11:4 rate 21:23 23:9 24:4 reiterate 52:21 restricting 9:19 sense 42:6 44:7 read 58:5,7 relate 59:15 restriction 37:7 sensitive 34:17 **reads** 34:19 related 41:6 44:2 restrictions 36:11 38:5 separate 59:3 real 8:23 11:8 13:2 17:11 relationship 16:18 19:3 result 9:1 separately 46:20 19:5 21:12 30:23 42:4 30:18 reworked 49:14 separation 9:5 reason 5:15 15:25 17:22 relevant 7:22 **Roberts** 54:16,20 56:9 18:17 32:18 43:19 60:1 **September** 3:18 4:1,4,13 remember 57:21 roll 4:13 50:10 54:3 reasonable 26:13 28:3 **series** 33:8,9 renamed 5:9 31:3,6,14 38:15 43:2 46:6 rule 17:23 18:8 21:1 23:15 services 29:10,25 31:17 51:22 repayment 51:19 58:11 24:5,8,12 25:12,23 29:3, 32:7 37:21,23 18 30:25 32:18 41:5,12,18 reasons 30:9 replaced 27:2 48:21 49:16 58:2,3,12,15 set 55:23 recall 5:5 59:18,19 report 4:24 16:7 55:4 sets 12:16 57:13 58:9,10 59:24 60:15 recapitulate 29:18 55:19 rulemakings 16:15

recapitulating 48:4

reporting 41:20 52:23

56:2 60:8

rules 16:21 28:8,22 29:12

setting 17:20

settled 18:6

talked 17:18 23:22 41:13

19 47:14 49:10 47:25 55:17 settlement 51:23 stop 41:20 **sounds** 39:8 talking 8:17 17:21 18:13 settlements 57:11 stopped 60:1 19:23 20:21 22:11 26:22 source 45:4 **share** 17:13,15 21:14 stopping 41:7 talks 29:4 26:3 30:17 38:10 speak 7:8 52:9 **store** 30:2 technical 6:23 16:21 **shares** 23:19 speaker 8:18 **story** 11:14 12:15 tee 42:12 **sharing** 28:15,21 30:20 speaking 9:6 20:3 Strategic 8:11 teeth 41:19 58:22 32:17 **specific** 9:12 60:17 strong 6:10 10:5 40:16 **she'll** 8:16 **Tempe** 8:2.5.8 specifically 19:20 51:20 58:19 **shift** 51:12 terminated 60:5 **spell** 43:11 structure 47:7 short 11:14 40:23 terms 29:19 39:19 51:13 spend 30:10 43:6 stuff 34:7 36:20 48:7 56:8 **show** 17:12 43:17 57:24 58:23 spending 22:16 44:2 test 42:24 **showed** 33:17 **submit** 54:21 spends 7:6 there'll 9:7 sign 12:11 **subsection** 20:21 26:8 **spent** 6:24 55:18 34:24 35:13 50:2 thing 5:3 6:1 14:15 20:25 **signed** 33:18 21:8 28:10 29:11 31:7 **spouse** 17:15 19:16 substantial 55:5 44:21 59:12 **significant** 22:12 23:2 23:18 26:2,17 27:4 28:15 30:14 32:4,9,19 37:18 **sucks** 53:7 significantly 51:13 things 5:2 7:25 9:24 11:12 14:5 17:4 18:10 **sudden** 37:20 **spouses** 22:12 32:16 signing 13:25 21:2 23:8 28:9 33:1 34:7 **square** 20:13 sufficient 51:18 55:9 36:21 38:8,9 40:11 42:23 signs 19:2 57:6 43:9,15 44:1,20 46:19 **staff** 16:18,20 36:16 39:24 similar 22:6 43:16 55:24 57:3 41:16 42:9 55:12 sufficiently 31:22 57:13 simpler 27:16 thinking 35:10 60:6 standard 24:4 supplies 28:10 sitting 51:7 thinks 13:25 34:5 **start** 19:23 27:15 38:25 support 39:13 **situation** 15:5 24:12 39:5,22 40:3 45:18 Thomas 53:3 supporting 18:5 53:10 54:23 started 22:10 thought 5:24 8:8,15,19 suppose 29:8 situations 38:2 59:10,11 20:1.2 22:8 27:16 29:1 state 5:14 6:18 7:14 8:13, supposed 31:3 32:20,22 55:10 57:5 **sliced** 37:12 25 9:2 13:9,12 17:4 19:2 20:8 37:7 43:11 59:6 **Supreme** 8:25 9:3,18 thoughts 38:10 55:19 **slide** 17:1,9 State's 11:11 43:14,24 surprised 12:25 thousand 56:3 slightly 43:14 54:23 58:6.16 suspect 13:14 thousands 31:16 slow 55:2 **statement** 44:5,6,10 switched 56:17 small 6:6 54:21 thread 59:8 system 36:16 38:7 throwing 38:2 statewide 42:16 44:17 smaller 5:20 7:3 **status** 48:4 tighten 29:22 solution 39:5 Т time 6:25 7:6 21:4 22:6 solve 17:10,13 **statute** 19:15 tactically 10:19 23:24 51:16 54:12 55:18, **stay** 14:14 **solved** 23:14 23,24 56:1 takes 55:21 **solves** 17:25 **stays** 48:11 times 28:23 taking 18:1 42:1 son 21:22 24:18 30:19 steady 55:3 tinker 32:23 **talk** 6:13 8:23,24 23:8 **steps** 13:7 **sort** 6:6 9:5,6,17 12:16 29:3 42:15 46:21 47:17 today 40:3 51:6

29:4,20 35:12 36:22 38:2,

stipulated 51:13

17:1,22 19:22,25 26:18,22

48:14 49:14

told 58:8

**Tom** 4:25 10:7 13:21 16:6, 9,23 25:21 28:11 34:10 35:10 38:12 42:14 46:9 49:14,21 50:24 51:1 54:17 57:14 59:23

tomorrow 8:10

ton 30:6 tool 14:8 topic 8:19

**totally** 22:20 **track** 21:4

traditional 36:11 38:4

**traditional** 36:11 38:4 45:2

transfer 23:22 treasurer 59:12

treat 29:12.13 41:21

treated 29:15 39:19

treating 28:19

treats 24:12

tribal 8:13

true 10:15 31:21 59:11

**Tucson** 24:19

**turn** 57:24

type 37:7

U

**U.S.** 7:15

ultimately 7:23 39:25

unclear 5:4

**understand** 13:6 23:7 30:24 34:22 39:23 40:10 47:16 49:6 57:23,25 58:4, 5,6,7,8 60:23

understanding 31:25 48:24

**understood** 25:22 32:12 40:9

ınfairl

unfairly 22:17 unserious 20:17 update 21:1

**upgrades** 43:9,19

uplifting 7:16

**urging** 29:21

utilized 19:24

٧

Valley 6:21

variables 36:22

vendor 16:18

vendors 18:18

versus 29:10 39:19

**VI** 54:14

view 21:1 23:15 38:25

45:16

violates 9:5

**visual** 14:10

**volume** 11:9

volunteer 30:7

**vote** 3:23,24 7:24 14:19 48:17 58:12

40.17 30.12

**voter** 8:17 10:17 13:5 14:12 15:6,24

voters 9:25

votes 4:20 50:17 54:10

W

wait 34:25

wanted 5:2,18 6:6,22 7:25 18:24 25:22 28:18 32:12,16 38:10 39:21 40:5,8 51:24 56:22 59:23 60:3

wanting 42:11

watch 38:7

ways 30:16 37:11

wealthy 37:3

website 6:5,11,17 7:9,21

week 5:9 8:2 9:8 11:10

Werther 3:10 4:2,6,14,15 10:11 13:19,20,21 22:23 25:15,19,20,21 26:1,5,8, 13,16,20 27:1,6,23 28:11, 17 31:24 32:11,15 34:11, 12,13 35:9,12,16,19,22,24 46:13 47:25 48:23 49:5, 21,24 50:1,11,12 53:19,23 54:4,5 59:21,22,23 60:10

West 6:21

**white** 17:23 23:21 33:15, 25

withstand 46:7

woefully 54:25

word 29:21 35:16

words 18:22 44:20 60:25

**work** 32:13 39:12 52:19 56:15

workable 22:9

working 7:7 25:23

works 24:10

**world** 11:8

worth 5:24 6:1

write 23:2

written 47:10 54:21

wrong 13:3 59:12

Υ

**year** 7:18 10:5,6,17 14:17 36:24 55:23

years 57:22

Ζ

**Zoom** 51:5,17 52:14,19 53:12