# THE STATE OF ARIZONA CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION 

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF SPECIAL MEETING

Phoenix, Arizona
August 22, 2017
10:33 a.m.

COASH \& COASH, INC.
Court Reporting, Video \& Videoconferencing 1802 North 7th Street, Phoenix, AZ 85006 602-258-1440 staff@coashandcoash.com

Prepared by:
LILIA MONARREZ, CSR, RPR Certificate No. 50699

| Pa | 10:34:54-10:36:10 Page 4 |
| :---: | :---: |
| SPECIAL MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at $10: 33 \mathrm{a} . \mathrm{m}$. on August 22, 2017, at the State of Arizona, Clean Elections Commission, 1616 West Adams, Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the following Board members: <br> Mr. Steve Titla, Chairman (Telephonic) <br> Mr . Mark S. Kimble (Telephonic) <br> Mr . Damien Meyer (Telephonic) <br> Mr. Galen D. Paton (Telephon <br> OTHERS PRESENT: <br> Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director <br> Paula Thomas, Executive Officer <br> Sara Larsen, Financial Affairs Officer <br> Mike Becker, Policy Director <br> Alec Shaffer, Web Content Manager <br> Stephanie Cooper, Executive Support Specialist <br> Kara Karlson, Assistant Attorney General <br> Nathan Arrowsmith, Osborn Maledon, P.A. <br> Lee Miller, AZ Secretary of State's Office <br> Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General <br> Jesus Rubalcava, Self (Telephonic) <br> Dustin Gardiner, Arizona Republic | 1 And -- <br> 2 CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Why don't -- why don't we go to that then. <br> MR. COLLINS: Yes. I think we should, and then I will preface this by saying that Mr. Miller from the Secretary of State's office is here. He has, I <br> 7 think, some comments respecting the executive director's report which we think it's -- because it's <br> 9 noticed for discussion, it's perfectly reasonable to <br> have him make those comments under this agenda item. <br> So before -- so with your indulgence, after <br> I present my end of the report, Mr. Miller -- I will <br> turn the microphone over to Lee Miller who is the <br> deputy Secretary of State who's present in the room, if that's okay with you, Mr. Chairman. <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Yeah. Okay yeah. That's good. <br> MR. COLLINS: Okay. With that, <br> Mr. Chairman, you've all, I hope, had an opportunity to <br> 20 review my executive director's report. As you know, <br> 21 we as staff or I as executive director felt the need to <br> 22 put you on notice that, you know, some changes have <br> 23 been made to the published Administrative Code that we <br> 24 were concerned about. In the 24 hours since that <br> 25 report was published and to be subject to your |
| PROCEEDING <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Why don't we call <br> this meeting to order. <br> Roll call. <br> MR. COLLINS: Commissioners, if you could <br> announce yourself for the record, that would be <br> helpful. <br> COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Galen Paton. <br> COMMISSIONER MEYER: This is Commissioner <br> Meyer. <br> COMMISSIONER CHAN: Commissioner Chan here <br> too. <br> COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mark Kimble. <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: This is Steve Titla here, <br> chairman of the board. <br> Do we have a quorum? <br> MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman, we do. <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Tom, I'm trying to <br> open the agenda on my computer here. <br> MR. COLLINS: Yeah. <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: But what's the next item <br> on the agenda? <br> MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, the next item <br> on the agenda is the executive director's report. | 1 discussion, we have had some -- a couple of exchanges with -- with the Secretary's office. You have in your 3 supplemental materials an email from Mr. Miller to me 4 and to -- to Ms. O'Grady, as well as a letter that 5 Ms. O'Grady sent to the Secretary's office yesterday. <br> 6 As I noted in the executive director's <br> 7 report, to the extent that this ends up being something <br> that we can't handle administratively, we will have <br> 9 more information on the legal front on August 31st; <br> 10 however, what I can tell you is that as an <br> 11 administrative matter, what I plan to do in working <br> 12 with Ms. O'Grady and Mr. Arrowsmith from -- from Osborn <br> 13 Maledon is provide some answers to the question that <br> Mr. Miller raised in his email. <br> Those don't, of course, set aside our -- <br> the concerns we noted in the prior letter, but <br> nevertheless, we welcome the opportunity to provide <br> Mr. Miller with further legal analysis and we do hope <br> to have this matter resolved or at least a better -- a <br> clearer or a sharper understanding of where we stand <br> before our August 31st business meeting. <br> 22 So that's -- that's really the highlights <br> 23 of the report and subsequent action since the report <br> 24 was filed. If you have questions for me, I'll take <br> 25 them now. Otherwise, I would turn it over to |


| 10:38:05-10:39:20 Page 6 | 10:41:29-10:43:20 Page 8 |
| :---: | :---: |
| Mr. Miller and then I'm happy to come back for further questions if you have any. <br> So with that, Mr. Chairman and <br> Commissioners, do you have any questions on what I've outlined in the written materials or what I've said here this morning? <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Any questions for <br> Mr. Collins? <br> (No response.) <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Commissioners? <br> (No response.) <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: If not, if we can go to <br> the next person, Tom. <br> MR. COLLINS: Yes, sir. <br> MR. MILLER: Mr. Chairman, members, my name <br> is Lee Miller. I serve as the Deputy Secretary of <br> State. Thank you very much for an opportunity to visit with you-all this morning. I will summarize the email that I sent to Tom and Mary O'Grady. <br> Simply put, in this particular instance, <br> the Secretary of State's office simply acts as a <br> printer of notices, of information, of reports, of <br> 23 proposals, of final decisions that we get from boards, <br> 24 commissions and state agencies. We have no legal <br> 25 authority over the content of what's in the code. We | 1 the code that goes forward, I will simply delete that 2 section which GRRC has noticed as expired, and that is 3 exactly what we did in this instance. We did nothing <br> 4 more, nothing less than we do with every single other 5 board, commission and agency. We follow strictly the 6 direction we get from GRRC. We follow strictly the -7 our statutory obligations, and we have in no way, shape 8 or form chosen a side, taken a position. Frankly, we <br> 9 believe we have no discretion in -- in the instance of 10 removing these two rules from the code. <br> 11 Now, I fully recognize that the Commission <br> 12 disputes whether GRRC has the authority to do that, <br> 13 whether GRRC had the authority to issue that notice, <br> 14 and we attempted to capture that dispute in an editor's <br> 15 note in the code. In the meantime, I am -- I believe I <br> 16 am bound by the statute in the absence of a resolution, <br> 17 a legal resolution to the Commission's -- GRRC's <br> 18 authority to declare those two rules expired, but <br> 19 having said that, know that in literally 60 seconds I <br> 20 can restore those provisions which were taken out of <br> 21 the code back into the code through the wonder of <br> 22 computers. <br> 23 And so just -- and we have asked the <br> 24 representative from the Attorney General's Office that <br> 25 represents that section of our office. Those attorneys |
| 1 simply -- to the extent we make edits, it's simply for <br> 2 form and format, but I have no legal authority to <br> 3 change the information sent over to us with the <br> 4 direction to print it in the Arizona Administrative <br> 5 Code. <br> 6 And, specifically, there is a statute which <br> 7 governs what our relationship is with the Governor's <br> 3 Regulatory Review Council, A.R.S. 41-1056. And as I <br> 9 highlighted in the email, it -- that statute <br> articulates a very specific process for the Secretary <br> of State's Office for the publications division of the <br> Secretary of State's Office to adhere to when we <br> receive notices from GRRC. <br> And so what we note that the -- the <br> Commission is attempting to resolve a jurisdictional <br> issue with the Regulatory Review Council: Does the <br> Regulatory Review Council have any authority whatsoever <br> over the Commission? And I earnestly look forward to a <br> rapid resolution of that question. In the meantime, I <br> 20 am bound by statute, and this Statute 41-1056 tells me <br> 21 at Subsection J that if I get a notice from GRRC that a <br> 22 rule has expired, number one, I will publish a notice <br> 23 that -- essentially, I will -- I will transcribe the <br> 24 notice from GRRC and put it in the register. <br> 25 I will after -- and in the next edition of | 1 are different than the attorneys that represent you-all <br> 2 at the AG's office and represent us on election <br> 3 matters, but we have asked them for legal advice. I <br> spoke with your attorney, Mary O'Grady, yesterday about <br> this particular matter and said literally one minute <br> after somebody gives me a legal rationale for getting <br> past the obligations that the Secretary of State has under 41-1056, those rules will go back into the code. <br> And so what I really wanted to leave you <br> with today is an assurance that we didn't choose a <br> side. We're not taking a position. We don't believe <br> one side or another is right or wrong in the Clean <br> Elections Commission's attempting to resolve the <br> jurisdictional issue with GRRC, but in the meantime, <br> I'm stuck with the statute. I'm stuck with the <br> commands and the notices I get from GRRC, and we follow <br> those as we would deal with any other board, commission <br> or agency of the state. <br> And with that, I'm available for any questions. <br> COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, this is <br> 22 Commissioner Chan. I wanted to thank Lee for coming to <br> 23 talk to us about this. <br> 24 I do have a question for you, Lee, but <br> 25 first, I would just like to make a comment. I mean, I |

recognize the role you're in doing these publications,
but saying that your office doesn't take a position or a side on this, I think is a little disingenuous just because I believe we're in this position because of some lobbying by your office. So I just want to make
6 that comment. And if I'm incorrect, you can -- you can
7 please feel free to correct me on the record.
8 But I was curious. It seems like there was
a little bit of a delay in making this change since
GRRC took their action, and I just wondered if you could go over why that was. I think the GRRC action took place -- I mean, it was at least a month ago, wasn't it? Does it always take this much to make such a change? Because I believe since there was no change we were under the impression that you guys were not taking a position and were leaving both of the rules in place while we kind of work this out.

MR. MILLER: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner
Chan, fellow members of the commission, the
Administrative Register and the Administrative Code are
not -- unlike, for example, the Code of Federal -- Code
of Federal Regulations and the Federal Register, unlike
23 those publications, those -- they are not things that
24 are issued daily.
25 They are issued roughly every couple of
weeks, and as articulated in the statute, first we had
to publish a notice that in the next edition of the code GRRC had identified these two particular rules as expired. And then when -- a couple of weeks after that when the next edition of the code actually was published, you have a version of the code absent those two rules. The code itself is generally published quarterly, but that timeline moves so that depending on
9 the even flow of regulation in the state of Arizona.
10 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Okay. Thank you for
1 that information.
12 I don't have anything further,
3 Mr. Chairman.
CHAIRMAN TITLA: Any other questions by the commissioners?

COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mr. Chairman, this is
Mark Kimble.
CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay, Mark.
19 COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: I would just say I've
20 got numerous questions. I've got some substantial
21 disagreements with what Mr. Miller said. I've got some
22 questions about what position we should take in
23 response to this unilateral action by the Secretary of
24 State's Office, but I think I'll hold all that until
25 the meeting on the 31st.

1 CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Okay, Mr. Kimble.
2 Any other questions by -- or comments by
3 the Commission?
4 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Actually, Mr. Chairman,
5 this is Commissioner Chan again, and this is actually a
6 question for Tom.
7 Just knowing -- I'm looking forward to
8 getting an AG opinion. I do have a question because of
9 the issues we had with GRRC and conflict issues,
10 whether the AG's office can even issue an opinion on
11 this, but I don't want to go too far afield. I just
12 want to throw that out there, Tom.
13 Do you have any comments on that?
14 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner
15 Chan, two thoughts, and I need to -- I want to go back
16 to -- so let me ask you a question and then I have a
17 secondary statement.
18 It is our view that the Attorney General's
19 Office because of the interagency conflict that has
20 spun out from first the Secretary's initial fore into
21 this area at GRRC and then GRRC's troublesome and
22 procedurally and constitutionally flawed process and
23 then this additional wrinkle that the Attorney
24 General's Office is probably not the appropriate office
25 to be advising the Secretary's office, but that's

10:49:26-10:51:03
Page 13
1 something that the Secretary and the Attorney General's
2 Office, I'm sure, will work out.
3 And I have confidence that the Attorney
4 General's Office, until I hear otherwise, will
5 recognize that those -- those -- those conflicts are
6 not severable -- or separable within the office at this
7 point and will appoint counsel for Mr. Miller.
8 With respect to Mr. Miller's point under
$941-1056(\mathrm{~J})$, that is the issue on which I plan to
10 administratively, working with our attorneys to address
11 because, in our view, with no disrespect to the many
12 attorneys who work -- as you know, not in attorney
13 capacities, but attorneys who work at the attorney --
14 at the Secretary of State's Office, it is quite clear
15 from the record that nothing in GRRC's order falls
16 under 41-1056(J).
17 And we will be working on a communication
18 to that effect administratively and we will let you
19 know what, if any, response we get to that, but suffice
20 it to say, that (J), which is highlighted helpfully in
21 Mr. Miller's email which is the first supplement to
22 your executive director's report, says if an agency
23 fails to submit its report, the following things
24 happen. Well, there is no set of facts in this process
25 where the agency, the Clean Elections Commission, has

Page 14
failed to submit its report.
2 And so the upshot is that we think that notwithstanding what I believe Mr. Miller is saying in good faith, we think he's -- we think that the analysis
5 that he's done or has been done is incorrect and
6 incorrect as applied to the facts and does put the
7 Secretary in a position where the Secretary's office is
taking action on a regulatory matter that is not a
statutory matter but is, in fact, a discretionary
10 matter.
And that is what raises and continues to
raise the contractual issue that sort of brings
together what had been two different tracts into one
relatively complicated, but still understandable
situation where we have certain obligations as the
Commission. GRRC had certain obligations it did not
fulfill and GRRC had certain actions that it did not
take, and Subsection J is not in play because there is
no -- the circumstance that is the predicate for that
statute, an agency failing to submit its report, has
never occurred.
And it's important just to not to go too
23 far afield for purposes of the limited discussion we
24 can have on this, but as you know, as a matter of
25 historical record, we have resubmitted reports to GRRC
time and again. And, in fact, we have a resubmitted
report pending with GRRC right this minute. So
3 Subsection J is not in play, and we'll be -- we will
4 try to articulate that in a more formal and legal way
5 to Mr. Miller for his aid in working through this
6 problem.
7 And that's what we're going to do
administratively, and our hope is that by the next
9 business meeting we will have -- we will have reached
10 some resolution on that, but that's all I have to say
11 at that point about that, unless you have questions.
12 CHAIRMAN TITLA: Any questions for the
13 director?
14 COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Galen Paton.
15 I'm just concerned that people involved in elections
16 and the public is totally confused by all of this. And
17 that -- and is that going to upset the next election
18 cycle and -- if we don't get this resolved?
19 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner
20 Paton, sort of keeping it to the executive director's
21 report context, I can say that that question in many
22 ways will be the question for us to answer in the
23 main -- at the business meeting on -- regular meeting
24 on August 31st. Our hope is based on the
25 administrative actions that I am taking in conjunction

1 with our attorneys, that at least with respect to the
2 code that is published by the Secretary of State's
3 Office, we may hit that off. There are other issues
4 that are beyond the scope of the executive director's
5 report that we will inevitably have to discuss on the
6 31st.
7 CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Any other comment?
8 Questions for Tom?
9 (No response.)
10 CHAIRMAN TITLA: If not, this item is up
11 for discussion and possible action.
12 MR. COLLINS: And, Mr. Chairman --
13 CHAIRMAN TITLA: Anything -- yeah.
14 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, we don't need
15 any action at this point. We think the discussion is
16 sufficient.
17 CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay.
18 MR. COLLINS: As staff. That's our staff
19 view.
20 CHAIRMAN TITLA: All right. So any more
21 discussion, commissioners?
22 (No response.)
23 CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. If there's no more
24 discussions, why don't we go to the next item then.
25 MR. COLLINS: Sure. Thanks.

10:55:19-10:56:42
Page 17
1 CHAIRMAN TITLA: Which is Number III,
2 discussion and possible action on MUR 17-01, Jesus
3 Rubalcava, including a proposed repayment order
4 submitted by the executive director.
5 Tom?
6 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Mr. Chairman, a
7 preparatory comment before we get into this. For this
8 matter, because it involves a repayment order, you have
9 outside counsel who is here from the Attorney General's
10 Office licensing division, whose name is Jeanne
11 Galvin -- am I saying that right?
12 So Jeanne Galvin is in the room in the
13 event that you have questions related to what I'm about
14 to say because I am acting in a capacity where I'm
15 asking for an enforcement order.
16 Mr. Rubalcava is on the phone. What I
17 propose is that I take a total of ten minutes to
18 present my case. I'd like to present the main case on
19 this issue in seven minutes and then reserve three or
20 so minutes for rebuttal as necessary. And you should
21 have received two things in the email from Ms. Thomas.
22 One is a PowerPoint that we are going to do in the
23 room -- and Mr. Rubalcava should have also received
24 that -- as well as a revised proposed order that
25 corrects -- that corrects a scrivener's error in the --

| 10:56:46-10:57:44 Page 18 | 10:58:33-10:59:49 Page 20 |
| :---: | :---: |
| that corrects a scrivener's error in the proposed order. <br> So the order that we are asking you to <br> approve is the -- is denominated the revised proposed <br> order and you received it via email, I believe, just <br> before the meeting started. I'm trying to confirm that <br> that happened. <br> MS. THOMAS: Yes, it did. <br> MR. COLLINS: Okay. So I would -- with <br> that -- with your permission, what I would do is I <br> would present my case. We would offer Mr. Rubalcava an <br> opportunity to present whatever material he wishes to <br> present via phone and then I would like to have a <br> couple of minutes for rebuttal, if that is amenable to <br> the Commission. <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Is that okay, <br> commissioners? <br> COMMISSIONER CHAN: That's fine by me. <br> Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Chan here. <br> Tom, just a quick question. <br> Is your PowerPoint going to go over why <br> we're here today just a week ahead of our regularly <br> scheduled meeting? <br> MR. COLLINS: My PowerPoint is going to go <br> over what we -- what we are planning to do. If you | 1 As you can see, it's entitled "Citizens <br> 2 Clean Elections Commission Executive Director <br> 3 Recommendation Repayment Order MUR 17-01, Jesus <br> 4 Rubalcava." So just to give you a very quick caveat <br> 5 about this PowerPoint, this PowerPoint is not designed <br> 6 to supplant the proposed order and exhibits -- the <br> 7 revised proposed order and exhibits you received, but <br> 8 rather to highlight the contents of the proposed order <br> 9 in order for you to understand where we're coming from <br> 10 and why we're -- why we think this is an appropriate <br> 11 course of action. <br> 12 As you know, rehearsing history, <br> 13 Mr . Rubalcava was first subject to a random audit and <br> 14 then subject to a comprehensive audit review of his <br> 15 entire campaign -- campaign. He was subject to a <br> 16 complaint that was filed by the executive director. <br> 17 The Commission has found reason to believe violations <br> 18 may have occurred, and the issue today is a proposed <br> 19 repayment order. <br> 20 As you know -- and this is important. The <br> 21 Clean Elections Act, apart from its other features, <br> 22 requires that the Commission shall ensure that money <br> 23 from the Fund is placed in candidate campaign accounts <br> 24 or otherwise spent as specified in this article and not <br> 25 otherwise. And the Commission has passed rules to |
| 1 have questions about -- about why we are doing this <br> 2 now, I'm happy to answer those. It's really up to you. <br> 3 If you'd like me to get through the -- get through -- <br> COMMISSIONER CHAN: Go ahead. Just -yeah. <br> MR. COLLINS: Okay. <br> COMMISSIONER CHAN: That's fine. I'm <br> sorry. I don't mean to delay it. <br> MR. COLLINS: Okay. <br> COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'll just -- I have no questions. <br> MR. COLLINS: Okay. And so I will -- <br> Mr. Chairman, with your permission, I'd like to begin <br> my presentation. And I have lost the clicker. So, <br> Stephanie -- <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Why don't we <br> proceed. <br> MR. COLLINS: Okay. So if you have the <br> PowerPoint -- <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Let me get your <br> PowerPoint open. <br> MR. COLLINS: You should have a PDF of the <br> PowerPoint, and then the public who is watching should <br> be able to see the PowerPoint and Mr. Rubalcava should <br> 25 also have a copy of the PDF. | 1 ensure that that happens, and among those rules are <br> 2 Arizona Admin Code 702(A) which states that a <br> 3 participating candidate shall use funds in the <br> 4 candidate's current campaign account to pay for goods <br> 5 and services for direct campaign purposes only. <br> 6 And Arizona Admin Code R2-20-703(C) states <br> 7 that any expenditure made by that candidate or the <br> candidate's committee that cannot be documented as a <br> 9 direct campaign expenditure shall promptly be repaid to the Fund with the candidate's personal money. <br> I would note -- this is not in the <br> PowerPoint, but in your materials at Exhibit 4 to -- or <br> Attachment 4, I should say -- Exhibit 4, rather, to the <br> proposed order, Mr. Rubalcava swore that he would -- <br> under paragraph 8 , that he had the burden of proving <br> that expenditures made by or on behalf of the candidate <br> were for direct campaign purposes. So that's in the <br> record and that's -- and that's something that's <br> established. <br> Rule 704(B) provides that the Commission <br> may determine that a participating candidate who has <br> 22 received payments from the Fund must repay the Fund <br> 23 under any of the following circumstances. There are a <br> 24 number of circumstances, and the one we're focused on <br> 25 here today for purposes of -- for purposes of -- well, |


| 11:01:09-11:02:30 Page 22 | 11:04:09-11:05:35 Page 24 |
| :---: | :---: |
| for purposes of clarity and alacrity, among other <br> things, is that use of funds not for direct campaign <br> 3 expenses, if the Commission determines any amount <br> 4 was -- was not -- was payment to an eligible candidate, <br> 5 it will notify the candidate of the amount so used, and <br> 6 the candidate shall pay to the fund an amount equal to 7 such amount. <br> So this is a -- what you see next is a <br> 9 screenshot from the comprehensive audit review which is Exhibit 2 to the -- Exhibit 2 to the main order. And there the most important language is that the candidate indicated he was unable to identify or locate any documentation supporting the deposits and withdrawals from the campaign bank statements. <br> Mr. Rubalcava himself in response to the audit stated that he was -- a reason why he was not able to provide that information, but he said that he accepts the report on findings as a way to acknowledge and learn from what was done incorrectly and he's "willing to accept the consequences of my wrongdoing <br> 21 and ask that the Commission allow me to take corrective <br> 22 actions in order to comply; whether this be repaying <br> 23 back any unaccounted monies and fees set forth by the <br> 24 Commission." <br> 25 So not only did Mr. Rubalcava sign in | I'll stand for any questions and then, as I said, I'd <br> like to reserve some time after Mr. Rubalcava speaks to -- to rebut, if necessary. <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Are there any questions <br> for the director? <br> (No response.) <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Is there a -- does <br> Mr. Rubalcava want to make a statement? <br> MR. RUBALCAVA: Yes. Thank you, Chairman and commissioners. <br> I do want to make a statement. So I did <br> receive the documents that the Executive Director <br> Collins sent out to you guys, and so in regards to <br> those specific -- what is being asked of, I think, in <br> my opinion, I disagree and I do believe it's unfair, <br> and here is exactly why. <br> I think that I -- if given -- if given the <br> time to do so, but when you're on 10 days or 14 days <br> and trying to submit some of this information -- the <br> district that I was representing is the second largest <br> 21 geographical district in the state, and it encompasses <br> 22 a lot of traveling and mileage. I actually could have <br> 23 easily driven through the state, through that part of <br> 24 the district of the state, to go and collect receipts <br> 25 of the businesses and the individuals that helped me |
| 1 Exhibit 4 an application where he stated that he had <br> 2 the burden to show that his expenditures were for <br> 3 direct campaign purposes. He then stipulated in his <br> 4 response to the audit that he was unable to show that <br> 5 and that he would, in fact, repay monies unaccounted <br> 6 for and take -- take corrective action as ordered by 7 the Commission. <br> 8 Our recommendation on repayment is that the <br> 9 repayment must be from personal funds, that it reserves <br> 10 expressly additional penalties pursuant to the acts and <br> 11 rules and continues our investigatory activities <br> 12 previously approved. Why is that important? Because <br> 13 as the first slide indicated, this is about securing <br> 14 the Fund against -- against expenditures that are not justified under the Fund. <br> There are additional penalties that we are <br> in the process of doing -- that may result from an <br> ongoing investigation that we are engaged in and we <br> 19 will continue to engage in. This order that we -- the <br> 20 revised proposed order expressly permits appeal by <br> 21 Mr . Rubalcava as permitted by Commission rules and <br> 22 requires repayment within 30 days. <br> 23 So that's really the upshot of it. We <br> 24 think that the revised proposed order is an appropriate <br> 25 action at this time, and we would ask you to do that. | 1 out through that campaign to re -- try to recuperate <br> 2 some of those receipts that were missing. <br> 3 A lot of the receipts were already included <br> 4 in that random audit because when they did the random <br> 5 audit, the first initial five random transactions that <br> 6 they asked for, they went ahead and changed them. So <br> 7 in other words, they asked for five random audit <br> 8 receipts and then when I explained to the individual <br> 9 that was doing the audit what was -- what had happened <br> 10 with my campaign and the transferring of funds from my <br> 11 personal account to the campaign account, she then <br> 12 started asking for more information. <br> 13 Well, then it was no longer the five random <br> 14 audit. It became almost a -- I won't say a full audit, <br> 15 but it was -- it came pretty close to what was being <br> 16 asked in the full audit. My question to that <br> 17 individual, because she was the one that did the full <br> 18 audit, was why couldn't we use some of what was <br> 19 initially asked for in the random audit to take place <br> 20 of what was being asked in the full audit because of <br> 21 the situation where -- where I was spending most of the <br> 22 day was at work. <br> 23 And so I was taking these receipts to work <br> 24 to try to get these put together as quickly as possible <br> 25 for the auditing firm. And so because it was in a |


| 11:07:09-11:08:46 Pa | 11:10:19-11:11:46 Page 28 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 school when I was moved over the Christmas holidays not <br> 2 only once but twice, somewhere along the way these <br> 3 receipts and information got lost. And so why I say I <br> 4 could easily go back and get verification that these <br> 5 funds were not spent the way that I'm being accused of <br> 6 spending them, if given the time to do so. <br> 7 I'll give you a perfect example. I spent <br> 8 over $\$ 6,000$ just with one business and Families to <br> 9 Arizona, which is in my district. They did all my <br> 10 printing of materials, all my campaign fund. <br> 11 Individuals that worked for me, because the district is <br> 12 so large, I had little groups of individuals that I <br> 13 paid. All I would have to do is get ahold of them, go <br> 14 out, have them, you know, re-sign, get it notarized or <br> 15 whatever I had to do, fill out an affidavit for the <br> 16 payment that I paid to those individuals. <br> So I can account for those, but I was <br> 18 needing more time to do so. I'm a school teacher and <br> 19 it's really difficult for me. Basically the only time <br> 20 that I have to be able to do this would be on the <br> 21 weekends. And so I can, if the Commission would -- the <br> 22 commissioners would allow for me to go back and get <br> 23 those receipts, get ahold of those individuals that <br> 24 volunteered and worked for my campaign, I can do that. <br> 25 If I have to go business to business, then I will do | 1 don't -- I didn't know these individuals from <br> 2 beforehand, but they work with activist groups in, say, <br> 3 Yuma or Somerton area. And I didn't know them. I got <br> 4 to know them through the campaign season. They worked <br> 5 that one day or that one weekend and then I never saw <br> 6 them again. So that's what my challenge is of trying <br> 7 to locate these individuals. <br> 8 Now, when I was served that compliance <br> 9 order, I believe I -- I don't know if it was 10 days or <br> 1014 days. I don't have the document in front me to <br> 11 provide all that information. After I wasn't able to <br> 12 get all the information that was needed, all of the <br> 13 receipts, I didn't know what the -- what the next <br> 14 step -- I'll be very honest with you. I don't know <br> 15 what the steps are with the Commission's desire as to <br> 16 what happens next. So, basically, I have been on a -- <br> 17 just waiting to see what it is that the Commission would like in order to proceed. <br> COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Well, Mr. Rubalcava, <br> did you call anyone at the Commission or contact anyone <br> and asked them what the next steps were? <br> 22 MR. RUBALCAVA: I did not, and part of the <br> 23 reason why is because it was made very clear that the <br> 24 Commission could not provide any kind of -- I did <br> 25 exchange a few emails, and it was very clear to me -- |
| that, but I can account for those -- those funds that were spent. <br> To go beyond that and ask for me to repay <br> the full amount and then plus what was given to me by individuals as -- what they call seed money, to include that money on top of it I think is really, in my opinion, unfair. <br> COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mr. Chairman, this is Mark Kimble. <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Commissioner <br> Kimble. <br> COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mr. Rubalcava, as to <br> your -- your response for more time, I note in the <br> report that we have that an order of compliance was <br> served on you on June 23rd and you've done nothing <br> since then. That's two months from tomorrow -- two <br> months ago tomorrow. <br> Have you, in the past two months since you <br> got this order, done anything to get any of these <br> documents that you say you can get? <br> MR. RUBALCAVA: Commissioner, I have -- <br> thank you for the question. I have gotten ahold of the individuals. A lot of them have moved. You know, I'm <br> trying to relocate their numbers. These are <br> 25 volunteers. A lot of the volunteers showed up. I | 1 one of them being from Mr. Collins that -- and it was just a simple question. I don't remember what the question was, but it -- he did provide an answer, but he also did make it very clear that he could not provide any kind of legal advice. <br> At that point, I wasn't asking for legal <br> advice, but if it was taken as I was asking for legal <br> advice -- I basically then said, okay, well, I'm not <br> going to -- that was my thought process that I wasn't <br> going to be able to get any questions really answered <br> without it being considered legal advice. <br> CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Any further <br> questions for the gentleman? <br> COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman -- <br> COMMISSIONER PATON: I do. <br> COMMISSIONER CHAN: Oh, is that Mr. Kimble <br> or -- <br> COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Galen Paton. <br> I was just going to ask, if possible, is it -- you <br> know, I'm not sure exactly your procedures as to where <br> we're going from this. <br> MR. COLLINS: Sure. <br> COMMISSIONER PATON: But it would seem to <br> me that -- could he submit these receipts? For <br> instance, with the printer for $\$ 6,000$ ? I would think |

11:13:15-11:14:44 Page 30
he Chan email him that -- those receipts if he spent that money. I'm sure the guy has it in his -- in his accounting. And, I mean, I would want him to be able to prove that he spent the money on legitimate items,
5 and I -- that's kind of where I stand, but I don't know
6 the time frame of which you gave him a timed response.
7 Could you speak to that, Tom?
8 MR. COLLINS: So -- yes. Mr. Chairman,
9 Commissioner Paton, after the Commission found reason
10 to believe violations may have occurred, the Commission
11 served an order of compliance on Mr. Rubalcava as
12 outlined in -- as Mr. -- as Commissioner Kimble noted.
13 We have not heard from him since then. I do recall an
14 email from him, and I did respond saying we can't
15 provide legal advice. I don't have that email in front
16 of me or the context, but here's what I would -- if I
17 could integrate both my rebuttal and an answer to your
18 question because they go together.
19 Just to look at a few things that we're
20 talking about here, Mr. Rubalcava doesn't indicate --
21 didn't indicate having mileage reported on his campaign
22 finance report and never were provided mileage logs.
23 He did not provide documents other than bank accounts,
24 and he didn't raise the issues that he's raising today
25 before in this matter. In fact, he came in front of

11:14:47-11:16:07
Page 31
the Commission and essentially stipulated that
everything that the auditors had found was correct.
He has had since November -- that was when
he was first selected for a random audit -- and his
bank accounts do not support the campaign finance
reports which is the ultimate reflection in the -- in
the audit reports. We are only asking for the amount
of Clean Elections Fund to be repaid. The amount of
money we calculated does not include seed money. It
10 only includes the amount of money he received in
11 both -- as for Clean Elections, in Clean Elections
12 funding.
He's required to keep from the beginning
the paperwork necessary to support his documentation
throughout the process and to support his campaign
finance report. So I agree in prince- -- maybe not in
principle, but in part with Commissioner Paton that if that were produced, the Commission might -- we might as staff subsequently come back to the Commission and say we need to revise this order, but we granted extensions throughout the full audit and we still were provided no documents.

And so our position is quite firm. This
24 order ought to be entered today in order to ensure the
25 integrity of the Fund. If there's other information

1 subsequent to this that Mr. Rubalcava wants to provide,
2 by all means he's free to provide it. We have an
3 ongoing investigation into the remaining issues in the
4 matter. There is also a conciliation process that's
5 mandated in our rules and in statutes, and that is all
6 available to him.
7 It is important that this order be entered
8 today in order that when we do this, Mr. Rubalcava
9 understands that the time for extensions and the time
10 for dissembling is over and the Fund's integrity takes
11 precedence over Mr. Rubalcava's ever-shifting stories
12 of why he can't identify the documents that he seems to
13 think he's had after going on a year.
14 In answer to Mr. -- to Commissioner Chan's
15 commission earlier, we think that it's important to get
16 this resolved by this order being initiated now for a
17 number of reasons that we can get into, but the least
18 of which is this order is the thing that has brought
19 Mr . Rubalcava back to the Commission to talk to us and
20 we think that is very important. And so we think that
21 it is appropriate to authorize the order -- the revised
22 proposed order today. As the order itself says, it
23 will be effective upon my signature and we will issue
24 it to him according to the Commission rules.
25 In addition to providing information,

11:17:46-11:18:57
Page 33
1 Mr. Rubalcava has an -- and in an opportunity to
2 conciliate, Mr. Rubalcava also has appellate rights.
3 So this is not the beginning nor the end of
4 Mr. Rubalcava's opportunities. This is a place marker
5 to show that the -- that the Fund's integrity has to
6 take precedence, and we -- we believe that none of the
7 information you've received today changes that
8 recommendation or alters it in any material way and we
9 would ask that you approve the revised proposed order
10 for my signature.
11 MS. GALVIN: Members of the --
12 CHAIRMAN TITLA: Any further comments,
13 action by the Commission?
MS. GALVIN: Members of the Commission,
15 this is Jeanne Galvin.
COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: Mr. Chairman, this is Mark Kimble.

CHAIRMAN TITLA: Okay. Commissioner Kimble.

COMMISSIONER KIMBLE: I would just say one
21 thing and that -- it's important to remember this is
22 not our money. This is public money, and we are
23 charged with making sure it is spent in an appropriate
24 way in accordance with the statutes and rules. And I
25 think it's incumbent upon us to move forward on this



confirm (1) 18:6
conflict (2) 12:9,19
conflicts (1) 13:5
confused (1) 15:16
conjunction (1) 15:25
consequences (1) 22:20
considered (1) 29:11
constitutionally (1) 12:22
contact (1) 28:20
content (1) 6:25
contents (1) $20: 8$
context (2) 15:21;30:16
continue (1) 23:19
continues (2) 14:11; 23:11
contractual (1) 14:12
copy (1) 19:25
corrective (2) 22:21; 23:6
corrects (3) 17:25,25; 18:1
Council (3) 7:8,16,17
counsel (2) 13:7;17:9
couple (4) 5:1;10:25; 11:4;18:14
course (2) 5:15;20:11
curious (1) 10:8
current (1) 21:4
cycle (1) 15:18

| D |
| :---: |

daily (1) 10:24
date (1) $36: 18$
day (2) 25:22;28:5
days (9) $23: 22 ; 24: 18$,
18;28:9,10;34:22,25;
35:7;36:18
deal (1) 9:17
decisions (1) 6:23
declare (1) 8:18
delay (2) 10:9;19:8
delete (1) 8:1
denominated (1) 18:4
depending (1) $11: 8$
deposits (1) 22:13
deputy (2) 4:14;6:16
designed (1) 20:5
desire (1) $28: 15$
determine (1) 21:21
determines (1) 22:3
different (2) 9:1;14:13
difficult (1) 26:19
direct (5) 21:5,9,17;
22:2;23:3
direction (2) 7:4;8:6
director (7) 4:21;15:13;
17:4;20:2,16;24:5,12
director's (7) 3:25;4:8, 20;5:6;13:22;15:20; 16:4
disagree (2) 24:15;36:4 disagreements (1) 11:21
discretion (1) 8:9
discretionary (1) 14:9
discuss (1) 16:5
discussion (8) 4:9;5:1;
14:23;16:11,15,21;
17:2;35:15
discussions (1) 16:24
disingenuous (1) 10:3
dispute (1) 8:14
disputes (1) 8:12
disrespect (1) 13:11
dissembling (1) 32:10
district (5) 24:20,21,24; 26:9,11
division (2) 7:11;17:10
document (1) 28:10
documentation (2) 22:13;31:14
documented (1) 21:8
documents (5) 24:12; 27:20;30:23;31:22; 32:12
done (7) 14:5,5;22:19; 27:15,19;34:9;36:1 driven (1) $24: 23$
due (1) $36: 17$
Dustin (1) 37:19
earlier (1) 32:15
earnestly (1) 7:18
easily (2) 24:23;26:4
edition (3) 7:25;11:2,5
editor's (1) $8: 14$
edits (1) 7:1
effect (1) 13:18
effective (1) $32: 23$
election (2) 9:2;15:17
Elections (8) 9:13;
13:25;15:15;20:2,21;
31:8,11,11
eligible (1) $22: 4$
else (2) $35: 25 ; 37: 13$
email (11) 5:3,14;6:18;
7:9;13:21;17:21;18:5;
30:1,14,15;34:13
emails (1) $28: 25$
encompasses (1) 24:21
end (2) $4: 12 ; 33: 3$
ends (1) 5:7
enforcement (1) 17:15
engage (1) 23:19
engaged (1) 23:18
ensure (4) 20:22;21:1;
31:24;34:24
entered (2) 31:24;32:7
entire (2) 20:15;36:9
entitled (1) 20:1
equal (1) 22:6
error (2) 17:25;18:1 essentially (2) 7:23; 31:1
established (1) 21:19
even (2) 11:9;12:10
event (1) 17:13
ever-shifting (1) 32:11
exactly (3) $8: 3 ; 24: 16$; 29:20
example (2) 10:21;26:7
exchange (1) $28: 25$
exchanges (1) $5: 1$
executive (12) 3:25;4:7,
20,21;5:6;13:22;15:20;
16:4;17:4;20:2,16; 24:12
Exhibit (5) 21:12,13; 22:10,10;23:1
exhibits (2) $20: 6,7$
expenditure (2) 21:7,9
expenditures (3) 21:16;
23:2,14
expenses (1) $22: 3$
expired (4) 7:22;8:2,18; 11:4
explained (1) 25:8
expressly (2) $23: 10,20$
extensions (2) 31:20; 32:9
extent (2) 5:7;7:1
$\mathbf{F}$
fact (5) 14:9;15:1;23:5; 30:25;34:7
facts (2) $13: 24 ; 14: 6$
failed (1) $14: 1$
failing (1) $14: 20$
fails (1) $13: 23$
faith (1) 14:4
falls (1) $13: 15$
Families (1) 26:8
far (2) $12: 11 ; 14: 23$
favor (3) 35:17;37:6; 38:8
features (1) 20:21
Federal (3) 10:21,22,22
feel (1) 10:7
fees (1) 22:23
fellow (1) 10:19
felt (1) $4: 21$
few (2) $28: 25 ; 30: 19$
filed (2) 5:24;20:16
fill (1) $26: 15$
final (1) 6:23
finance (3) 30:22;31:5, 16
findings (1) 22:18
fine (2) $18: 18 ; 19: 7$
firm (2) 25:25;31:23
first (8) 9:25;11:1;
12:20;13:21;20:13;
23:13;25:5;31:4
five (3) $25: 5,7,13$
flawed (1) 12:22
flow (1) 11:9
focused (1) 21:24
follow (3) 8:5,6;9:16
following (2) 13:23; 21:23
fore (1) $12: 20$
form (2) 7:2;8:8
formal (1) 15:4
format (1) 7:2
forth (1) 22:23
forward (5) 7:18;8:1; 12:7;33:25;34:12
found (3) 20:17;30:9; 31:2
frame (1) 30:6
Frankly (1) $8: 8$
free (2) 10:7;32:2
front (4) 5:9;28:10; 30:15,25
fulfill (1) 14:17
full (6) $25: 14,16,17,20$; 27:4;31:21
fully (1) $8: 11$
Fund (10) 20:23;21:10, 22,22;22:6;23:14,15; 26:10;31:8,25
funding (1) $31: 12$
funds (8) $21: 3 ; 22: 2$; 23:9;25:10;26:5;27:1; 34:1,2
Fund's (2) 32:10;33:5
further (5) 5:18;6:1; 11:12;29:12;33:12
G

Galen (3) 3:9;15:14; 29:18
Galvin (10) 17:11,12; 33:11,14,15;34:15,16; 36:7,12,15
GARDINER (1) 37:20
gave (1) 30:6
General (1) 34:16
generally (1) 11:7
General's (6) 8:24;
12:18,24;13:1,4;17:9
gentleman (1) 29:13
geographical (1) 24:21
given (4) 24:17,17; 26:6;27:4
gives (1) 9:6
goes (1) 8:1
good (2) 4:17;14:4
goods (1) 21:4
Governor's (1) 7:7
governs (1) 7:7
granted (1) 31:20
groups (2) 26:12;28:2
GRRC (18) 7:13,21,24;
8:2,6,12,13;9:14,16;

10:10,11;11:3;12:9,21;
14:16,17,25;15:2
GRRC's (3) $8: 17$;
12:21;13:15
guy (1) $30: 2$
guys (2) 10:15;24:13

## H

handle (1) 5:8
happen (1) 13:24
happened (2) 18:7;

## 25:9

happens (2) 21:1;28:16
happy (2) 6:1;19:2
hear (1) 13:4
heard (1) $30: 13$
helped (1) $24: 25$
helpful (1) $3: 8$
helpfully (1) 13:20
here's (1) 30:16
highlight (1) 20:8
highlighted (2) 7:9; 13:20
highlights (1) 5:22
himself (1) 22:15
historical (1) $14: 25$
history (1) 20:12
hit (1) 16:3
hold (1) 11:24
holidays (1) $26: 1$
honest (1) 28:14
hope (4) 4:19;5:18; 15:8,24
hours (1) 4:24

I
identified (1) 11:3
identify (2) 22:12;32:12
III (1) 17:1
immediately (2) 34:21; 35:8
important (8) 14:22;
20:20;22:11;23:12;
32:7,15,20;33:21
impression (1) 10:15
inclined (1) 36:19
include (2) 27:5;31:9
included (1) 25:3
includes (1) 31:10
including (1) 17:3
incorrect (3) 10:6;14:5, 6
incorrectly (1) 22:19
incumbent (1) 33:25
independent (1) 34:17
indicate (2) 30:20,21
indicated (2) 22:12;
23:13
individual (2) 25:8,17
individuals (9) 24:25;
26:11,12,16,23;27:5,

23;28:1,7
indulgence (1) 4:11 inevitably (1) 16:5 information (13) 5:9; 6:22;7:3;11:11;22:17; 24:19;25:12;26:3; 28:11,12;31:25;32:25; 33:7
initial (2) 12:20;25:5 initially (1) $25: 19$
initiated (1) 32:16
instance (4) 6:20;8:3,9; 29:25
instead (1) 35:7
integrate (1) 30:17
integrity (3) 31:25; 32:10;33:5
interagency (1) 12:19
into (7) 8:21;9:8;12:20; 14:13;17:7;32:3,17
investigation (2) 23:18; 32:3
investigatory (1) 23:11
involved (1) 15:15
involves (1) 17:8
issue (9) $7: 16 ; 8: 13$; 9:14;12:10;13:9;14:12; 17:19;20:18;32:23
issued (2) $10: 24,25$ issues (5) 12:9,9;16:3; 30:24;32:3
item (6) 3:22,24;4:10; 16:10,24;37:14
items (1) 30:4

| $\mathbf{J}$ |
| :---: |

Jeanne (6) 17:10,12; 33:15;34:16;35:4; 36:14
Jesus (2) 17:2;20:3
June (1) 27:15
jurisdictional (2) 7:15; 9:14
justified (1) 23:15

| $\mathbf{K}$ |
| :---: |

keep (1) 31:13
keeping (1) 15:20
Kimble (17) 3:14,14;
11:16,17,19;12:1;27:8, 9,11,12;28:19;29:16; 30:12;33:16,17,19,20
kind (4) 10:17;28:24; 29:5;30:5
knowing (1) 12:7

| $\mathbf{L}$ |
| :---: |

language (1) 22:11
large (1) 26:12
largest (1) 24:20
last (1) 36:15
latest (1) $34: 13$
learn (1) 22:19
least (4) 5:19;10:12; 16:1;32:17
leave (1) 9:9
leaving (1) 10:16
Lee (4) 4:13;6:16;9:22, 24
legal (14) 5:9,18;6:24; 7:2;8:17;9:3,6;15:4; 29:5,6,7,11;30:15; 34:17
legitimate (1) 30:4
less (1) 8:4
letter (2) 5:4,16
licensing (1) $17: 10$
limited (1) 14:23
literally (2) 8:19;9:5
little (3) 10:3,9;26:12
lobbying (1) 10:5
locate (2) 22:12;28:7
logs (1) 30:22
longer (1) 25:13
look (3) 7:18;30:19; 37:17
looking (1) 12:7
lost (2) 19:14;26:3
lot (4) 24:22;25:3; 27:23,25

| $\mathbf{M}$ |
| :---: |

main (3) 15:23;17:18; 22:10
making (2) 10:9;33:23
Maledon (1) 5:13
mandated (1) 32:5
many (3) 13:11;15:21; 34:9
Mark (5) 3:14;11:17,18; 27:9;33:17
marker (1) 33:4
Mary (2) 6:19;9:4
material (2) 18:12;33:8
materials (4) 5:3;6:5; 21:12;26:10
matter (10) 5:11,19;9:5; 14:8,9,10,24;17:8; 30:25;32:4
matters (1) 9:3
may (6) 16:3;20:18; 21:21;23:17;30:10; 36:7
maybe (1) $31: 16$
mean (5) 9:25;10:12; 19:8;30:3;36:4
means (1) $32: 2$
meantime (3) 7:19; 8:15;9:14
meeting (9) 3:4;5:21; 11:25;15:9,23,23;18:6, 23;38:2
members (5) 6:15;
10:19;33:11,14;34:15
MEYER (11) 3:10,11;
35:12,13,14;37:2,2,4;
38:1,2,4
microphone (1) 4:13
might (2) $31: 18,18$
mileage (3) 24:22;
30:21,22
Miller (14) 4:5,12,13; 5:3,14,18;6:1,15,16; 10:18;11:21;13:7;14:3; 15:5
Miller's (2) 13:8,21
minute (2) 9:5;15:2
minutes (4) 17:17,19,
20;18:14
missing (1) $25: 2$
mitigates (1) $34: 7$
money (12) 20:22;
21:10;27:5,6;30:2,4; 31:9,9,10;33:22,22; 34:7
monies (2) 22:23;23:5
month (1) 10:12
months (4) 27:16,17, 18;34:9
more (10) 5:9;8:4;15:4; 16:20,23;25:12;26:18; 27:13;34:3;35:6
morning (3) 6:6,18; 34:14
most (2) 22:11;25:21
motion (14) 35:9,13,15, 24;36:8,11,15,20,24; 37:5,12,22,24;38:3
move (4) $33: 25 ; 35: 5$; 36:22;38:2
moved (2) 26:1;27:23
moves (1) 11:8
moving (1) 34:12
much (2) 6:17;10:13
MUR (2) 17:2;20:3
must (2) 21:22;23:9
$\mathbf{N}$
name (2) 6:15;17:10 necessary (4) 17:20; 24:3;31:14;36:11 need (5) 4:21;12:15; 16:14;31:20;37:13
needed (1) 28:12
needing (1) $26: 18$
needs (1) 35:25
nevertheless (1) 5:17
next (13) 3:22,24;6:13; 7:25;11:2,5;15:8,17; 16:24;22:8;28:13,16, 21
none (1) 33:6
nor (1) $33: 3$
notarized (1) 26:14
note (4) 7:14;8:15; 21:11;27:13
noted (4) 5:6,16;30:12; 36:5
notice (6) 4:22;7:21,22, 24;8:13;11:2
noticed (2) 4:9;8:2
notices (3) 6:22;7:13; 9:16
notify (1) $22: 5$
notwithstanding (1) 14:3
November (1) 31:3
number (6) 7:22;17:1; 21:24;32:17;34:20; 36:16
numbers (1) 27:24
numerous (1) 11:20
$\mathbf{O}$
obligations (5) 8:7;9:7;
14:15,16;34:6
occurred (3) 14:21; 20:18;30:10
off (1) $16: 3$
offer (1) 18:11
office (24) 4:6;5:2,5; 6:21;7:11,12;8:24,25; 9:2;10:2,5;11:24; 12:10,19,24,24,25; 13:2,4,6,14;14:7;16:3; 17:10
O'Grady (5) 5:4,5,12; 6:19;9:4
once (1) 26:2
one (12) 7:22;9:5,12; 14:13;17:22;21:24; 25:17;26:8;28:5,5; 29:1;33:20
ongoing (2) 23:18;32:3
only (6) 21:5;22:25; 26:2,19;31:7,10
open (2) 3:20;19:21
opinion (4) 12:8,10; 24:15;27:7
opportunities (1) 33:4
opportunity (5) 4:19; 5:17;6:17;18:12;33:1
Opposed (3) 35:20; 37:8;38:10
order (45) 3:4;13:15; 17:3,8,15,24;18:2,3,5; 20:3,6,7,8,9,19;21:14; 22:10,22;23:19,20,24; 27:14,19;28:9,18; 30:11;31:20,24,24; 32:7,8,16,18,21,22,22; 33:9;34:13,19,23;36:9, 12,18,20,23
ordered (1) 23:6
orders (1) 34:20
Osborn (1) 5:12

Otherwise (4) 5:25;
13:4;20:24,25
ought (1) $31: 24$
out (9) $8: 20 ; 10: 17$;
12:12,20;13:2;24:13;
25:1;26:14,15
outlined (2) 6:5;30:12
outside (1) 17:9
over (13) 4:13;5:25;
6:25;7:3,18;10:11;
18:21,25;26:1,8;32:10,
11;34:9
owing (2) $35: 1 ; 36: 17$

## P

page (1) $34: 18$
paid (2) 26:13,16
paperwork (1) 31:14
paragraph (2) 21:15;
34:19
part (3) 24:23;28:22;
31:17
participating (2) 21:3,21
particular (3) 6:20;9:5; 11:3
passed (1) 20:25
past (2) 9:7;27:18
PATON (11) 3:9,9;
15:14,14,20;29:15,18,
18,23;30:9;31:17
pay (2) $21: 4 ; 22: 6$
payment (3) 22:4;
26:16;36:17
payments (1) 21:22
PDF (2) 19:22,25
penalties (2) 23:10,16
pending (1) 15:2
people (1) 15:15
perfect (1) 26:7
perfectly (1) 4:9
permission (2) 18:10; 19:13
permits (1) 23:20
permitted (1) 23:21
person (1) 6:13
personal (3) 21:10; 23:9;25:11
phone (2) 17:16;18:13
place (4) 10:12,17; 25:19;33:4
placed (1) 20:23
plan (2) 5:11;13:9
planning (1) 18:25
play (2) 14:18;15:3
please (1) 10:7
plus (1) 27:4
point (5) 13:7,8;15:11; 16:15;29:6
position (8) 8:8;9:11;
10:2,4,16;11:22;14:7; 31:23
possible (4) 16:11;

| $\begin{gathered} 17: 2 ; 25: 24 ; 29: 19 \\ \text { PowerPoint }(10) 17: 22 \\ 18: 21,24 ; 19: 19,21,23, \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 34: 21 \\ & \text { put (5) 4:22;6:20;7:24; } \\ & 14: 6 ; 25: 24 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Regulatory (4) 7:8,16, } \\ & \text { 17;14:8 } \\ & \text { rehearsing (1) 20:12 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { right (4) 9:12;15:2; } \\ & 16: 20 ; 17: 11 \\ & \text { rights (1) } 33: 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { severable (1) 13:6 } \\ & \text { shall (4) 20:22;21:3,9; } \\ & 22: 6 \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| precedence (2) 32:11; | Q | relationship (1) 7:7 | Roll (1) 3: | sharper (1) 5:20 |
| predicate (1) 14:19 |  | relocate (1) 27:24 | roughly (1) 10:25 | showed (1) 27:25 |
| preface (1) 4:5 | quick (2) 18:20;20:4 | remaining (1) $32:$ | Rubalcava (27) 17:3 | side (4) 8:8;9:11,12; |
| preparatory (1) 17:7 | quickly (1) $25: 24$ quite (2) $13 \cdot 14 \cdot 31.23$ | remember (2) 29:2 | 16,23;18:11;19:24 | $10: 3$ |
| :18,18;18:11,12,13 | quite (2) 13:14;31:23 quorum (1) $3: 17$ | $\text { removing (1) } 8: 1$ | 8,9 | sign (1) $22: 25$ <br> signature (2) $32: 2$ |
| presentation (1) 19:14 <br> pretty (1) 25:15 | R | $\begin{aligned} & \text { repaid (2) } 21: 9 ; 31: 8 \\ & \text { repay (6) } 21: 22 ; 23: \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & : 19,22 \\ & : 1,8,1 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 33: 10 \\ \text { simple (1) } 29: 2 \end{gathered}$ |
| reviously (1) 23:12 <br> prince- (1) 31:16 |  | $\begin{array}{r} 27: 3 ; 34: 20,22,25 \\ \text { repaying (1) } 22: 22 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} 33: 1,2 ; 34: 2,11 \\ \text { Rubalcava's (2) } 32: 11 ; \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Simply (5) } 6: 20,21 ; \\ & 1 ; 8: 1 \end{aligned}$ |
| rinciple (1) 31:17 | raise (2) 14:12;30:24 | repayment (9) 17:3,8; | 33 | single (1) $8: 4$ |
| t (1) 7:4 | raised (1) 5:14 | 20:3,19;23:8,9,22 | rule (2) 7:22 | situation (2) 14:15; |
| er | raises | 36: | rules (15) 8:10, | 25:21 |
| ting | raising | repo | 16;11 | s |
| prior proba | ra | $\begin{aligned} & 20,25 ; 5: 7,23,23 ; 13: 22, \\ & 23 ; 14: 1,20 ; 15: 2,21 ; \end{aligned}$ | $33: 24 ; 34:$ | somebody (1) 9:6 <br> Somerton (1) 28:3 |
| (1) $15: 6$ <br> rally (1) $12: 22$ | rapid (1) 7:19 <br> rather (2) 20:8;21:13 | $\begin{aligned} & 16: 5 ; 22: 18 ; 27: 14 \\ & 30: 22 ; 31: 16 \end{aligned}$ | S | somewhere (1) 26:2 sorry (1) 19:8 |
| cedures (2) 29:20; | rationale (1) 9:6 | $\text { reported (1) } 30$ | S | sort (2) $14: 12 ; 15: 20$ |
|  |  | reports ( | safeguard (1) $34: 1$ | speak (1) 30:7 |
| roceed (2) 19:17; | reach (1) 34:10 | $31: 6,7$ represent (2) | $\text { saw (1) } 28: 5$ | speaks (1) $24: 2$ |
| 28:18 | reached (1) 15: | represent (2) 9:1,2 | saying (5) 4:5;10:2; | specific (2) 7:10;24: |
| oceedings (1) 38:16 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { really (7) } 5: \\ 19: 2: 23: 2 \end{array}$ | representative (1) 8:24 representing (1) 24:20 | 14:3;17:11;30:14 | specifically (1) 7:6 <br> specified (1) 20:24 |
| $13: 24 ; 23: 17 ; 29: 9$ | 29:10 | represents (1) 8:25 | $\text { school (2) } 26: 1,1$ | spending (2) $25: 21$ |
| 31:15;32:4 | reason (4) | require (1) $36: 19$ | scope (1) 16:4 | 26:6 |
| od | 22:16;28:23;30:9 | required (1) $31: 13$ | screenshot (1) 22:9 | spent (7) 20:24;26:5,7; |
| (1) | reasonable (1) $4: 9$ | requires (2) 20:22 | scrivener's (2) 17:25; | 27:2;30:1,4;33:23 |
| perly (1) $34: 24$ | reasons (1) 32:1 |  |  | spoke (1) 9:4 spun (1) 12.20 |
| propose (1) 17:17 | rebut (1) $24: 3$ rebuttal (3) 1 | reserve (2) 17:19;24 reserves (1) 23:9 | season (1) <br> second (9) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { spun (1) } 12: 20 \\ & \text { staff (5) } 4: 21 ; 16: 18,18 ; \end{aligned}$ |
| proposed (18) 17:3,24 |  | $\text { re-sign (1) } 26: 1$ | $35: 11,13,14 ; 36: 1$ | 31:19;34:9 |
| 18:1,4;20:6,7,8,18; | recall (1) 30:13 | resolution (4) 7:19 | 37:1,3;38:5,6 | stand (3) 5:20;24: |
| 21:14;23:20,24;32:22; | receipts (10) 24:24; | 8:16,17;15:10 | secondary (1) 12:17 | 30:5 |
| $33: 9 ; 34: 19 ; 36: 9,12,20,$ | $25: 2,3,8,23 ; 26: 3,23$ | resolve (2) 7:15;9:1 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { seconds (3) } 8: 19 ; 37: 4 ; \\ & 38: 7 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { started (3) 18:6;25:12; } \\ & 34: 3 \end{aligned}$ |
| rove (1) | receive (2) 7:13;24:12 | $15: 18 ; 32: 16$ | Secretary (12) 4:6,14; | State (9) 4:14;6:17,24; |
| provide (12) 5:13,17; | received (7) 17:21,23; | respect (2) 13:8;16 | 6:16,21;7:10,12;9:7; | 9:7,18;11:9;24:21,23, |
| 22:17;28:11,24;29:3,5 | $\begin{aligned} & 18: 5 ; 20: 7 ; 21: 22 ; 31: 10 \\ & 33: 7 \end{aligned}$ | respecting (1) 4:7 <br> respond (1) $30 \cdot 14$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11: 23 ; 13: 1,14 ; 14: 7 \\ & 16 \cdot 2 \end{aligned}$ | 24 |
| $\text { d (2) } 30: 22$ |  | re | 16 | tated (2) 22:16;23:1 |
| (2) | recognize (3) $8: 11$; | response (19) 6:9,11 | 12:20,25;14 | 24:8,11 |
| (1) $32: 25$ | 10:1;13:5 | 11:23;13:19;16:9,22 | section (2) 8:2,2 | statements (1) 22:14 |
| oviding (1) 32:25 | Recommendation (3) | 15;23:4;24:6;27:13; | securing (1) 23:13 | states (2) 21:2,6 |
| ving (1) $21: 15$ | 20:3;23:8;3 | $; 34: 11 ; 35: 16,21$ | seed (2) 27:5;31:9 | State's (7) 4:6;6:2 |
| visions (1) 8:20 <br> lic (6) 15:16;19 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { record (5) 3:7;10: } \\ 13: 15 ; 14: 25 ; 21: \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 23;37:9,11;38:11,13 } \\ & \text { restore (1) 8:20 } \end{aligned}$ | seem (1) 29:23 <br> seems (2) 10:8;32: | $\begin{aligned} & 7: 11,12 ; 11: 24 ; 13: 14 \\ & 16: 2 \end{aligned}$ |
| 33:22;34:7;37:16,17 | $13: 15,14.25,21: 18$ recuperate (1) $25: 1$ | resubmitted (2) 14:25; | selected (1) 31: | statute (8) 7:6,9,20,20; |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { publications (3) 7:11; } \\ & 10: 1,23 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { reflect (4) } 34: 24 ; 35: 6,6 \text {; } \\ & 36: 17 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 15: 1 \\ \text { result (1) } 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { sent (4) 5:5;6:19;7: } \\ & 24: 13 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 8: 16 ; 9: 15 ; 11: 1 ; 14: 20 \\ \text { statutes (2) } 32: 5 ; 33: 24 \end{array}$ |
| blic's (1) 34 | reflection (1) 31:6 | review (6) 4:20;7:8,16 | separable (1) 13:6 | statutory (2) 8:7;14:9 |
|  | regards (1) 24:13 | 17;20:14;22:9 | serve (1) 6:16 | step (1) 28:14 |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { ublished (5) 4:23,25; } \\ & 11: 6,7 ; 16: 2 \end{aligned}$ | register (3) 7:24;10:20, | revise (1) 31:20 <br> revised (12) 17:24 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { served (3) 27:15;28:8; } \\ & 30: 11 \end{aligned}$ | Stephanie (1) 19:15 <br> steps (2) 28:15,21 |
| urposes (7) | re | (12) 17.24 |  | Steve (1) 3:15 |
| 21:5,17,25,25;22:1; | regularly (1) 18:22 | 21;33:9;34:19,19; | set (3) 5:15;13:24; | still (2) 14:14;31:2 |
| 23:3 | regulation (1) 11:9 | 36:9,11,23 | 22:23 | stipulated (2) 23:3;31:1 |
| pursuant (2) 23:10; | Regulations (1) 10:22 | revision (3) 36:4,4,8 | seven (1) 17:19 | stories (1) 32:11 |


| strictly (2) 8:5,6 | 18:20:30:7:35:25; |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| stuck (2) 9:15,15 | 37:13 | W | 3 |
| ```14,15 submit (5) 13:23;14:1, 20;24:19;29:24 submitted (1) 17:4``` | took (2) 10:10,12 <br> top (1) 27:6 <br> total (1) 17:17 <br> totally (1) 15:16 | waiting (1) $28: 17$ <br> wants (2) $32: 1 ; 37: 18$ <br> watching (1) 19:23 <br> way (7) 8:7;15:4;22:18; | $\begin{aligned} & 30 \text { (5) 23:22;34:22,25; } \\ & 35: 7 ; 36: 17 \\ & \text { 31st (5) 5:9,21;11:25; } \\ & 15: 24 ; 16: 6 \end{aligned}$ |
| 14:18;15:3 | transactions (1) 25:5 | ways (1) $15: 22$ | 4 |
| ```32:1 subsequently (1) 31:19 substantial (1) 11:20``` | transferring (1) 25:10 <br> traveling (1) 24:22 <br> troublesome (1) 12:21 | weekend (1) $28: 5$ <br> weekends (1) 26:21 <br> weeks (2) 11:1,4 | 4 (4) 21:12,13,13;23:1 41-1056 (3) 7:8,20;9:8 41-1056J (2) 13:9,16 |
| sufficient (1) 16:16 | $34: 10,10$ | what's (2) 3:22;6:25 | 6 |
| summarize (1) 6:18 | 24:19;27:24;28:6 turn 3 ( $4 \cdot 13 \cdot 5 \cdot 25$. | $34: 12$ | 60 (1) 8:19 |
| supplement (1) 13:21 | 34:18 | who's (1) 4:14 | 7 |
| support (3) $31: 5,14,15$ <br> supporting (1) 22:13 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { two (10) } 8: 10,18 ; 11: 3 \\ & \quad 7 ; 12: 15 ; 14: 13 ; 17: 21 ; \end{aligned}$ | willing (1) $22: 20$ wishes (1) 18:12 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 702A (1) 21:2 } \\ & \text { 704B (1) } 21: 20 \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { sure (8) } 13: 2 ; 16: 25 ; \\ & 29: 20,22 ; 30: 2 ; 33: 23 ; \end{aligned}$ | $\mathbf{U}$ | within (4) 13:6;23:22; | 8 |
| swore (1) 21:14 | ultimate (1) 31:6 | wonder (1) 8:21 |  |
|  | unaccounted (2) 22.23 | words (1) 25:7 |  |
| talk (2) 9:23;32:19 | under (8) 4:10;9:8; | $13 ; 25: 22,23 ; 28: 2$ |  |
| talking (1) 30:20 | 10:15;13:8,16;21:15, | worked (3) 26:11,24; |  |
| teacher (1) 26:18 | $23 ; 23: 15$ | 28:4 |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { tells (1) 7:20 } \\ & \text { ten (1) 17:17 } \end{aligned}$ | understandable (1) $14: 14$ | working (4) 5:11;13:10, $17 ; 15: 5$ |  |
| terminology (1) 35:7 | understands (1) 32:9 | wrinkle (1) 12:23 |  |
| Thanks (2) 16:25;35:4 | unfair (2) 24:15;27:7 | written (1) 6:5 |  |
| Thomas (2) 17:21;18:8 | unilateral (1) 11:23 | wrong (1) 9:12 |  |
| thoughts (1) 12:15 | unlike (2) 10:21,22 | wrongdoing (1) 22:20 |  |
| three (1) 17:19 | $\text { up (4) } 5: 7 ; 16: 10 ; 19: 2$ | Y |  |
| throw (1) 12:12 | upon (2) 32:23;33:25 |  |  |
| timed (1) 30:6 | upset (1) 15:17 | yesterday (2) 5:5;9:4 |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { timeline (1) 11:8 } \\ & \text { TITLA (49) 3:3,15,15, } \end{aligned}$ | upshot (2) 14:2;23:23 <br> urge (1) $34: 18$ | you-all (2) 6:18;9:1 <br> Yuma (1) 28:3 |  |
| 11:14,18;12:1;15:12; | $25: 18$ | 1 |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| $24: 4,7 ; 27: 10 ; 29: 12$ | V | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \text { (2) 24:18;28:9 } \\ & 11: 22 \text { (1) } 38: 14 \end{aligned}$ |  |
| 33:12,18;35:2,9,14,17, |  | 11:23 (1) 38:17 |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { 20,22,24;36:24;37:4,8, } \\ & 10,12,21,24 ; 38: 3,7,10, \end{aligned}$ | verification (1) 26:4 version (1) 11:6 | $14 \text { (2) 24:18;28:10 }$ |  |
| $12,14$ | via (2) $18: 5,13$ | 17-01 (2) 17:2;20:3 |  |
| today (10) 9:10;18:22; | view (3) 12:18;13:11; | 2 |  |
| 20:18;21:25;30:24; | 16:19 |  |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & 31: 24 ; 32: 8,22 ; 33: 7 ; \\ & 34: 17 \end{aligned}$ | violations (2) 20:17; $30: 10$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \text { (5) 22:10,10;34:18, } \\ & 20 ; 36: 16 \end{aligned}$ |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { together (3) 14:13; } \\ & 25: 24 ; 30: 18 \end{aligned}$ | visit (1) 6:17 <br> volunteered (1) 26:24 | $\text { 23rd (1) } 27: 15$ |  |
| $\begin{gathered} \text { Tom (11) } 3: 19 ; 6: 13,19 ; \\ 12: 6,12 ; 16: 8 ; 17: 5 ; \end{gathered}$ | volunteers (2) 27:25,25 | 24 (1) 4:24 |  |

