

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF VIRTUAL PUBLIC MEETING

Phoenix, Arizona

December 22, 2025

9:30 a.m.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
PO Box 513, Litchfield Park, AZ 85340
(P) 623-975-7472
www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

Reported By:
Angela Furniss Miller, RPR
Certified Reporter (AZ 50127)

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

<div>2</div> <div>1 PUBLIC MEETING, BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS</div> <div>2 COMMISSION, convened virtually at 9:30 a.m. on</div> <div>3 December 22, 2025, in the presence of the following Board</div> <div>4 Members:</div> <div>5 Mr. Mark S. Kimble, Chairman</div> <div>6 Mr. Sam Crump</div> <div>7 Mr. Galen D. Paton</div> <div>8 Ms. Christina Werther</div> <div>9 Mr. Steve Titla</div> <div>10 OTHERS PRESENT:</div> <div>11 Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director</div> <div>12 Paula Thomas, Executive Officer</div> <div>13 Mike Becker, Policy Director</div> <div>14 Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director</div> <div>15 William Richards, Richards & Moskowitz</div> <div>16 Samantha Fox, Richards & Moskowitz</div> <div>17 Cathy Herring, KCA</div> <div>18</div> <div>19</div> <div>20</div> <div>21</div> <div>22</div> <div>23</div> <div>24</div> <div>25</div> <div>Miller Certified Reporting, LLC</div> <div>www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com</div>	<div>3</div> <div>1 P R O C E E D I N G</div> <div>2</div> <div>3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning. I'm Mark</div> <div>4 Kimble, Chair of the Citizens Clean Elections Commission.</div> <div>5 It is 9:30 a.m. on Monday, December 22nd, 2025. I</div> <div>6 call this meeting of the Citizens Clean Elections Commission</div> <div>7 to order.</div> <div>8 With that, we will take attendance. Commissioners,</div> <div>9 please identify yourselves for the record.</div> <div>10 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Christina Werther.</div> <div>11 COMMISSIONER PATON: Galen Paton.</div> <div>12 COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Sam Crump.</div> <div>13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla? Are you</div> <div>14 with us?</div> <div>15 (No audible response.)</div> <div>16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I show you still muted,</div> <div>17 Commissioner Titla.</div> <div>18 (No audible response.)</div> <div>19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well we'll proceed and,</div> <div>20 Commissioner Titla, if you can hear us unmute yourself and</div> <div>21 let us know you're here.</div> <div>22 At this time we have four Commissioners here which</div> <div>23 constitutes a quorum. And I believe we have Commissioner</div> <div>24 Titla here, but we'll wait to resolve that.</div> <div>25 Item II. Discussion, possible action on Clean</div> <div>Miller Certified Reporting, LLC</div> <div>www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com</div>
<div>4</div> <div>1 Elections Commission versus Fontes; the Arizona Democratic</div> <div>2 Party versus Fontes; and the Arizona -- excuse me, and the</div> <div>3 Republican National Committee versus Fontes.</div> <div>4 The purpose of this meeting is to have an update</div> <div>5 from our attorneys and consider any recommendations they have</div> <div>6 related to the three cases that have been filed against the</div> <div>7 Secretary of State for his decision to attempt to rename the</div> <div>8 No Labels Party as the Independent Party.</div> <div>9 I also want to take a moment to focus on what the</div> <div>10 suits are about and what they are not about.</div> <div>11 The suits are about whether the Secretary had the</div> <div>12 authority or properly decided that the No Labels Party could</div> <div>13 rename itself in this ad hoc manner in the middle of the</div> <div>14 election cycle. The Secretary's attempt to make this change</div> <div>15 directly undermines the terms of the Clean Elections Act and</div> <div>16 rules, and the Commission's independent express authority to</div> <div>17 communicate with voters, contributors, and candidates.</div> <div>18 It will also cause deep confusion for voters and</div> <div>19 confound other election administrators' efforts to ensure</div> <div>20 2026 elections go off without a hitch.</div> <div>21 One doesn't have to think hard to imagine a close</div> <div>22 primary headed to a recount in which a number of voters</div> <div>23 either believe they were given the wrong ballot based on</div> <div>24 their party status or a mistake in affiliation.</div> <div>25 Those who minimize this risk are ignoring the</div> <div>Miller Certified Reporting, LLC</div> <div>www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com</div>	<div>5</div> <div>1 concerns of the vast majority of County Recorders and others</div> <div>2 who work in this area.</div> <div>3 Before we entertain a motion to go into executive</div> <div>4 session, I wanted to ask my fellow Commissioners if they have</div> <div>5 any comments or questions that our staff or our attorneys can</div> <div>6 answer in open session.</div> <div>7 Commissioners?</div> <div>8 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Yeah. Chairman?</div> <div>9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yes, Commissioner Titla.</div> <div>10 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Yeah, this is Steve</div> <div>11 Titla. I was on the phone calling in but I could hear you</div> <div>12 guys, but you could not hear me speak. So I ended the call</div> <div>13 and went on Zoom and now I can hear you. But I'm traveling</div> <div>14 back from the Valley up to San Carlos, so I'll be going</div> <div>15 through hills and mountains and so I may lose you here and</div> <div>16 there, but I'll -- I'll try to call again right away.</div> <div>17 Thanks.</div> <div>18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you,</div> <div>19 Commissioner Titla.</div> <div>20 And the record will show that we have all five</div> <div>21 Commissioners with us present.</div> <div>22 Any comments or questions for staff or attorneys</div> <div>23 before we discuss whether to go into executive session?</div> <div>24 (No audible response.)</div> <div>25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: If not, are there any</div> <div>Miller Certified Reporting, LLC</div> <div>www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com</div>

<p style="text-align: right;">6</p> <p>1 members of the public who wish to speak on this item?</p> <p>2 If you're on Zoom, please use the "raise hand"</p> <p>3 feature and state your first and last name for the record.</p> <p>4 (No audible response.)</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I don't see anyone.</p> <p>6 Cathy, do you?</p> <p>7 MS. HERRING: I do not.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay, thank you.</p> <p>9 Unless there -- there are further questions or</p> <p>10 discussions, I would entertain a motion to go into executive</p> <p>11 session.</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I move</p> <p>13 that we go into executive session for Item II.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner</p> <p>15 Werther.</p> <p>16 Is there a second?</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second. Paton.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner</p> <p>19 Paton.</p> <p>20 It's been moved and seconded that we go into</p> <p>21 executive session. I will call the roll.</p> <p>22 Commissioner Crump.</p> <p>23 COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther.</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">7</p> <p>1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.</p> <p>2 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.</p> <p>4 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The vote</p> <p>6 is five-to-nothing. We will go into executive session; thank</p> <p>7 you.</p> <p>8 MS. HERRING: Thank you. And Tom, can you</p> <p>9 please confirm who should participate in the executive</p> <p>10 session breakout room?</p> <p>11 MR. COLLINS: I think the Commissioners and me</p> <p>12 and Bill and Sam and Gina I think in case we need any</p> <p>13 expert...</p> <p>14 MS. HERRING: Okay. Thank you.</p> <p>15 (Whereupon the proceeding is in executive session</p> <p>16 from 9:36 a.m. until 10:03 a.m.)</p> <p>17</p> <p>18 * * * * *</p> <p>19</p> <p>20 (Whereupon all members of the public are present</p> <p>21 and the proceeding resumes in general session.)</p> <p>22 MS. HERRING: Chairman Kimble, if you are</p> <p>23 speaking you are on mute.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I'm sorry.</p> <p>25 We're back in regular session -- okay, we have all</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">8</p> <p>1 five Commissioners with us now. Thank you.</p> <p>2 Item III on our agenda is public comment. This is</p> <p>3 the time for comments and suggestions from the public.</p> <p>4 Please limit your remarks to items within the Commission's</p> <p>5 authority. Action taken as a result of public comment is</p> <p>6 limited by statute to directing staff to study the matter,</p> <p>7 responding to criticism or scheduling it for further</p> <p>8 consideration.</p> <p>9 Do I have anyone in person or on Zoom who wishes to</p> <p>10 comment?</p> <p>11 (No audible response.)</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I don't see anyone.</p> <p>13 Cathy, no one that you are aware of?</p> <p>14 MS. HERRING: Correct.</p> <p>15 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay, thank you.</p> <p>16 You may also send comments to the Commission at</p> <p>17 ccec@azcanelections.gov.</p> <p>18 Item IV, adjournment. Is there a motion to</p> <p>19 adjourn?</p> <p>20 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I move to</p> <p>21 adjourn.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner</p> <p>23 Werther.</p> <p>24 Is there a second?</p> <p>25 COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second. This is</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">9</p> <p>1 Paton.</p> <p>2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Commissioner</p> <p>3 Paton.</p> <p>4 It's been moved and seconded that we adjourn. I</p> <p>5 will call the roll.</p> <p>6 Commissioner Crump?</p> <p>7 COMMISSIONER CRUMP: Aye.</p> <p>8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Werther.</p> <p>9 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Did you say "aye,"</p> <p>11 Commissioner Werther?</p> <p>12 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: I did, yes. Aye.</p> <p>13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay, thank you.</p> <p>14 Commissioner Paton.</p> <p>15 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.</p> <p>17 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.</p> <p>19 We are adjourned. Thank you very much for your</p> <p>20 time.</p> <p>21 (Whereupon the meeting concludes at</p> <p>22 10:06 a.m.)</p> <p>23</p> <p>24</p> <p>25</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Miller Certified Reporting, LLC www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com</p>

STATE OF ARIZONA)
) ss.
COUNTY OF MARICOPA)

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

1	C	consider ^[1] - 4:5 consideration ^[1] - 8:8 constitutes ^[1] - 3:23 contributors ^[1] - 4:17 correct ^[1] - 8:14 County ^[1] - 5:1 criticism ^[1] - 8:7 CRUMP ^[3] - 3:12, 6:23, 9:7 Crump ^[3] - 3:12, 6:22, 9:6 cycle ^[1] - 4:14	G	manner ^[1] - 4:13 Mark ^[1] - 3:3 matter ^[1] - 8:6 meeting ^[3] - 3:6, 4:4, 9:21 members ^[2] - 6:1, 7:20 middle ^[1] - 4:13 minimize ^[1] - 4:25 mistake ^[1] - 4:24 moment ^[1] - 4:9 Monday ^[1] - 3:5 morning ^[1] - 3:3 motion ^[3] - 5:3, 6:10, 8:18 mountains ^[1] - 5:15 move ^[2] - 6:12, 8:20 moved ^[2] - 6:20, 9:4 MR ^[1] - 7:11 MS ^[5] - 6:7, 7:8, 7:14, 7:22, 8:14 mute ^[1] - 7:23 muted ^[1] - 3:16
10:03 ^[1] - 7:16 10:06 ^[1] - 9:22	candidates ^[1] - 4:17 Carlos ^[1] - 5:14 case ^[1] - 7:12 cases ^[1] - 4:6 Cathy ^[2] - 6:6, 8:13 ccec@azcanelections.gov ^[1] - 8:17 Chair ^[3] - 3:4, 7:5, 9:18 Chairman ^[4] - 5:8, 6:12, 7:22, 8:20 CHAIRMAN ^[25] - 3:3, 3:13, 3:16, 3:19, 5:9, 5:18, 5:25, 6:5, 6:8, 6:14, 6:18, 6:24, 7:1, 7:3, 7:5, 7:24, 8:12, 8:15, 8:22, 9:2, 9:8, 9:10, 9:13, 9:16, 9:18 change ^[1] - 4:14 Christina ^[1] - 3:10 Citizens ^[2] - 3:4, 3:6 Clean ^[4] - 3:4, 3:6, 3:25, 4:15 close ^[1] - 4:21 COLLINS ^[1] - 7:11 comment ^[3] - 8:2, 8:5, 8:10 comments ^[4] - 5:5, 5:22, 8:3, 8:16 Commission ^[4] - 3:4, 3:6, 4:1, 8:16 Commission's ^[2] - 4:16, 8:4 COMMISSIONER ^[18] - 3:10, 3:11, 3:12, 5:8, 5:10, 6:12, 6:17, 6:23, 6:25, 7:2, 7:4, 8:20, 8:25, 9:7, 9:9, 9:12, 9:15, 9:17 Commissioner ^[19] - 3:13, 3:17, 3:20, 3:23, 5:9, 5:19, 6:14, 6:18, 6:22, 6:24, 7:1, 7:3, 8:22, 9:2, 9:6, 9:8, 9:11, 9:14, 9:16 Commissioners ^[7] - 3:8, 3:22, 5:4, 5:7, 5:21, 7:11, 8:1 Committee ^[1] - 4:3 communicate ^[1] - 4:17 concerns ^[1] - 5:1 concludes ^[1] - 9:21 confirm ^[1] - 7:9 confound ^[1] - 4:19 confusion ^[1] - 4:18	December ^[1] - 3:5 decided ^[1] - 4:12 decision ^[1] - 4:7 deep ^[1] - 4:18 Democratic ^[1] - 4:1 directing ^[1] - 8:6 directly ^[1] - 4:15 discuss ^[1] - 5:23 discussion ^[1] - 3:25 discussions ^[1] - 6:10	H	
2		E	hand ^[1] - 6:2 hard ^[1] - 4:21 headed ^[1] - 4:22 hear ^[4] - 3:20, 5:11, 5:12, 5:13 HERRING ^[5] - 6:7, 7:8, 7:14, 7:22, 8:14 hills ^[1] - 5:15 hitch ^[1] - 4:20 hoc ^[1] - 4:13	
2025 ^[1] - 3:5 2026 ^[1] - 4:20 22nd ^[1] - 3:5			I	
9			identify ^[1] - 3:9 ignoring ^[1] - 4:25 II ^[2] - 3:25, 6:13 III ^[1] - 8:2 imagine ^[1] - 4:21 Independent ^[1] - 4:8 independent ^[1] - 4:16 Item ^[4] - 3:25, 6:13, 8:2, 8:18 item ^[1] - 6:1 items ^[1] - 8:4 itself ^[1] - 4:13 IV ^[1] - 8:18	
9:30 ^[1] - 3:5 9:36 ^[1] - 7:16			K	
A			KIMBLE ^[25] - 3:3, 3:13, 3:16, 3:19, 5:9, 5:18, 5:25, 6:5, 6:8, 6:14, 6:18, 6:24, 7:1, 7:3, 7:5, 7:24, 8:12, 8:15, 8:22, 9:2, 9:8, 9:10, 9:13, 9:16, 9:18 Kimble ^[2] - 3:4, 7:22	
a.m. ^[4] - 3:5, 7:16, 9:22 Act ^[1] - 4:15 Action ^[1] - 8:5 action ^[1] - 3:25 ad ^[1] - 4:13 adjourn ^[3] - 8:19, 8:21, 9:4 adjourned ^[1] - 9:19 adjournment ^[1] - 8:18 administrators' ^[1] - 4:19 affiliation ^[1] - 4:24 agenda ^[1] - 8:2 answer ^[1] - 5:6 area ^[1] - 5:2 Arizona ^[2] - 4:1, 4:2 attempt ^[2] - 4:7, 4:14 attendance ^[1] - 3:8 attorneys ^[3] - 4:5, 5:5, 5:22 audible ^[5] - 3:15, 3:18, 5:24, 6:4, 8:11 authority ^[3] - 4:12, 4:16, 8:5 aware ^[1] - 8:13 aye ^[11] - 6:23, 7:2, 7:4, 7:5, 9:7, 9:9, 9:10, 9:12, 9:15, 9:17, 9:18 Aye ^[1] - 6:25			L	
B		F	feature ^[1] - 6:3 fellow ^[1] - 5:4 filed ^[1] - 4:6 first ^[1] - 6:3 five ^[3] - 5:20, 7:6, 8:1 five-to-nothing ^[1] - 7:6 focus ^[1] - 4:9 Fontes ^[3] - 4:1, 4:2, 4:3 four ^[1] - 3:22	name ^[1] - 6:3 National ^[1] - 4:3 need ^[1] - 7:12 nothing ^[1] - 7:6 number ^[1] - 4:22
ballot ^[1] - 4:23 based ^[1] - 4:23 Bill ^[1] - 7:12 breakout ^[1] - 7:10			M	
			majority ^[1] - 5:1	
				N
				O
				P
				participate ^[1] - 7:9 Party ^[4] - 4:2, 4:8, 4:12 party ^[1] - 4:24 PATON ^[5] - 3:11, 6:17, 7:2, 8:25, 9:15 Paton ^[7] - 3:11, 6:17, 6:19, 7:1, 9:1, 9:3, 9:14 person ^[1] - 8:9 phone ^[1] - 5:11 possible ^[1] - 3:25 present ^[2] - 5:21, 7:20 primary ^[1] - 4:22 proceed ^[1] - 3:19 proceeding ^[2] - 7:15, 7:21 properly ^[1] - 4:12 public ^[5] - 6:1, 7:20,

8:2, 8:3, 8:5 purpose ^[1] - 4:4	statute ^[1] - 8:6 Steve ^[1] - 5:10 still ^[1] - 3:16 study ^[1] - 8:6 suggestions ^[1] - 8:3 suits ^[2] - 4:10, 4:11	8:9
Q		
questions ^[3] - 5:5, 5:22, 6:9 quorum ^[1] - 3:23	T	
R	terms ^[1] - 4:15 three ^[1] - 4:6 Titla ^[9] - 3:13, 3:17, 3:20, 3:24, 5:9, 5:11, 5:19, 7:3, 9:16 TITLA ^[3] - 5:8, 5:10, 7:4 TITLE ^[1] - 9:17 Tom ^[1] - 7:8 traveling ^[1] - 5:13 try ^[1] - 5:16	
raise ^[1] - 6:2 recommendations ^[1] - 4:5 record ^[3] - 3:9, 5:20, 6:3 Recorders ^[1] - 5:1 recount ^[1] - 4:22 regular ^[1] - 7:25 related ^[1] - 4:6 remarks ^[1] - 8:4 rename ^[2] - 4:7, 4:13 Republican ^[1] - 4:3 resolve ^[1] - 3:24 responding ^[1] - 8:7 response ^[5] - 3:15, 3:18, 5:24, 6:4, 8:11 result ^[1] - 8:5 resumes ^[1] - 7:21 risk ^[1] - 4:25 roll ^[2] - 6:21, 9:5 room ^[1] - 7:10 rules ^[1] - 4:16	U	
	undermines ^[1] - 4:15 unless ^[1] - 6:9 unmute ^[1] - 3:20 up ^[1] - 5:14 update ^[1] - 4:4	
	V	
	Valley ^[1] - 5:14 vast ^[1] - 5:1 versus ^[3] - 4:1, 4:2, 4:3 vote ^[1] - 7:5 voters ^[3] - 4:17, 4:18, 4:22 votes ^[2] - 7:5, 9:18	
S	W	
Sam ^[2] - 3:12, 7:12 San ^[1] - 5:14 scheduling ^[1] - 8:7 second ^[4] - 6:16, 6:17, 8:24, 8:25 seconded ^[2] - 6:20, 9:4 Secretary ^[2] - 4:7, 4:11 Secretary's ^[1] - 4:14 see ^[2] - 6:5, 8:12 send ^[1] - 8:16 session ^[11] - 5:4, 5:6, 5:23, 6:11, 6:13, 6:21, 7:6, 7:10, 7:15, 7:21, 7:25 show ^[2] - 3:16, 5:20 sorry ^[1] - 7:24 speaking ^[1] - 7:23 staff ^[3] - 5:5, 5:22, 8:6 State ^[1] - 4:7 state ^[1] - 6:3 status ^[1] - 4:24	wait ^[1] - 3:24 WERTHER ^[6] - 3:10, 6:12, 6:25, 8:20, 9:9, 9:12 Werther ^[6] - 3:10, 6:15, 6:24, 8:23, 9:8, 9:11 wish ^[1] - 6:1 wishes ^[1] - 8:9	
	Y	
	yourself ^[1] - 3:20 yourselves ^[1] - 3:9	
	Z	
	Zoom ^[3] - 5:13, 6:2,	