

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING AND POSSIBLE EXECUTIVE SESSION OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION

Location: Citizens Clean Elections Commission

1616 West Adams, Suite 110

Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Date: Monday, July 29, 2019

Time: 9:30 a. m.

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the Commissioners of the Citizens Clean Elections Commission and the general public that the Citizens Clean Elections Commission will hold a regular meeting, which is open to the public on July 29, 2019. This meeting will be held at 9:30 a.m., at the Citizens Clean Elections Commission, 1616 West Adams, Suite 110, Phoenix, Arizona 85007. The meeting may be available for live streaming online at www.livestream.com/cleanelections. Members of the Citizens Clean Elections Commission will attend either in person or by telephone, video, or internet conferencing.

The Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for the purpose of obtaining legal advice on any item listed on the agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03 (A)(3). The Commission reserves the right at its discretion to address the agenda matters in an order different than outlined below.

All matters on the agenda may be discussed, considered and are subject to action by the Commission.

Possible action on any Matter Under Review (MUR) identified in this agenda may include authorizing or entering into a conciliation agreement with subject of the MUR, in addition to any other actions, such as finding reason to believe a violation has occurred, finding probable cause to believe a violation has occurred, applying penalties, ordering the repayment of monies to the Clean Elections Fund, or terminating a proceeding.

The agenda for the meeting is as follows:

- I. Call to Order.
- II. Discussion and Possible Action on Commission Minutes for May 30, 2019 meeting.
- III. Discussion and Possible Action on Executive Director's Report and Legislative Report. Possible Action may include directing staff to take positions on legislation or legal issues discussed in the report. The report is typically available online on the Clean Elections Commission website or via email request at ccec@azcleanelections.gov

IV. Discussion and Possible Action on the following proposed Rule Changes for 60 day public comment period. Possible action may include approval of the proposed rules, a determination whether any rules adopted unanimously should be made effective immediately, termination of a rulemaking docket, or directing staff to file a notice of supplemental rulemaking.

A. Amendment to A.A.C. R2-20-702 concerning participating candidates use of clean elections funding.

B. Amendment to A.A.C. R2-20-704 related to repayment of clean elections funding.

C. Amendment to A.A.C. R2-20-113 related to candidate statements.

D. Amendment to A.A.C. R2-20-104 related to loans to participating candidates.

The Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for the purpose of obtaining legal advice on this item, pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03 (A)(3).

V. Public Comment

This is the time for consideration of comments and suggestions from the public. Action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or rescheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date or responding to criticism

VI. Adjournment.

This agenda is subject to change up to 24 hours prior to the meeting. A copy of the agenda background material provided to the Commission (with the exception of material relating to possible executive sessions) is available for public inspection at the Commission's office, 1616 West Adams, Suite 110, Phoenix, Arizona 85007.

Dated this 25th day of July, 2019.

Citizens Clean Elections Commission Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director

Any person with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation, such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the Commission at (602) 364-3477. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange accommodations.

1	
2	
3	
4	THE STATE OF ARIZONA
5	CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PUBLIC MEETING
11	
12	
13	
14	Phoenix, Arizona
15	May 30, 2019
16	9:30 a.m.
17	TTEM II
18	
19	
20	
21	COASH & COASH, INC.
22	Court Reporting, Video & Videoconferencing 1802 North 7th Street, Phoenix, AZ 85006
23	602-258-1440 staff@coashandcoash.com
24	Prepared by:
25	LILIA MONARREZ, CSR, RPR Certificate No. 50699

Coash & Coash, Inc. 602-258-1440 www.coashandcoash.com

	zens Clean Elections Commission	iccing	Ma	y 30, 2019
	Page 2	09:30:54-09:	32:07	Page 4
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	PUBLIC MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at 9:30 a.m. on May 30, 2019, at the State of Arizona, Clean Elections Commission, 1616 West Adams, Conference Room, Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the following Board members: Mr. Mark S. Kimble, Chairperson Mr. Damien R. Meyer Ms. Amy B. Chan Mr. Galen D. Paton OTHERS PRESENT: Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director Paula Thomas, Executive Officer Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director Mike Becker, Policy Director Alec Shaffer, Web Content Manager Avery Oliver, Voter Education Specialist Fanessa Salazar, Administrative Assistant Mary O'Grady, Osborn Maledon Nathan Arrowsmith, Osborn Maledon Kara Karlson, AZ Attorney General's Office Joseph LaRue, AZ Attorney General's Office Ryan Wheelock, RIESTER Rivko Knox, AZ League of Women Voters	1 CHA 2 COM 3 CHA 4 COM 5 CHA 6 It's appr 7 Item 8 executiv 9 Tom 10 MR. 11 Mr. Cha 12 We a 13 if we wa 14 haven't 15 stateme 16 of legis 17 look at a 18 say, tha 19 think th 20 certainl 21 we need 22 stateme 23 And 3 24 to it. I denoted	IRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer? MISSIONER MEYER: Aye. IRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton? MISSIONER PATON: Aye. IRMAN KIMBLE: The Chair votes aye. oved 4 to nothing. III, discussion and possible action on we director's report and legislative report. COLLINS: Yes. Thank you, mirman. The a couple of things. I don't know and to start at the top, but I do think, if you had a chance to read Chairman Kimble's not relating to the comments of some a co ators at the end of the session, please take that. You know, I think it's suffice it to the whatever subjective intent the members he al language was somebody, I think, took by myself and Chairman Kimble aback, and led to I think it was appropriate to make	uple a ad, I I think
25 09:2	25:39-09:30:54 Page 3	09:32:09-09:		Page 5
				9
1	PROCEEDING		IRMAN KIMBLE: No, I don't think so.	
2	CHAIDMAN KIMBI E: Good morning I call to	2 Thank y		
3	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Good morning. I call to meeting the May 30th, 2019, meeting of the Citizens		COLLINS: Okay. With respect to voter	ione
	Clean Elections Commission.		on, we've been working with local jurisdict	10118
5	Clean Elections Commission.	5 to neip	ensure folks have information about the	

- Item II, discussion and possible action on
- 7 Commission minutes for the April 25th, 19 -- 2019
- 8 meeting.
- Are there any comments or additions or
- 10 corrections to the minutes?
- 11 (No response.)
- 12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, we'll do a
- 13 roll call vote.
- Commissioner Chan? 14
- 15 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Oh, do you need a
- 16 motion, Mr. Chairman?
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Oh, that would be 17
- 18 helpful, yes.
- 19 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I would move that we
- 20 approve the minutes as written.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second? 21
- 22 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Second.
- 23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Roll call vote.
- 24 Commissioner Chan?
- 25 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.

- 6 elections that are happening. We did an interview in
- 7 the -- or last -- I guess, last quarter with the City
- 8 of Phoenix clerks about the City of Phoenix elections.
- 9 We did -- we spent some time with the mayor and town
- 10 administrators of Chino Valley about some significant
- 11 ballot questions there.
- Part of that was our effort to help provide
- 13 voters with more information about the fact that, you
- 14 know, there are elections going on around the --
- throughout the year, some of which may be the most
- important election to you. You know, in Chino Valley,
- for example, they were putting -- offering their first
- property tax in the town's history, and -- you know,
- 19 and that's a pretty significant decision there. So, in
- 20 any event, we've been doing that. I think that was
- 21 successful for the May 21st election.
- We've had Avery and then -- and then Alec
- and Gina at -- on a number of different events,
- 24 including events -- roundtable events hosted by the
- 25 Maricopa County Recorder. We've -- Avery has been to

09:33:41-09:35:06 Page 6 09:36:34-09:37:48 Page 8

- 1 the Community Leadership Breakfast sponsored by the
- **2** Phoenix Indian Center. We have -- Avery attended a
- 3 meeting of the African-American Commission and -- and
- 4 tomorrow Alec, Avery and Gina will be at the Native
- 5 Vote Strategy Session.
- 6 So we're continuing to try, in effect,
- 7 enhancing, with the additional staff we have through
- 8 Avery, our ability to be, you know, in touch with
- 9 leaders from a variety of communities. And I think
- 10 that builds on what we've been -- what we've been doing
- 11 over the course of the last five years.
- We are using -- we do have this Happy
- 13 Graduation Campaign on -- on the internet. It's pretty
- 14 cool. You can put a frame around your graduation
- 15 picture and a reminder to vote, you know, if you're 18.
- 16 So that was -- that was only put together relatively --
- 17 relatively quickly, but we hope to expand on going in
- 18 the future. We think it was a good -- a good pilot
- 19 there.
- 20 And we'll be -- we're a co-sponsor of the
- 21 Navajo Voters Coalition Voter Education Summit on
- 22 June 8th. So we've been helping to encourage
- 23 attendance, and my plan is to be -- I plan to be there
- **24** on the 8th.
- So -- and, then, we're doing -- later on

- 1 a -- on the last day, bills could be introduced. There
- 2 was a bill introduced, which we've been tracking, 2724,
- 3 which had serious constitutional problems in it. We
- 4 worked closely with the staffs of both houses, the
- 5 majority staff and minority staff, to articulate those
- 6 constitutional issues. We didn't actually -- bless
- 7 you.
- 8 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Excuse me.
- 9 MR. COLLINS: You know, we did not spend a
- 10 lot of time actually at -- physically at the capitol,
- 11 though we did, this year, make a concerted effort to
- 12 get out and meet more of the new lawmakers, as well as
- 13 lawmakers who had changed chairmanships and that kind
- 14 of thing. So we think overall this -- this was a
- 15 quite -- this was a pretty successful legislative
- 16 session, from our perspective.
- 17 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question.
- 18 MR. COLLINS: Sure, please.
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
- 20 COMMISSIONER PATON: So, to me, the fact
- 21 that we aren't able to have a lobbyist --
- MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
- 23 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- may even be better
- 24 because you're lobbying, right?
- MR. COLLINS: Well, I would say this. With

09:35:12-09:36:30 Page 7 09:37:51-09:39:07 Page 9

- 1 today, we're doing a brief interview with one of the --
- 2 with one of the experts on what's been going on at the
- 3 legislature just so voters know what they need to
- 4 expect at the ballot coming -- coming up going forward
- 5 after the -- after the -- after the general effective
- 6 date
- 7 We have the U.S. Term Limits matter on this
- 8 agenda. I think both Mr. LaSota and Mr. Gaona got
- 9 notice, right?
- 10 MS. THOMAS: Yes, sir.
- 11 MR. COLLINS: Okay. So -- and then we're
- 12 working -- and we'll get into that when we get into the
- 13 item. We'll get into more detail.
- 14 We still have some outstanding legal
- 15 matters. The Legacy Foundation Action Fund case is now
- 16 at the Court of Appeals, maybe, or -- no, not yet.
- 17 It's not yet at the Court of Appeals nor is AZAN versus
- 18 State yet at the Court of Appeals, but eventually,
- 19 those cases are anticipated to go to the Court of
- 20 Appeals by somebody.
- 21 And that really -- oh, and then -- and,
- 22 then, getting into the -- you know, if you have
- 23 specific questions that Mike can answer, but the
- 24 legislative report, I think, the big takeaway from the
- 25 legislation this year was that, you know, there was

- 1 the strategy that Mike and I have developed -- and Mike
- 2 is, really, the principal architect of -- is to say,
- 3 look, we -- we're not in a position, really, where --
- 4 because, as you all know, the legislature is very
- 5 ideologically divided on campaign finance issues. So
- 6 we're not in a position to really convince anyone on a
- 7 policy basis. You know, you either like what we do or
- 8 you don't, but -- so we focused on talking -- on,
- 9 essentially, speaking about the legal issues because
- 10 those, to us, are black and white.
- 11 And so, yeah, we -- the one success -- the
- 12 referendum that passed last year had a section we were
- 13 able to get -- negotiate with the rules attorneys in
- 14 the senate to have removed from the final piece of --
- 15 the final referendum, which actually would have made
- 16 that referendum significantly more problematic than it
- 17 was. This year we wrote about a number of
- 18 constitutional issues to the extent that, I think,
- 19 basically, folks came to the conclusion that if the
- 20 bill did something, it would probably be a VK problem
- 21 or the bill might not do anything.
- And I think that people had other
- 23 priorities with the budget and everything like that.
- 24 So it just didn't -- it didn't come -- it didn't come
- 25 back. We would expect -- so, yeah, I agree. I mean, I

09:39:10-09:40:16 Page 10 | 09:41:19-09:42:23 Page 12

- 1 think --
- 2 COMMISSIONER PATON: So you're, like,
- 3 effectively warning them of passing something that
- 4 would be dubious.
- 5 MR. COLLINS: That's exactly right,
- 6 Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Paton, and I think that
- 7 that's been a good strategy so far. We feel
- 8 comfortable with that, and it seems to -- it seems --
- 9 it seems to work. I mean, like, I think, both Mike and
- 10 I are more comfortable -- policy discussions don't
- 11 really get us anywhere but, you know -- you know, so we
- 12 really approach these things as legal issues more than
- 13 political issues, at this point. And I think that's
- 14 been helpful for the last couple of years. So I agree,
- 15 and so I think we're doing all right.
- 16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other questions for
- 17 Mr. Collins on his executive director's report?
- 18 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I just have a quick
- 19 question, Mr. Chairman.
- 20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
- 21 COMMISSIONER MEYER: On the Happy
- 22 Graduation Campaign, one, that's a great idea. I'm
- 23 always continually amazed at the creative ideas you
- 24 come up with to promote voter education.
- MR. COLLINS: This was entirely 100 percent

- 1 track all of those posts that we have. It's a
- 2 completely digital campaign. So, yes, we would be able
- 3 to track the success for it.
- 4 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Can you -- is there,
- 5 like, email blast or anything you did, like, to send it
- **6** to school superintendents or stuff like that?
- 7 MS. ROBERTS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner,
- 8 we -- I did send an email to the Public Information
- 9 Officer at the Department of Education about this. I
- 10 haven't received a response back yet. I just sent it a
- 11 few days ago. As Tom mentioned, we, kind of, did this
- 12 really quickly, so I'm hopping to get a response back
- 13 from them. We would have loved the opportunity to even
- 14 get Superintendent Hoffman down to the mural and get,
- 15 you know, her in front of the wings to help support
- 16 this and amplify this message because we have been
- 17 seeing a lot of Happy Graduation messaging coming out
- 18 of, you know, the teachers and the administrators.
- 19 So we do have that email out there, but we
- 20 can, also, follow up on it to see if they can, also,
- 21 send it out to the other administrators, as well.
- 22 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I think it's a great
- 23 idea. I mean, something you can do every year and just
- 24 build on it. So, well done.
- 25 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

09:40:18-09:41:16 Page 11 09:42:23-09:43:37 Page 13

- 1 Gina's idea. She literally walked into my office and
- 2 said, hey, why don't we do something for graduation?
- 3 So it was -- that was -- so all -- you know, all
- 4 compliments to Gina on this one.
- 5 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Great job. And I'm
- 6 just curious, is there a way to track how many --
- 7 COMMISSIONER PATON: I was going to ask.
- 8 COMMISSIONER MEYER: -- people are doing
- 9 that?
- 10 MS. ROBERTS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner
- 11 Meyer, I just wanted to speak on the microphone so that
- 12 the reporter can hear me.
- Yes, we track all of our campaigns. So we
- 14 will -- after -- the campaign is going to run for four
- 15 weeks total. So we have about three weeks left of it
- 16 to run, and once that ends, we will track the success
- 17 of it, the metrics, how many people -- you know,
- 18 impressions we got, how many people actually used it.
- 19 So, the frame that Tom mentioned, it says, "I
- 20 registered to vote."
- 21 We -- I think in the ED report, it
- 22 mentions, you know, we're targeting parents to say,
- 23 hey, when you're celebrating with your -- with your new
- 24 graduates, you know, present them with the voter
- 25 registration form as part of their present. So we can

- 1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you.
- 2 Any other comments on the executive
- 3 director's report?
- 4 (No response.)
- 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Item IV, discussion and
- 6 possible action on final audit approval for the 2018
- 7 general election participating candidates, Rebecca
- 8 Speakman and Kathy Hoffman.
- **9** Tom?
- 10 MR. COLLINS: Yeah. Yes. Mr. Chairman
- 11 and -- and Commissioners, so I believe -- both
- 12 candidates, I think, received notice this was going to
- 13 be on the agenda, I assume. I don't know. Do we know?
- 14 Yeah, they did. Okay. So -- but I'm not totally
- 15 shocked they're not here.
- So, Mike has been working with the auditors
- 17 on these. Kathy Hoffman was just the last statewide
- **18** candidate to get wrapped up. The Speakman situation is
- 19 a little more complicated, as you can tell from reading
- 20 the -- the audit itself. So, as you know, approval of
- 21 the audit is not the same as approval of the -- you
- 22 know, the actions detailed in the audit.23 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Sure.
- MR. COLLINS: So, for that -- for that
- 25 purpose, we would recommend -- and I think we've -- I

09:43:41-09:44:58 Page 14 09:45:50-09:46:33 Page 16

- 1 sent -- we put out a recommended motion. Basically,
- 2 what we're asking for is approval of the audits on A
- 3 and B. Of course, Mike and I are willing -- or happy
- 4 to take questions on those. And then, obviously, we
- 5 are looking for authorization to do a more extensive
- 6 audit on Candidate Speakman.
- So with that, I welcome any questions
- 8 anyone has on the audits, and Mike and I are ready to
- 9 answer any questions you might have.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any questions on these 10
- 11 two audits?
- 12 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. 13
- COMMISSIONER PATON: So, from what -- from 14
- 15 reading the thing about the Candidate Speakman, did she
- 16 turn anything in?
- MR. BECKER: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner 17
- 18 Paton, yes, the candidate did turn in some information
- 19 to get the preliminary audit moving, but when the
- 20 auditor went back to her asking for more information
- 21 regarding bank statements, receipts, things like that,
- 22 there was no response. We contacted her, several phone
- 23 calls, emails. I emailed her. The auditor emailed
- 24 her. The auditor called her. I called her. We sent
- 25 her letters. In fact, I was even speaking with her

- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The Chair votes aye.
- 2 It's approved 4 to nothing.
- Any other motions on these audits? 3
- 4 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman?
- 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer?
- COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman, I move
- 7 we authorize staff to move forward with the full audit
- of Candidate Speakman.
- COMMISSIONER CHAN: I would second that
- 10 motion, Mr. Chairman.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: It's been moved and 11
- 12 seconded that we authorize staff to move forward with
- 13 the full audit of Candidate Speakman.
- Roll call vote. 14
- 15 Commissioner Chan?
- 16 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer? 17
- 18 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Ave.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton? 19
- COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. 20
- 21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The Chair votes aye.
- 22 It's approved 4 to nothing.
- Item V, discussion and possible action on
- 24 MUR 18-14, U.S. Term Limits, Inc.
- 25 Tom?

09:45:03-09:45:49 Page 15 09:46:33-09:48:04 Page 17

- 1 father-in-law, who's also a candidate for the
- 2 legislature, and he was trying to get her involved and
- 3 still no response.
- And so this is the next step to move
- 5 forward and do a full audit and then see what
- 6 information we can gather.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other questions on
- 8 these two audits?
- 9 (No response.)
- 10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Do we have a motion on
- **11** both or either audit?
- 12 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman.
- 13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer?
- COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman, I move 14
- 15 we approve the Hoffman and Speakman audits.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second? 16
- 17 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Second.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: We'll do a roll call 18
- **19** vote.
- 20 Commissioner Chan?
- 21 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
- 22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer?
- 23 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton? 24
- 25 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.

- MR. COLLINS: Yes, Mr. Chairman,
- 2 Commissioners, so a couple of things we're trying to
- 3 accomplish here. We have what I would call -- well,
- 4 sufficient agreement amongst myself as staff for the
- 5 head of the AG's governmental accountability unit and
- 6 as staff in his capacity as -- you know, staff capacity
- and Mr. LaSota on behalf of U.S. Term Limits.
- I do need to note that the -- obviously,
- 9 the AG's office is an independent agency in this
- 10 context. I am -- you know, they are moving on a
- 11 similar trajectory to us in terms of getting final
- 12 approval from their front office, much like you give
- 13 final approval for our end of this.
- We think that this matter, this
- conciliation does a couple of things. Number 1, it's
- efficient because it ensures that the Commission and
- the Attorney General resolve two ends of a case that
- are not necessarily related -- or they're related, but
- they're not necessarily legally joined; but it gets the
- whole picture, which I think is a very good step and
- something we've been able to do consistently with the
- 22 Attorney General's office. And I -- and I commend them
- 23 for their help on that.
- So we assume they will -- we don't know and
- 25 I can't assure, but I am confident that they will also

09:48:09-09:49:46 Page 18 | 09:51:19-09:52:46 Page 20

- 1 approve this formally. I'm confident that Mr. LaSota
- 2 will sign if we approve it. So, really, it's -- and,
- 3 basically, what it does is goes over the fact that the
- 4 group, U.S. Term Limits, which is a -- it's a
- 5 longstanding 501. It's -- I mean, there's even -- I
- 6 mean, there's a very famous U.S. Supreme Court case
- 7 involving U.S. Term Limits where their efforts to have
- 8 term limits imposed on Congress by state legislators
- 9 were struck down.
- 10 So this is -- and so, you know, given that
- 11 there's not -- we do, you know, still maintain that
- 12 these were electioneering communications, but for
- 13 purposes of conciliation, obviously, we're -- we're
- 14 always willing to -- you know, to allow some, you now,
- 15 leeway on the -- well, not just leeway, but it's a
- 16 settlement. In other words, we don't have -- we don't
- 17 demand an admission of wrongdoing by USTL, and I don't
- 18 think that, frankly, as a national group coming in
- 19 Arizona, it would be -- I mean, it's not true of all
- 20 cases, but in this case, I think that it's reasonable.
- The amount of the fine overall, though it's
- 22 split between us and AGO when this is all done, is
- 23 basically 10 percent of what they could have been
- 24 fined, which is consistent with our conciliation
- 25 practices. And, then, most importantly, we'll get the

- 1 whatever the number is, you double that. That's how
- 2 you get to the 58 -- whatever the --
- 3 COMMISSIONER MEYER: 53,000?
- 4 MR. COLLINS: -- the 53, and then we -- and
- 5 then we just took it down to 10. Now, I think that,
- 6 you know, obviously, you know, the amount that we
- 7 enforce in terms of fines is always open to discussion.
- 8 You know, our issue has always been to try to get the
- 9 reports first, you know, and make sure we can get that
- 10 locked in and not let the dollars interfere with
- 11 getting the public information.
- We don't -- the fact of the matter is that
- 13 because the fines don't really keep up with inflation
- 14 exactly, it's -- you know, it's -- because a day --
- 15 it's a day-to-day thing, not an overall spending thing,
- **16** that creates a -- I wouldn't call it a distortion.
- 17 It's just the metric for -- the metric for penalty is
- **18** different from the metric of value of the expenditure.
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, I semi-understand
- 20 that, but you were -- you were just talking about that
- 21 U.S. Term Limits is a large national organization. And
- 22 is a fine of this amount going to be sufficient to
- 23 deter them from doing this again or -- it seems like
- 24 pocket change to them.
- 25 MR. COLLINS: I think that what is

09:49:48-09:51:14 Page 19 09:52:49-09:54:20 Page 21

- 1 reports filed within two weeks after this -- after this
- 2 agreement is resolved.
- 3 So with all that having been said, unless
- 4 you have particular questions left over from the
- 5 background materials and things that -- that you -- any
- 6 other questions you have, my recommendation is that we
- 7 would approve this conciliation agreement, and then I8 would -- you know, then we would, you know, circulate a
- 9 signed copy to, you know, our counterparties, so to
- 10 speak.
- 11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well --
- MR. COLLINS: But the AG is not a
- 13 counterparty. It's just in this -- in its own
- 14 capacity, just -- but it's hard to figure out the
- 15 exact, correct language.
- 16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Well, Mr. Collins, so
- 17 this involves spending of close to \$27,000, and the
- 18 total settlement is \$5,400, roughly. You said this is
- 19 10 percent of what they could have been fined. To a
- 20 laymen such as myself, it seems awfully lenient.
- 21 MR. COLLINS: Well, it's 10 percent of --
- 22 see, our fines are based on time, not value. So,
- 23 because there hadn't been reports filed -- they also
- 24 cap out at twice the amount of the spend. So,
- 25 basically, once you get to 27,000, you can -- or

- 1 sufficient to deter them from doing this again is the
- 2 fact that, notwithstanding the -- I don't know how to
- 3 put this. Entities that come from outside of Arizona
- 4 do not necessarily understand some of the differences
- 5 between Arizona law and the U.S. Supreme Court's law
- 6 with respect to absolute bans on -- on speech by
- 7 corporations, which are all gone. So reporting is
- 8 still allowed.
- 9 Our basis for requiring reporting is set
- 10 forth -- is set forth in both statute and case law. I
- 11 think the biggest concern of a group like this is they
- 12 don't want any trouble with the IRS. So I would think
- 13 that, even if they -- even if they were -- you know, we
- 14 believe they were communicating in electioneering, they
- 15 probably don't want the mailers counted towards their
- 16 advocacy, sort of, numbers as they're working with the
- 17 IRS. And that's really the big -- the big -- the IRS
- **18** carries the bigger hammer in this than we do.
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Any other comments
- 20 or questions from other members of the commission?
- 21 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I have a question.
- 22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer?
- 23 COMMISSIONER MEYER: So, Tom, help me
- 24 understand this.
- 25 Did the U.S. Term Limits -- do you think

09:54:22-09:55:25 Page 22 09:56:55-09:57:50 Page 24

- 1 they understood they were violating our reporting
- 2 obligations?
- 3 MR. COLLINS: No.
- 4 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Okay. So -- so, one,
- 5 it looks, like, under paragraph E on page 2 here --
- 6 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
- 7 COMMISSIONER MEYER: -- that once you
- 8 notified them of the issue, they did comply and provide
- 9 the information that you requested.
- MR. COLLINS: Both -- they both began to
- 11 file -- they filed for the General Election -- and,
- 12 also, they provided me the information that I've asked
- 13 for. Yes.
- 14 COMMISSIONER MEYER: So once they were
- 15 aware of their obligations, they began to report?
- MR. COLLINS: That's correct. They did not
- 17 go back and report the primary spending because they
- 18 were, basically, you know, essentially, reserving
- 19 their, you know, right to litigate that. And, as you
- 20 recall, they narrowed it to the issue of expressed
- 21 advocacy purely. They did not dispute the timing,
- 22 targeting, any of that. It was expressly whether or
- 23 not the document was expressed advocacy. Yeah, they
- 24 reserved that to have this conversation, but -- I mean,
- 25 to have -- to either -- to either have an

- MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
- 2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
- 3 COMMISSIONER PATON: It seems to me that
- 4 maybe they didn't know exactly that they were violating
- 5 our --
- 6 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
- 7 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- our laws here. And
- 8 then they tried to play nice after that, but it does
- **9** seem like we are spending an inordinate amount of time
- 10 dealing with this. I mean, it's been on the agenda
- 11 many, many times.
- 12 MR. COLLINS: Right.
- 13 COMMISSIONER PATON: So if it's on our
- 14 agenda, that means it's on our -- you know, your
- 15 staff's agenda.
- 16 MR. COLLINS: Yeah, yeah.
- 17 COMMISSIONER PATON: And it's taken a lot
- 18 of time
- 19 MR. COLLINS: Sure.
- 20 COMMISSIONER PATON: And I think we do a
- 21 lot of -- the staff seems to do a lot of work on these
- 22 items, and I think like Commissioner Kimble. \$5,000
- 23 seems like -- I mean, to a normal person maybe it seems
- 24 like it's a lot, but to these people it's probably not.
- 25 So I think maybe in the future we can look to making

09:55:28-09:56:54 Page 23 09:57:56-09:58:49

- 1 administrative proceeding or else to conciliate.
- And, obviously, we've already done probable
- 3 cause, I think, at the last meeting. And so this is --
- 4 this is, in our rules, the next -- I mean, there's
- 5 always an opportunity to conciliate, but there's a6 specific rule that allows for post probable cause
- 7 conciliation at the request of the respondent. And so
- 8 that's where we are with USTL.
- 9 You know, as I say, I mean, we can have a
- 10 broader conversation -- and I'd be happy to -- about
- 11 what we want to do in terms of the ratio of fine to --
- **12** potential fine. I mean, that's -- because that comes
- 13 up regularly. We have tried to become a little more
- 14 predictable in terms of setting some percentage -- some
- 15 threshold percentages. You know, they don't always
- 16 work out perfectly, but -- but, you know, we -- we
- 17 don't think we're out of step with other agencies.
- 18 The fact that the Attorney General's
- 19 Office, in its independent capacity, is considering the
- 20 same agreement and at least the person at my level, you
- 21 know, is going to present, as I am, the recommendation
- 22 that I'm making gives me some confidence we're in the
- 23 ballpark of -- you know, of reasonable. And I, also --
- 24 you know, but there's, I mean --
- 25 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question.

- 1 this more expensive penalties because we're spending so
- 2 much time and effort to get to the bottom of this --
- 3 MR. COLLINS: Sure, sure.
- 4 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- and get them to act
- 5 and to get them to turn stuff in to us --
- 6 MR. COLLINS: Right.
- 7 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- and whatever. And
- 8 so, in this case, I would go with the conciliation
- 9 because --
- 10 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
- 11 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- they haven't been
- 12 obstinate or anything like that, but I agree. It
- 13 sounds like a small amount when we are spending a lot
- 14 of time and effort dealing with it.
- 15 MR. COLLINS: Understood.
- 16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other comments from
- 17 commissioners?
- 18 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Yes.
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
- 20 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I mean, I agree a lot
- 21 with what Commissioner Paton said. I -- due to the
- 22 fact that, one, they weren't aware of this obligation
- 23 to comply and then, two, they did comply and worked
- 24 with us as soon as the requests were made or when the
- 25 requests were made, I think this re -- this

Page 25

09:58:53-09:59:44 Page 26 10:00:52-10:01:56 Page 28

- 1 conciliation is fine at this time. I think now that
- 2 they're aware of what their obligations are, if this
- 3 happens again, then, I think --
- 4 MR. COLLINS: Sure.
- 5 COMMISSIONER MEYER: -- we would look at
- 6 this through an entirely different lens.
- 7 MR. COLLINS: Sure.
- 8 COMMISSIONER MEYER: So on the -- so I
- 9 support this amount.
- And on the issue of the amount of time and
- 11 whatnot we've put into this, I don't think that the
- 12 purpose of this fine is to -- is to compensate the
- 13 Commission for the work they've put into this. I think
- 14 the purpose of this fine is to try to provide notice
- 15 and deter them from doing this again in the future.
- 16 And, I think -- from the factual background I have
- 17 here, I think that's going to happen. So I will
- 18 support this conciliation, as well.
- 19 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman?
- 20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
- 21 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Since everybody else
- 22 weighed in, I'll take a turn, too.
- 23 I support this conciliation agreement. I'm
- 24 very cynical. So I feel like organizations like this
- 25 probably know exactly what they're doing, and they're

- 1 So I think that you do have to take each
- 2 case individually, and it does matter to me and, I
- 3 think, it would matter to the Commission and the AG's
- 4 office, too, and to ourselves as commissioners if we
- 5 saw the same people coming back or doing the same thing
- 6 they had done in another jurisdiction and been dinged
- 7 for here, if that makes sense.
- 8 So I agree, I guess, with everything
- 9 everybody has said, and I would support this
- 10 conciliation agreement.
- 11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I would -- I would just
- 12 say one other thing. We're not dealing with some naive
- 13 legislative candidate from Gila Bend who's never run
- 14 for office before and doesn't understand the
- 15 intricacies of it. This is an organization that this
- 16 is what they do.
- 17 MR. COLLINS: Right.
- 18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And if they didn't know
- 19 what Arizona law was, then they should have checked
- 20 before they started playing in Arizona elections. And
- 21 it still seems awfully little to me.
- MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, if I can make
- 23 one other observation. I mean, the other thing we have
- 24 here is, you know, we have -- we have an expressed
- 25 advocacy definition here in statute that's part of the

09:59:46-10:00:51 Page 27 10:02:02-10:03:23 Page 29

- 1 playing fast and loose with the rules. I'm not
- 2 saying -- again, I do support this. I'm not saying I
- 3 don't, but I appreciate that we are willing to, kind
- 4 of, give somebody a mulligan.
- 5 And, then, I agree with what, I think,
- 6 Commissioner Meyer was trying to point out that, you
- 7 know, if this particular organization comes back and
- 8 does the same thing, I think definitely we have to go
- 9 for more harsher penalties, like I would expect us to
- 10 do in any case.
- 11 You know, I always harken back to when I
- 12 was election director for the Secretary of State, and
- 13 if I truly believed -- I mean, I like that human
- 14 aspect. When you're talking to the person who was
- 15 responsible for the spending and they're saying to you,
- 16 I am really sorry; I had no idea; we were doing our
- 17 best to exercise our First Amendments rights in a way
- 18 that we thought was legal and acceptable, I took them
- 19 at their word.
- 20 Sometimes there were people I didn't
- 21 believe because I knew they had experience in other
- 22 arenas, maybe not with our office, but that they had
- 23 done the same thing in our jurisdictions, et cetera.
- 24 So those people maybe we would not be as conciliatory
- 25 with.

- 1 Clean Elections Act, and we also have a case called the
- 2 Committee for Justice and Fairness v. -- whoever it
- 3 was. And -- and that -- and that case lays out that
- 4 the standards for disclosure are not the standards
- 5 for -- for not speaking at all, which is what the issue
- 6 was in this Wisconsin Right to Life case.
- 7 That's how we see the law here. It may
- 8 very well be -- and I know that, you know, if you're
- 9 getting your compliance advice from Washington, the
- 10 prevailing view is that WRTL controls all these things,
- 11 which is just -- this is wishful reading to me, but --
- 12 but nevertheless, there is -- there are campaign
- 13 finance agencies out of state who believe the Supreme
- 14 Court has held other than it has held about disclosure
- 15 in this context.
- And we also have a case that because of
- 17 the -- for lack of a better way of putting it --
- 18 dilatory actions of the respondents, we already have a
- 19 case on expressed advocacy that's not resolved. And
- 20 I'm -- my preference -- and conciliation is a tradeoff.
- 21 My preference is to get the reports from the people
- 22 now, get what -- you know, have some monetary23 association but not start loading up the courts with
- 24 questions about expressed advocacy because there is a
- 25 case there, you know. And so it's a give and take.

10:03:27-10:04:32 Page 30 10:05:23-10:06:24 Page 32

- 1 I mean, there's -- there's just -- you
- 2 know, if you can get the reports without having to go
- 3 through -- what are we now on, what, five years of
- 4 litigation we LFAF? Then I take the reports. That's
- 5 just my -- you know, so -- but definitely, we can have
- 6 a broader discussion about how this works in general
- 7 because I am -- certainly.
- 8 And you're -- you know, just so you know
- 9 and the parties know, everybody knows, I don't bind you
- 10 all. So you are -- you know, if you want to -- if you
- 11 want to vote on this now, that's your -- I mean, if
- 12 that was your choice, that's -- you're fully within
- 13 your rights. You're not obligated to follow any --
- 14 anything -- anything we recommend. That's just what we
- 15 recommend.
- 16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any more comments on this
- **17** item?
- 18 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman?
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
- 20 COMMISSIONER MEYER: As someone who does
- 21 litigation for a living, I just want to reinforce what
- 22 Tom just said about -- what I heard him say was
- 23 sometimes, you know, you have to resolve matters so you
- 24 get the information you want. And it's not about
- 25 winning or losing, per se, in that specific case. It's

- 1 and seconded that we approve the conciliation agreement
- 2 with U.S. Term Limits, Inc.
- 3 Roll call vote.
- 4 Commissioner Chan?
- 5 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
- 6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer?
- 7 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.
- 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton?
- 9 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
- 10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The Chair votes no. It
- **11** approves 3 to 1.
- 12 Item VI, discussion and possible action on
- 13 the following rule changes for 60-day public comment
- 14 period: A, amendment to A.A.C. R2-20-702,
- 15 participating candidates use of clean elections
- 16 funding; B, amendment to A.A.C. R2-20-704, repayment of
- 17 Clean Elections funding; C, amendment to A.A.C.
- 18 R2-20-113, candidate statements; and, D, amendment to
- **19** A.A.C. R2-20-104, loans to participating candidates.
- **20** Tom?
- MR. COLLINS: Yes. I don't -- I'm not sure
- 22 what the best order to taking them is, but I will take
- 23 them in the order they're presented, if that's all
- 24 right with everyone.
- 25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Sure.

10:04:35-10:05:22 Page 31 10:06:24-10:07:45 Page 33

- 1 a bigger goal. It's the bigger picture of what is
- 2 our -- what are we trying to accomplish, what is our
- 3 objective. And getting the reports and being able to
- 4 provide that information, I think, is a primary
- 5 objective.
- 6 And -- I guess I'll leave it at that, but I
- 7 agree with what Tom just said very much.
- 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other -- any other
- **9** comments on Item V?
- 10 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, can I
- 11 just make a motion?
- 12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yes. Commissioner Chan?
- 13 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Would it just be to
- **14** adopt the conciliation agreement?
- 15 MR. COLLINS: To authorize -- yeah. I
- 16 guess --
- 17 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I am sorry.
- 18 MR. COLLINS: No, It's my fault. Just,
- 19 yeah, to approve the conciliation agreement.
- 20 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Okay. Mr. Chairman, I
- **21** would move that we approve the recommended conciliation
- 22 agreement.
- 23 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I would second that
- 24 motion.
- 25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Second? It's been moved

- 1 MR. COLLINS: And Mike is here. He drafted
- 2 these. So if you're -- he may have other -- if you
- 3 have questions that go beyond my knowledge, please do
- 4 and ask him. And then we have a voter-ed related one,
- **5** too.
- 6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Before you start, is it
- 7 safe to say that all these changes are driven by
- 8 legislation?
- 9 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman --
- 10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Not initiated by us?
- 11 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, the change in
- 12 Rule 702 is driven by legislation. The change in --
- **13** but the changes in 704, 113 and 104 -- specifically 704
- 14 and 104, without getting into divulging any
- 15 attorney-client issues, have to do with some analysis
- 16 we've done about the rules and some problematic issues
- 17 in them that we would like to correct. They had --
- 18 those rules have not been reviewed in some time until
- 19 recently. And then 7 -- then 113 deals with a --
- 20 essentially, codifying what's become the practice of
- 21 the Commission so that they're -- with respect to
- **22** candidate statements.
- 23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.
- MR. COLLINS: So that's how it is.
- 25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Go ahead. You

10:07:48-10:09:14 Page 34 | 10:10:29-10:11:27 Page 36

- 1 want to go through them in order?
- 2 MR. COLLINS: Sure. So, 702, this is the
- 3 306 change. As you recall, Prop -- this is the party
- 4 piece. As you recall, 306 said that money may not be
- 5 paid directly or indirectly to a party or a 501 group
- 6 that can spend money on candidates. So -- and it,
- 7 also -- so what we've done here is we've taken out the
- 'C' C 1 701/\):
- 8 specific reference to tax-exempt status under 501(a) in
- 9 Section A. And then, with respect to parties, the
- 10 advanced payment to parties, we just took all this out
- 11 because it's -- that's just not allowed anymore.
- So that's it. I mean, it's that simple. I
- 13 mean, basically, this is taking the language of 306
- 14 with respect to parties, taking any authorization that
- 15 was in 702 to use money in a way that's now prohibited
- 16 expressly by 306, and that's it.
- 17 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman?
- 18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
- 19 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Tom, they can still
- 20 make a payment from their campaign bank account to a
- 21 political committee, though, or civic organization?
- 22 What would examples of that be? And that wasn't
- 23 prohibited by 306?
- 24 MR. COLLINS: It was absolutely not
- 25 prohibited by 306. 306 was express about political

- 1 not political -- co-op political that invite folks to
- 2 talk about --
- 3 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Like the chamber or
- 4 something?
- MR. COLLINS: Or the chamber or -- you
- 6 know, I mean, we've -- I mean, an example is we've had
- 7 a table at the Panhellenic Conference the last couple
- 8 of times before elections. We've had --
- 9 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Okay.
- MR. COLLINS: We've had what -- we are out
- 11 at National Voter Registration Day. I mean, we're
- 12 doing a lot of stuff. I assume that, I mean, the
- 13 candidates do the same kinds of things. I mean, if
- 14 civic organization means anything, you know, if it
- 15 means that, you know, you send -- you spend 20 -- \$20
- 16 to get your campaign ad in a -- in a program of a --
- 17 you know, of -- you know, your neighborhood association
- 18 or something like that, I mean, that's clearly not --
- 19 well, first of all, 306 does not affect that and,
- 20 second of all, that would be another example, you know,
- 21 here.
- 22 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Thank you. And,
- 23 Mr. Chairman, Tom, I didn't mean --
- MR. COLLINS: No, no, no.
- 25 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I didn't mean that I

10:09:20-10:10:26 Page 35 | 10:11:29-10:12:29 Page 37

- 1 parties and 501(a) groups that can -- I shouldn't have
- 2 included the text in here. I'm sorry -- and 501(a)
- 3 groups that can spend on candidates. So our striking
- 4 here is actually even broader than what 306 requires
- 5 because we're not reserving the right to make
- 6 contributions to -- or not make contributions -- to
- 7 make purchases from 501 groups that don't make
- 8 expenditures on candidates. We're just taking the
- **9** whole 501 out.
- 10 They did not say anything about political
- 11 committees. The only objection they raised to civic
- 12 organizations was the addition of the 501(a) language.
- 13 So that's gone, and there's nothing in the language.
- 14 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, Tom, what
- 15 are -- what are some examples -- real world examples
- 16 how clean candidates would make -- like, what kind of
- 17 payments do our clean candidates make to political
- 18 committees or civic organizations? Do you -- I'm
- 19 putting you on the spot a little bit, but I'm just
- 20 curious about --
- 21 MR. COLLINS: Well, I think the most
- 22 obvious one is attendance at events. I think that, you
- 23 know, I mean, having a table set up might cost you 50
- 24 bucks at either a community -- or 25 bucks. I don't
- 25 know. I mean, there are all kinds of groups that are

- 1 thought that violated 306. I was just curious what
- 2 that actually looked like and meant.
- 3 MR. COLLINS: It's a fair question. I
- 4 didn't take it that way. I just -- I just -- 306 says
- 5 what it says, and it doesn't say what it doesn't say.
- 6 And so we've -- I mean, in analyzing this -- and, I
- 7 mean, this is -- this is my recommendation, as much as
- 8 any other, but you know, we did talk about that
- 9 arguable inconsistency. But it's not our job to fix
- **10** that.
- 11 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Well, and I think
- 12 that's why I supported the inclusion and specificity of
- 13 our rule which, again, the voters, obviously, approved
- 14 this change.
- 15 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
- 16 COMMISSIONER CHAN: So, thank you for
- 17 explaining that.
- 18 MR. COLLINS: No. Yeah, I hope -- I hope
- 19 that's the explanation. I think -- I think, you know,
- 20 the political committee thing -- we'll see. You know,
- 21 we may be back in a year, you know, talking about --
- 22 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Civic organization?
- 23 MR. COLLINS: -- what's a civic
- 24 organization. I don't know, but I know that this both
- 25 addressed what's in the text of 306 and what Scott

10:12:32-10:13:58 Page 38 | 10:14:50-10:15:41 Page 40

- 1 Musey, who is the leading proponent of all of the
- 2 anti-Clean Elections measures in the legislature,
- 3 specifically complained about in his testimony.
- 4 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other questions or
- 5 comments about 2 -- 702?
- 6 MR. COLLINS: And he's got a chance to
- 7 public comment. People can -- this is only open for
- 8 public comment. They can --
- 9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Right. Right, by people
- 10 here.
- Okay. Tom, you want to discuss 704?
- MR. COLLINS: Yeah. 704 is pretty easy.
- 13 We came upon this rule which dates to, at least, at the
- 14 best we can determine, 2001. It's problematic in two
- 15 respects. One, it's a repayment-specific rule. The
- 16 statute of limitations for repayment to the State does
- 17 not -- there is not one. So, by imposing by rule a
- 18 one-year implicit rule of limitation, we are not -- we
- 19 are, sort of, waiving -- or implicitly waiving an
- 20 important defense.
- 21 And -- and relatedly -- and this is where
- 22 we bring the second piece, which is that the Clean
- 23 Elections statute itself says the Commission is to
- 24 monitor inflows and outflows from the account to make
- 25 sure money is placed in accounts as necessary and not

- 1 through all of them.
- 2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yeah, let's go through
- 3 all of them and see if we need to --
- 4 MR. COLLINS: Okay. Okay. Okay.
- 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other questions about
- **6** 704?
- 7 (No response.)
- 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Tom, 113?
- 9 MR. COLLINS: 113, this is --
- 10 COMMISSIONER PATON: Well, actually, I do
- 11 have a question.
- 12 MR. COLLINS: Yes.
- 13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton?
- **14** COMMISSIONER PATON: So if you -- so what's
- 15 the penalty if they keep on stringing this out more
- 16 than a year?
- MR. COLLINS: This is -- the problem is
- 18 that the one year is a restriction on us, not on them.
- 19 So that's the issue. The issue is it's restricting our
- 20 ability to go out.
- 21 And, then, I would answer -- I would answer
- 22 one -- I would note one other thing. This rule is
- 23 vague as to what "election" would mean, anyway. So by
- 24 taking out the -- this self-imposed rule of limitation,
- 25 you don't have to deal with which was the primary,

10:14:01-10:14:48 Page 39 10:15:44-10:16:48 Page 41

- 1 otherwise.
- 2 So those two things together, to me, make
- 3 clear that we need to make this change. Again, I don't
- 4 want to -- I don't -- I'm not sure how to quite talk
- 5 about this without waiving any -- I'm looking down at
- 6 Kara to --
- 7 MS. KARLSON: Yeah.
- 8 MR. COLLINS: Do you have anything you want
- 9 to add? Let me put it that way. Do you have anything
- 10 you want to add, or have I covered what we need to say?
- MS. KARLSON: I think you've covered what
- **12** you need to say, unless there's additional questions.
- 13 MR. COLLINS: Okay. All right.
- 14 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any questions
- 15 from the commissioners?
- 16 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I have a legal
- 17 question on the statute of limitations that I don't
- 18 really want to bring up. It's more of an executive
- 19 session.
- 20 MS. KARLSON: Yeah, that --
- 21 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Okay.
- MR. COLLINS: Well, we could always go into
- 23 executive session, if you'd like.
- 24 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Should we --
- 25 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Why don't we go

- 1 general. It just doesn't -- it's a -- this is -- this
- 2 just makes sure that if we don't catch you with
- 3 something you need to repay within a year of the
- 4 election, we can still go after you under our -- under
- 5 our --
- 6 COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay.
- 7 MR. COLLINS: -- under our express
- 8 authority --
- 9 COMMISSIONER PATON: It doesn't relieve
- 10 them of the fact they have to pay.
- 11 MR. COLLINS: That's absolutely correct.
- 12 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman and
- 13 Commissioner Paton, thank you, because, for some
- 14 reason, I was reading it, I think, the way you were,
- 15 and then what Tom just said cleared it up for me. So,
- 16 frankly, I don't think I need to go into executive
- 17 session for this, but if we -- if other commissioners
- 18 do, that's fine. I think I need more coffee.
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Let's move on to
- **20** 113, Tom.
- MR. COLLINS: Okay. 113 is an effort to
- 22 codify what has become -- I wouldn't say a formal
- 23 practice because those words are crucid, but I would
- 24 say an accommodation that we regularly make to25 candidates who request it, which is when they run

10:16:50-10:18:07 Page 42 10:19:50-10:20:59 Page 44

- 1 something for the primary but don't want to write a
- 2 different thing for the general, we'll run their
- 3 general thing, their general statement.
- Oftentimes, what that means is Gina and
- 5 Alec and others will be calling members -- or not
- 6 members -- campaigns and saying, hey, what do you want
- 7 to do? And, oftentimes, they will say, well, can you
- 8 run my old one instead? So what this says is,
- 9 basically, if you choose not to submit a general
- 10 candidate -- General Election candidate statement
- 11 but -- you know, and are advancing, unless you --
- 12 unless you give us a General Election statement, we
- 13 will use your primary statement.
- 14 And we'll make that -- people aware of that
- 15 so that they don't have to call in and do this, sort
- 16 of, like, oh, can you do this? Can you do that? It
- 17 will make things more efficient on the production side
- 18 for sure. And, as I say, it's never been a --
- 19 "practice" is probably a word we will never use again
- 20 after today in this room, but it is a -- it is an
- 21 informal ad hoc request-driven decision that we now
- 22 want to codify.
- 23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Any questions
- **24** about 113?
- 25 (No audible response.)

- 1 managed to not only not repay himself but to -- it
- 2 turned out not to matter that he did this, but it did
- 3 point up that we would like to have our guidance and
- our rules line up.
- And we think this is more consistent with
- the statute than allowing, you know, a loan amount of
- the entire -- I mean, I don't think the entire amount
- of your seed money, for example --
- 9 COMMISSIONER PATON: So I have a question.
- 10 MR. COLLINS: Yeah, yeah.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton? 11
- 12 COMMISSIONER PATON: To clear this up in my
- 13 mind.
- 14 MR. COLLINS: Yeah. Sure.
- 15 COMMISSIONER PATON: So the person borrowed
- more money than what the top expenditure that was set
- **17** forth?
- MR. COLLINS: It should be -- it should be 18
- or shouldn't be? Should not be? Okay. 19
- 20 That 2 will need to be struck. I'm sorry,
- 21 but -- I'm sorry, Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Paton.
- COMMISSIONER PATON: So they borrowed more 22
- 23 money than the expenditure limit?
- MR. COLLINS: They borrowed -- no. They 24
- 25 borrowed as much money as one expenditure limit would

10:18:08-10:19:44 Page 43 10:21:03-10:22:20 Page 45

- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. And, finally, 104,
- **2** Tom?
- MR. COLLINS: Yeah, 104. 104, and I would
- 4 ask, when we make the motion, there's a strike 2 -- you
- **5** see the line -- it says line 1, 2, 3, 4 -- 5, after the
- 6 struck "and," that 2 should have been struck, I
- 7 believe -- no? It's not supposed to be struck. Okay.
- 8 Okay. So, fine. Never mind. So, then, that is what
- 9 it is.
- And what this does is deals with the --10
- 11 this deals with the issue we found that we had a -- we
- 12 had a candidate last -- last election who brought
- 13 forward that our guidance on loans and the particular
- 14 language that was in the rule did not line up one to
- 15 one. And, as a result, that candidate -- and I -- and
- 16 I -- this part is -- I mean, I wrote him a letter about
- 17 this. So we were in a position where we were able to
- 18 confirm that his -- that his reading was acceptable;
- 19 however, you know, if there was a complaint, it would
- 20 come to the Commission.
- Long story short, the person took out quite 21
- 22 a large loan, quite larger -- about -- I don't know --
- 23 about 100 times larger than we contemplated being able
- 24 to take out because of the -- because of the way that
- 25 the language was and, as it turns out, that person

- 1 allow them to. So there are multiple expenditure
- 2 limits that apply. We believe that the personal
- 3 expenditure limit, which is like \$740, is the limit on
- 4 loans, and we've said that in our guidance for a long
- 5 time. This person brought us the question of, hey,
- 6 this rule seems to say you add these, you add all of
- these expenditure limits together, and I get to stack
- them and I can take out a loan up to that total.
- And that's not how we've ever read the
- 10 rule, but it was certainly not implausible. We had to,
- you know, tell him that, and then -- and then he just
- failed to qualify. He became a non-Clean Elections
- candidate, and he just ended up owing to himself --
- 14 owing himself a bunch of money. So, I mean, the
- 15 backstory sounds more complicated than it is. The
- 16 bottom line is we want to have straightforward that you
- 17 can't stack caps together to take -- give loans to
- 18 yourself.
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.
- 20 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman?
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan. 21
- COMMISSIONER CHAN: I just have a comment 22
- because, you know, initially reading this -- and I 24 remember this situation. So I know what we're
- 25 clarifying. I was thinking, you know, if somebody is

10:22:23-10:23:35 Page 46 10:25:15-10:26:27 Page 48 1 running clean and -- you know, we have different 1 to -- we want to be able to ask questions about and now

- 2 interests that we're trying to promote through the
- 3 Clean Elections system, you know: improve the
- 4 integrity of state government, diminishing the
- 5 influence of special interest money, encouraging
- 6 citizen participation in the political process.
- And, on one hand, I feel, like, personal
- 8 monies are not going to be special interest money, but
- 9 at the same time, if you're allowing people with their
- 10 own money to put their personal money into a clean
- 11 candidacy, you are diminishing their need for more
- 12 grassroots support. And so I think, for that reason, I
- 13 can support this rule. I think it's maybe a little bit
- 14 of two -- not conflicting things but -- just my
- 15 thoughts.
- COMMISSIONER PATON: It's like they're 16
- 17 circumventing something.
- MR. COLLINS: Well -- Mr. Chairman,
- 19 Commissioner Chan, Commissioner Paton, yeah, it's, sort
- 20 of, both. It's, on the one hand, your personal
- 21 money -- corruptive influence may be limited, but the
- 22 agreements you've made as a clean candidate supercede
- 23 those. So, you know, if this person wanted to make
- 24 some kind of constitutional challenge that he can't be
- 25 required to agree to spending limits in order to have

- 2 seems like the appropriate time because all of these
- 3 confluence of litigation, legislation, existing, you
- 4 know, stuff.
- You know, we talked a little about this
- 6 last time. We have a little more -- a deeper -- a
- 7 little more extensive staff to ask questions about. I
- 8 have some. So I would recommend we go into executive
- 9 session with Mary for the purposes of that I've
- 10 identified -- and Nate.
- 11 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman?
- 12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer?
- COMMISSIONER MEYER: Does that purpose 13
- 14 include questions on these four rules we just
- 15 discussed?
- MR. COLLINS: It would -- it would 16
- 17 especially concern -- well, let me put it this way. It
- concerns all of them to the extent that GRRC is
- involved and, obviously, 306 specifically. So what
- we're really talking about is, okay, we're in
- litigation with GRRC, the State of Arizona and the
- 22 Secretary of the State of Arizona, all of whom are
- opposed to our position, even though we're on the same
- 24 side of the V. So I think that -- I think that
- 25 questions related to the GRRC process are -- are -- you

10:23:40-10:25:11 Page 47 10:26:36-10:27:03 Page 49

- 1 access to Clean Elections, then more power to him.
- He -- the particular candidate in this case
- 3 sued us twice just -- just to try to get his loan back
- 4 and did not succeed. Joe defended both of those cases.
- 5 And I would simply say this about that. The other --
- 6 the other important part of this is the fact that the
- 7 candidate is required to repay, out of their Clean 8 Elections grant, this immediately. Well, that means
- 9 that -- if you make a loan to yourself of \$43,000, that
- 10 means you're, essentially, making it -- you're repaying
- 11 yourself, then, with public money, which is not what --
- 12 clearly not within what I think the best reading of the
- 13 Act is.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Any other 14
- 15 questions about 104?
- (No response.) 16
- 17 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any questions about any
- 18 of these that require us to go into executive session?
- 19 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, if I may
- 20 interrupt for a moment. I would recommend, for
- 21 purposes of addressing the 306, AZAN versus State,
- 22 overlap, Mary O'Grady and Nathan Arrowsmith are here
- 23 for that specific purpose. I would recommend an
- 24 executive session on that because, you know, we're in
- 25 a -- we're in a -- there are some steps that we want

- 1 know, are clearly -- clearly relevant to what we would
- 2 be going into executive session to discuss.
- 3 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman?
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
- 5 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I move that we go into
- 6 executive session to discuss the issues that Tom has
- 7 listed.
- 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?
- 9 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I would second that
- 10 motion.
- 11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: We'll have a roll call
- **12** vote.
- 13 Commissioner Chan?
- 14 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
- 15 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer?
- COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. 16
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton? 17
- COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. 18
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The Chair votes aye.
- 20 We'll go into executive session.
- (The following section of the meeting is in 21
- 22 executive session and bound under separate cover.)
- 23 * * * * *
- 24 ///
- 25 ///

11:06:40-11:07:19 Page 50 11:08:27-11:09:54 Page 52

- 1 (End of executive session. Public meeting
- 2 resumes at 10:06 a.m.)
- 3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. We're now back in
- 4 open session for Item VI, discussion and possible
- 5 action on four different rule changes opening a 60-day
- 6 public comment period.
- 7 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move
- 8 that we approve --
- 9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
- 10 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I approve -- I move
- 11 that we approve the proposed amended versions of
- 12 R2-20-104, 113, 702 and 704 for 60 days of public
- 13 comment.
- 14 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second?
- 15 COMMISSIONER PATON: Second.
- 16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: It's been moved and
- 17 seconded that we open these four rule changes for a
- **18** 60-day public comment period.
- **19** Commissioner Chan?
- 20 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
- 21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer?
- 22 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.
- 23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton?
- 24 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
- 25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The Chair votes aye.

- 1 have yet, but I think it, also, is the question given
- 2 that the holdover is -- you know, are a little -- no
- 3 one has resigned yet.
- 4 You know, we have -- we have an issue that,
- 5 you know, is -- becomes really ripe in January 30th
- 6 when Chairman Kimble's term ends because, at that
- 7 point, we will be down to -- assuming that Commissioner
- 8 Meyer and Commissioner Titla don't resign, we will be
- 9 down to Commissioner -- Commissioner Paton and
- 10 Commissioner Chan.
- 11 So Commissioner -- so the issue -- so we're
- 12 really six months away from a potential crisis on this
- 13 issue, and -- and so the question we have to ask
- 14 ourselves -- and I would defer to your all political
- 15 judgment because it's probably better than mine, but
- 16 whether or not we want to work on a draft -- you all
- 17 want to work on a draft which we can facilitate without
- 18 violating the open meeting law or you want to designate
- 19 a member to write, on behalf of the Commission, a
- 20 letter to the governor urging the governor to make an
- 21 appointment. I really don't think any of these are
- 22 outside of the bounds of good taste. I know. And I
- 23 think the polite -- I think a politely written letter
- 24 that reminds the governor that this is important --
- 25 because he's got a lot of other stuff going on. I'm

11:07:22-11:08:24 Page 51 11:09:57-11:10:50 Page 53

- 1 It's 4 to nothing approved.
- 2 Item VII, discussion and possible action on
- 3 a proposed letter to Governor Ducey regarding
- 4 appointment for Clean Elections commissioner.
- 5 Tom, do you want to talk about that?
- 6 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Mr. Chairman,
- 7 Commissioners, you know, I've had ad hoc conversations
- 8 with a number of people about this, and the League of
- 9 Women Voters sent a letter to Governor Ducey last week,
- 10 which is in your materials. Rivko is here and is a
- 11 cosigner of that letter, along with, I believe, the
- 12 president, of the League --- or the then president of
- 13 the League.
- 14 Did she -- is she still the president after
- 15 this weekend? No. Okay.
- 16 They had their convention in Yavapai County
- 17 last week.
- 18 MS. KNOX: She was when she signed it. I'm
- 19 sorry. I'm speaking out of context.
- 20 MR. COLLINS: Yeah. In any event, it
- 21 raises a question as to how or whether we -- or you, I
- 22 should say, as commissioners, want to communicate with
- 23 the Governor. I think that the League is an important
- 24 group in the whole world of elections and voting, and I
- 25 hope that they get a response. I don't know that they

- 1 willing to -- you know, I think we're all willing to
- 2 accept that. And -- okay.
- 3 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'm sorry.
- 4 Mr. Chairman, may I interrupt?
- 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan.
- 6 COMMISSIONER CHAN: No.
- 7 MR. COLLINS: No, no. I was talking too
- 8 long, anyway.
- 9 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I don't mean to
- 10 minimize what the governor has. I know he's very busy,
- 11 but this is one of his duties. So, anyway, I just want
- 12 to say to Rivko and the League of Women Voters, thank
- 13 you so much for writing this letter. I think that was
- 14 wonderful.
- 15 And, frankly, Tom, I mean, I feel like
- 16 writing a letter is -- we can write a letter. I don't
- 17 not want to write a letter, but I mean, at this point,
- 18 it's almost, like, what's our next option? A mandamus
- 19 action? I mean, what -- do we have a standing? I feel
- 20 like it's a lot to ask of commissioners who have
- 21 already served five years to continue serving. And,
- 22 like you said, when we're down to two, who are serving
- 23 and then three in a holdover status, that is a crisis
- **24** for the Commission.
- 25 And, frankly, the problem is we have a

11:10:53-11:11:59 Page 54 11:13:00-11:13:36 Page 56

- 1 governor who doesn't like Clean Elections. So why --
- 2 it's, like, his philosophy or policy disagreement is
- 3 impacting the legitimacy of this independent,
- 4 non-partisan election body. And that really is what
- 5 the crux of the matter is, and how do we get him to
- 6 move on that.
- MR. COLLINS: Well, there are other
- 8 options. I mean, the other options are these. I think
- 9 that -- let me put it this way. I'm sorry,
- 10 Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Chan.
- 11 COMMISSIONER CHAN: No, please.
- 12 MR. COLLINS: I think there -- I think
- 13 there are a variety of options on the table. One thing
- 14 we haven't approached to the governor's office to do is
- 15 to have any kind of sit-down meeting with an
- 16 appropriately -- appropriate staff level meeting. You
- 17 know, I have -- you know, we have some connections, but
- 18 we've never, for example, asked for a meeting between
- 19 our chairman and the chief of staff of the Governor's
- 20 office.
- 21 I mean, that would be -- I mean, if we were
- 22 to ask for that and ask for a prompt response to the
- 23 request for a meeting, that would be one thing, too.
- 24 That would be more -- in the -- you know, more --
- 25 arguably more aggressive than a mere letter. It would

- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: It's been long that you
- 2 could have received a reply? Okay.
- MS. KNOX: Yes. Probably -- I don't 3
- 4 know -- ten days or two weeks, something like that.
- 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.
- 6 MS. KNOX: At the most.
- 7 MR. LaRUE: Excuse me.
- 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.
- 9 MR. LaRUE: Chairman, could I recommend
- 10 that you have her come to the microphone?
- 11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I'm sorry.
- 12 MS. KNOX: I apologize. Thank you very
- 13 much.
- Rivko -- for the record, Rivko Knox, with
- 15 the League of Women Voters. I think the letter was
- 16 sent probably about two weeks ago.
- 17 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.
- 18 MS. KNOX: Give or take.
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. And you've
- 20 received no reply?
- 21 MS. KNOX: No, no.
- 22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.
- MS. KNOX: And we would share any response
- 24 we got with the Commission, as appropriate, which I
- 25 think -- thank you for bringing that up.

11:12:02-11:12:58 Page 55 11:13:37-11:14:22 Page 57

- 1 be, like, look, we really need to talk about this. I
- 2 don't -- I really don't have a recommendation to make
- 3 here, other than I do feel like, you know, as long as
- 4 this is an institutional concern, we'll need to make
- 5 some kind of move -- maybe more than one kind of move.
- 6 So --
- 7 COMMISSIONER PATON: Can I make a
- 8 statement, please?
- 9 MR. COLLINS: I'm sorry.
- 10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
- 11 COMMISSIONER PATON: I would think that
- 12 would probably be the best policy. I mean, the letter
- 13 thing is, I mean, kind of, passive. I think if either
- 14 you or Mr. Kimble or -- you know, should, maybe, make
- 15 an appointment with somebody in the governor's office
- 16 and make a plea --
- 17 MR. COLLINS: Sure.
- COMMISSIONER PATON: -- for them to follow 18
- 19 through with this.
- 20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I would ask, Ms. Knox,
- 21 have you received any reply? When -- how long ago did
- 22 this go out?
- 23 MR. COLLINS: A month?
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I don't see a date on it. 24
- 25 MR. COLLINS: Three weeks?

- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you.
- Any other comments from commissioners? 2
- 3 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I'll just state that I
- 4 think a meeting would be ideal at this point.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I agree with
- 6 Commissioner Chan. I don't think we need a motion on
- 7 this, do we?
- MR. COLLINS: No, no. I think it's just --
- 9 I mean, it sounds like the commissioners --
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton, do 10
- 11 you have --
- MR. COLLINS: Commissioner Paton -- I think
- 13 we're all on the same page.
- COMMISSIONER PATON: No. I think we should
- 15 have -- somebody should have a meeting with the
- **16** governor's staff.
- CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. 17
- 18 MR. COLLINS: Okay.
- 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are you okay with that?
- 20 Okay. So we're not going to work on a
- 21 letter right now.
- Item VIII, discussion and possible action
- 23 on proposed 2019 Commission meeting dates for July
- 24 through December.
- 25 In our packet, we have the proposed meeting

11:14:26-11:15:13 Page 58 | 11:16:20-11:17:01 Page 60

- 1 dates of July 29th, August 22nd, September 26th,
- 2 October 17th, November 14th and December 12th.
- 3 Any comments or concerns about any of these
- 4 meeting dates from members of the Commission?
- 5 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman.
- 6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yes, Commissioner Meyer.
- 7 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I would move that we
- 8 approve the meeting dates as presented in Item VIII of
- 9 our agenda for July through December 2019.
- 10 COMMISSIONER PATON: Question about --
- 11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Wait.
- 12 Is there a second?
- 13 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Oh, I second.
- 14 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Commissioner
- 15 Paton?
- 16 COMMISSIONER PATON: And July 29th, that's
- 17 a Monday?
- 18 MS. THOMAS: Correct.
- 19 COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay.
- 20 MR. COLLINS: Yeah.
- 21 COMMISSIONER PATON: So the other ones are
- 22 Thursdays?
- 23 MS. THOMAS: Correct.
- 24 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And, I guess, it's worth
- 25 stating that we're holding a Monday meeting because the

- 1 to put that on your radar.
- 2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.
- 3 MR. COLLINS: I may be able to attend by
- 4 phone.
- 5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Or you could have
- 6 some member of your staff be delegated to --
- 7 MR. COLLINS: Okay. Absolutely. Yeah,
- 8 we're not worried about getting the meeting done. It's
- 9 more of a matter if you're -- if I'm not here.
- 10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yeah. Okay.
- 11 MR. COLLINS: Huh? That's true. I know.
- 12 Look, someone -- someone made a sound cloud of
- 13 imitations of how I talk, and I'll never share it with
- 14 vou guvs
- 15 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I don't want to hear
- 16 it.
- 17 MS. KARLSON: I will find it.
- 18 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay, then. So it's been
- 19 moved and seconded that we approve the meeting -- the
- 20 meeting dates for July through December of 2019.
- 21 Commissioner Chan?
- 22 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
- 23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer?
- 24 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.
- 25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton?

11:15:17-11:16:16 Page 59 11:17:04-11:17:59 Page 61

- 1 30-day comment period would not have --
- 2 MR. COLLINS: Correct.
- 3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- would not have been
- 4 reached if we held a Thursday meeting before that.
- 5 MR. COLLINS: That's correct.
- 6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.
- 7 COMMISSIONER PATON: So you'll remind us,
- 8 like, on Thursday or Friday?
- 9 MS. THOMAS: Yes.
- 10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. It's been moved
- 11 and seconded that -- to approve the meeting dates for
- 12 July through December that are in Attachment VIII --
- 13 I'm sorry. Tom?
- MR. COLLINS: Oh, I'm sorry. I had a -- I
- 15 had a quick question for you, Mr. Chairman.
- 16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay.
- 17 MR. COLLINS: And for Joe and Kara, if it's
- 18 not irrelevant. I have a -- or it might be relevant to
- 19 Item I -- or Item III about the June 20th meeting we
- 20 have scheduled. We have a June 20th meeting which is
- 21 not on here because it's already scheduled. It is very
- 22 unlikely that I will be at the June 20th meeting. It
- 23 will be the first meeting that I've missed in -- I
- 24 don't know -- ever, but I have some unavoidable stuff
- 25 that I've got to deal with that day. So I just wanted

- 1 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
- **2** CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The Chair votes aye.
- **3** It's approved 4 to nothing.
- 4 Item XI, public comment. Is there anyone
- 5 who wants to make comment to the Commission?
- 6 Ms. Knox?
- 7 MS. KNOX: Yes.
- 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Could you state your name
- 9 and address for the record.
- 10 MS. KNOX: Yes, definitely. Rivko Knox, on
- 11 behalf of the League of Women Voters of Arizona.
- 12 I was authorized to make this statement,
- 13 and we -- the League, although, like Tom mentioned a
- 14 few minutes ago, we do have new leadership. We have
- 15 three new co-presidents. I'm not quite sure how
- 16 quickly they respond, but we may be submitting a
- 17 letter, more or less, to this effect of paper, as well,
- 18 but I wanted to speak on this this morning. But if the
- 19 letter goes in, the title would be the antithesis --
- 20 antithesis -- I can't speak well this morning -- of
- 21 civil dialogue.
- 22 The non-partisan League of Women Voters has
- 23 always encouraged civic participation in our democracy
- 24 and has tried to ensure that the public is well
- 25 informed about the issues that impact on their lives.

11:18:02-11:19:08 Page 62 11:20:13-11:20:26 Page 64 1 Accurate factual information is the bedrock of a COMMISSIONER CHAN: I would move to adjourn 2 vibrant democracy. Further, civic engagement requires 2 the meeting. 3 civil dialogue. People do not want to engage if they CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Second? I'll second it. 3 4 fear being belittled, yelled at, forced to face 4 Commissioner Chan? 5 personal criticism and rude comments and language or 5 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. 6 especially threatened. 6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer? 7 League members live in our present society COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. 8 and thus are aware of the sad state of so much of what 8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton? 9 goes for information, as well as conversations about 9 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. 10 public policy issues. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The Chair votes aye. 10 However, we were shocked to read about the 11 We are adjourned. 11 12 comments of Representatives John Allen and Kevin Payne 12 (Whereupon, the proceedings concluded at 13 relating to the head of Clean Elections. Although the 13 11:20 a.m.) 14 comment made by Representative Allen did include the 14 /// words "virtual" in the middle of this sentence "Can we 15 16 virtually shoot the head of Clean Elections?" to which 16 17 Payne replied "Yes," the sentiment was very disturbing. 17 The Clean Elections Commission and staff --18 19 Commissioners and staff do an outstanding job of voter 19 20 education, especially in less urban areas and with more 20 21 diverse populations, while educating candidates who 21 22 choose to run clean and providing transparency in the 22 electoral process. 23 League members helped write the language 24 24 25 that became the initiative that created Clean 25 11:19:11-11:20:10 Page 63 Page 65 STATE OF ARIZONA 1 Elections, worked for its passage and continue to COUNTY OF MARICOPA 2 monitor and attempt to protect its vital mission of 3 BE IT KNOWN the foregoing proceedings were 3 ensuring integrity in government, encouraging 4 taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified 4 involvement in elections and reducing the influence of 5 Reporter of the State of Arizona; that the proceedings 5 money in the electoral process. Although some 6 were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter 6 legislators oppose the concept of public funds (though 7 transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that 7 it is not taxpayer money) being used to encourage 8 the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate 8 candidates to run, a disagreement about policy should 9 transcript of all proceedings and testimony had and 9 never lead to even virtual threats of violence. 10 adduced upon the taking of said proceedings, all done to The League urges the leadership of the 10 11 the best of my skill and ability. 11 Legislature, as well as Governor Ducey, to speak out 12 I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way 12 about the language used by Representatives Allen and 13 Payne, encourage them both to apologize to the 13 related to nor employed by any of the parties thereto 14 Commissioners and staff, and remind them that the words 14 nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof. 15 15 of public figures carry great weight and help establish DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 31st day of 16 a standard conduct for the public. 16 May, 2019. 17 17 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Well said. 18 MS. KNOX: So, we would like that to go on 18 LILIA MONARREZ, RPR, CR #50699 19 the record. 19 20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Very, very well done. 20 21 Thank you. Thank you, Ms. Knox. 21 Does anyone else wish to address the 22 22 23 Commission? I guess not, since everyone else works for 23 24 the Commission. 24 25 Is there a motion to adjourn? 25

	advanced (1) 34:10
\$	advancing (1) 42:11
Ψ	advice (1) 29:9
¢20 (4) 26.15	advocacy (6) 21:16;
\$20 (1) 36:15	22:21,23;28:25;29:19,
\$27,000 (1) 19:17	24
\$43,000 (1) 47:9	_ ·
\$5,000 (1) 24:22	affect (1) 36:19
\$5,400 (1) 19:18	African-American (1)
\$740 (1) 45:3	6:3
	AG (1) 19:12
/	again (8) 20:23;21:1;
	26:3,15;27:2;37:13;
/// (3) 49:24,25;64:14	39:3;42:19
m (3) 47.24,25,04.14	agencies (2) 23:17;
A	29:13
A	agency (1) 17:9
	agenda (6) 7:8;13:13;
AAC (4) 32:14,16,17,19	
aback (1) 4:20	24:10,14,15;58:9
ability (2) 6:8;40:20	aggressive (1) 54:25
able (9) 8:21;9:13;	ago (5) 12:11;18:22;
12:2;17:21;31:3;43:17,	55:21;56:16;61:14
23;48:1;60:3	agree (9) 9:25;10:14;
absolute (1) 21:6	25:12,20;27:5;28:8;
absolutely (3) 34:24;	31:7;46:25;57:5
41:11;60:7	agreement (10) 17:4;
	19:2,7;23:20;26:23;
accept (1) 53:2	28:10;31:14,19,22;
acceptable (2) 27:18;	32:1
43:18	agreements (1) 46:22
access (1) 47:1	AG's (3) 17:5,9;28:3
accommodation (1)	AG S (3) 17.3,9,20.3
41:24	ahead (1) 33:25
accomplish (2) 17:3;	Alec (3) 5:22;6:4;42:5
31:2	Allen (3) 62:12,14;
account (2) 34:20;	63:12
38:24	allow (2) 18:14;45:1
accountability (1) 17:5	allowed (2) 21:8;34:11
accounts (1) 38:25	allowing (2) 44:6;46:9
Accurate (1) 62:1	allows (1) 23:6
act (3) 25:4;29:1;47:13	almost (1) 53:18
action (10) 3:6;4:7;	along (1) 51:11
	although (3) 61:13;
7:15;13:6;16:23;32:12;	62:13;63:5
50:5;51:2;53:19;57:22	always (9) 10:23;
actions (2) 13:22;29:18	18:14;20:7,8;23:5,15;
actually (7) 8:6,10;	27:11;39:22;61:23
9:15;11:18;35:4;37:2;	amazed (1) 10:23
40:10	
ad (3) 36:16;42:21;	amended (1) 50:11 amendment (4) 32:14,
51:7	• •
add (6) 4:23,25;39:9,	16,17,18
10;45:6,6	Amendments (1) 27:17
addition (1) 35:12	amongst (1) 17:4
additional (2) 6:7;39:12	amount (10) 18:21;
additions (1) 3:9	19:24;20:6,22;24:9;
address (2) 61:9;63:22	25:13;26:9,10;44:6,7
addressed (1) 37:25	amplify (1) 12:16
addressing (1) 47:21	analysis (1) 33:15
adjourn (2) 63:25;64:1	analyzing (1) 37:6
	anticipated (1) 7:19
adjourned (1) 64:11	anti-Clean (1) 38:2
administrative (1) 23:1	antithesis (2) 61:19,20
administrators (3) 5:10;	anymore (1) 34:11
12:18,21	apologize (2) 56:12;
admission (1) 18:17	
adopt (1) 31:14	63:13
L	1

```
Appeals (4) 7:16,17,18,
  20
apply (1) 45:2
appointment (3) 51:4;
  52:21;55:15
appreciate (1) 27:3
approach (1) 10:12
approached (1) 54:14
appropriate (4) 4:21;
  48:2:54:16:56:24
appropriately (1) 54:16
approval (6) 13:6,20,
  21;14:2;17:12,13
approve (14) 3:20;
  15:15;18:1,2;19:7;
  31:19,21;32:1;50:8,10,
  11;58:8;59:11;60:19
approved (6) 4:6;16:2,
  22;37:13;51:1;61:3
approves (1) 32:11
April (1) 3:7
architect (1) 9:2
areas (1) 62:20
arenas (1) 27:22
arguable (1) 37:9
arguably (1) 54:25
Arizona (8) 18:19;21:3,
  5;28:19,20;48:21,22;
  61:11
around (2) 5:14;6:14
Arrowsmith (1) 47:22
articulate (1) 8:5
aspect (1) 27:14
association (2) 29:23;
  36:17
assume (3) 13:13;
  17:24;36:12
assuming (1) 52:7
assure (1) 17:25
Attachment (1) 59:12
attempt (1) 63:2
attend (1) 60:3
attendance (2) 6:23;
  35:22
attended (1) 6:2
Attorney (3) 17:17,22;
  23:18
attorney-client (1) 33:15
attorneys (1) 9:13
audible (1) 42:25
audit (10) 13:6,20,21,
  22;14:6,19;15:5,11;
  16:7,13
auditor (3) 14:20,23,24
auditors (1) 13:16
audits (6) 14:2,8,11;
  15:8,15;16:3
August (1) 58:1
authority (1) 41:8
authorization (2) 14:5;
  34:14
authorize (3) 16:7,12;
  31:15
                             24,25
```

```
authorized (1) 61:12
Avery (5) 5:22,25;6:2,4,
  8
aware (5) 22:15;25:22;
  26:2;42:14;62:8
away (1) 52:12
awfully (2) 19:20;28:21
Aye (31) 3:25;4:2,4,5;
  15:21,23,25;16:1,16,
  18,20,21;32:5,7,9;
  49:14,16,18,19;50:20,
  22,24,25;60:22,24;
  61:1,2;64:5,7,9,10
AZAN (2) 7:17;47:21
           B
back (11) 9:25;12:10,
  12;14:20;22:17;27:7,
  11;28:5;37:21;47:3;
  50:3
background (2) 19:5;
  26:16
backstory (1) 45:15
ballot (2) 5:11;7:4
ballpark (1) 23:23
bank (2) 14:21;34:20
bans (1) 21:6
based (1) 19:22
basically (8) 9:19;14:1;
  18:3,23;19:25;22:18;
  34:13;42:9
basis (2) 9:7;21:9
became (2) 45:12;
  62:25
BECKER (1) 14:17
become (3) 23:13;
  33:20;41:22
becomes (1) 52:5
bedrock (1) 62:1
began (2) 22:10,15
behalf (3) 17:7;52:19;
  61:11
belittled (1) 62:4
Bend (1) 28:13
best (5) 27:17;32:22;
  38:14;47:12;55:12
better (3) 8:23;29:17;
  52:15
beyond (1) 33:3
big (3) 7:24;21:17,17
bigger (3) 21:18;31:1,1
biggest (1) 21:11
bill (3) 8:2;9:20,21
bills (1) 8:1
bind (1) 30:9
bit (2) 35:19;46:13
black (1) 9:10
blast (1) 12:5
bless (1) 8:6
body (1) 54:4
borrowed (4) 44:15,22,
```

```
both (12) 7:8;8:4;10:9;
  13:11;15:11;21:10;
  22:10,10;37:24;46:20;
  47:4:63:13
bottom (2) 25:2;45:16
bound (1) 49:22
bounds (1) 52:22
Breakfast (1) 6:1
brief (1) 7:1
bring (2) 38:22;39:18
bringing (1) 56:25
broader (3) 23:10;30:6;
brought (2) 43:12;45:5
bucks (2) 35:24,24
budget (1) 9:23
build (1) 12:24
builds (1) 6:10
bunch (1) 45:14
busy (1) 53:10
```

\mathbf{C}

```
call (10) 3:3,13,23;
  15:18;16:14;17:3;
  20:16;32:3;42:15;
  49:11
called (3) 14:24,24;
  29:1
calling (1) 42:5
calls (1) 14:23
came (2) 9:19;38:13
Campaign (8) 6:13;9:5;
  10:22;11:14;12:2;
  29:12;34:20;36:16
campaigns (2) 11:13;
  42:6
can (35) 6:14;7:23;
  11:12,25;12:4,20,20,
  23;13:19;15:6;19:25;
  20:9;23:9;24:25;28:22;
  30:2,5;31:10;34:6,19;
  35:1,3;38:7,8,14;41:4;
  42:7,16,16;45:8;46:13;
  52:17:53:16:55:7;
  62:15
candidacy (1) 46:11
candidate (18) 13:18;
  14:6,15,18;15:1;16:8,
  13;28:13;32:18;33:22;
  42:10,10;43:12,15;
  45:13;46:22;47:2,7
candidates (13) 13:7,
  12;32:15,19;34:6;35:3,
  8,16,17;36:13;41:25;
  62:21;63:8
cap (1) 19:24
capacity (4) 17:6,6;
  19:14;23:19
capitol (1) 8:10
caps (1) 45:17
carries (1) 21:18
```

carry (1) 63:15

case (16) 7:15:17:17; 18:6,20;21:10;25:8; 27:10;28:2;29:1,3,6,16, 19,25;30:25;47:2 cases (3) 7:19;18:20; 47:4 catch (1) 41:2 cause (2) 23:3,6 celebrating (1) 11:23 Center (1) 6:2 certainly (3) 4:20;30:7; 45:10 cetera (1) 27:23 Chair (8) 4:5;16:1,21; 32:10;49:19;50:25; 61:2;64:10 **CHAIRMAN (164)** 3:3, 12,16,17,21,23;4:1,3,5, 11,14,20,24;5:1;8:19; 10:6,16,19,20;11:10; 12:7;13:1,5,10;14:10, 13,17;15:7,10,12,13, 14,16,18,22,24;16:1,4, 5,6,10,11,17,19,21; 17:1;19:11,16;20:19; 21:19,22;24:2;25:16, 19;26:19,20;28:11,18, 22;30:16,18,19;31:8, 10,12,20,25;32:6,8,10, 25;33:6,9,10,11,23,25; 34:17,18;35:14;36:23; 38:4,9;39:14,24;40:2,5, 8,13;41:12,19;42:23; 43:1;44:11,21;45:19, 20,21;46:18;47:14,17, 19;48:11,12;49:3,4,8, 11,15,17,19;50:3,7,9, 14,16,21,23,25;51:6; 52:6;53:4,5;54:10,19; 55:10,20,24;56:1,5,8,9, 11,17,19,22;57:1,5,10, 17,19;58:5,6,11,14,24; 59:3,6,10,15,16;60:2,5, 10,18,23,25;61:2,8; 63:20;64:3,6,8,10 chairmanships (1) 8:13 challenge (1) 46:24 **chamber (2)** 36:3,5 Chan (62) 3:14,15,19, 24,25;15:17,20,21; 16:9,15,16;26:19,20, 21;31:10,12,13,17,20; 32:4,5;34:17,18,19; 35:14;36:3,9,22,25; 37:11,16,22;41:12; 45:20,21,22;46:19; 49:9,13,14;50:7,9,10, 19,20;52:10;53:3,5,6,9; 54:10,11;57:3,6;58:13; 60:15,21,22;63:17; 64:1.4.5 **chance (2)** 4:14;38:6 comments (12) 3:9; **change (6)** 20:24;

33:11,12;34:3;37:14; 39:3 **changed (1)** 8:13 **changes (5)** 32:13; 33:7,13;50:5,17 **checked (1)** 28:19 **chief (1)** 54:19 **Chino (2)** 5:10,16 **choice (1)** 30:12 **choose (2)** 42:9;62:22 **circulate (1)** 19:8 circumventing (1) 46:17 citizen (1) 46:6 **Citizens (1)** 3:4 City (2) 5:7,8 civic (8) 34:21;35:11, 18;36:14;37:22,23; 61:23;62:2 civil (2) 61:21;62:3 **clarifying (1)** 45:25 Clean (20) 3:5;29:1; 32:15,17;35:16,17; 38:22;46:1,3,10,22; 47:1,7;51:4;54:1; 62:13,16,18,22,25 **clear (2)** 39:3;44:12 **cleared (1)** 41:15 clearly (4) 36:18;47:12; 49:1.1 clerks (1) 5:8 close (1) 19:17 closely (1) 8:4 cloud (1) 60:12 Coalition (1) 6:21 **codify (2)** 41:22;42:22 **codifying (1)** 33:20 coffee (1) 41:18 **COLLINS (92)** 4:10; 5:3;7:11;8:9,18,22,25; 10:5,17,25;13:10,24; 17:1;19:12,16,21;20:4, 25;22:3,6,10,16;24:1,6, 12,16,19;25:3,6,10,15; 26:4,7;28:17,22;31:15, 18;32:21;33:1,9,11,24; 34:2,24;35:21;36:5,10, 24;37:3,15,18,23;38:6, 12;39:8,13,22;40:4,9, 12,17;41:7,11,21;43:3; 44:10,14,18,24;46:18; 47:19;48:16;51:6,20; 53:7;54:7,12;55:9,17, 23,25;57:8,12,18; 58:20;59:2,5,14,17; 60:3,7,11 **comfortable (2)** 10:8,10 coming (5) 7:4,4;12:17; 18:18;28:5 commend (1) 17:22 comment (11) 32:13; 38:7,8;45:22;50:6,13, 18;59:1;61:4,5;62:14

4:15;13:2;21:19;25:16; 30:16:31:9:38:5:57:2: 58:3;62:5,12 **Commission (19)** 3:5,7; 6:3;17:16;21:20;26:13; 28:3;33:21;38:23; 43:20;52:19;53:24; 56:24;57:23;58:4;61:5; 62:18;63:23,24 Commissioner (198) 3:14,15,19,22,24,25; 4:1,2,3,4;8:8,17,19,20, 23;10:2,6,18,20,21; 11:5,7,8,10;12:4,7,22; 13:23;14:12,13,14,17; 15:12,13,14,17,20,21, 22,23,24,25;16:4,5,6,9, 15,16,17,18,19,20; 20:3;21:21,22,23;22:4, 7,14;23:25;24:2,3,7,13, 17,20,22;25:4,7,11,18, 19,20,21;26:5,8,19,20, 21;27:6;30:18,19,20; 31:10,12,13,17,20,23; 32:4,5,6,7,8,9;34:17, 18,19;35:14;36:3,9,22, 25;37:11,16,22;39:16, 21,25;40:10,13,14; 41:6,9,12,13;44:9,11, 12,15,21,22;45:20,21, 22;46:16,19,19;48:11, 12,13;49:3,4,5,9,13,14, 15,16,17,18;50:7,9,10, 15,19,20,21,22,23,24; 51:4;52:7,8,9,9,10,11; 53:3,5,6,9;54:10,11; 55:7,10,11,18;57:3,6, 10,12,14;58:5,6,7,10, 13,14,16,19,21;59:7; 60:15,21,22,23,24,25; 61:1;63:17;64:1,4,5,6, 7,8,9 **Commissioners (13)** 13:11;17:2;25:17; 28:4;39:15;41:17;51:7, 22;53:20;57:2,9;62:19; 63:14 **Committee (3)** 29:2; 34:21;37:20 **committees (2)** 35:11, **communicate (1)** 51:22 communicating (1) 21:14 communications (1) 18:12 communities (1) 6:9 **Community (2)** 6:1; 35:24 **compensate (1)** 26:12 complained (1) 38:3 complaint (1) 43:19

comply (3) 22:8;25:23, 23 concept (1) 63:6 concern (3) 21:11; 48:17;55:4 concerns (2) 48:18; 58:3 **concerted (1)** 8:11 conciliate (2) 23:1,5 conciliation (15) 17:15; 18:13,24;19:7;23:7; 25:8;26:1,18,23;28:10; 29:20;31:14,19,21; 32:1 conciliatory (1) 27:24 concluded (1) 64:12 **conclusion (1)** 9:19 conduct (1) 63:16 **Conference (1)** 36:7 **confidence (1)** 23:22 confident (2) 17:25; 18:1 confirm (1) 43:18 conflicting (1) 46:14 **confluence (1)** 48:3 **Congress (1)** 18:8 connections (1) 54:17 considering (1) 23:19 consistent (2) 18:24; 44:5 consistently (1) 17:21 constitutional (4) 8:3,6; 9:18;46:24 contacted (1) 14:22 contemplated (1) 43:23 context (3) 17:10; 29:15:51:19 **continually (1)** 10:23 **continue (2)** 53:21;63:1 continuing (1) 6:6 contributions (2) 35:6,6 controls (1) 29:10 **convention (1)** 51:16 conversation (2) 22:24; 23:10 conversations (2) 51:7; 62:9 **convince (1)** 9:6 cool (1) 6:14 co-op (1) 36:1 **co-presidents (1)** 61:15 copy (1) 19:9 corporations (1) 21:7 corrections (1) 3:10 corruptive (1) 46:21 cosigner (1) 51:11 co-sponsor (1) 6:20 cost (1) 35:23 counted (1) 21:15

compliance (1) 29:9

45:15

complicated (2) 13:19;

compliments (1) 11:4

counterparties (1) 19:9 counterparty (1) 19:13 County (2) 5:25;51:16 couple (6) 4:12,15; 10:14;17:2,15;36:7 course (2) 6:11;14:3 Court (6) 7:16,17,18, 19;18:6;29:14 courts (1) 29:23 Court's (1) 21:5 cover (1) 49:22 covered (2) 39:10,11 created (1) 62:25 creates (1) 20:16 creative (1) 10:23 **crisis (2)** 52:12;53:23 criticism (1) 62:5 **crucid (1)** 41:23 crux (1) 54:5 **curious (3)** 11:6;35:20; 37:1 cynical (1) 26:24

D

date (2) 7:6;55:24 dates (7) 38:13;57:23; 58:1,4,8;59:11;60:20 day (4) 8:1;20:14; 36:11:59:25 days (3) 12:11;50:12; 56.4 day-to-day (1) 20:15 deal (2) 40:25;59:25 dealing (3) 24:10; 25:14;28:12 deals (3) 33:19;43:10, **December (5)** 57:24; 58:2,9;59:12;60:20 decision (2) 5:19;42:21 **deeper (1)** 48:6 defended (1) 47:4 defense (1) 38:20 **defer (1)** 52:14 definitely (3) 27:8;30:5; 61:10 **definition (1)** 28:25 **delegated (1)** 60:6 **demand (1)** 18:17 **democracy (2)** 61:23; 62:2 **Department (1)** 12:9 **designate (1)** 52:18 detail (1) 7:13 detailed (1) 13:22 **deter (3)** 20:23;21:1; 26:15 determine (1) 38:14 **developed (1)** 9:1 dialogue (2) 61:21;62:3 differences (1) 21:4different (6) 5:23;20:18;

completely (1) 12:2

26:6;42:2;46:1;50:5 digital (1) 12:2 dilatory (1) 29:18 diminishing (2) 46:4,11 dinged (1) 28:6 directly (1) 34:5 director (1) 27:12 director's (3) 4:8;10:17; 13:3 disagreement (2) 54:2; 63:8 disclosure (2) 29:4,14 discuss (3) 38:11;49:2, discussed (1) 48:15 **discussion (10)** 3:6;4:7; 13:5;16:23;20:7;30:6; 32:12;50:4;51:2;57:22 **discussions (1)** 10:10 dispute (1) 22:21 distortion (1) 20:16 disturbing (1) 62:17 diverse (1) 62:21 divided (1) 9:5 divulging (1) 33:14 document (1) 22:23 dollars (1) 20:10 done (9) 12:24;18:22; 23:2;27:23;28:6;33:16; 34:7;60:8;63:20 double (1) 20:1 down (7) 12:14;18:9; 20:5;39:5;52:7,9;53:22 draft (2) 52:16,17 drafted (1) 33:1 driven (2) 33:7,12 dubious (1) 10:4 **Ducey (3)** 51:3,9;63:11 due (1) 25:21 duties (1) 53:11

\mathbf{E}

easy (1) 38:12 **ED (1)** 11:21 **educating (1)** 62:21 **education (5)** 5:4;6:21; 10:24;12:9;62:20 effect (2) 6:6;61:17 effective (1) 7:5 effectively (1) 10:3 efficient (2) 17:16; 42:17 **effort (5)** 5:12;8:11; 25:2,14;41:21 efforts (1) 18:7 either (6) 9:7;15:11; 22:25,25;35:24;55:13 **election (11)** 5:16,21; 13:7;22:11;27:12; 40:23;41:4;42:10,12; 43:12;54:4 electioneering (2)

18:12;21:14 Elections (23) 3:5;5:6, 8,14;28:20;29:1;32:15, 17;36:8;38:2,23;45:12; 46:3;47:1,8;51:4,24; 54:1;62:13,16,18;63:1, **electoral (2)** 62:23;63:5 **else (4)** 23:1;26:21; 63:22,23 email (3) 12:5,8,19 emailed (2) 14:23,23 **emails (1)** 14:23 **encourage (3)** 6:22; 63:7,13 **encouraged (1)** 61:23 **encouraging (2)** 46:5; end (3) 4:16;17:13; 50:1 **ended (1)** 45:13 ends (3) 11:16;17:17; 52:6 enforce (1) 20:7 **engage (1)** 62:3 engagement (1) 62:2 enhancing (1) 6:7 **ensure (2)** 5:5;61:24 ensures (1) 17:16 ensuring (1) 63:3 entire (2) 44:7,7 entirely (2) 10:25;26:6 **Entities (1)** 21:3 **especially (3)** 48:17; 62:6,20 essentially (4) 9:9; 22:18;33:20;47:10 **establish (1)** 63:15 et (1) 27:23 even (9) 8:23;12:13; 14:25;18:5;21:13,13; 35:4;48:23;63:9 event (2) 5:20;51:20 events (4) 5:23,24,24; 35:22 **eventually (1)** 7:18 **everybody (3)** 26:21; 28:9;30:9 everyone (2) 32:24; 63:23 **exact (1)** 19:15 **exactly (4)** 10:5;20:14; 24:4;26:25 **example (5)** 5:17;36:6, 20;44:8;54:18 **examples (3)** 34:22; 35:15,15 Excuse (2) 8:8;56:7 **executive (14)** 4:8; 10:17;13:2;39:18,23; 41:16;47:18,24;48:8;

existing (1) 48:3 **expand (1)** 6:17 **expect (3)** 7:4;9:25; 27:9 **expenditure (7)** 20:18; 44:16,23,25;45:1,3,7 expenditures (1) 35:8 **expensive (1)** 25:1 **experience (1)** 27:21 **experts (1)** 7:2 **explaining (1)** 37:17 **explanation (1)** 37:19 express (2) 34:25;41:7 **expressed (5)** 22:20, 23;28:24;29:19,24 **expressly (2)** 22:22; 34:16 **extensive (2)** 14:5;48:7 **extent (2)** 9:18;48:18

\mathbf{F}

face (1) 62:4 facilitate (1) 52:17 fact (10) 5:13;8:20; 14:25;18:3;20:12;21:2; 23:18;25:22;41:10; 47:6 factual (2) 26:16;62:1 failed (1) 45:12 fair (1) 37:3 Fairness (1) 29:2 famous (1) 18:6 far (1) 10:7 fast (1) 27:1 father-in-law (1) 15:1 fault (1) 31:18 fear (1) 62:4 feel (6) 10:7;26:24; 46:7;53:15,19;55:3 few (2) 12:11;61:14 figure (1) 19:14 figures (1) 63:15 file (1) 22:11 filed (3) 19:1,23;22:11 final (5) 9:14,15;13:6; 17:11,13 finally (1) 43:1 finance (2) 9:5;29:13 find (1) 60:17 fine (9) 18:21;20:22; 23:11,12;26:1,12,14; 41:18;43:8 fined (2) 18:24;19:19 fines (3) 19:22;20:7,13 first (5) 5:17;20:9; 27:17;36:19;59:23 five (3) 6:11;30:3;53:21 fix (1) 37:9 focused (1) 9:8 folks (3) 5:5;9:19;36:1 follow (3) 12:20;30:13; 55:18

49:21 forced (1) 62:4 form (1) 11:25 formal (1) 41:22 formally (1) 18:1 forth (3) 21:10,10;44:17 forward (5) 7:4;15:5; 16:7,12;43:13 found (1) 43:11 Foundation (1) 7:15four (4) 11:14;48:14; 50:5.17 frame (2) 6:14;11:19 frankly (4) 18:18;41:16; 53:15,25 Friday (1) 59:8 front (2) 12:15;17:12 full (3) 15:5;16:7,13 fully (1) 30:12 **Fund (1)** 7:15 funding (2) 32:16,17 funds (1) 63:6 Further (1) 62:2 future (3) 6:18;24:25; 26:15

following (2) 32:13;

G

general (12) 7:5;13:7;

42:2,3,3,9,10,12

General's (2) 17:22;

17:17;22:11;30:6;41:1;

Gaona (1) 7:8

23:18

gets (1) 17:19

Gila (1) 28:13

gather (1) 15:6

Gina (4) 5:23;6:4;11:4; 42:4 Gina's (1) 11:1 given (2) 18:10;52:1 gives (1) 23:22 **goal (1)** 31:1 goes (3) 18:3;61:19; 62:9 **Good (6)** 3:3;6:18,18; 10:7;17:20;52:22 government (2) 46:4; 63:3 governmental (1) 17:5 Governor (9) 51:3,9,23; 52:20,20,24;53:10; 54:1;63:11 governor's (4) 54:14, 19;55:15;57:16 graduates (1) 11:24 **Graduation (5)** 6:13,14; 10:22;11:2;12:17 grant (1) 47:8 grassroots (1) 46:12 great (4) 10:22;11:5;

12:22:63:15

group (5) 18:4,18; 21:11;34:5;51:24 groups (4) 35:1,3,7,25 GRRC (3) 48:18,21,25 guess (6) 5:7;28:8; 31:6,16;58:24;63:23 guidance (3) 43:13; 44:3;45:4 guys (1) 60:14

Η

hammer (1) 21:18

hand (2) 46:7,20 happen (1) 26:17 **happening (1)** 5:6 happens (1) 26:3 **Happy (5)** 6:12;10:21; 12:17;14:3;23:10 hard (1) 19:14 harken (1) 27:11 harsher (1) 27:9 head (3) 17:5;62:13,16 hear (2) 11:12;60:15 heard (1) 30:22 Hearing (1) 3:12 held (3) 29:14,14;59:4 help (6) 5:5,12;12:15; 17:23;21:23;63:15 helped (1) 62:24 helpful (2) 3:18;10:14 helping (1) 6:22 **hey (4)** 11:2,23;42:6; 45:5 himself (3) 44:1;45:13, 14 **history (1)** 5:18 hoc (2) 42:21;51:7 Hoffman (4) 12:14; 13:8,17;15:15 holding (1) 58:25 holdover (2) 52:2;53:23 hope (4) 6:17;37:18, 18;51:25 hopping (1) 12:12 hosted (1) 5:24 houses (1) 8:4 Huh (1) 60:11 human (1) 27:13

Ι

idea (4) 10:22;11:1; 12:23;27:16 ideal (1) 57:4 ideas (1) 10:23 identified (1) 48:10 ideologically (1) 9:5 II (1) 3:6 III (2) 4:7;59:19 imitations (1) 60:13 immediately (1) 47:8 impact (1) 61:25

49:2,6,20,22;50:1

exercise (1) 27:17

impacting (1) 54:3 **implausible (1)** 45:10 **implicit (1)** 38:18 **implicitly (1)** 38:19 **important (5)** 5:16; 38:20;47:6;51:23; 52:24 **importantly (1)** 18:25 imposed (1) 18:8imposing (1) 38:17 impressions (1) 11:18**improve (1)** 46:3 Inc (2) 16:24;32:2 include (2) 48:14;62:14 included (1) 35:2 including (1) 5:24 inclusion (1) 37:12 inconsistency (1) 37:9 independent (3) 17:9; 23:19;54:3 Indian (1) 6:2 indirectly (1) 34:5 individually (1) 28:2 inflation (1) 20:13 inflows (1) 38:24 **influence (3)** 46:5,21; 63:4 informal (1) 42:21 **information (13)** 5:5,13; 12:8;14:18,20;15:6; 20:11;22:9,12;30:24; 31:4:62:1.9 informed (1) 61:25 initially (1) 45:23 initiated (1) 33:10 **initiative (1)** 62:25 inordinate (1) 24:9 instead (1) 42:8 institutional (1) 55:4 integrity (2) 46:4;63:3 intent (1) 4:18 interest (2) 46:5,8 **interests (1)** 46:2 interfere (1) 20:10 internet (1) 6:13 interrupt (2) 47:20;53:4 interview (2) 5:6;7:1 into (16) 7:12,12,13,22; 11:1;26:11,13;33:14; 39:22;41:16;46:10; 47:18;48:8;49:2,5,20 **intricacies (1)** 28:15 introduced (2) 8:1,2 invite (1) 36:1 involved (2) 15:2;48:19 involvement (1) 63:4 involves (1) 19:17 involving (1) 18:7 irrelevant (1) 59:18 IRS (3) 21:12,17,17 issue (11) 20:8;22:8, 20;26:10;29:5;40:19, 19;43:11;52:4,11,13

issues (11) 8:6;9:5,9, 18;10:12,13;33:15,16; 49:6;61:25;62:10 Item (15) 3:6;4:7;7:13; 13:5;16:23;30:17;31:9; 32:12;50:4;51:2;57:22; 58:8;59:19,19;61:4 items (1) 24:22 IV (1) 13:5

J

January (1) 52:5 job (3) 11:5;37:9;62:19 Joe (2) 47:4;59:17 John (1) 62:12 joined (1) 17:19 judgment (1) 52:15 July (6) 57:23;58:1,9, 16;59:12;60:20 June (4) 6:22;59:19,20, 22 jurisdiction (1) 28:6 jurisdictions (2) 5:4; 27:23 Justice (1) 29:2

K

Kara (2) 39:6;59:17 **KARLSON (4)** 39:7,11, 20:60:17 **Kathy (2)** 13:8,17 keep (2) 20:13;40:15 **Kevin (1)** 62:12 **KIMBLE (125)** 3:3,12, 17,21,23;4:1,3,5,20,24; 5:1;8:19;10:16,20; 13:1.5:14:10.13:15:7. 10,13,16,18,22,24; 16:1,5,11,17,19,21; 19:11,16;20:19;21:19, 22;24:2,22;25:16,19; 26:20;28:11,18;30:16, 19;31:8,12,25;32:6,8, 10,25;33:6,10,23,25; 34:18;38:4,9;39:14,24; 40:2,5,8,13;41:19; 42:23;43:1;44:11; 45:19,21;47:14,17; 48:12;49:4,8,11,15,17, 19;50:3,9,14,16,21,23, 25;53:5;55:10,14,20, 24;56:1,5,8,11,17,19, 22;57:1,5,10,17,19; 58:6,11,14,24;59:3,6, 10,16;60:2,5,10,18,23, 25;61:2,8;63:20;64:3, 6,8,10 **Kimble's (2)** 4:14;52:6 kind (9) 8:13;12:11; 27:3;35:16;46:24;

54:15;55:5,5,13

kinds (2) 35:25;36:13 knew (1) 27:21 knowledge (1) 33:3 knows (1) 30:9 KNOX (15) 51:18; 55:20;56:3,6,12,14,18, 21,23;61:6,7,10,10; 63:18,21

\mathbf{L}

language (10) 4:19;

43:14,25;62:5,24;

large (2) 20:21;43:22

larger (2) 43:22,23

19:15;34:13;35:12,13;

lack (1) 29:17

63:12

LaRUE (2) 56:7,9 **LaSota (3)** 7:8;17:7; 18:1 last (14) 5:7,7;6:11;8:1; 9:12;10:14;13:17;23:3; 36:7;43:12,12;48:6; 51:9,17 later (1) 6:25 law (6) 21:5,5,10; 28:19;29:7;52:18 lawmakers (2) 8:12,13 laws (1) 24:7 laymen (1) 19:20 lays (1) 29:3 lead (1) 63:9 leaders (1) 6:9 Leadership (3) 6:1; 61:14;63:10 leading (1) 38:1 League (12) 51:8,12, 13,23;53:12;56:15; 61:11,13,22;62:7,24; 63:10 least (2) 23:20;38:13 leave (1) 31:6 **leeway (2)** 18:15,15 **left (2)** 11:15;19:4 **Legacy (1)** 7:15 **legal (5)** 7:14;9:9; 10:12;27:18;39:16 **legally (1)** 17:19 legislation (4) 7:25; 33:8,12;48:3 legislative (4) 4:8;7:24; 8:15;28:13 **legislators (3)** 4:16; 18:8;63:6 **legislature (5)** 7:3;9:4; 15:2;38:2;63:11 legitimacy (1) 54:3 lenient (1) 19:20 lens (1) 26:6 less (2) 61:17;62:20 **letter (16)** 43:16;51:3,9, 11;52:20,23;53:13,16,

16,17;54:25;55:12; 56:15;57:21;61:17,19 **letters (1)** 14:25 level (2) 23:20;54:16 **LFAF (1)** 30:4 **Life (1)** 29:6 limit (4) 44:23,25;45:3, 3 limitation (2) 38:18; 40:24 limitations (2) 38:16; 39:17 limited (1) 46:21 Limits (12) 7:7;16:24; 17:7;18:4,7,8;20:21; 21:25;32:2;45:2,7; 46:25 **line (5)** 43:5,5,14;44:4; 45:16 listed (1) 49:7 literally (1) 11:1 litigate (1) 22:19 litigation (4) 30:4,21; 48:3,21 little (9) 13:19;23:13; 28:21;35:19;46:13; 48:5,6,7;52:2 live (1) 62:7 lives (1) 61:25 living (1) 30:21 loading (1) 29:23 loan (5) 43:22;44:6; 45:8;47:3,9 loans (4) 32:19;43:13; 45:4,17 **lobbying (1)** 8:24 **lobbyist (1)** 8:21 local (1) 5:4 locked (1) 20:10 Long (6) 43:21;45:4; 53:8;55:3,21;56:1 longstanding (1) 18:5 look (6) 4:17;9:3; 24:25;26:5;55:1;60:12 looked (1) 37:2 looking (2) 14:5;39:5 looks (1) 22:5 loose (1) 27:1 losing (1) 30:25 lot (11) 8:10;12:17; 24:17,21,21,24;25:13, 20;36:12;52:25;53:20 loved (1) 12:13

\mathbf{M}

mailers (1) 21:15 maintain (1) 18:11 majority (1) 8:5 makes (2) 28:7;41:2 making (3) 23:22; 24:25;47:10 managed (1) 44:1 mandamus (1) 53:18 many (5) 11:6,17,18; 24:11,11 Maricopa (1) 5:25 Mary (2) 47:22;48:9 materials (2) 19:5; 51:10 matter (8) 7:7;17:14; 20:12;28:2,3;44:2; 54:5;60:9 matters (2) 7:15;30:23 **May (13)** 3:4;5:15,21; 8:23;29:7;33:2;34:4; 37:21;46:21;47:19; 53:4;60:3;61:16 maybe (9) 7:16;24:4, 23,25;27:22,24;46:13; 55:5,14 **mayor (1)** 5:9 mean (46) 9:25;10:9; 12:23;18:5,6,19;22:24; 23:4,9,12,24;24:10,23; 25:20;27:13;28:23; 30:1,11;34:12,13; 35:23,25;36:6,6,11,12, 13,18,23,25;37:6,7; 40:23;43:16;44:7; 45:14;53:9,15,17,19; 54:8,21,21;55:12,13; means (6) 24:14;36:14, 15;42:4;47:8,10 meant (1) 37:2 measures (1) 38:2meet (1) 8:12 meeting (29) 3:4,4,8; 6:3;23:3;49:21;50:1; 52:18;54:15,16,18,23; 57:4,15,23,25;58:4,8, 25;59:4,11,19,20,22, 23:60:8.19.20:64:2 member (2) 52:19;60:6 members (7) 4:18; 21:20;42:5,6;58:4; 62:7,24 mentioned (3) 11:19; 12:11;61:13 mentions (1) 11:22 mere (1) 54:25 message (1) 12:16 messaging (1) 12:17 metric (3) 20:17,17,18 metrics (1) 11:17 **MEYER (63)** 3:22;4:1, 2;8:8;10:18,20,21; 11:5,8,11;12:4,22; 13:23;15:12,13,14,22, 23;16:4,5,6,17,18;20:3;

21:21,22,23;22:4,7,14;

31:23;32:6,7;39:16,21,

25;48:11,12,13;49:3,4,

25:18,19,20;26:5,8;

27:6:30:18.19.20:

5 15 16.50.21 22.52.9.		28.4 14.54.14 20.	noner (4) 61.17	38:22
5,15,16;50:21,22;52:8;		28:4,14;54:14,20;	paper (1) 61:17	
58:5,6,7;60:23,24;64:6,	${f N}$	55:15	paragraph (1) 22:5	pilot (1) 6:18
7		Officer (1) 12:9	parents (1) 11:22	placed (1) 38:25
microphone (2) 11:11;	naive (1) 28:12	Oftentimes (2) 42:4,7	Part (5) 5:12;11:25;	plan (2) 6:23,23
56:10		O'Grady (1) 47:22	28:25;43:16;47:6	play (1) 24:8
middle (1) 62:15	name (1) 61:8	old (1) 42:8	participating (3) 13:7;	playing (2) 27:1;28:20
	narrowed (1) 22:20			
might (4) 9:21;14:9;	Nate (1) 48:10	once (4) 11:16;19:25;	32:15,19	plea (1) 55:16
35:23;59:18	Nathan (1) 47:22	22:7,14	participation (2) 46:6;	please (5) 4:16;8:18;
Mike (8) 7:23;9:1,1;	national (3) 18:18;	one (27) 7:1,2;9:11;	61:23	33:3;54:11;55:8
10:9;13:16;14:3,8;33:1	20:21;36:11	10:22;11:4;22:4;25:22;	particular (4) 19:4;27:7;	pocket (1) 20:24
mind (2) 43:8;44:13	Native (1) 6:4	28:12,23;33:4;35:22;	43:13;47:2	point (6) 10:13;27:6;
mine (1) 52:15		38:15,17;40:18,22,22;	parties (5) 30:9;34:9,	44:3;52:7;53:17;57:4
minimize (1) 53:10	Navajo (1) 6:21	42:8;43:14,15;44:25;	10,14;35:1	policy (6) 9:7;10:10;
	necessarily (3) 17:18,			
minority (1) 8:5	19;21:4	46:7,20;52:3;53:11;	party (2) 34:3,5	54:2;55:12;62:10;63:8
minutes (4) 3:7,10,20;	necessary (1) 38:25	54:13,23;55:5	passage (1) 63:1	polite (1) 52:23
61:14	need (15) 3:15;7:3;	ones (1) 58:21	passed (1) 9:12	politely (1) 52:23
missed (1) 59:23	17:8;39:3,10,12;40:3;	one-year (1) 38:18	passing (1) 10:3	political (10) 10:13;
mission (1) 63:2		only (4) 6:16;35:11;	passive (1) 55:13	34:21,25;35:10,17;
moment (1) 47:20	41:3,16,18;44:20;	38:7;44:1	Paton (67) 4:3,4;8:17,	36:1,1;37:20;46:6;
	46:11;55:1,4;57:6			
Monday (2) 58:17,25	needed (1) 4:21	open (5) 20:7;38:7;	19,20,23;10:2,6;11:7;	52:14
monetary (1) 29:22	negotiate (1) 9:13	50:4,17;52:18	14:12,13,14,18;15:24,	populations (1) 62:21
money (17) 34:4,6,15;	neighborhood (1) 36:17	opening (1) 50:5	25;16:19,20;23:25;	position (4) 9:3,6;
38:25;44:8,16,23,25;	nevertheless (1) 29:12	opportunity (2) 12:13;	24:2,3,7,13,17,20;25:4,	43:17;48:23
45:14;46:5,8,10,10,21;		23:5	7,11,21;32:8,9;40:10,	possible (8) 3:6;4:7;
47:11;63:5,7	new (4) 8:12;11:23;	oppose (1) 63:6	13,14;41:6,9,13;44:9,	13:6;16:23;32:12;50:4;
	61:14,15			
monies (1) 46:8	next (3) 15:4;23:4;	opposed (1) 48:23	11,12,15,21,22;46:16,	51:2;57:22
monitor (2) 38:24;63:2	53:18	option (1) 53:18	19;49:17,18;50:15,23,	post (1) 23:6
month (1) 55:23	nice (1) 24:8	options (3) 54:8,8,13	24;52:9;55:7,10,11,18;	posts (1) 12:1
months (1) 52:12	non-Clean (1) 45:12	order (4) 32:22,23;	57:10,12,14;58:10,15,	potential (2) 23:12;
more (33) 4:25;5:13;	none (1) 3:12	34:1;46:25	16,19,21;59:7;60:25;	52:12
7:13;8:12;9:16;10:10,		organization (7) 20:21;	61:1;64:8,9	power (1) 47:1
12;13:19;14:5,20;	non-partisan (2) 54:4;	27:7;28:15;34:21;	pay (1) 41:10	practice (3) 33:20;
	61:22			
23:13;25:1;27:9;30:16;	nor (1) 7:17	36:14;37:22,24	payment (2) 34:10,20	41:23;42:19
39:18;40:15;41:18;	normal (1) 24:23	organizations (3)	payments (1) 35:17	practices (1) 18:25
42:17;44:5,16,22;	note (2) 17:8;40:22	26:24;35:12,18	Payne (3) 62:12,17;	predictable (1) 23:14
45:15;46:11;47:1;48:6,	notice (3) 7:9;13:12;	others (1) 42:5	63:13	preference (2) 29:20,21
7;54:24,24,25;55:5;		otherwise (1) 39:1	penalties (2) 25:1;27:9	preliminary (1) 14:19
60:9;61:17;62:20	26:14	ourselves (2) 28:4;	penalty (2) 20:17;40:15	present (4) 11:24,25;
	notified (1) 22:8			
morning (3) 3:3;61:18,	notwithstanding (1)	52:14	people (15) 9:22;11:8,	23:21;62:7
20	21:2	out (28) 8:12;12:17,19,	17,18;24:24;27:20,24;	presented (2) 32:23;
most (4) 5:15;18:25;	November (1) 58:2	21;14:1;19:14,24;	28:5;29:21;38:7,9;	58:8
35:21;56:6	number (5) 5:23;9:17;	23:16,17;27:6;29:3,13;	42:14;46:9;51:8;62:3	president (3) 51:12,12,
motion (10) 3:16;14:1;		34:7,10;35:9;36:10;	per (1) 30:25	14
15:10;16:10;31:11,24;	17:15;20:1;51:8	40:15,20,24;43:21,24,	percent (4) 10:25;	pretty (4) 5:19;6:13;
	numbers (1) 21:16			
43:4;49:10;57:6;63:25		25;44:2;45:8;47:7;	18:23;19:19,21	8:15;38:12
motions (1) 16:3	\mathbf{O}	51:19;55:22;63:11	percentage (1) 23:14	prevailing (1) 29:10
move (16) 3:19;15:4,		outflows (1) 38:24	percentages (1) 23:15	primary (5) 22:17;31:4;
14;16:6,7,12;31:21;	objection (1) 35:11	outside (2) 21:3;52:22	perfectly (1) 23:16	40:25;42:1,13
41:19;49:5;50:7,10;	objective (2) 31:3,5	outstanding (2) 7:14;	period (4) 32:14;50:6,	principal (1) 9:2
54:6;55:5,5;58:7;64:1		62:19	18;59:1	priorities (1) 9:23
moved (5) 16:11;31:25;	obligated (1) 30:13	over (3) 6:11;18:3;19:4	person (8) 23:20;	probable (2) 23:2,6
	obligation (1) 25:22			
50:16;59:10;60:19	obligations (3) 22:2,15;	overall (3) 8:14;18:21;	24:23;27:14;43:21,25;	probably (9) 9:20;
moving (2) 14:19;17:10	26:2	20:15	44:15;45:5;46:23	21:15;24:24;26:25;
much (8) 17:12;25:2;	observation (1) 28:23	overlap (1) 47:22	personal (5) 45:2;46:7,	42:19;52:15;55:12;
31:7;37:7;44:25;53:13;	obstinate (1) 25:12	owing (2) 45:13,14	10,20;62:5	56:3,16
56:13;62:8		own (2) 19:13;46:10	perspective (1) 8:16	problem (3) 9:20;
mulligan (1) 27:4	obvious (1) 35:22	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	philosophy (1) 54:2	40:17:53:25
	obviously (7) 14:4;	P		
	17:8;18:13;20:6;23:2;	1	Phoenix (3) 5:8,8;6:2	problematic (3) 9:16;
multiple (1) 45:1		1	phone (2) 14:22;60:4	33:16;38:14
multiple (1) 45:1 MUR (1) 16:24	37:13;48:19			
multiple (1) 45:1 MUR (1) 16:24 mural (1) 12:14	37:13;48:19	packet (1) 57:25	physically (1) 8:10	problems (1) 8:3
multiple (1) 45:1 MUR (1) 16:24	37:13;48:19 October (1) 58:2	packet (1) 57:25 page (2) 22:5;57:13		problems (1) 8:3 proceeding (1) 23:1
multiple (1) 45:1 MUR (1) 16:24 mural (1) 12:14 Musey (1) 38:1	37:13;48:19 October (1) 58:2 offering (1) 5:17	page (2) 22:5;57:13	physically (1) 8:10	proceeding (1) 23:1
multiple (1) 45:1 MUR (1) 16:24 mural (1) 12:14	37:13;48:19 October (1) 58:2		physically (1) 8:10 picture (3) 6:15;17:20;	

62:23;63:5 **production (1)** 42:17 program (1) 36:16 prohibited (3) 34:15,23, **promote (2)** 10:24;46:2 **prompt (1)** 54:22 **Prop (1)** 34:3 **property (1)** 5:18 **proponent (1)** 38:1 proposed (4) 50:11; 51:3;57:23,25 protect (1) 63:2 **provide (4)** 5:12;22:8; 26:14;31:4 provided (1) 22:12 providing (1) 62:22 Public (16) 12:8;20:11; 32:13;38:7,8;47:11; 50:1,6,12,18;61:4,24; 62:10;63:6,15,16 **purchases (1)** 35:7 purely (1) 22:21 purpose (5) 13:25; 26:12,14;47:23;48:13 purposes (3) 18:13; 47:21;48:9 **put (11)** 6:14,16;14:1; 21:3;26:11,13;39:9; 46:10;48:17;54:9;60:1 **putting (3)** 5:17;29:17; 35:19

0

qualify (1) 45:12 quarter (1) 5:7 quick (2) 10:18;59:15 quickly (3) 6:17;12:12; 61:16 quite (5) 8:15;39:4; 43:21.22:61:15

R

R2-20-104 (2) 32:19; 50:12 **R2-20-113 (1)** 32:18 **R2-20-702 (1)** 32:14 **R2-20-704 (1)** 32:16 radar (1) 60:1 raised (1) 35:11 raises (1) 51:21 ratio (1) 23:11 re (1) 25:25 reached (1) 59:4 read (3) 4:14;45:9; 62:11 reading (7) 13:19; 14:15;29:11;41:14; 43:18;45:23;47:12 ready (1) 14:8 real (1) 35:15

really (19) 7:21;9:2,3,6; 10:11,12;12:12;18:2; 20:13;21:17;27:16; 39:18;48:20;52:5,12, 21;54:4;55:1,2 reason (2) 41:14;46:12 reasonable (2) 18:20; 23:23

Rebecca (1) 13:7 recall (3) 22:20;34:3,4 receipts (1) 14:21 received (5) 12:10; 13:12;55:21;56:2,20

recently (1) 33:19 recommend (7) 13:25; 30:14,15;47:20,23; 48:8;56:9

recommendation (4) 19:6;23:21;37:7;55:2 recommended (2) 14:1; 31:21

record (3) 56:14;61:9; 63:19 **Recorder (1)** 5:25

reducing (1) 63:4 **reference (1)** 34:8 referendum (3) 9:12,15,

regarding (2) 14:21; 51:3

registered (1) 11:20 registration (2) 11:25; 36.11

regularly (2) 23:13; 41:24 reinforce (1) 30:21

related (4) 17:18,18; 33:4;48:25 relatedly (1) 38:21

relating (2) 4:15;62:13 **relatively (2)** 6:16,17 relevant (2) 49:1;59:18 relieve (1) 41:9

remember (1) 45:24 remind (2) 59:7;63:14 reminder (1) 6:15

reminds (1) 52:24 removed (1) 9:14 **repay (3)** 41:3;44:1; 47:7

repaying (1) 47:10 repayment (2) 32:16; 38:16

repayment-specific (1) 38:15

replied (1) 62:17 reply (3) 55:21;56:2,20 report (8) 4:8,8;7:24; 10:17;11:21;13:3;

22:15,17 reporter (1) 11:12

reporting (3) 21:7,9; $22 \cdot 1$

reports (7) 19:1,23; 20:9:29:21:30:2.4:31:3 Representative (1)

62:14 Representatives (2) 62:12;63:12

request (3) 23:7;41:25; 54:23

request-driven (1) 42:21

requested (1) 22:9 reguests (2) 25:24,25 require (1) 47:18

required (2) 46:25;47:7 requires (2) 35:4;62:2 **requiring (1)** 21:9

reserved (1) 22:24 reserving (2) 22:18; 35:5

resign (1) 52:8 resigned (1) 52:3

resolve (2) 17:17;30:23 resolved (2) 19:2;29:19 respect (5) 5:3;21:6;

33:21;34:9,14 respects (1) 38:15 respond (1) 61:16

respondent (1) 23:7 respondents (1) 29:18 response (13) 3:11;

> 12:10,12;13:4;14:22; 15:3,9;40:7;42:25; 47:16;51:25;54:22; 56:23

responsible (1) 27:15 restricting (1) 40:19 restriction (1) 40:18 result (1) 43:15

resumes (1) 50:2 reviewed (1) 33:18 right (15) 7:9;8:24;

10:5,15;22:19;24:12; 25:6;28:17;29:6;32:24; 35:5;38:9,9;39:13;

57:21 rights (2) 27:17;30:13 ripe (1) 52:5

Rivko (5) 51:10;53:12; 56:14,14;61:10 **ROBERTS (3)** 11:10;

12:7,25

roll (6) 3:13,23;15:18; 16:14;32:3;49:11 room (1) 42:20

roughly (1) 19:18 roundtable (1) 5:24 rude (1) 62:5

rule (16) 23:6;32:13; 33:12;37:13;38:13,15, 17,18;40:22,24;43:14; 45:6,10;46:13;50:5,17

rules (7) 9:13;23:4; 27:1;33:16,18;44:4;

48:14 run (8) 11:14,16;28:13; 41:25;42:2,8;62:22; 63:8 running (1) 46:1

S

sad (1) 62:8 safe (1) 33:7 same (10) 13:21;23:20; 27:8,23;28:5,5;36:13; 46:9;48:23;57:13 saw (1) 28:5 saying (4) 27:2,2,15; 42:6 scheduled (2) 59:20,21 school (1) 12:6 Scott (1) 37:25 se (1) 30:25 second (17) 3:21,22; 15:16,17;16:9;31:23, 25;36:20;38:22;49:8,9; 50:14,15;58:12,13; 64:3,3 seconded (5) 16:12; 32:1;50:17;59:11;

60:19 Secretary (2) 27:12; 48:22 **section (3)** 9:12;34:9; 49:21 seed (1) 44:8 seeing (1) 12:17

seem (1) 24:9 seems (12) 10:8,8,9; 19:20;20:23;24:3,21, 23,23;28:21;45:6;48:2

self-imposed (1) 40:24 semi-understand (1) 20:19 senate (1) 9:14

send (4) 12:5,8,21; 36:15 sense (1) 28:7 **sent (5)** 12:10;14:1,24;

51:9;56:16 sentence (1) 62:15 sentiment (1) 62:17 separate (1) 49:22 **September (1)** 58:1 serious (1) 8:3 served (1) 53:21

serving (2) 53:21,22 session (15) 4:16;6:5; 8:16;39:19,23;41:17;

47:18,24;48:9;49:2,6, 20,22;50:1,4 **set (4)** 21:9,10;35:23;

44:16 setting (1) 23:14 **settlement (2)** 18:16;

19:18

several (1) 14:22 **share (2)** 56:23;60:13 **shocked (2)** 13:15; 62:11 **shoot (1)** 62:16 **short (1)** 43:21 side (2) 42:17;48:24 sign (1) 18:2

signed (2) 19:9;51:18 **significant (2)** 5:10,19 significantly (1) 9:16

similar (1) 17:11 **simple (1)** 34:12 **simply (1)** 47:5

sit-down (1) 54:15 **situation (2)** 13:18;

45:24 **six (1)** 52:12 **small (1)** 25:13 society (1) 62:7 **somebody (6)** 4:19;

7:20;27:4;45:25;55:15; 57:15 someone (3) 30:20;

60:12,12 **Sometimes (2)** 27:20;

30:23 soon (1) 25:24

sorry (12) 27:16;31:17; 35:2;44:20,21;51:19; 53:3:54:9:55:9:56:11: 59:13.14

sort (4) 21:16;38:19; 42:15;46:19

sound (1) 60:12 **sounds (3)** 25:13;

45:15:57:9 **speak (5)** 11:11;19:10; 61:18,20;63:11

speaking (4) 9:9;14:25; 29:5;51:19

Speakman (7) 13:8,18; 14:6,15;15:15;16:8,13 special (2) 46:5,8

specific (5) 7:23;23:6; 30:25;34:8;47:23

specifically (3) 33:13; 38:3;48:19 **specificity (1)** 37:12

speech (1) 21:6 **spend (5)** 8:9;19:24;

34:6;35:3;36:15 **spending (8)** 19:17;

20:15;22:17;24:9;25:1, 13;27:15;46:25

spent (1) 5:9 **split (1)** 18:22 **sponsored (1)** 6:1

spot (1) 35:19 stack (2) 45:7,17 **staff (17)** 6:7;8:5,5;

16:7,12;17:4,6,6; 24:21;48:7;54:16,19;

Citizens Clean Elections
57:16;60:6;62:18,19;
63:14 staffs (1) 8:4
staff's (1) 24:15
standard (1) 63:16
standards (2) 29:4,4
standing (1) 53:19 start (3) 4:13;29:23;
33:6
started (1) 28:20
State (12) 7:18;18:8; 27:12;29:13;38:16;
46:4;47:21;48:21,22;
57:3;61:8;62:8
statement (8) 4:15,22;
42:3,10,12,13;55:8; 61:12
statements (3) 14:21;
32:18;33:22
statewide (1) 13:17
stating (1) 58:25 status (2) 34:8;53:23
statute (6) 21:10;28:25;
38:16,23;39:17;44:6
step (3) 15:4;17:20;
23:17 steps (1) 47:25
still (8) 7:14;15:3;
18:11;21:8;28:21;
34:19;41:4;51:14
story (1) 43:21 straightforward (1)
45:16
Strategy (3) 6:5;9:1;
10:7 strike (1) 43:4
striking (1) 35:3
stringing (1) 40:15
struck (5) 18:9;43:6,6,
7;44:20 stuff (6) 12:6;25:5;
36:12;48:4;52:25;
59:24
subjective (1) 4:18
submit (1) 42:9 submitting (1) 61:16
succeed (1) 47:4
success (3) 9:11;11:16;
12:3 successful (2) 5:21;
8:15
sued (1) 47:3
suffice (1) 4:17
sufficient (3) 17:4;
20:22;21:1 Summit (1) 6:21
supercede (1) 46:22
Superintendent (1)
12:14 superintendents (1)
12:6
support (8) 12:15;26:9,
18,23;27:2;28:9;46:12,

13
supported (1) 37:12
supposed (1) 43:7
Supreme (3) 18:6;21:5;
29:13
Sure (18) 8:18;13:23;
20:9;24:19;25:3,3;
26:4,7;32:21,25;34:2;
38:25;39:4;41:2;42:18;
44:14;55:17;61:15
system (1) 46:3

T table (3) 35:23;36:7; 54:13 takeaway (1) 7:24 talk (6) 36:2;37:8;39:4; 51:5;55:1;60:13 talked (1) 48:5 talking (6) 9:8;20:20; 27:14;37:21;48:20; 53.7 targeting (2) 11:22; 22:22 taste (1) 52:22 tax (1) 5:18 tax-exempt (1) 34:8 taxpayer (1) 63:7 teachers (1) 12:18 ten (1) 56:4 **Term (10)** 7:7;16:24; 17:7;18:4,7,8;20:21; 21:25;32:2;52:6 terms (4) 17:11;20:7; 23:11,14 testimony (1) 38:3 thinking (1) 45:25 **THOMAS (4)** 7:10; 58:18,23;59:9 though (5) 8:11;18:21; 34:21;48:23;63:6 thought (2) 27:18;37:1 thoughts (1) 46:15 threatened (1) 62:6 threats (1) 63:9 three (4) 11:15;53:23; 55:25;61:15 threshold (1) 23:15 **throughout (1)** 5:15 **Thursday (2)** 59:4,8 **Thursdays (1)** 58:22 thus (1) 62:8 times (3) 24:11;36:8; 43:23 timing (1) 22:21 Titla (1) 52:8 title (1) 61:19 today (2) 7:1;42:20 together (4) 6:16;39:2; 45:7,17 Tom (22) 4:9;11:19; 12:11;13:9;16:25;

21:23;30:22;31:7; 32:20;34:19;35:14; 36:23;38:11;40:8; 41:15,20;43:2;49:6; 51:5;53:15;59:13; 61:13 tomorrow (1) 6:4 took (5) 4:19;20:5; 27:18;34:10;43:21 top (2) 4:13;44:16 total (3) 11:15;19:18; 45:8 totally (1) 13:14 touch (1) 6:8 towards (1) 21:15 town (1) 5:9 town's (1) 5:18 **track (5)** 11:6,13,16; 12:1,3 tracking (1) 8:2 tradeoff (1) 29:20 **trajectory (1)** 17:11 **transparency (1)** 62:22 tried (3) 23:13;24:8; 61:24 trouble (1) 21:12 true (2) 18:19;60:11 truly (1) 27:13 **try (4)** 6:6;20:8;26:14; 47:3 trying (5) 15:2;17:2; 27:6;31:2;46:2 turn (4) 14:16,18;25:5; 26:22 turned (1) 44:2 turns (1) 43:25 twice (2) 19:24;47:3 two (11) 14:11;15:8; 17:17;19:1;25:23; 38:14:39:2:46:14; 53:22;56:4,16 U

unavoidable (1) 59:24 under (6) 22:5;34:8; 41:4,4,7;49:22 understood (2) 22:1; 25:15 unit (1) 17:5 unless (4) 19:3;39:12; 42:11,12 unlikely (1) 59:22 **up (17)** 7:4;10:24; 12:20;13:18;20:13; 23:13;29:23;35:23; 39:18;41:15;43:14; 44:3,4,12;45:8,13; 56:25 upon (1) 38:13 urban (1) 62:20 **urges (1)** 63:10

urging (1) 52:20

use (4) 32:15;34:15; 42:13,19 used (3) 11:18;63:7,12 using (1) 6:12 USTL (2) 18:17;23:8

\mathbf{V}

vaque (1) 40:23 Valley (2) 5:10.16 value (2) 19:22;20:18 variety (2) 6:9;54:13 versions (1) 50:11 versus (2) 7:17;47:21 VI (2) 32:12;50:4 vibrant (1) 62:2 view (1) 29:10 VII (1) 51:2 VIII (3) 57:22;58:8; 59:12 violated (1) 37:1 violating (3) 22:1;24:4; 52:18 violence (1) 63:9 virtual (2) 62:15;63:9 virtually (1) 62:16 vital (1) 63:2 **VK (1)** 9:20 vote (10) 3:13,23;6:5, 15;11:20;15:19;16:14; 30:11;32:3;49:12 voter (6) 5:3;6:21; 10:24;11:24;36:11; 62:19 voter-ed (1) 33:4 voters (9) 5:13;6:21; 7:3;37:13;51:9;53:12; 56:15;61:11,22 votes (8) 4:5;16:1,21;

W

32:10;49:19;50:25;

61:2;64:10

voting (1) 51:24

Wait (1) 58:11 waiving (3) 38:19,19; 39:5 walked (1) 11:1 wants (1) 61:5 warning (1) 10:3 Washington (1) 29:9 way (10) 11:6;27:17; 29:17;34:15;37:4;39:9; 41:14;43:24;48:17; 54:9 week (2) 51:9,17 weekend (1) 51:15 weeks (6) 11:15,15; 19:1;55:25;56:4,16 weighed (1) 26:22 weight (1) 63:15

weren't (1) 25:22 whatnot (1) 26:11 what's (6) 7:2;33:20; 37:23,25;40:14;53:18 Whereupon (1) 64:12 white (1) 9:10 whole (3) 17:20;35:9; 51:24 who's (2) 15:1;28:13 willing (5) 14:3;18:14; 27:3;53:1,1 wings (1) 12:15 winning (1) 30:25 **Wisconsin (1)** 29:6 wish (1) 63:22 wishful (1) 29:11 within (4) 19:1;30:12; 41:3;47:12 without (4) 30:2;33:14; 39:5;52:17 Women (5) 51:9;53:12; 56:15;61:11,22 wonderful (1) 53:14 word (2) 27:19;42:19 words (4) 18:16;41:23; 62:15;63:14 work (7) 10:9;23:16; 24:21;26:13;52:16,17; 57:20 worked (3) 8:4;25:23; 63:1 working (4) 5:4;7:12; 13:16;21:16 works (2) 30:6;63:23 world (2) 35:15;51:24 worried (1) 60:8 worth (1) 58:24 wrapped (1) 13:18 write (5) 42:1;52:19; 53:16,17;62:24 writing (2) 53:13,16 written (2) 3:20;52:23 wrongdoing (1) 18:17 wrote (2) 9:17;43:16 WRTL (1) 29:10

\mathbf{X}

XI (1) 61:4

Y

Yavapai (1) 51:16 year (10) 5:15;7:25; 8:11;9:12,17;12:23; 37:21;40:16,18;41:3 years (4) 6:11;10:14; 30:3;53:21 yelled (1) 62:4

1

1 (3) 17:15;32:11;43:5

welcome (1) 14:7

Citizens Clean Elections	Commission	+	Wiay 50, 20
10 (4) 18:23;19:19,21; 20:5 10:06 (1) 50:2	60 (1) 50:12 60-day (3) 32:13;50:5, 18		
100 (2) 10:25;43:23 104 (6) 33:13,14;43:1,	7		
3,3;47:15 11:20 (1) 64:13 113 (8) 33:13,19;40:8, 9;41:20,21;42:24; 50:12 12th (1) 58:2 14th (1) 58:2	7 (1) 33:19 702 (5) 33:12;34:2,15; 38:5;50:12 704 (6) 33:13,13;38:11, 12;40:6;50:12		
17th (1) 58:2	8		
18 (1) 6:15 18-14 (1) 16:24 19 (1) 3:7	8th (2) 6:22,24		
2			
2 (6) 22:5;38:5;43:4,5, 6;44:20 20 (1) 36:15 2001 (1) 38:14 2018 (1) 13:6 2019 (5) 3:4,7;57:23; 58:9;60:20 20th (3) 59:19,20,22 21st (1) 5:21 22nd (1) 58:1 25 (1) 35:24 25th (1) 3:7 26th (1) 58:1 27,000 (1) 19:25 2724 (1) 8:2 29th (2) 58:1,16			
3	_		
3 (2) 32:11;43:5 306 (14) 34:3,4,13,16, 23,25,25;35:4;36:19; 37:1,4,25;47:21;48:19 30-day (1) 59:1 30th (2) 3:4;52:5			
4			
4 (6) 4:6;16:2,22;43:5; 51:1;61:3			
5			
5 (1) 43:5 50 (1) 35:23 501 (4) 18:5;34:5;35:7,			
501a (4) 34:8;35:1,2,12 53 (1) 20:4 53,000 (1) 20:3 58 (1) 20:2			
6			
	The state of the s		

CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT July 29, 2019

Announcements:

- The qualifying period for candidates interested in running with Clean Elections funding begins August 1 and training (live and online) begins August 2. Qualifying contributions are \$5 contributions candidates raise to show there is grassroots support from actual voters living in their district. They are turned in along with the candidates application for funding.
- The public can view Commission meetings live via the internet at <u>www.livestream.com/cleanelections</u>. A link is available on our website.
- Avery completed the first week of the Secretary of State's Election Officer Certification training course. He will become a certified election official after completing the remaining coursework this fall.

Voter Education:

Elections:

- Local elections will be held on August 27th.
 - Voter registration deadline = Monday, July 29th
 - Early voting begins = Wednesday, July 31st
 - City of Phoenix = Proposition 105 and Proposition 106
 - City of Peoria = Councilmember
 - City of Prescott = Mayor & Councilmember
 - City of Tucson = Mayor & Councilmember
 - City of Yuma = Municipal Judge & Councilmember
 - Navajo County = Proposition 421

Community Outreach/Events

- The Navajo Voters Coalition Summit was held on June 8th at Dine College in Tsaile. Tom presented on Clean Elections' voter education efforts and running for office.
- Chairman Kimble filmed the introductory video in our Commissioner video series, which
 is designed to educate voters on the commission, and the background and goals for
 each commissioner.
- Gina trained attendees at Election Officer Certification training on assisting and communicating with the public.
- Gina and Tom participated in the Secretary of State's statewide election security conference calls with county election officials.
- Gina attended the Election Officials of Arizona spring workshop.
- Avery participated in the SOS's Voter Outreach Advisory Committee meetings.
- Avery participated in the Arizona Commission of African American Affairs.
- Gina participated in the Department of Education's Civic Engagement Committee meeting.
- Avery participated in the Maricopa County Recorder's Town Hall event.
- A byline article by Commissioner Paton regarding the start of the qualifying period ran in the Apache Junction Independent, and is slated to run in the Arizona Capitol Times, West Valley View, Glendale Star, and Peoria Times this week.

Miscellaneous

Outstanding legal matters

- <u>Legacy Foundation Action</u> Fund
- o AZAN v. State et. al.

• GRRC

- GRRC Staff has removed our pending 2017 5-year-review from their internal agenda. Staff informs us that this was done as housekeeping. It is not clear if this means the Council will never address the additional report we filed, but that seems possible.
- Mike and Tom recently had a meeting with SOS staff about GRRC and other matters, including those covered by the Interagency Service Agreement. Although those discussions have not progressed, we still plan to work with the Secretary's office on shared items of interest.

• Challenge to Circulator "Strike out" law

- A coalition of voters, organizers, and organizations are challenging A.R.S. section 19-118(c) on First and Fourteenth Amendment Grounds.
- The law requires that, in the event of a challenge to initiative or referendum signatures, the failure of a properly subpoenaed signature gatherer to appear results in the striking of all that person's petition signatures.
- According to plaintiffs, the restrictions chill "core political speech" and have reduced the chances of a successful placement on the ballot, results in unfair content-based treatment based on the kind of petition, and impermissibly burdens the exercise of a fundamental right.
- Plaintiffs' motion for preliminary injunction and complaint are available.

• Washington Supreme Court upholds Seattle public financing program.

According to the Seattle television station KING 5, the court: ruled that Seattle's democracy vouchers do not burden free speech, because they facilitate public discussion and encourage voter participation. Justices also found the program doesn't force taxpayers to associate with any particular message that the program may be conveying, and therefore doesn't violate First Amendment rights.

https://www.king5.com/article/news/seattle-democracy-vouchers-are-constitutional-washington-supreme-court-rules/281-0c4b3b61-9b72-4df5-b6e2-f30a740be516

- The program distributes vouchers to voters that are used in its public financing program.
- This challenge was somewhat novel in that Plaintiffs are among the first to claim that Janus, a recent US Supreme Court case barring mandatory payments to unions by non-members on first amendment associational grounds, also barred the public financing program. The Court distinguished that case, stating, "Unlike the employees in Janus, [Plaintiffs] cannot show the tax [which funds the program] individually associated them with any message conveyed by the Democracy Voucher Program."
- The opinion can be read here: http://www.courts.wa.gov/opinions/pdf/966605.pdf

From: **Spencer**, **Eric H.** <<u>espencer@swlaw.com</u>>

Date: Sunday, July 14, 2019

Subject: Question re proposed amended R2-20-104(E)

To: "michael.becker@azcleanelections.gov" <michael.becker@azcleanelections.gov>, "thomas.collins@azcleanelections.gov" <thomas.collins@azcleanelections.gov>

Hi Mike and Tom,

Quick question for you about the highlighted phase below. Is 16-941(A)(1) really an expenditure limitation? It reads more like a provision governing how contributions may be accepted (a "contribution limitation" of sorts), but I'm not seeing the expenditure limitation part. Can you all help me out? Thanks!

Take care, Eric

R2-20-104. Certification as a Participating Candidate

E. Loans. A participating candidate may accept an individual contribution as a loan or may loan his or her campaign committee personal monies during the exploratory and qualifying periods only. The total sum of the contributions received shall not exceed the expenditure limits set forth in A.R.S. § 16-941(A)(1). Personal funds and loans shall not exceed the expenditure limits set forth in A.R.S. § 16-941(A)(2). If the loan is to be repaid, the loans shall be repaid promptly upon receipt of Clean Elections funds if the participating candidate qualifies for Clean Elections funding. Loans from a financial institution or bank, to a candidate used for the purpose of influencing that candidate's election shall be considered personal monies and shall not exceed the personal monies expenditure limits set forth in A.R.S. § 16-941(A)(2).

ITEM IV - PUBLIC COMMENT

R2-20-702. Use of Campaign Funds

- A. A participating candidate shall use funds in the candidate's current campaign account to pay for goods and services for direct campaign purposes only. Funds shall be disbursed and reported in accordance with A.R.S. § 16-948(C).
- B. A participating candidate may:
 - 1. Make a payment from the candidate's campaign bank account:
 - a. To a political committee or civic organization including a person with tax exempt status under section 501(a) of the internal revenue code or an unincorporated association. The payment is not a contribution if the payment is reasonable in relation to the value received.
 - b. For customary charges for services rendered, such as for printing and obtaining voter or telephone lists, shall be considered reasonable in relation to the value received.
 - c. Of not more than \$200 per person to attend a political event open to the public or to party members shall be considered reasonable in relation to the value received.
 - 2. Only make an advanced payment to a political party for services such as consulting, communications, field employees, canvassers, mailers, auto-dialers, telephone town halls, electronic communications and other advertising purchases and other campaign services if an itemized invoice identifying the value of the service is provided directly to the participating candidate at the time of the advanced payment.
 - a. Payment in the absence of an itemized invoice or advanced payment for such services shall be deemed a contribution to the political party.
 - b. Payment may be advanced for postage upon the receipt of a written estimate and so long as any balance is returned to the candidate if the advance exceeds the actual cost of the postage.
 - c. Payment may be advanced for advertising that customarily requires prepayment upon the receipt of a written estimate and so long as any balance is returned to the candidate if the advance exceeds the actual cost of the advertisement.
 - d. A political party may not mark up or add any additional charge to the value of services provided to the particular candidate. All expenditures must be for the services used by the particular participating candidate.
 - e. The Commission shall be included in the mail batch for all mailers and invitations. The Commission shall also be provided with documentation from the mail house, printer or other original source showing the number of mailers printed and the number of households to which a mailer was sent. Failure to provide this information within 7 days after a mailer has been mailed may be considered as evidence the mailer was not for direct campaign purposes.

R2-20-704. Repayment

- A. In general, the Commission may determine that a participating candidate who has received payments from the Fund must repay the Fund as determined by the Commission.
 - A candidate who has received payments from the Fund shall pay the Fund any amounts that the Commission determines to be repayable. In making repayment determinations, the Commission may utilize information obtained from audits and examinations or otherwise obtained by the Commission in carrying out its responsibilities.
 - 2. The Commission will notify the candidate of any repayment determinations made under this section as soon as possible... but not later than one year after the day of the election.

R2-20-113. Candidate Statement Pamphlet

A. The Commission shall publish a candidate statement pamphlet in both the primary and general elections as required by A.R.S. §16-956(A)(1). Commission staff shall send invitations for submission of a 200 word statement to every statewide and legislative candidate who has qualified for the ballot. Statements submitted for the primary candidate statement pamphlet shall be used for the general candidate statement pamphlet unless otherwise stated by the candidate.

B. The following candidates will not be invited to submit a statement for the candidate statement pamphlet: 1. In the primary election: write-in candidates for the primary election, independent candidates, no party affiliation or unrecognized party candidates. 2. In the general election: write in candidates

TITLE 2. ADMINISTRATION CHAPTER 20. CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION ARTICLE 1. GENERAL PROVISIONS Section R2-20-104. Certification as a Participating Candidate ARTICLE 1. GENERAL PROVISIONS

PROVISIONS Section R2-20-104. Certification as a Participating Candidate ARTICLE 1. GENERAL PROVISIONS			
R2-20-104. Certification as a Participating Candidate			
A. No change			
1. No change			
2. No change			
3. No change			
4. No change			
5. No change			
6. No change			
B. No change			
1. No change			
2. No change			
3. No change			
4. No change			
C. No change			
1. No change			
2. No change			
3. No change			
4. No change			
5. No change			
6. No change			
7. No change			
8. No change			
9. No change			

- 10. No change
- 11. No change

D. No change

- 1. No change
- 2. No change
- 3. No change
- 4. No change
- 5. No change
 - a. No change
 - b. No change
- 6. No change

E. Loans. A participating candidate may accept an individual contribution as a loan or may loan his or her campaign committee personal monies during the exploratory and qualifying periods only. The total sum of the contribution contributions received or personal funds and loans shall not exceed the expenditure limits set forth in A.R.S. § 16-941(A)(1) and (2). Personal funds and loans shall not exceed the expenditure limits set forth in A.R.S. § 16-941(A)(2). If the loan is to be repaid, the loans shall be repaid promptly upon receipt of Clean Elections funds if the participating candidate qualifies for Clean Elections funding. Loans from a financial institution or bank, to a candidate used for the purpose of influencing that candidate's election shall be considered personal monies and shall not exceed the personal monies expenditure limits set forth in A.R.S. § 16-941(A)(2).

- F. No change
- G. No change

R2-20-104. Certification as a Participating Candidate

E. Loans. A participating candidate may accept an individual contribution as a loan or may loan his or her campaign committee personal monies during the exploratory and qualifying periods only. The total sum of the contributions received or personal funds and loans shall not exceed the expenditure limits set forth in A.R.S. § 16-941(A)(1). Personal funds and loans shall not exceed the expenditure limits set forth in A.R.S. § 16-941(A)(2). and (2). If the loan is to be repaid, the loans shall be repaid promptly upon receipt of Clean Elections funds if the participating candidate qualifies for Clean Elections funding. Loans from a financial institution or bank, to a candidate used for the purpose of influencing that candidate's election shall be considered personal monies and shall not exceed the personal monies expenditure limits set forth in A.R.S. § 16-941(A)(2).

ITEM IV(D)

Staff Recommended Motions

Immediate effect motion language

Mr. Chairman, I move that pursuant to Ars 956 (c) and (d) that the amendment to r2-20-702 be approved for immediate effect.

Mr. Chairman, I move that pursuant to Ars 956 (c) and (d) that the amendment to r2-20-113 be approved for immediate effect.

Mr. Chairman, I move that pursuant to Ars 956 (c) and (d) that the amendment to r2-20-704 be approved for immediate effect.

Delayed effect Motion Language

Mr. Chairman, I move that pursuant to Ars 956 (c) and (d) that the amendment to r2-20-702 be approved effective January 1.

Mr. Chairman, I move that pursuant to Ars 956 (c) and (d) that the amendment to r2-20-113 be approved effective January 1.

Mr. Chairman, I move that pursuant to Ars 956 (c) and (d) that the amendment to r2-20-704 be approved effective January 1.

Termination of proceedings

Mr. chairman, I move that the commission terminate the rule amendment proceeding in R2-20-104.

Initiation of new amendment

Mr. Chairman, I move that, pursuant to 16-956(c) - (e) that the amendment to R2-20-104 be published for public comment period of no less than 60 days.