2020 ANNUAL REPORT

Presented By The Citizens Clean Elections Commission

The Annual Report will be submitted to the Governor, the President of the Arizona State Senate and the Speaker of the Arizona State House of Representatives. This report will be made available online at www.azcleanelections.gov.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Letter from the Chairman</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voter &amp; Public Education</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Information</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020 Candidate Summary</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020 Primary &amp; General Election Candidate Summary</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enforcement, Candidate Audits &amp; Litigation</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rulemaking &amp; Legislation</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looking Forward to 2021</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissioners &amp; Staff</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
February 25, 2021

The Honorable Doug Ducey  
Governor of the State of Arizona  
1700 West Washington  
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Dear Governor Ducey:

The Citizens Clean Elections Commission is pleased to submit for your information the 2020 Annual Report, pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes §16-956(A)(5). The Annual Report describes the activities performed by the Commission in the last calendar year.

In 1998, the voters of Arizona passed the Citizens Clean Elections Act. 22 years later, the Commission continues its commitment of upholding the letter and spirit of the Act. The Commission accomplished its goals set forth and looks forward to the same success in 2021.

Respectfully,

Galen D. Paton, Chairman  
Citizens Clean Elections Commission
Voter & Public Education

The Commission continued to provide information to the public regarding participation in the political process, Clean Elections participation and the functions and purposes of the Clean Elections Act. This was accomplished through education campaigns throughout the two local elections, the statewide Presidential Preference Election and the Primary and General Elections, along with grassroots and social media outreach. The Commission consistently provides election information on how, where and when to vote. Because of the COVID-19 pandemic and quarantine precautions, the Commission adapted its education plans to reach voters virtually. This included quickly adjusting our debate process to transition to a virtual format that allowed candidates and voters to safely interact on the issues that matter to them. The Clean Elections virtual debates increased accessibility and allowed more voters than ever before to engage with the candidates and learn where they stand on the issues.

The Commission’s education and outreach efforts for 2020 included:

- Voter Education Campaigns
- Dispelling Misinformation
- Candidate Statement Pamphlets
- Candidate Training
- Grassroots Outreach
- Election Security
- U.S. Senate Debate
- Virtual Debates
- Drop Box Map
- Website and Social Media

Educating the Voters.

Educating the Candidates.

In addition to educating the voters, the Commission strives to educate candidates running for office.

The Commission hosts candidate training workshops that include details about campaign finance reporting and debate participation.

The Commission spends 10% of the expenditure cap on voter education in accordance with its statutory requirements. See page 11 of this report for more financial information.
2020 was a unique year and as such the emphasis of the Voter Education Campaign (titled the Balloteer) was multifaceted. Campaign goals included providing information on the following topics: election education/logistics, independent voters, youth voters, voter registration, early voting information (including details regarding USPS), election security, voting during COVID-19, election laws/processes, dispelling disinformation and misinformation, and to assist voters in confirming whether their ballot was counted. We connected with voters through social media, television, radio, out of home, print, digital and online ads.

2020 Elections:
• March 10, 2020 Local Elections
• March 17, 2020 Presidential Preference Election
• May 19, 2020 Local Elections
• August 4, 2020 Primary Election
• November 3, 2020 General Election
• To view more details regarding these elections, please visit our past elections page (www.azcleanelections.gov/arizona-elections/past-election-list).
Voter Education Guides were created, printed, and distributed to voters in the primary and general elections. The guides contained a 200-word statement and a picture from each statewide and legislative candidates. The Commission distributed approximately 2.2 million copies of the Primary election guide and another 2.2 million copies of the General election guide, to the households containing a registered Arizona voter. For the Primary election there were a total of 169 statements submitted, out of 173 eligible candidates (97.6%). Whereas the guide for the General election contained 148 submitted statements, out of 151 eligible candidates (98%).

In the Commission’s dedication to continue to reach all voters, the first ever American Sign Language version of the guide was developed in partnership with the Arizona Commission for the Deaf and the Hard of Hearing. This resulted in a fully accessible voter guide, servicing voters who are blind, deaf and deaf blind. For more information on this project, please visit: https://www.azcleanelections.gov/media/asl-voter-education-guide.

The Voter Education Guide was also made available in Spanish, HTML/Plain Text, Navajo, Audio, and Large Print.
Grassroots Outreach

In an ongoing effort to increase outreach to Arizona Voters, the Commission participated in many events over the course of 2020. Some outings included partnering with election officials across the state where the Commission helped register voters and inform them on how to vote and stay up to date on local, state and federal elections. Even though the pandemic precluded in-person events Avery Xola, the Commission's “Voter Education Specialist”, was able to adapt and attend many election related events virtually.

Notable Outreach Events Included:

- Attended Maricopa County’s Native American Roundtable discussion on access to voter information. (January 22)
- Participated as a vendor at The Maricopa County Arizona Veterans Stand Down Alliance to inform and register veterans. (January 24)
- Presented to the students at Central Arizona College in Casa Grande on How to Vote, How to Register, and register students. (January 28)
- Participated in the African American Legislative Council’s Youth Day at the Capitol event and informed the students about civic engagement (February 14)
- Attended the Maricopa County Recorders’ Office Presidential Preference Election Townhall and educated the attendees on the Presidential Preference Election (February 15)
- Weekly meetings with Mesa Community College Civic Engagement team to continue planning civic engagement projects (2020)
- Represented Clean Elections in monthly virtual Youth Leadership and Development meetings sponsored by Opportunities for Youth. (2020)
- The Voter Ed team produced an American Sign Language Voter Education Guide, for the primary, in a partnership with the Arizona Commission for the Deaf and the Hard of Hearing and Linda Bove from Sesame Street. (June)
- The Voter Ed team met with the Arizona Center for Disability Law to discuss outreach efforts for voters with disabilities. (June)
- Participated in a discussion on Voting in Arizona on the PBS Horizon Town Hall series (July 22, 2020)
- Avery recorded a video about his experience as a UOCAVA voter in the United States Air Force for social media (August 19, 2020)
- Avery was Interviewed by State of Black Arizona about General Election voter information (August 26, 2020)
- Voter Ed team conducted a series of voter education presentations for Ability 360 (September 22, 29, and October 13, and 27)
- Avery presented a virtual presentation for Maricopa Community College's Civic Action Hour on "How Government works" (October 1, 2020)
- Avery answered questions about the voting process via a Facebook Live event hosted by Becca Bailey of The Arizona Commission for The Deaf and Hard of Hearing. (October 7, 2020)
Clean Elections
Training & Guides

Education is a core component of the Commission. In 2020, the Commission continued to provide information to interested groups and potential candidates through speaking engagements, training workshops, as well as through publications on our enhanced agency website. Each election cycle the Commission develops a guide to assist participating candidates as they navigate the political campaign process and to inform non-participating candidates, and other groups involved in elections, about the Clean Elections Act and rules. The guide covers important topics such as requirements of the Clean Elections Act and Rules, filing and reporting deadlines, how to become a Clean Elections participating candidate, and how to qualify for funding.

Participating candidates are required to attend one Clean Elections Candidate Training Workshop during the election cycle. The workshops are open to the public and designed to provide information to prospective candidates, or those who are assisting participating candidates, about the requirements of the Clean Elections Act.
The Commission was able to develop new content for the public regarding Election Security. Election security refers to all the ways election officials ensure the maximum degree of correctness, impartiality, uniformity, and efficiency in the voting process. With 2020 being a year of misinformation this content was particularly useful to help inform and reassure the voting public of the safeguards in place regarding elections and the ballot verification & tabulation protocol. This content is available on the Commission’s website.

Additionally, election officials have long stated that misinformation is the greatest threat to the 2020 election cycle. The Commission was able to proactively and reactively address concerns voters may have had as a result of misinformation about the electoral process and ultimately provide voters with official, nonpartisan election information.
U.S. Senate Debate

As a part of the Commission’s efforts to educate voters about candidates and the issues, the Commission sponsored the U.S. Senate debate between incumbent Martha McSally and challenger Mark Kelly.

- The U.S. Senate debate received the third highest ratings of any PBS show on any PBS station in the country in the past two years. Beating Masterpiece, NewsHour, and Ken Burns. More than 179K viewers watched on 8.1.
- 250K viewers streamed the debate on Arizona PBS platforms YouTube and Facebook and another 330K viewers watched the debate on partner platforms.
- When all is totaled, more than 750k people watched the 90-minute debate, and many stayed online for the 30-minute reporter’s roundtable with the moderators.

Watch the US Senate candidates debate live on October 8th. Visit our site to learn how to watch & submit questions, so you can vote informed on November 3rd. https://bit.ly/3ly3xu72
#AZdebates
Candidate Virtual Debates

Debates in the 2020 Election Cycle were held for both the Primary and General Elections and in a new virtual format. A debate was conducted for every contested Statewide and Legislative office that included a participating candidate or upon the request of a traditional candidate.

Voters were able to participate in the debate process in a number of ways. Statewide debates were televised on Arizona Horizon, all legislative debates were open to the public virtually, recorded for on demand viewing and live streamed to the Commissions YouTube Page. Voters were able to submit questions for candidates ahead of the debate or during the debate through email, phone and text. This new virtual format allowed the program to expand and reach more voters than ever before! The Primary Election debates received approximately 7,414 views throughout the state, while the General Election debates were viewed 9,148 times! 15 legislative debates were held in the Primary Election and 24 legislative debates were held in the General Election, along with the Corporation Commission debates.
A new feature provided by the Commission was an interactive Google Map, in which staff compiled all ballot drop box location information and relevant details (dates/hours of operation). A ballot drop box is a secured bin provided by County Election Officials where voters can return their voted ballot. They are located in a secure location, such as inside or in front of a federal, state, local, or tribal government building.

The Google Map provided voters another access point to find where they could return their voted ballot, in addition to the Voter Dashboard. The map grew in popularity and success as it was utilized in both the Primary and General Elections. The map had over 170 locations included and after the election the received nearly **400 thousand views**!
The Commission had a significant increase in its engagement with voters online. The website is the most comprehensive elections website in the state, providing voters with everything they need to cast their ballot and vote informed on the candidates and the issues. Additionally, the website serves to educate voters about election administration, security and transparency, so they can have confidence in the system. Voters, Google and other prominent organizations, both private and public, looked to the Clean Elections website as a reliable online source for election information.

Utilizing social media channels has allowed the Commission to instantly connect with voters on timely and important election related issues. This was especially useful during the pandemic to communicate with voters as well as allow the commission to dispel misinformation. The Commission adapted to changing social media platform policies to ensure voters in Arizona were presented with critical election information, even earning recognition from Facebook for the Commission’s efforts in combating misinformation.

**Social media sites such as Twitter, YouTube and Facebook were utilized, and the chart below displays the amount of followers/likes throughout the previous years.**

**Social Media Traffic:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2018</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>35,098</td>
<td>34,492</td>
<td>34,084</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twitter</td>
<td>1,699</td>
<td>1,860</td>
<td>2,098</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YouTube</td>
<td>990,541</td>
<td>3,307</td>
<td>1,712,089</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Website Traffic:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Sessions</th>
<th>Users</th>
<th>% of New Users</th>
<th>Page Views</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td>1,514,415</td>
<td>1,196,474</td>
<td>98.65%</td>
<td>2,881,496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>194,338</td>
<td>165,171</td>
<td>90.4%</td>
<td>356,231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>1,012,202</td>
<td>676,846</td>
<td>81.9%</td>
<td>1,909,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>68,687</td>
<td>55,937</td>
<td>90.8%</td>
<td>101,525</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Clean Elections is funded by voluntary contributions and surcharges on criminal penalties and violations, such as traffic tickets.

Not a single dollar of Clean Elections funding comes from the State’s General Fund.

Rather than taking money from taxpayers, Clean Elections has donated $74 million to the State’s General Fund since its inception through 2016.

*The removal of the $5 check-off box on Arizona state income tax return forms and dollar-for-dollar tax credits caused a decrease in revenue to the Clean Elections Fund, and as a result the Commission was unable to transfer excess monies to the General Fund in 2020.

*Previously, Arizona citizens could contribute voluntarily through a $5 check-off box on Arizona state income tax return forms and through dollar for dollar tax credits. This portion of the Act was removed in 2012; however, late tax filers may still contribute.

**The Clean Elections Commission operates on a calendar year budget rather than the State’s fiscal year budget.
Arizona’s Citizens Clean Elections Act

The public financing system is voluntary; candidates who choose to participate in this system to receive public funding are known as participating candidates. Candidates who choose to raise private campaign funds are known as non-participating/traditional candidates.

To become a Clean Elections participating candidate, a candidate must raise a number of $5 qualifying contributions during a defined qualifying period. Clean Elections participating candidates agree to forgo contributions from political action committees.

During the Primary election 173 candidates sought statewide and legislative offices, with 37 of those individuals participating in the Clean Elections system. The Clean Elections candidate participation rate was 21% in the Primary election.

During the General election there were 151 candidates seeking statewide and legislative offices, 32 of which were participating candidates. The Clean Elections candidate participation rate was 21% in the General election.

In 2020, more than $2.8 million was distributed from the Clean Elections Fund to participating candidates.
Reallocation Notice: Pursuant to A.R.S. §16-952(D), a one-party-dominant legislative district is a district in which the number of registered voters registered in the party with the highest number of registered voters exceeds the number of registered voters to each of the other parties by an amount at least as high as ten percent of the total number of voters registered in the district. In 2020, qualifying legislative candidates received $18,121 in funding for the primary. Legislative candidates who were eligible, and chose to reallocate, received $27,182 for the primary instead of the general election. Candidates who reallocated received the primary funding amount for the general election. Candidates are eligible to reallocate their funding if they are in a one-party dominant district, are in the dominant party, and have a contested primary election.
Enforcement

The Commission acts on both external and internally filed complaints.

During 2020, the Commission resolved 2 complaints arising from the 2020 election cycle.

Enforcement, Audits & Litigation

The Commission enforces the Citizens Clean Elections Act and Commission rules which are a part of the Arizona Administrative Code. The Act and Commission rules contain specific campaign finance provisions and limitations.

Commission staff monitor campaign finance reports to ensure campaign spending occurs as specified by the Act and Rules. The Commission has the authority to subpoena witnesses, take evidence, and require, by subpoena, the production of any books, papers, records or other material relevant to an enforcement matter.

Potential penalties for violations of the Act range from monetary penalties, the disqualification of a candidate or forfeiture of office. Most enforcement matters are settled amicably.

The Commission also conducts audits to ensure compliance with the Act and Commission rules. The audits are completed by an independent auditing agency. Candidate audits are conducted during election years after the Commission has disbursed funds to qualified candidates.

In 2020, the Commission conducted 40 audits. Every participating candidate was audited.
Rulemaking & Legislation

Commission Rulemaking Authority
In accordance with A.R.S. §16-956(C), the Commission may adopt rules to carry out the purposes of the Citizens Clean Elections Act. In 2019, the Commission began implementing Proposition 306.

The Commission proposes and adopts rules in public meetings, with at least sixty days allowed for interested parties to comment after the rules are proposed. After consideration of the comments received in the sixty day comment period, the Commission may adopt the rule in an open meeting.

The Commission diligently makes changes to its rules and procedures to address concerns and improve the functions of the program. Rules adopted by the Commission are not effective until January 1 in the year following the adoption of the rule. However, rules adopted by unanimous vote may be immediately effective and are enforceable.

In 2020, the Commission did not make amendments to any rules.

Vision Statement
Through the successful implementation of the Arizona Citizens Clean Elections Act, the Commission seeks to improve the integrity of Arizona state government and promote public confidence in the Arizona political process.
2020 Legislation

The Commission adopted the following legislative principles and priorities in an effort to improve the Act and Commission procedures:

Oppose efforts to defund, eliminate or limit the Citizens Clean Elections Act and/or the Commission. Over several sessions, members of the legislature have proposed measures that seek to defund, limit, or eliminate the authority of the Act or the Commission itself. The Commission has historically opposed these efforts on the grounds that they are typically poorly constructed, misleading, or otherwise ill-considered. The Commission works to maintain the letter and spirit of the law and supports efforts that further the purpose of the Act. Specifically, the Commission opposes the following:

- Amending, superseding the Clean Elections Act and/or diverting funds from the Clean Elections fund without furthering the purpose of the act or the required supermajority vote.
- Attempts to limit the power the Commission has to enforce the Act

Support election law reforms. Elections issues continue to percolate through both the political and legal process. The Commission continues to support reforms including improving the public financing program; improving the campaign finance code to ensure that voters are receiving information about the identity and contributions of campaign contributors and expenditures, including independent expenditures; ensuring that changes improve the State’s anti-corruption, anti-circumvention and informational interests, the Clean Elections Act and the Commission’s independence; and improving voter access to information, voter involvement and voting.

Support improvements to voter education and access. The Commission continues to support efforts to enhance voter education and participation through legislation that advances the anti-corruption and public participation values that undergird the Act.
Voter Education Plan
The Commission will continue its voter education efforts in 2021 by offering voters a comprehensive education plan that focuses on how to participate in the electoral process, voting informed and the importance of voting in local elections. The following are just a few of the efforts the Commission will undertake in 2021:

- Education on local elections & how to participate
- Youth voter outreach & civics programs
- Website & application improvements
- Education on redistricting and how it impacts voting
- Educational video series for voters regarding voting by mail, how to ensure your vote was counted, etc.
- Surveys & focus groups with voters to better understand their voter education needs.

2022 Education Plan Preview
2022 midterms will have all of the statewide offices on the ballot. The Commission will develop and communicate detailed information pertaining to all of these elections to better assist the electorate!

2022 Election Cycle ~ Candidate Information
Candidates may begin collecting $5 qualifying contributions on August 1, 2021, the start of the qualifying period. Candidates must collect a minimum number of qualifying contributions, as referenced below;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Office</th>
<th>Qualifying Contributions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Governor</td>
<td>4,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary of State</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attorney General</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treasurer</td>
<td>1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supt. Of Public Inst.</td>
<td>1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporation Commission</td>
<td>1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mine Inspector</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legislature</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Citizens Clean Elections Commission was established by the enactment of the Citizens Clean Elections Act, A.R.S., Title 16, Chapter 6, Article 2. In addition to administering the provisions of Article 2, the Commission promulgates rules and enforces A.R.S. §§ 16-940 through 16-961.

The Commission’s mission is to fairly, faithfully and fully implement and administer the Citizens Clean Elections Act.

The Citizens Clean Elections Commission consists of five members. All members must be registered to vote in the State of Arizona. No more than two members of the commission may be members of the same political party. No more than two members of the commission may be residents of the same county.

*Commissioners listed are for the 2020 calendar year.
Galen D. Paton – Republican – Pima County
Governor Doug Ducey appointed Galen D. Paton, a Republican, to the Citizens Clean Elections Commission for a 5-year term expiring January 31, 2021. Commissioner Paton obtained his Master of Arts in Physical Education from the Southern Methodist University in Dallas, Texas. He has had a long and rewarding career coaching high school and college softball, volleyball and basketball teams in the southwest. In 2005, he led Sabino High School to the Arizona 4A State Championship and a No. 4 ranking in the country. The Arizona Coaches Association along with the National Fastpitch Coaches Association crowned Mr. Paton 2005 coach of the year. Mr. Paton retired from coaching in 2010 and is a current member of the Realty Executives Tucson Elite group. He resides in Tucson with his wife.

Mark Kimble – Independent – Pima County
Senate Democratic Leader Katie Hobbs appointed Mark Kimble, an Independent, to the Citizens Clean Elections Commission in July 2015. Mark was a longtime journalist in Southern Arizona. After graduating from the University of Arizona with a bachelor’s degree in journalism, Mark worked for the Associated Press and then for the Tucson Citizen newspaper. During a 35-year career at the Citizen, he was a reporter, city editor, assistant managing editor and associate editor-columnist in charge of the editorial page. When the Citizen closed in 2009, Mark went to work as senior press advisor and later as communications director for Congresswoman Gabrielle Giffords. When she resigned in 2012, Mark became communications director for her successor, Congressman Ron Barber. Mark and his wife, Jennifer Boice, live in Tucson.

Damien R. Meyer – Democrat – Maricopa County
Former Governor Jan Brewer appointed Damien R. Meyer to the Citizens Clean Elections Commission to serve a term ending January 31, 2019. Damien R. Meyer is an experienced commercial litigation attorney. Damien has extensive experience in representing both individuals and businesses including banks, contractors, landlords, real estate developers, aviation companies, entrepreneurs, and health care companies in all areas of their business including contractual analysis and disputes, collection and payment disputes, commercial tort liability, provisional remedies and negotiation of pre-litigation disputes to avoid formal litigation. He also has extensive experience in representing clients in formal litigation in Arizona State and Federal courts, the Arizona Court of Appeals, in private arbitrations and before several state administrative agencies. Mr. Meyer, his wife and two children currently reside in Phoenix.
Commissioner Biographies

Steve M. Titla – Democrat - Gila County
Former Senate Democratic Leader Leah Landrum Taylor appointed Steve M. Titla in July 2013 to the Citizens Clean Elections Commission. Mr. Titla is a partner in the Titla & Parsi law firm and is admitted to practice law both in Arizona and on the San Carlos Apache Reservation. The firm represents the San Carlos Apache Tribe as special counsel and has also served as legal counsel for the election boards of the San Carlos Apache and San Juan Southern Paiute Tribes. Previously, Mr. Titla was an attorney with the Navajo Nation Department of Justice and has served as president of the National Native American Bar Association. In addition to a B.S. and J.D. from Arizona State University, Mr. Titla earned an M.B.A. from the University of Phoenix. From 1974-76 Mr. Titla served in the U.S. Marine Corps, leaving with an honorable discharge. He also served in the Arizona National Guard until his honorable discharge in 1980. Mr. Titla’s term on the Citizens Clean Elections Commission expires in January of 2018.

Amy B. Chan – Republican – Maricopa County
Senate Democratic Leader Katie Hobbs appointed Amy B. Chan, a Republican, to the Citizens Clean Elections Commission for a 5-year term expiring January 31, 2022. Amy B. Chan was admitted to the State Bar in 1999. Initially she worked as an immigration attorney, helping people obtain immigration benefits through the administrative and immigration court process. In 2001 she began work as a legislative research analyst for the House Judiciary Committee. She was an Administrative Law Judge for the Corporation Commission from 2005-2006 and then returned to the legislature as Policy Advisor and Counsel to the Majority for the State Senate. In 2009 Secretary of State Ken Bennett appointed her State Election Director. She served in that capacity until 2013, when she left to spend more time with her growing family. She and her husband Keith have two sons and live in Phoenix.