

CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION

Report on Agreed-Upon Procedures

**Benjamin Carmitchel
Participating Candidate for
State Senator - District 16
General Election 2018**



Independent Accountants' Report on
Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures

To the Chairman and Members of the
Citizens Clean Elections Commission
Phoenix, Arizona

We (the Contractor) have performed the procedures enumerated below, which were specified and agreed to by the State of Arizona Citizens Clean Elections Commission (the Commission), solely to assist the Commission in evaluating whether Benjamin Carmitchel (the Candidate) Campaign finance reports for both the General Recap (October 21, 2018 to November 6, 2018) and the 2018 4th Quarter (October 21, 2018 to December 31, 2018) reporting periods were prepared in compliance with Title 16, Articles 1 and 2 of the Arizona Revised Statutes, Campaign Contributions and Expenses, and the Citizens Clean Elections Act, and whether the reports complied with the rules of the Citizens Clean Elections Commission. The Candidate's management is responsible for the General Recap and 4th Quarter Reports. The sufficiency of these procedures is solely the responsibility of those parties specified in this report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

The summary of procedures and associated findings are presented on the subsequent pages.

This agreed-upon procedures engagement was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. We were not engaged to, and did not conduct an examination or review, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on the General Recap and 4th Quarter Campaign finance reports of Benjamin Carmitchel. Accordingly, we do not express such an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the parties listed in the first paragraph, and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than those specified parties.

Fester & Chapman, PLLC

February 20, 2019

Summary of Procedures and Findings

1. Preliminary Procedures

- a) Commission Staff will obtain a copy of the candidate's campaign finance report for the reporting period and provide the records to the Contractor.

Finding

We obtained both the General Recap (October 21, 2018 to November 6, 2018) and the 2018 4th Quarter (October 21, 2018 to December 31, 2018) Campaign finance reports from the Arizona Secretary of State's Website.

- b) Perform a desk review of the receipts reported in the candidate's campaign finance report as follows:
 - (i) Determine whether the candidate accepted contributions only from individuals.

Finding

No contributions were received during the periods under review.

- (ii) Determine whether any contributions received from individuals exceed the early contribution limit.

Finding

No contributions were received during the periods under review.

- (iii) Check compliance with the maximum early contribution limits.

Finding

No contributions were received during the periods under review.

- (iv) Check compliance with the maximum personal contribution limits.

Finding

No contributions were received during the periods under review.

- c). Perform a desk review of the disbursements reported in the candidate's campaign finance report to identify any unusual items requiring follow-up during fieldwork.

Finding

We noted no unusual disbursements during our review.

- d). Contact the candidate or the campaign treasurer, as appropriate, to schedule a date to perform fieldwork. Discuss the nature of the documentation, which will be needed to perform the engagement and ascertain the location of the necessary documentation.

Finding

We contacted the Candidate to discuss the agreed-upon procedures, the timing of our procedures, and the documentation needed.

2. Fieldwork Procedures

- a) Commission staff will contact the candidate to request the records for agreed-upon procedures attest engagement. Candidates receiving audits after the Primary Election shall provide records from the election cycle through the 3rd Quarter Report. Candidates receiving audits after the General Election shall provide records from the election cycle through the 4th Quarter Report.

Finding

Commission staff sent an initial notice of primary audit selection to the Candidate and informed the Candidate that we would be contacting them. We then communicated to the Candidate in a written request, the purpose of the request, agreed-upon procedures to be performed, documentation needed, and potential future requirements of the Candidate.

- b) Commission staff will provide the records to the Contractor upon receipt. The contractor shall contact the candidate and/or his or her representative(s) to discuss the purpose of the engagement, the general procedures to be performed and potential future requirements of the candidate, such as possible repayments to the Fund.

Finding

See comment in a) above.

- c) The Contractor shall contact or conduct an interview with the candidate and/or his or her representative(s) to discuss the bookkeeping policies and procedures utilized by the campaign committee.

Finding

The Candidate provided a description of bookkeeping policies and procedures utilized by the Campaign Committee.

- (i) Review the names of the candidate's family members. Family members include parents, grandparents, aunt, uncle, child or sibling of the candidate or the candidate's spouse, including the spouse of any of the listed family members regardless of whether the relation is established by marriage or adoption.

Finding

We obtained and reviewed the names of the Candidate's family members.

- (ii) Review bank statements for each of the months in the reporting period and perform the following:
- Select a sample of deposits and withdrawals from the bank statements and determine that the transaction is properly reflected in the candidate's records and campaign finance report.

Finding

We selected five withdrawals from the bank statements for the periods under review and determined that they appeared to be properly recorded in the Candidate's Campaign finance reports. One deposit selected (total population) from the bank statements was a deposit to replace funds which had been previously withdrawn mistakenly. This deposit was not recorded on the Campaign finance reports, but the original withdrawal of funds had been recorded, therefore the deposit was not properly reflected in the Candidate's records and Campaign finance report.

- Perform a proof of receipts and disbursements for the reporting period.

Finding

Proof of receipts and disbursements was performed for the reporting period with the following exceptions: (a) We noted that the amount of the refund submitted to the Commission per the bank statement was \$520.90, however the amount of the refund per the Campaign finance report was \$530.90, resulting in an unreconciled difference of \$10.00; (b) one expenditure for \$517.71 was listed on the Candidate's Campaign finance reports but not listed in the Campaign bank account statement; (c) two withdrawals totaling \$330.09 and one deposit for \$100.00 were listed on the Campaign bank account statements, but not listed on the Candidate's Campaign finance reports. The net effect of all these differences was an unreconciled variance of \$277.62.

- d) Judgmentally select a sample of early contributions reported in the candidate's campaign finance report and agree to supporting documentation, which reflects the name of the contributor (for all contributions) and for individuals who contributed greater than \$50, which reflects the contributor's address, occupation and employer.

Finding

No contributions were received during the periods under review.

- (i) For other types of cash receipts reported on the candidate's campaign finance report, review supporting documentation and review for compliance with regulatory rules and laws and agree the receipt to inclusion in the campaign account bank statement.

Finding

No other types of cash receipts were reported in the Candidate's Campaign finance reports during the periods under review.

- (ii) For in-kind contributions, review the supporting documentation and determine the methodology utilized to value the contribution and assess the reasonableness.

Finding

No in-kind contributions were reported in the Candidate's Campaign finance reports during the periods under review.

- e) Judgmentally select a sample of cash expenditures reported in the candidate's campaign finance report and select 100% of Arizona Democratic Party, Maricopa Democratic Party, Pinal County Democratic, Yavapai County Democratic Party expenses for selected candidates, and perform the following:

- (i) Review supporting invoice or other documentation and agree amount to the amount reported in the candidate's finance report.

Finding

We reviewed five expenditures and agreed amounts to supporting invoices or other documentation to the Candidate's Campaign finance report.

- (ii) Determine that the name, address and nature of goods or services provided agree to the information reported in the candidate's campaign finance report.

Finding

We reviewed five expenditures and agreed the name, address, and nature of goods or services provided in the Candidate's Campaign finance report.

- Agree the amount of the expenditure to the campaign account bank statement.

Finding

We reviewed five expenditures and agreed amounts to the Campaign account bank statements without exception.

- (iii) Determine whether the expenditure was made for a direct campaign purpose. Direct campaign purpose includes, but is not limited to, materials, communications, transportation, supplies and expenses used toward the election of the candidate.

Finding

We reviewed five expenditures and determined that four out of five expenditures tested appeared to have been made for direct campaign purposes. One out of five expenditures tested was a withdrawal from an ATM machine made in error, which the Candidate replaced less than a week later. However, the withdrawal was recorded on the Campaign finance reports and did not appear to be made for a direct campaign expenditure.

- If the expenditure is a joint expenditure made in conjunction with other candidates, determine that the amount paid represents the candidate's proportionate share of the total cost.

Finding

None of the expenditures we tested appeared to be for joint expenditures.

- f) Determine whether any petty cash funds have been established and, if so, determine how expenditures from these funds have been reflected in the accounting records. Determine whether aggregate petty cash funds exceed the limit of \$1,460.

Finding

Based on inquiry of the Candidate, the Candidate did not establish a petty cash fund during the periods under review.

- (i) If applicable, judgmentally select a sample of expenditures made from the candidate's petty cash fund(s) and obtain supporting documentation for the expenditure. Determine whether the expenditure was for a direct campaign expense and whether the expenditure was in excess of the \$160 limit on petty cash expenditures.

Finding

Based on inquiry of the Candidate, the Candidate did not establish a petty cash fund during the periods under review.

- g) Determine whether a legal defense fund has been established.

Finding

Based on inquiry of the Candidate, the Candidate did not establish a legal defense fund during the periods under review.

- (i) If a legal defense fund was established, how was it accounted for?

Finding

Based on inquiry of the Candidate, the Candidate did not establish a legal defense fund during the periods under review.

- h) Contact the candidate and/or his or her representative(s) to discuss the preliminary engagement findings and recommendations that the Contractor anticipates presenting to the CCEC. During this conference, the Contractor will advise the candidate and/or his or her representative(s) of their right to respond to the preliminary findings and the projected timetable for the issuance of the final issuance of the report.

Finding

We discussed our findings with the Candidate and the Candidate did not provide responses to our findings.