

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PUBLIC MEETING

Phoenix, Arizona
November 16, 2023
9:30 a.m.

By: Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR
Certified Reporter
Certificate No. 50666



Page 2

1 PUBLIC MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN
2 ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at 9:30 a.m. on
3 November 16, 2023, at the State of Arizona, Clean
4 Elections Commission, 1110 West Washington, Conference
5 Room, Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the
6 following Board Members:
7
8 Mr. Mark Kimble, Chairman
9 Mr. Galen Paton
10 Ms. Amy Chan
11
12 OTHERS PRESENT:
13
14 Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director
15 Paula Thomas, Executive Officer
16 Mike Becker, Policy Director
17 Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director
18 Kara Karlson, Assistant Attorney General
19 Mary O'Grady, Osborn Maledon
20 Jessica Painter, Meeting Planner
21 Rivko Knox, Member of the Public
22 Jim Barton, Barton Mendez Soto
23
24
25

Page 3

1 P R O C E E D I N G
2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Item I today is the call to
3 order. It is 9:30 a.m. on November 16th, 2023, and I'm
4 going to call this meeting of the Citizens Clean
5 Elections Commission to order.
6 With that, we will take attendance.
7 Commissioners, please identify yourselves for the
8 record.
9 COMMISSIONER PATON: Galen Paton.
10 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Amy Chan.
11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And I'm Commissioner
12 Kimble.
13 We have a quorum, so we will begin.
14 Item II, discussion and possible action on
15 meeting minutes for October 26, 2023. Commissioners,
16 you have the minutes from our October meeting in the
17 packet. Is there any discussion on the minutes?
18 (No response.)
19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: If not, then do I have a
20 motion to approve the minutes? Commissioner Chan.
21 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I move that we approve
22 the minutes as written.
23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
24 Commissioner Chan.
25 Is there a second?

Page 4

1 COMMISSIONER PATON: Second.
2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
3 Commissioner Paton.
4 I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan.
5 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
7 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
8 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
9 The minutes are approved 3-to-nothing.
10 Item III is the discussion and possible
11 action on the Executive Director's Report. Tom.
12 MR. COLLINS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman,
13 Commissioners. We did have a -- an election, a
14 jurisdictional election on November 7th, and so that --
15 you can see those results on our website.
16 Just yesterday morning Gina, along with
17 Senator Bennett, the Pima County Recorder, and a local
18 attorney had a -- a panel discussion online through the
19 Arizona Capitol Times about how to get -- how to get --
20 everything you needed to know about the election in
21 2024, which was very -- a very good session. And I
22 think we have a video of that or there will be
23 eventually, usually, if you want to watch that. But it
24 was a really, really content-rich panel. And from
25 talking to Gina, they had more questions than they

Page 5

1 could even get to, and so that was really a success and
2 leaving people wanting more.
3 I also wanted to highlight the workshop that
4 Avery did at the Tempe Public Library for National
5 Civics Day. This was in conjunction with the Maricopa
6 County Recorder's Office. And Avery has developed a
7 presentation on civil discourse, and I had -- I live in
8 Tempe, and so I had some folks who I know were there,
9 and they gave it high marks. And so that was -- that
10 was good to hear.
11 We are continuing to host workshops for
12 participating candidates every week, and we've had 27
13 candidates attend so far.
14 I think we -- we talked about this last
15 meeting, but the Governor's Bipartisan Election Task
16 Force announced its report on November 2nd. It has a
17 number of different programmatic recommendations. The
18 one that obviously we talked about last time, which --
19 based on the reports from the last meeting that they
20 had that made it in was our -- was how we can utilize
21 our website to develop more of a one-stop -- or, we, I
22 think, developed the framework for this, but to enhance
23 the one-stop shop aspect of the Clean Elections
24 website. There are some other programmatic aspects in
25 the -- in the report and then a couple of executive

Page 6

1 orders that the Governor issued.
2 We will have a hearing on December 13th on --
3 just going to move on to the legal materials. There's
4 a hearing on December 13th on the legislative
5 leadership's lawsuit and motion for a preliminary
6 injunction on Proposition 211. So this is a case that
7 principally has to do with the legislative leadership,
8 so the Speaker of the House and the President of the
9 Senate's claims that the -- that Prop 211, the
10 statutory framework violates the separation of powers
11 principles and a related concept called the
12 Nondelegation Doctrine, which has something to do with
13 how the Legislature, or in this case the voters who act
14 as the Legislature, can delegate certain powers to
15 executive agencies. You know, Mary and her team have
16 been working on this, along with the AG's Office.
17 Those are kind of the main things I wanted
18 to -- to mention on the report. Those are really the
19 highlights, from my perspective, unless any
20 Commissioners have any questions.
21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Tom.
22 Are there any questions from Commissioners on
23 Tom's report?
24 (No response.)
25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you, Tom.

Page 7

1 Item IV, discussion and possible action on
2 Advisory Opinion Request 2023-01 from Service Employees
3 International Union-United Healthcare Workers West.
4 This Agenda item represents our first advisory request
5 under Proposition 211. The issue presented by the
6 requestor is, does a donation, monetary -- excuse me --
7 monetary or in-kind, made to a ballot committee in
8 support of its collection of signatures for ballot
9 measure qualification, qualification efforts, support a
10 covered person's campaign media spending as defined by
11 the Act.
12 The staff has prepared a recommended response
13 that is in your packet. I'm going to ask Tom to
14 summarize this document. And then, Commissioners, if
15 you have any questions, I will ask -- I will turn to
16 you.
17 Tom.
18 MR. COLLINS: Yes. Thank you, Mr. Chairman,
19 Commissioners. So as Commissioner Kimble mentioned,
20 the Commission passed a rule -- adopted a rule called
21 R2-20-808 -- excuse me -- that provides for an advisory
22 opinion process. The advisory opinion process is
23 designed to allow folks who have a basis for doing so
24 to ask the Commission a question about whether or not a
25 particular course of action will be -- you know, how it

Page 8

1 will -- how that course of action would be treated
2 under Prop 211.
3 So the -- so the purpose of that is to
4 provide a framework in which folks who have an interest
5 in -- can, you know, get a -- an answer to a question
6 without having to have it only answered through some
7 kind of enforcement process. And, as part of that, it
8 provides some protection to the person who asks if they
9 abide by the terms of the advisory opinion.
10 So in that sense, it's a transparent way to
11 deal with legal and, to some extent, policy questions,
12 and it does so in a way that, rather than expanding in
13 a particular way the Commission's role, rather it
14 really is a -- is a limiting effort and ensures that
15 the Commission's discretion is channeled into a
16 transparent formal process that will -- that folks can
17 rely upon.
18 And so with that, we received a request in
19 late September regarding a discrete question of whether
20 or not a ballot measure's petition circulation would
21 qualify -- if you made payments towards that, would
22 that qualify as campaign media spending, or, if, as
23 here, a donor opted out, right, which is to say said to
24 their -- the covered person or end spender, I don't
25 want my dollars used for campaign media spending, you

Page 9

1 know, but can that -- can those dollars still be used
2 for ballot measure petition circulation.
3 I know you all -- all three Commissioners who
4 are here, I know you're all very familiar with the
5 petition process, but just so -- you know, sort of for
6 the record formally, you know, under the Arizona
7 Constitution voters themselves can initiate
8 legislation, either statutory or constitutional, and
9 there is a formal process that involves, you know,
10 printing petitions of the proposed legislation,
11 circulating those -- that text along with the
12 petitions, and voters who are eligible to vote in that
13 particular -- whatever jurisdiction, in this case
14 statewide, can -- are eligible to vote can sign saying,
15 yes, I would like to have the opportunity to vote on
16 this on the ballot.
17 This is a heavily regulated area of political
18 activity, the petition process is, the initiative
19 process is. I mean, it's sort of -- you know, from my
20 point of view, on its face it's First Amendment
21 activity very clearly, it's literally petitioning the
22 government, and yet it's one of the most heavily
23 regulated areas in Arizona political law.
24 So to -- so the question, you know, as I laid
25 out, was, you know, if you're going to pay for

Page 10

1 signatures, is that campaign media spending. And the
2 analysis that we've recommended follows -- traces out
3 the statutory terms, and -- and two highlights of that.
4 First, the definitions of campaign media
5 spending in Prop 211 relate to public communications,
6 and public communications is defined, you know, to
7 include billboards, television, Internet, you know,
8 other things like that. And here the advisory opinion
9 request states that the requestor would not be doing
10 any of those things or supporting any of those things.
11 And it also says that -- but if you were doing public
12 communications related to a ballot measure, that would
13 fall under the category of campaign media spending.
14 So the upshot is, if I said to a -- as a
15 donor if I said I want to opt out from having my
16 dollars used for campaign media spending, are these
17 petitions themselves campaign media spending,
18 essentially.
19 And the staff's conclusion or recommendation
20 for the Commission is that they are not campaign media
21 spending because that discrete and heavily regulated on
22 its own process of petitioning the government through
23 those forms -- that petition formal process, you know,
24 is not a public communication as defined in the Act.
25 And thus, you know, we think that the answer to that

Page 11

1 question is that that is not going to -- that that
2 course of action would be correct under the Act, that a
3 person who said I'm opting out and -- but nevertheless,
4 this money -- I want this -- I think this money can be
5 used for petition circulation efforts, we think the
6 answer to that question is yes.
7 We received three public comments on this
8 point. All of those public comments reached the same
9 conclusion. Some of their analysis was a little more
10 perhaps elaborate than -- than what staff believed
11 necessary to answer this question. We think that the
12 statute is pretty clear on it. I mean, we think the
13 statute is clear as a bell on this.
14 And additionally, some of the request -- some
15 of the comments asked us to sort of explore some other
16 issues, such as, well, what does that mean for
17 opposition to a ballot initiative. And I think that --
18 I think that -- I think that -- you know, we did not
19 get into detail on other issues that might have been
20 raised in the comments, but rather think that we
21 answered the discrete question in front of you and
22 provided an answer that we think is reliable and we
23 hope folks will rely on it and we hope you decide to
24 approve it.
25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Tom. You

Page 12

1 mentioned some -- some other organizations that weighed
2 in on the advisory opinion, and I wanted to ask you
3 about one of those from Statecraft that supported the
4 advisory opinion, but seemed to then go into new areas
5 assuming that these would also be free of the
6 requirement to report. And in their -- in their e-mail
7 they said canvassing and field activities are
8 intrinsically a direct face-to-face mode of outreach,
9 they're not public communications, and similar
10 face-to-face activities in opposition to an initiative
11 or referendum effort should also not be covered.
12 And I'm wondering your thoughts on that. And
13 it seems like that's a stretch from what the advisory
14 opinion said, and I'm not sure that I'm comfortable
15 letting that stand without some comment.
16 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioners, I
17 think that's a fair question. The way we chose to
18 address that for present purposes was to take the --
19 you know, take the advisory opinion's context on its --
20 on its face and not really attempt to expand it beyond
21 the discrete question asked.
22 So the reason -- and the reason why, and this
23 goes to your point, why I would not want to expand
24 beyond the -- I mean, first of all, obviously, if there
25 was a specific question that we could be asked on this,

Page 13

1 we would consider it under the proper term -- proper
2 process. But under this process that we've outlined, I
3 think it's important to understand that we would need
4 to have a little bit more specificity about precisely
5 what field canvassing means, what that kind of
6 face-to-face interaction would be in order for us to
7 provide the kind of analysis that we think is here.
8 In this case, the advisory opinion request
9 itself, you know, outlines with some -- with a level of
10 specificity what is to be undertaken and what is to be
11 excluded, and I think -- and I think the process that
12 we have put in place, which is -- parallels the Federal
13 Election Commission's process in most respects, I think
14 that we're better off, in this place, sort of answering
15 the discrete question. We -- there may be -- I think
16 with more detail we could provide a more specific
17 answer to that question now, but I think for present
18 purposes -- I think for present purposes I think we
19 decided or I concluded that it would be better -- we'd
20 be better off answering the question in front of us.
21 Obviously, I think that -- I think it's
22 helpful, I would say, to get a comment like that for
23 the purpose of flagging additional issues, as you
24 noted, that we will have to deal with at some point
25 down the road, but at this point we're not really in a

Page 14

1 place to do that.
2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. It just seemed to me
3 that the request for an advisory opinion was for a
4 request on a narrow issue, and then Statecraft took
5 that and expanded it greatly and almost said -- and I'm
6 probably taking this too far, but they almost said,
7 because of what you said in your advisory opinion, we
8 are assuming this, thank you very much. And it seems
9 like we need to say something that -- that you're
10 bringing up things that were not addressed in the
11 advisory opinion and you shouldn't assume that just
12 because you wrote a letter saying they assume that.
13 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, I think that's a
14 fair question. What I would -- what I don't think we
15 need to do, and I wouldn't recommend, is adding
16 language to the opinion to say that, because what I
17 would like to not have the opinions become is having to
18 have a rebuttal of every single public comment that we
19 have.
20 But that said, I think that your statement is
21 correct and it's correct as a matter of the policy I
22 stated. In other words, the policy expressly says, if
23 you want to have something on which you can rely, this
24 is the process to follow, and so I think this
25 conversation itself makes that clear on the record to

Page 15

1 anybody who -- who looks at it. You know, not to say
2 that folks aren't going to make assumptions. Folks can
3 make assumptions, but -- and they have to, right,
4 that's the nature of making decisions.
5 But, yes, I take your point and I -- and I
6 agree that under the rules and the process we've
7 outlined we're not in a position to say to someone, you
8 having asserted a point in a Commission proceeding,
9 that we are -- we -- you now have some reliance
10 interest. No, there is no reliance interest created by
11 such -- such -- by mere assertion.
12 MS. KARLSON: Mr. Chairman.
13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.
14 Ms. Karlson.
15 MS. KARLSON: I would also just really like
16 to emphasize that point by Mr. Collins, specifically
17 that the rule for -- that provides for an advisory
18 opinion, R2-20-808, it's really limited to this -- it
19 requires the requestor to provide specific facts and
20 to -- it needs to be limited to that context. I think
21 that, just from a procedural legal standpoint, to be
22 clear, advisory opinions should not start going outside
23 the bounds of what is being -- what was properly
24 brought before -- under the rules.
25 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. I guess my --

Page 16

1 my only concern, and I'm not a lawyer, is that by not
2 saying anything about this, are they going to take it
3 as --
4 COMMISSIONER PATON: Golden.
5 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- as an understanding
6 that -- that we agree?
7 MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, the thing I --
8 what I can -- what I can do, if this would satisfy you,
9 I'm happy to, you know, draft a message -- a
10 communication to them that outlines that, you know,
11 and -- you know, I mean, I think that's perfectly
12 reasonable. I think that what you've said captures the
13 legal advice that Ms. Karlson has just given you, as
14 well as my own recommendation on that point. And so I
15 think that there would be no problem for us simply
16 writing them a letter that says, hey, you know, FYI, we
17 considered your comment at some length in open session,
18 and our position is -- you know, if you have a specific
19 question that you would like to provide, please do so,
20 but otherwise we're just not in a position to create --
21 and we want to dispel you of any idea that you have a
22 reliance interest here.
23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.
24 Are there comments from either of the other
25 two Commissioners with us today?

Page 17

1 COMMISSIONER PATON: No.
2 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: None.
3 Also, today Mr. Barton is with us, who
4 requested this advisory opinion. Mr. Barton, are there
5 comments you'd like to make?
6 MR. BARTON: Mr. Chair, I don't have any
7 specific comments, but I am here to answer questions if
8 it's -- if it's helpful.
9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you.
10 Do the Commissioners have any questions of
11 Mr. Barton?
12 (No response.)
13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Hearing none, is
14 there a motion to approve the response to the advisory
15 opinion request?
16 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I would move that we
17 adopt or approve the --
18 Actually, Tom, how should I -- how should I
19 phrase this motion? I'm sorry.
20 MR. COLLINS: I'm sorry, Mr. Chairman.
21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom.
22 MR. COLLINS: Approve. Approve is fine.
23 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Approve?
24 MR. COLLINS: Yes. It doesn't matter.
25 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Okay. And it's -- it's

Page 18

1 the request or our response to the request that we're
2 approving?

3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: It's the response to the
4 advisory opinion request.

5 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Okay. That's what I
6 thought. Thank you. I'm sorry. It feels like a
7 Monday to me right now.

8 All right. Mr. Chairman, I move that we
9 approve the response to the Advisory Opinion Request
10 2023-01.

11 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
12 Commissioner Chan.

13 Is there a second?

14 COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second.

15 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,
16 Commissioner Paton.

17 It's been moved and seconded that we approve
18 the response to the advisory opinion request. I will
19 call the roll. Commissioner Chan.

20 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.

21 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.

22 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.

23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
24 The response is approved 3-to-nothing.
25 Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Barton, for

Page 19

1 coming.

2 MR. BARTON: Thank you, sir.

3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Item V, public comment.
4 This is the time for consideration of comments and
5 suggestions from the public. Action taken as a result
6 of public comment will be limited to directing staff to
7 study the matter or rescheduling the matter for further
8 consideration and decision at a later date or
9 responding to criticism. Please limit your comment to
10 no more than two minutes.

11 Does any member of the public wish to make
12 comments at this time? Does anyone on Zoom wish to
13 make comment?

14 Ms. Knox.

15 MS. KNOX: Thank you very much. Chairman,
16 Commissioners, Mr. Collins, staff, my name is Rivko
17 Knox. I've lived in Arizona for years and years and
18 years. I started out observing the Commission because,
19 I think as many of you know, and I have certainly said
20 this in the past, the League of Women Voters, of which
21 I am a longtime, 50-plus-year member, was very
22 instrumental in helping to draft the initial language
23 and getting the initiative passed and for quite a
24 while, I think, kept a -- kept a close eye, was very
25 supportive of the Commission, various changes that were

Page 20

1 proposed, and some we opposed, some we didn't. As I
2 think you know also, the League is a totally
3 nonpartisan organization.

4 I started observing because I was appointed
5 as an observer by the president of the League of Women
6 Voters of Arizona. I continued coming because I
7 learned so, so, so much about elections, as well as the
8 role of the Commission. And I sat through some
9 extremely interesting meetings and very challenging --
10 challenging meetings, some that made quite a few
11 headlines, and, like I say, learned a great deal and
12 have always been extremely impressed with the
13 professionalism of all the Commissioners, as well as
14 with, Mr. Collins, you and your staff. Nothing but
15 pure professionalism. Always eager to hear comments,
16 responding as appropriate.

17 The reason I chose to speak this afternoon --
18 or, this morning, I guess, is that I noticed that the
19 Governor's Office of Commissions and Boards -- or, I'm
20 not getting the term right -- has actually put out a
21 notice seeking additional people to apply.

22 And I just wanted to say that a number of
23 years ago I actually thought it might be my crowning
24 kind of achievement to apply and be on the Commission,
25 and then I read all the requirements and realized,

Page 21

1 because of my partisan involvement, in addition to
2 being in the League, I was not eligible to apply. But
3 I do know a few people who have, and I thought this was
4 a good time for me to like thank all of you
5 Commissioners.

6 Some of you have been on for, it seems like
7 thousands of years. I know that's not true, because
8 none of us are that old, but it does seem that some of
9 you have been around for a long, long, long time.
10 You've never lost your commitment, your interest. Your
11 attendance is outstanding, your reading of the
12 materials, your commitment to the purpose of Clean
13 Elections. And even though your terms have expired,
14 I -- I just want to applaud you.

15 I hope that new people will apply. I hope
16 that new people will be appointed, because that's the
17 way the process was intended. Nobody was intended to
18 serve forever, even though some of you may feel like
19 that. But I wanted to thank you and thank you,
20 Mr. Collins -- thank all the Commissioners, thank you,
21 Mr. Collins, and all your staff. I've watched some
22 come and some go. They were all, again, very
23 dedicated.

24 I hope that new Commissioners will be
25 appointed. I hope they will be as dedicated and

Page 22

1 professional and nonpartisan and as committed to the
2 mission of Clean Elections as all of you have been. I
3 just wish you the best of luck.
4 I do plan to continue to observe. By the
5 way, I do -- I'm not an official observer on behalf of
6 the League, but I do write little reports that I send
7 out to, I don't know, 15, 20 people I know, almost all
8 from the League, who are interested in knowing what's
9 going on because you do some outstanding work. And
10 some of it gets in the newspapers -- or, the news, I
11 should say, the media, and some doesn't, so I keep
12 people kind of informed.
13 So thank you. It's been a tremendous
14 learning experience. And I'm not saying good-bye. I
15 just thought, with the new -- the request for people to
16 be appointed to the Commission, that it was an
17 appropriate time for me to make some comments. So,
18 again, thank you, and I will be back. Bye-bye.
19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Ms. Knox, for
20 your comments and your kind words. Your opinions
21 certainly mean a lot because of your longtime interest
22 in the Commission going back to when this whole process
23 was started. And I think I can speak on behalf of my
24 colleagues when I say, it does seem like thousands of
25 years, but maybe not quite.


Page 23

1 And the -- if the process has started to find
2 new members of the Commission, I'm -- I personally am
3 glad of that, because this was not intended to be a
4 permanent job, even though I think I'm in the ninth
5 year of my five-year term or something like that.
6 But thank you very much, Ms. Knox, for your
7 continued interest in our activities and you give us a
8 good perspective looking forward and also looking back.
9 Thank you.
10 Anyone else wish to make a comment?
11 (No response.)
12 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: The public may also send
13 comments to the Commission by mail or e-mail at
14 ccec@azccleanelections.gov.
15 At this time, I would entertain a motion to
16 adjourn. Is there a motion to adjourn?
17 COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll make a motion to
18 adjourn.
19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is there a second to
20 Commissioner Paton's motion to adjourn?
21 COMMISSIONER CHAN: I second the motion.
22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by
23 Commissioner Chan.
24 I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan.
25 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.

Page 24

1 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
2 COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
3 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.
4 We are adjourned until next month. Thank you
5 very much.
6 (The meeting adjourned at 10:00 a.m.)
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Page 25

1 STATE OF ARIZONA)
) ss.
2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA)
3
4 BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings
5 were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified
6 Reporter of the State of Arizona; that the proceedings
7 were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter
8 transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that
9 the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate
10 transcript of all proceedings had and adduced upon the
11 taking of said proceedings, all to the best of my skill
12 and ability.
13
14 I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related
15 to nor employed by any of the parties hereto nor am I
16 in any way interested in the outcome hereof.
17
18 DATED at Tempe, Arizona, this 17th day of
19 November, 2023.
20
21
22 
23 Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR
24 Certified Reporter #50666
25

<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p> <p>10:00 24:6</p> <p>13th 6:2,4</p> <p>15 22:7</p> <p>16th 3:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <p>20 22:7</p> <p>2023 3:3,15</p> <p>2023-01 7:2 18:10</p> <p>2024 4:21</p> <p>211 6:6,9 7:5 8:2 10:5</p> <p>26 3:15</p> <p>27 5:12</p> <p>2nd 5:16</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <p>3-to-nothing 4:9 18:24</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">5</p> <p>50-plus-year 19:21</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <p>7th 4:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <p>9:30 3:3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">A</p> <p>a.m. 3:3 24:6</p> <p>abide 8:9</p> <p>achievement 20:24</p> <p>act 6:13 7:11 10:24 11:2</p> <p>action 3:14 4:11 7:1,25 8:1 11:2 19:5</p> <p>activities 12:7,10 23:7</p>	<p>activity 9:18,21</p> <p>adding 14:15</p> <p>addition 21:1</p> <p>additional 13:23 20:21</p> <p>additionally 11:14</p> <p>address 12:18</p> <p>addressed 14:10</p> <p>adjourn 23:16,18,20</p> <p>adjourned 24:4,6</p> <p>adopt 17:17</p> <p>adopted 7:20</p> <p>advice 16:13</p> <p>advisory 7:2,4,21,22 8:9 10:8 12:2,4,13,19 13:8 14:3,7,11 15:17,22 17:4,14 18:4,9,18</p> <p>afternoon 20:17</p> <p>AG's 6:16</p> <p>agencies 6:15</p> <p>Agenda 7:4</p> <p>agree 15:6 16:6</p> <p>Amendment 9:20</p> <p>Amy 3:10</p> <p>analysis 10:2 11:9 13:7</p> <p>announced 5:16</p> <p>answering 13:14,20</p> <p>applaud 21:14</p> <p>apply 20:21,24 21:2,15</p> <p>appointed 20:4 21:16, 25 22:16</p> <p>approve 3:20,21 11:24 17:14,17,22,23 18:9,17</p> <p>approved 4:9 18:24</p> <p>approving 18:2</p> <p>area 9:17</p> <p>areas 9:23 12:4</p> <p>Arizona 4:19 9:6,23 19:17 20:6</p>	<p>asks 8:8</p> <p>aspect 5:23</p> <p>aspects 5:24</p> <p>asserted 15:8</p> <p>assertion 15:11</p> <p>assume 14:11,12</p> <p>assuming 12:5 14:8</p> <p>assumptions 15:2,3</p> <p>attempt 12:20</p> <p>attend 5:13</p> <p>attendance 3:6 21:11</p> <p>attorney 4:18</p> <p>Avery 5:4,6</p> <p>aye 4:5,7,8 18:20,22,23 23:25 24:2,3</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">B</p> <p>back 22:18,22 23:8</p> <p>ballot 7:7,8 8:20 9:2,16 10:12 11:17</p> <p>Barton 17:3,4,6,11 18:25 19:2</p> <p>based 5:19</p> <p>basis 7:23</p> <p>begin 3:13</p> <p>behalf 22:5,23</p> <p>believed 11:10</p> <p>bell 11:13</p> <p>Bennett 4:17</p> <p>billboards 10:7</p> <p>Bipartisan 5:15</p> <p>bit 13:4</p> <p>Boards 20:19</p> <p>bounds 15:23</p> <p>bringing 14:10</p> <p>brought 15:24</p> <p>Bye-bye 22:18</p>	<hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">C</p> <p>call 3:2,4 4:4 18:19 23:24</p> <p>called 6:11 7:20</p> <p>campaign 7:10 8:22,25 10:1,4,13,16,17,20</p> <p>candidates 5:12,13</p> <p>canvassing 12:7 13:5</p> <p>Capitol 4:19</p> <p>captures 16:12</p> <p>case 6:6,13 9:13 13:8</p> <p>category 10:13</p> <p>ccec@ azcleelections. gov. 23:14</p> <p>Chair 4:8 17:6 18:23 24:3</p> <p>Chairman 3:2,11,19,23 4:2,6,8,12 6:21,25 7:18 11:25 12:16 14:2,13 15:12,13,25 16:5,7,23 17:2,9,13,20,21 18:3,8, 11,15,21,23 19:3,15 22:19 23:12,19,22 24:1, 3</p> <p>challenging 20:9,10</p> <p>Chan 3:10,20,21,24 4:4,5 17:16,23,25 18:5, 12,19,20 23:21,23,24, 25</p> <p>channeled 8:15</p> <p>chose 12:17 20:17</p> <p>circulating 9:11</p> <p>circulation 8:20 9:2 11:5</p> <p>Citizens 3:4</p> <p>Civics 5:5</p> <p>civil 5:7</p> <p>claims 6:9</p> <p>Clean 3:4 5:23 21:12 22:2</p>
---	--	--	---

clear 11:12,13 14:25
15:22
close 19:24
colleagues 22:24
collection 7:8
Collins 4:12 7:18 12:16
14:13 15:16 16:7 17:20,
22,24 19:16 20:14
21:20,21
comfortable 12:14
comment 12:15 13:22
14:18 16:17 19:3,6,9,13
23:10
comments 11:7,8,15,
20 16:24 17:5,7 19:4,12
20:15 22:17,20 23:13
Commission 3:5 7:20,
24 10:20 15:8 19:18,25
20:8,24 22:16,22 23:2,
13
Commission's 8:13,
15 13:13
Commissioner 3:9,10,
11,20,21,24 4:1,3,4,5,6,
7 7:19 16:4 17:1,16,23,
25 18:5,12,14,16,19,20,
21,22 23:17,20,21,23,
24,25 24:1,2
Commissioners 3:7,
15 4:13 6:20,22 7:14,19
9:3 12:16 16:25 17:10
19:16 20:13 21:5,20,24
Commissions 20:19
commitment 21:10,12
committed 22:1
committee 7:7
communication 10:24
16:10
communications
10:5,6,12 12:9
concept 6:11
concern 16:1
concluded 13:19
conclusion 10:19 11:9
conjunction 5:5
consideration 19:4,8
considered 16:17
Constitution 9:7
constitutional 9:8
content-rich 4:24
context 12:19 15:20
continue 22:4
continued 20:6 23:7
continuing 5:11
conversation 14:25
correct 11:2 14:21
County 4:17 5:6
couple 5:25
covered 7:10 8:24
12:11
create 16:20
created 15:10
criticism 19:9
crowning 20:23

D

date 19:8
Day 5:5
deal 8:11 13:24 20:11
December 6:2,4
decide 11:23
decided 13:19
decision 19:8
decisions 15:4
dedicated 21:23,25
defined 7:10 10:6,24
definitions 10:4
delegate 6:14
designed 7:23

detail 11:19 13:16
develop 5:21
developed 5:6,22
direct 12:8
directing 19:6
Director's 4:11
discourse 5:7
discrete 8:19 10:21
11:21 12:21 13:15
discretion 8:15
discussion 3:14,17
4:10,18 7:1
dispel 16:21
Doctrine 6:12
document 7:14
dollars 8:25 9:1 10:16
donation 7:6
donor 8:23 10:15
draft 16:9 19:22

E

e-mail 12:6 23:13
eager 20:15
effort 8:14 12:11
efforts 7:9 11:5
elaborate 11:10
election 4:13,14,20
5:15 13:13
elections 3:5 5:23 20:7
21:13 22:2
eligible 9:12,14 21:2
emphasize 15:16
Employees 7:2
end 8:24
enforcement 8:7
enhance 5:22
ensures 8:14

entertain 23:15
essentially 10:18
eventually 4:23
excluded 13:11
excuse 7:6,21
executive 4:11 5:25
6:15
expand 12:20,23
expanded 14:5
expanding 8:12
experience 22:14
expired 21:13
explore 11:15
expressly 14:22
extent 8:11
extremely 20:9,12
eye 19:24

F

face 9:20 12:20
face-to-face 12:8,10
13:6
facts 15:19
fair 12:17 14:14
fall 10:13
familiar 9:4
Federal 13:12
feel 21:18
feels 18:6
field 12:7 13:5
find 23:1
fine 17:22
five-year 23:5
flagging 13:23
folks 5:8 7:23 8:4,16
11:23 15:2
follow 14:24

Force 5:16	helpful 13:22 17:8	issue 7:5 14:4	learning 22:14
forever 21:18	helping 19:22	issued 6:1	leaving 5:2
formal 8:16 9:9 10:23	hey 16:16	issues 11:16,19 13:23	legal 6:3 8:11 15:21 16:13
formally 9:6	high 5:9	item 3:2,14 4:10 7:1,4 19:3	legislation 9:8,10
forms 10:23	highlight 5:3	IV 7:1	legislative 6:4,7
forward 23:8	highlights 6:19 10:3	<hr/>	Legislature 6:13,14
framework 5:22 6:10 8:4	hope 11:23 21:15,24,25	J	length 16:17
free 12:5	host 5:11	job 23:4	letter 14:12 16:16
front 11:21 13:20	House 6:8	jurisdiction 9:13	letting 12:15
FYI 16:16	<hr/>	jurisdictional 4:14	level 13:9
<hr/>	I	<hr/>	Library 5:4
G	idea 16:21	K	limit 19:9
Galen 3:9	identify 3:7	Karlson 15:12,14,15 16:13	limited 15:18,20 19:6
gave 5:9	II 3:14	Kimble 3:2,11,12,19,23 4:2,6,8 6:21,25 7:19 11:25 14:2 15:13,25 16:5,23 17:2,9,13,21 18:3,11,15,21,23 19:3 22:19 23:12,19,22 24:1, 3	limiting 8:14
Gina 4:16,25	III 4:10	kind 6:17 8:7 13:5,7 20:24 22:12,20	literally 9:21
give 23:7	important 13:3	knowing 22:8	live 5:7
glad 23:3	impressed 20:12	Knox 19:14,15,17 22:19 23:6	lived 19:17
Golden 16:4	in-kind 7:7	<hr/>	local 4:17
good 4:21 5:10 21:4 23:8	include 10:7	L	long 21:9
good-bye 22:14	informed 22:12	laid 9:24	longtime 19:21 22:21
government 9:22 10:22	initial 19:22	language 14:16 19:22	lost 21:10
Governor 6:1	initiate 9:7	late 8:19	lot 22:21
Governor's 5:15 20:19	initiative 9:18 11:17 12:10 19:23	law 9:23	luck 22:3
great 20:11	injunction 6:6	<hr/>	<hr/>
greatly 14:5	instrumental 19:22	lawsuit 6:5	M
guess 15:25 20:18	intended 21:17 23:3	lawyer 16:1	made 5:20 7:7 8:21 20:10
<hr/>	interaction 13:6	leadership 6:7	mail 23:13
H	interest 8:4 15:10 16:22 21:10 22:21 23:7	leadership's 6:5	main 6:17
happy 16:9	interested 22:8	League 19:20 20:2,5 21:2 22:6,8	make 15:2,3 17:5 19:11,13 22:17 23:10, 17
headlines 20:11	interesting 20:9	learned 20:7,11	makes 14:25
Healthcare 7:3	International 7:3		making 15:4
hear 5:10 20:15	Internet 10:7		Maricopa 5:5
hearing 6:2,4 17:13	intrinsically 12:8		marks 5:9
heavily 9:17,22 10:21	involvement 21:1		
	involves 9:9		

Mary 6:15	needed 4:20	orders 6:1	place 13:12,14 14:1
materials 6:3 21:12	news 22:10	organization 20:3	plan 22:4
matter 14:21 17:24 19:7	newspapers 22:10	organizations 12:1	point 9:20 11:8 12:23 13:24,25 15:5,8,16 16:14
means 13:5	ninth 23:4	outlined 13:2 15:7	policy 8:11 14:21,22
measure 7:9 9:2 10:12	Nondelegation 6:12	outlines 13:9 16:10	political 9:17,23
measure's 8:20	nonpartisan 20:3 22:1	outreach 12:8	position 15:7 16:18,20
media 7:10 8:22,25 10:1,4,13,16,17,20 22:11	noted 13:24	outstanding 21:11 22:9	powers 6:10,14
meeting 3:4,15,16 5:15,19 24:6	notice 20:21		precisely 13:4
meetings 20:9,10	noticed 20:18		preliminary 6:5
member 19:11,21	November 3:3 4:14 5:16	P	prepared 7:12
members 23:2	number 5:17 20:22	packet 3:17 7:13	present 12:18 13:17,18
mention 6:18		panel 4:18,24	presentation 5:7
mentioned 7:19 12:1	O	parallels 13:12	presented 7:5
mere 15:11	observe 22:4	part 8:7	president 6:8 20:5
message 16:9	observer 20:5 22:5	participating 5:12	pretty 11:12
minutes 3:15,16,17,20, 22 4:9 19:10	observing 19:18 20:4	partisan 21:1	principally 6:7
mission 22:2	October 3:15,16	passed 7:20 19:23	principles 6:11
mode 12:8	Office 5:6 6:16 20:19	past 19:20	printing 9:10
Monday 18:7	official 22:5	Paton 3:9 4:1,3,6,7 16:4 17:1 18:14,16,21, 22 23:17 24:1,2	problem 16:15
monetary 7:6,7	one-stop 5:21,23	Paton's 23:20	procedural 15:21
money 11:4	online 4:18	pay 9:25	proceeding 15:8
month 24:4	open 16:17	payments 8:21	process 7:22 8:7,16 9:5,9,18,19 10:22,23 13:2,11,13 14:24 15:6 21:17 22:22 23:1
morning 4:16 20:18	opinion 7:2,22 8:9 10:8 12:2,4,14 13:8 14:3,7, 11,16 15:18 17:4,15 18:4,9,18	people 5:2 20:21 21:3, 15,16 22:7,12,15	professional 22:1
motion 3:20 6:5 17:14, 19 23:15,16,17,20,21	opinion's 12:19	perfectly 16:11	professionalism 20:13,15
move 3:21 6:3 17:16 18:8	opinions 14:17 15:22 22:20	permanent 23:4	programmatic 5:17,24
moved 18:17	opportunity 9:15	person 8:8,24 11:3	Prop 6:9 8:2 10:5
	opposed 20:1	person's 7:10	proper 13:1
	opposition 11:17 12:10	personally 23:2	properly 15:23
N	opt 10:15	perspective 6:19 23:8	proposed 9:10 20:1
narrow 14:4	opted 8:23	petition 8:20 9:2,5,18 10:23 11:5	Proposition 6:6 7:5
National 5:4	opting 11:3	petitioning 9:21 10:22	protection 8:8
nature 15:4	order 3:3,5 13:6	petitions 9:10,12 10:17	provide 8:4 13:7,16
		phrase 17:19	
		Pima 4:17	

15:19 16:19	record 3:8 9:6 14:25		start 15:22
provided 11:22	Recorder 4:17		started 19:18 20:4 22:23 23:1
public 5:4 10:5,6,11,24 11:7,8 12:9 14:18 19:3, 5,6,11 23:12	Recorder's 5:6		Statecraft 12:3 14:4
pure 20:15	referendum 12:11		stated 14:22
purpose 8:3 13:23 21:12	regulated 9:17,23 10:21		statement 14:20
purposes 12:18 13:18	relate 10:5		states 10:9
put 13:12 20:20	related 6:11 10:12		statewide 9:14
	reliable 11:22		statute 11:12,13
	reliance 15:9,10 16:22		statutory 6:10 9:8 10:3
	rely 8:17 11:23 14:23		stretch 12:13
	report 4:11 5:16,25 6:18,23 12:6	S	study 19:7
qualification 7:9	reports 5:19 22:6	sat 20:8	success 5:1
qualify 8:21,22	represents 7:4	satisfy 16:8	suggestions 19:5
question 7:24 8:5,19 9:24 11:1,6,11,21 12:17,21,25 13:15,17, 20 14:14 16:19	request 7:2,4 8:18 10:9 11:14 13:8 14:3,4 17:15 18:1,4,9,18 22:15	seconded 18:17 23:22	summarize 7:14
questions 4:25 6:20,22 7:15 8:11 17:7,10	requested 17:4	seeking 20:21	support 7:8,9
quorum 3:13	requestor 7:6 10:9 15:19	Senate's 6:9	supported 12:3
	requirement 12:6	Senator 4:17	supporting 10:10
	requirements 20:25	send 22:6 23:12	supportive 19:25
	requires 15:19	sense 8:10	
	rescheduling 19:7	separation 6:10	
	respects 13:13	September 8:19	T
	responding 19:9 20:16	serve 21:18	taking 14:6
	response 3:18 6:24 7:12 17:12,14 18:1,3,9, 18,24 23:11	Service 7:2	talked 5:14,18
	result 19:5	session 4:21 16:17	talking 4:25
	results 4:15	shop 5:23	Task 5:15
	Rivko 19:16	sign 9:14	team 6:15
	road 13:25	signatures 7:8 10:1	television 10:7
	role 8:13 20:8	similar 12:9	Tempe 5:4,8
	roll 4:4 18:19 23:24	simply 16:15	term 13:1 20:20 23:5
	rule 7:20 15:17	single 14:18	terms 8:9 10:3 21:13
	rules 15:6,24	sir 19:2	text 9:11
		sort 9:5,19 11:15 13:14	thing 16:7
		speak 20:17 22:23	things 6:17 10:8,10 14:10
		Speaker 6:8	thought 18:6 20:23 21:3 22:15
		specific 12:25 13:16 15:19 16:18 17:7	thoughts 12:12
		specifically 15:16	
		specificity 13:4,10	
		spender 8:24	
		spending 7:10 8:22,25 10:1,5,13,16,17,21	
		staff 7:12 11:10 19:6,16 20:14 21:21	
		staff's 10:19	
		stand 12:15	
		standpoint 15:21	

thousands 21:7 22:24
time 5:18 19:4,12 21:4,
9 22:17 23:15
Times 4:19
today 3:2 16:25 17:3
Tom 4:11 6:21,25 7:13,
17 11:25 17:18,21
Tom's 6:23
totally 20:2
traces 10:2
transparent 8:10,16
treated 8:1
tremendous 22:13
true 21:7
turn 7:15

U

understand 13:3
understanding 16:5
undertaken 13:10
Union-united 7:3
upshot 10:14
utilize 5:20

V

video 4:22
view 9:20
violates 6:10
vote 9:12,14,15
voters 6:13 9:7,12
19:20 20:6
votes 4:8 18:23 24:3

W

wanted 5:3 6:17 12:2
20:22 21:19
wanting 5:2
watch 4:23

watched 21:21
website 4:15 5:21,24
week 5:12
weighed 12:1
West 7:3
Women 19:20 20:5
wondering 12:12
words 14:22 22:20
work 22:9
Workers 7:3
working 6:16
workshop 5:3
workshops 5:11
write 22:6
writing 16:16
written 3:22
wrote 14:12

Y

year 23:5
years 19:17,18 20:23
21:7 22:25
yesterday 4:16

Z

Zoom 19:12