

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPTION OF VIRTUAL PUBLIC MEETING

Phoenix, Arizona
September 16, 2026
9:30 a.m.

By: Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR
Certified Reporter
Certificate No. 50666

**CERTIFIED
TRANSCRIPT**

Page 2	Page 4
1 VIRTUAL PUBLIC MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS 2 CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at 9:30 a.m. on 3 September 16, 2026, at the State of Arizona, Clean 4 Elections Commission, 1110 West Washington, Conference 5 Room, Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the 6 following Board Members: 7 8 Mr. Mark Kimble, Chairman 9 Mr. Galen Paton 10 Ms. Christina Werther 11 Mr. Steve Titla 12 13 OTHERS PRESENT: 14 Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director 15 Paula Thomas, Executive Officer 16 Mike Becker, Policy Director 17 Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director 18 Alec Shaffer, Web Content Manager 19 Bill Richards, Richards & Moskowitz 20 Cathy Herring, KCA 21 Baron Glassgow, Member of the Public 22 23 24 25	1 attorney for Risa Lombardo and Duwayne Collier. I 2 don't know that -- that Mr. La Sota is here. Are you 3 here, Mr. La Sota? 4 (No response.) 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there anyone else here 6 representing the plaintiffs in this action? 7 (No response.) 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. We will proceed, 9 then, without them. If they show up, we'll make every 10 effort to accommodate them. 11 We will take public comment specific to this 12 item. If you are a member of the public and wish to 13 make a comment, please use the raise hand feature in 14 Zoom and I will call on individuals one at a time. 15 When your name is called, please unmute yourself and 16 state your full name for the record before beginning 17 your comments. To raise your hand in Zoom, click the 18 react icon in the bottom toolbar and select raise hand. 19 Please note that the Commissioners may have 20 questions for you. We ask that each speaker identify 21 themselves for the record and limit their comments -- 22 limit their comments to two more -- excuse me -- to no 23 more than three minutes. Please keep your microphone 24 or phone muted until you are called upon to speak. 25 Does any member of the public wish to make a
Page 3	Page 5
1 P R O C E E D I N G 2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning. I'm 3 Mark Kimble, and I call this meeting of the Citizens 4 Clean Elections Commission to order. It's 9:30 a.m. on 5 September 16th, 2026. Today's meeting is being held 6 virtually. With that, we will take attendance. 7 Commissioners, please identify yourselves for 8 the record. 9 COMMISSIONER PATON: Galen Paton. 10 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Steve Titla. Good 11 morning. 12 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Christina Werther. 13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning. And I'm 14 Mark Kimble. We have four of the five Commissioners 15 here. We have a quorum. 16 Item II, review, consideration, discussion, 17 analysis, and possible action on authorization to file 18 a response on Lombardo, et al., versus Arizona Citizens 19 Clean Elections Commission, et al., 20 Number CV2026-037740, Arizona Supreme Court, Maricopa 21 County, filed September 10th, 2026. 22 The Commission is represented by independent 23 counsel Bill Richards and Samantha Fox of Richards and 24 Moskowitz. 25 First, we will hear from Mr. La Sota,	1 comment on this item? 2 (No response.) 3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I don't see anyone. 4 As indicated in the Agenda, the Commission 5 may vote to go into executive session for discussion 6 and consultation for legal advice with its -- with its 7 attorneys pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(3) and (4). 8 Only the Commissioners and the Commission's attorneys 9 will be permitted to attend any executive session. 10 With that, does any Member of the Commission 11 wish to make a comment or wish to make a motion to go 12 into executive session? 13 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I'd like 14 to make a motion to go into executive session for this 15 item. 16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, 17 Commissioner Werther. 18 It's been moved that we go into executive 19 session. Is there a second? 20 Commissioner Paton, I think -- 21 COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second. 22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, 23 Commissioner Paton. 24 Second -- it's been moved and seconded that 25 we go into executive session. I will call the roll.

Page 6	Page 8
1 Commissioner Werther. 2 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye. 3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. 4 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. 6 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. 7 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We will 8 go into executive session. 9 * * * * * 10 (End of executive session. Public meeting 11 resumes.) 12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: We are back in open 13 session. 14 Just one more call for anyone representing 15 the plaintiffs in this action. Mr. La Sota or anyone 16 else from his firm wish to make any comment? 17 (No response.) 18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. If not, do I have a 19 motion regarding Lombardo, et al., versus Arizona 20 Citizens Clean Elections Commission, et al., 21 Number CV2026-037740? 22 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chairman, I'd like 23 to move the Commission authorize and ratify the 24 engagement of -- and payment of the law firm of 25 Richards and Moskowitz to respond to the lawsuit filed	1 Please limit your comments to no more than three 2 minutes. If you are a member of the public and wish to 3 make a comment, please use the raise hand feature in 4 Zoom and I will call on individuals one at a time. 5 Anyone on Zoom wish to make a comment? 6 (No response.) 7 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing and seeing no one. 8 Action taken as a result of public comment 9 will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, 10 rescheduling it for further consideration, or 11 responding to criticism. The public may also submit 12 comments by e-mail at ccec@azcanelections.gov. 13 Before we adjourn, I hope you'll -- you'll 14 indulge me for a few more minutes. The past month or 15 so has been unusual and a trying time for all of us. 16 We have gone from holding monthly meetings to meeting 17 almost weekly for a variety of pressing legal matters, 18 so I wanted to take a minute to thank everyone who's 19 worked so hard to make this possible. 20 First, the staff at Clean Elections, Mike 21 Becker, Gina Roberts, Avery Xola, Alec Shaffer, 22 Paula Thomas, who has the impossible job of trying to 23 work with numerous schedules and calendars to make our 24 meetings happen, and especially to Tom Collins, who's 25 worked endless hours to deal with these complex legal
Page 7	Page 9
1 by Risa Lombardo and Duwayne Collier in Maricopa County 2 Superior Court Case CV2026-037740 and to defend the 3 Commission and its Members from the date of filing of 4 the lawsuit through the conclusion of the litigation. 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second? 6 COMMISSIONER PATON: Second. This is Paton. 7 COMMISSIONER TITLA: I second that, Chairman. 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton, did you 9 second that? 10 COMMISSIONER PATON: Yes. 11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. It's been moved and 12 seconded that we take steps to respond to this lawsuit 13 as outlined by Commissioner Werther in her motion. I 14 will call the roll. 15 Commissioner Werther. 16 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye. 17 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. 18 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla. 20 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye. 21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The 22 motion is approved 4-to-nothing. 23 Public comment. This is the time for 24 consideration of comments and suggestions from the 25 public. At this time, we will take public comment.	1 issues while enduring personal insults, spurious 2 comments just to do his job. 3 I also want to thank our legal team, Craig 4 Morgan, Bill Richards, Samantha Fox. These meetings 5 would not be possible without the dedication of Cathy 6 Herring, our electronic expert, working with Zoom and 7 YouTube, and Kathryn Blackwelder and Angela Miller, our 8 court reporters. 9 And finally, I want to thank my fellow 10 Commissioners, Sam Crump, Galen Paton, Steve Titla, and 11 Christina Werther. Each of you has upended your 12 already busy schedules to ensure that we have a quorum 13 for every meeting. Thank you. 14 I apologize if I've left everyone out. This 15 has been a very busy period, and we couldn't have 16 pulled it all off without each one of you. Thank you. 17 At this time, I would entertain a motion to 18 adjourn. 19 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Mr. Chair, I move to 20 adjourn. 21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, 22 Commissioner Werther. 23 Is there a second? 24 COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second. 25 COMMISSIONER TITLA: I second.

Page 10

1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla, second.
2 I will call the roll on the motion to
3 adjourn.
4 Commissioner Werther.
5 COMMISSIONER WERTHER: Aye.
6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
7 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Titla.
9 COMMISSIONER TITLA: Aye.
10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are
11 adjourned.
12 (End of recording.)
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Page 11

1 STATE OF ARIZONA)
) ss.
2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA)
3
4 BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings
5 were transcribed by me; that I was then and there a
6 Certified Reporter of the State of Arizona; that the
7 proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and
8 thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my
9 direction; that the foregoing pages are a full, true,
10 and accurate transcript of all proceedings had and
11 adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all to the
12 best of my skill and ability.
13
14 I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related
15 to nor employed by any of the parties hereto nor am I
16 in any way interested in the outcome hereof.
17
18 DATED at Tempe, Arizona, this 17th day of
19 September, 2026.
20
21 
22 _____
23 Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR
Certified Reporter #50666
24
25

	attorney 4:1	comments 4:17,21,22 7:24 8:1,12 9:2	electronic 9:6
(	attorneys 5:7,8	Commission 3:4,19,22 5:4,10 6:20,23 7:3	end 6:10 10:12
(4) 5:7	authorization 3:17	Commission's 5:8	endless 8:25
	authorize 6:23	Commissioner 3:9,10, 12 5:13,17,20,21,23 6:1,2, 3,4,5,6,22 7:6,7,8,10,13, 15,16,17,18,19,20 9:19, 22,24,25 10:1,4,5,6,7,8,9	enduring 9:1
1	Avery 8:21	Commissioners 3:7,14 4:19 5:8 9:10	engagement 6:24
10th 3:21	aye 6:2,4,6,7 7:16,18,20, 21 10:5,7,9,10	complex 8:25	ensure 9:12
16th 3:5		conclusion 7:4	entertain 9:17
	B	consideration 3:16 7:24 8:10	et al 3:18,19 6:19,20
2	back 6:12	consultation 5:6	excuse 4:22
2026 3:5,21	Becker 8:21	counsel 3:23	executive 5:5,9,12,14,18, 25 6:8,10
	beginning 4:16	County 3:21 7:1	expert 9:6
3	Bill 3:23 9:4	court 3:20 7:2 9:8	
38-431.03(A)(3) 5:7	Blackwelder 9:7	Craig 9:3	F
	bottom 4:18	criticism 8:11	feature 4:13 8:3
4	busy 9:12,15	Crump 9:10	fellow 9:9
4-to-nothing 7:22		CV2026-037740 3:20 6:21 7:2	file 3:17
	C	D	filed 3:21 6:25
9	calendars 8:23	date 7:3	filing 7:3
9:30 3:4	call 3:3 4:14 5:25 6:14 7:14 8:4 10:2	deal 8:25	finally 9:9
	called 4:15,24	dedication 9:5	firm 6:16,24
A	Case 7:2	defend 7:2	fox 3:23 9:4
a.m. 3:4	Cathy 9:5	directing 8:9	full 4:16
A.R.S. 5:7	ccec@	discussion 3:16 5:5	
accommodate 4:10	azcleanelections.gov. 8:12	Duwayne 4:1 7:1	G
action 3:17 4:6 6:15 8:8	Chair 6:7 7:21 9:19 10:10	E	Galen 3:9 9:10
adjourn 8:13 9:18,20 10:3	Chairman 3:2,13 4:5,8 5:3,13,16,22 6:3,5,7,12, 18,22 7:5,7,8,11,17,19,21 8:7 9:21 10:1,6,8,10	e-mail 8:12	Gina 8:21
adjourned 10:11	Christina 3:12 9:11	effort 4:10	Good 3:2,10,13
advice 5:6	Citizens 3:3,18 6:20	Elections 3:4,19 6:20 8:20	
Agenda 5:4	Clean 3:4,19 6:20 8:20		H
Alec 8:21	click 4:17		hand 4:13,17,18 8:3
analysis 3:17	Collier 4:1 7:1		happen 8:24
Angela 9:7	Collins 8:24		hard 8:19
apologize 9:14	comment 4:11,13 5:1,11 6:16 7:23,25 8:3,5,8		hear 3:25
approved 7:22			Hearing 8:7
Arizona 3:18,20 6:19			held 3:5
attend 5:9			Herring 9:6
attendance 3:6			

holding 8:16			result 8:8
hope 8:13	M	P	resumes 6:11
hours 8:25	make 4:9,13,25 5:11,14 6:16 8:3,5,19,23	past 8:14	review 3:16
I	Maricopa 3:20 7:1	Paton 3:9 5:20,21,23 6:3, 4 7:6,8,10,17,18 9:10,24 10:6,7	Richards 3:23 6:25 9:4
icon 4:18	Mark 3:3,14	Paula 8:22	Risa 4:1 7:1
identify 3:7 4:20	matter 8:9	payment 6:24	Roberts 8:21
II 3:16	matters 8:17	period 9:15	roll 5:25 7:14 10:2
impossible 8:22	meeting 3:3,5 6:10 8:16 9:13	permitted 5:9	S
independent 3:22	meetings 8:16,24 9:4	personal 9:1	Sam 9:10
individuals 4:14 8:4	member 4:12,25 5:10 8:2	phone 4:24	Samantha 3:23 9:4
indulge 8:14	Members 7:3	plaintiffs 4:6 6:15	schedules 8:23 9:12
insults 9:1	microphone 4:23	pressing 8:17	seconded 5:24 7:12
issues 9:1	Mike 8:20	proceed 4:8	select 4:18
item 3:16 4:12 5:1,15	Miller 9:7	public 4:11,12,25 6:10 7:23,25 8:2,8,11	September 3:5,21
J	minute 8:18	pulled 9:16	session 5:5,9,12,14,19, 25 6:8,10,13
job 8:22 9:2	minutes 4:23 8:2,14	pursuant 5:7	Shaffer 8:21
K	month 8:14	Q	show 4:9
Kathryn 9:7	monthly 8:16	questions 4:20	Sota 3:25 4:2,3 6:15
Kimble 3:2,3,13,14 4:5,8 5:3,16,22 6:3,5,7,12,18 7:5,8,11,17,19,21 8:7 9:21 10:1,6,8,10	Morgan 9:4	quorum 3:15 9:12	speak 4:24
L	morning 3:2,11,13	R	speaker 4:20
La 3:25 4:2,3 6:15	Moskowitz 3:24 6:25	raise 4:13,17,18 8:3	specific 4:11
law 6:24	motion 5:11,14 6:19 7:13, 22 9:17 10:2	ratify 6:23	spurious 9:1
lawsuit 6:25 7:4,12	move 6:23 9:19	react 4:18	staff 8:9,20
left 9:14	moved 5:18,24 7:11	record 3:8 4:16,21	state 4:16
legal 5:6 8:17,25 9:3	muted 4:24	recording 10:12	steps 7:12
limit 4:21,22 8:1	N	reporters 9:8	Steve 3:10 9:10
limited 8:9	note 4:19	represented 3:22	study 8:9
litigation 7:4	Number 3:20 6:21	representing 4:6 6:14	submit 8:11
Lombardo 3:18 4:1 6:19 7:1	numerous 8:23	rescheduling 8:10	suggestions 7:24
	O	respond 6:25 7:12	Superior 7:2
	open 6:12	responding 8:11	Supreme 3:20
	order 3:4	response 3:18 4:4,7 5:2 6:17 8:6	T
	outlined 7:13		team 9:3
			Thomas 8:22

time 4:14 7:23,25 8:4,15
9:17

Titla 3:10 6:5,6 7:7,19,20
9:10,25 10:1,8,9

Today's 3:5

Tom 8:24

toolbar 4:18

U

unmute 4:15

unusual 8:15

upended 9:11

V

variety 8:17

versus 3:18 6:19

virtually 3:6

vote 5:5

votes 6:7 7:21 10:10

W

wanted 8:18

weekly 8:17

Werther 3:12 5:13,17 6:1,
2,22 7:13,15,16 9:11,19,
22 10:4,5

work 8:23

worked 8:19,25

working 9:6

X

Xola 8:21

Y

Youtube 9:7

Z

Zoom 4:14,17 8:4,5 9:6