	Transcript of Frocedurings / Fublic Meeting	<u>'</u>
1		Page 1
2		
3		
4		
5	THE STATE OF ARIZONA	
6	CITIZENS CLEAN ELECTIONS COMMISSION	
7		
8		
9		
10	REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PUBLIC MEETING	
11		
12	Phoenix, Arizona	
13	December 14, 2023 9:30 a.m.	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24	By: Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR CERTIFIED Certified Reporter	
25	Certificate No. 50666 TRANSCRIP	ľ

```
Page 2
                                                                                                               Page 4
               PUBLIC MEETING BEFORE THE CITIZENS CLEAN
                                                             1 that we approve the minutes as written. Is there a
2 ELECTIONS COMMISSION convened at 9:30 a m on
                                                             2 second?
3 December 14, 2023, at the State of Arizona, Clean
                                                             3
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: I'll second it.
4 Elections Commission, 1110 West Washington, Conference
    Room, Phoenix, Arizona, in the presence of the
                                                             4 Galen Paton.
   following Board Members:
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Seconded by
                                                             6 Commissioner Paton.
             Mr. Mark Kimble, Chairman
                                                                          I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan.
8
             Mr. Galen Paton
                                                             7
             Ms. Amy Chan
                                                             8
                                                                          COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.
9
             Mr. Damien Mever
                                                             9
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
10
                                                            10
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.
11
   OTHERS PRESENT:
12
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.
                                                            11
13
             Thomas M. Collins, Executive Director
                                                            12 Commissioner Meyer, you're muted.
             Paula Thomas, Executive Officer
                                                            13
                                                                          COMMISSIONER MEYER: I said, I'll abstain.
14
             Mike Becker, Policy Director
             Gina Roberts, Voter Education Director
                                                            14 Because I wasn't there, I can't verify they're
15
             Avery Xola, Voter Education Manager
                                                            15 accurate. I have no reason to doubt them, I just
             Alec Shaffer, Web Content Manager
                                                            16 wasn't there.
16
             Kara Karlson, Assistant Attorney General
             Mary O'Grady, Osborn Maledon
                                                            17
                                                                          CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. And I vote aye, so
17
             Mike Noble, Noble Predictive Insights
                                                            18 the minutes are approved 3-to-nothing.
             Sydney Evenson, Noble Predictive Insights
                                                            19
                                                                          Item III is discussion and possible action on
18
             Cathy Herring, Meeting Planner
             Rivko Knox, Member of the Public
                                                            20 the Executive Director's Report. Tom.
19
                                                                          MR. COLLINS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman,
                                                            21
2.0
                                                            22 Commissioners. I wanted to really quickly say, you
21
2.2
                                                            23 know, it's -- I guess this should be, unless -- barring
23
                                                            24 some unforeseen circumstance, the last meeting of the
2.4
                                                            25 year, so I wanted to really quickly run through a lot
                                                   Page 3
                                                                                                               Page 5
                     PROCEEDING
1
                                                             1 of -- a number of things that we accomplished this
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Agenda Item I is the call
                                                             2 year.
                                                                          I think it was a pretty -- pretty exciting
 3 to order. It is 9:30 \text{ a.m.}, December 14th, 2023. I
 4 call this meeting of the Citizens Clean Elections
                                                             4 year by Clean Elections off-year standards. We had a
 5 Commission to order.
                                                             5 -- we had a full look at our debate process, you may
             And with that, we will take attendance.
                                                             6 recall, in the spring running through June, when our
7 Commissioners, please identify yourselves for the
                                                             7 final Debate Task Force report was presented to the
8 record.
                                                             8 Commission, and so we've been going through
9
             COMMISSIONER PATON: Galen Paton.
                                                             9 implementing that since then.
10
             COMMISSIONER CHAN: Amy Chan.
                                                            10
                                                                          We have run through and reviewed the
             COMMISSIONER MEYER: Damien Meyer.
11
                                                            11 Proposition 211 over the course of several meetings in
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: And I'm Mark Kimble. We
12
                                                            12 the spring. And then we went into our regulatory
13 have four out of five of us here, so we have a quorum.
                                                            13 agenda there and we passed a -- I think a solid set of
14
             I apologize for not being there in person,
                                                            14 rules that provide the -- where the statute requires us
15 but I don't think you'd want to be around me right now.
                                                            15 to pass rules, we did that. And then in those cases
             Item II, discussion and possible action on
                                                            16 where the -- in the interest of the regulated community
17 minutes for the November 16th, 2023 meeting.
                                                            17 and the public, passed rules that provide some guidance
18 Commissioners, you have the minutes from our November
                                                            18 and, in effect, cabin the Commission's decision making
19 meeting in the packet. Is there any discussion?
                                                            19
                                                               through a transparent process that guarantees that
2.0
             (No response.)
                                                               folks who are operating under this Act -- or, seeks to
21
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, do I have a
                                                            21 quarantee that folks who are operating under this Act
22 motion to approve the minutes?
                                                            22 have the assurances that they ought to that the
2.3
             COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we
                                                            23 Commission will proceed in a -- in a deliberate and
24 approve the minutes as written.
                                                            24 stepwise manner.
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan has moved
                                                                          I think that, in addition, you know, we
```

and I think that's been good for the -- for us as staff
members, bringing us back together.

And then additionally, we -- you know, we had
a full -- you know, we'll see -- this was previewed in
the early -- first quarter, second quarter, you know,
our new website, but we got, I think, some due credit
for the work that Alec and Gina have done on the
website in the Governor's Task Force Report.

And then additionally, you know, we had a

1 transitioned back to having our meetings, you know, as

2 a hybrid meeting. I think that was a successful thing

11 And then additionally, you know, we had a 12 full -- Avery, sort of in the post-COVID era, was able 13 to return to full-time outreach efforts, and I think 14 that throughout, especially going through the fall, was

15 able to be available at -- you know, for numerous 16 members of our community around the state and

17 throughout the Valley.

18 So I think that -- you know, and then -- and 19 then obviously we've continued to -- Mike has started 20 up our efforts on the public financing part of the --21 of the Act.

22 So I just wanted to say that that is about as 23 comprehensive a year of touching every part of the Act 24 as we could, every part of our mission that we could as 25 staff, and so I am very proud of the work that, you Page 8

2 agency inside the ASU's journalism school. And the 3 voter education team has been working with them on 4 highlighting the 26th Amendment, which lowered the 5 voting age nationwide to 18, and so we have a video 6 from that that we were going to show. 7 (Video plays.) MR. COLLINS: So that was our 26th 9 Amendment --10 COMMISSIONER CHAN: That was fantastic. 11 Mr. Chairman, I just got such a kick out of that and 12 that was amazing. I loved it. 13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: It was. It was very good. MR. COLLINS: The one kid had a vote hat, 15 which, you know, those are -- that's our trademark. 16 We'll fight anybody who starts their own vote hat. 17 If I may, Mr. Chairman, I just wanted to 18 close out the report with highlighting a couple of 19 administrative things. The Election Procedures Manual 20 is pending with the Governor and the Attorney General, 21 so, you know, we anticipate that will probably get 22 approved at some point between now and the end of the

We have received two additional requests for

25 advisory opinions, so these will be Advisory Opinion

1 Cronkite Agency is a student-driven public relations

Page 7

24

1 know, that my colleagues here on staff have done. So I 2 wanted to start with that. And, you know, on -- sort of just to return 4 to the regular report for a moment, I wanted to 5 highlight -- and I think we're going to have a video to 6 show one of the projects we did do this year. But as 7 we look at the voter education and outreach portion of 8 the report, Avery was -- presented at a Secretary of 9 State's town hall at Northern Arizona University, which 10 was, I think, very exciting. And he was there with not 11 just the Secretary of State himself, but the Election 12 Director for Coconino County. Gina was recently a judge at We the -- for We 13 14 the People, a regional essay competition. Is it essay? 15 MS. ROBERTS: They debate the Constitution. MR. COLLINS: Debate, debate the 16 17 Constitution. And then tomorrow we will all -- most of us 19 will be at the security tabletop exercise, which is 20 sort of a scenario, it's operated by the Secretary of

21 State's Office, where we go through and work through

25 we can, the Clean Elections and Cronkite Agency --

I wanted to -- here I wanted to highlight, if

22 real life security problems that can arise in

23 elections.

Page 9

1 Request 2 and 3. We are in the public comment phase of 2 those requests. We are talking about -- as we go forward in 4 the next year, one of the things we're going to look at 5 on Prop 211 is talking -- is doing a little more 6 outreach around what it covers. We've gotten some 7 reports that are -- you know, that are a little 8 concerning around folks who have the perception or are 9 propagating the perception that Prop 211 is far broader 10 and more -- and requires more disclosure from more 11 entities than it really does. Prop 211 is focused directly on campaign 13 media spending. Nevertheless, there are some folks in 14 -- who run sort of what you might call service 15 nonprofits, that is to say, nonprofits that are not 16 principally engaged in policy action or lobbying or 17 grassroots lobbying, but actually are involved in 18 providing services to the community, you know, and 19 typically those kind of entities are not substantial 20 campaign media spenders. And in order to be 21 substantial campaign media spenders under the Act, 22 they'd have to spend, you know, something around -- on 23 the order of \$25,000 in a non-state race. 24 And so we think we need to do a little bit

25 more to sort of talk to those -- that community and

Page 13

```
Page 10
1 others to make sure they understand that the -- that
                                                             1
                                                                          MR. COLLINS: Sure.
 2 Prop 211 is targeted narrowly at a specific -- at big
                                                                          COMMISSIONER PATON: It's hard enough to deal
 3 campaign spenders and their major donors and not at
                                                             3 with all these different aspects of it alone, stuff
 4 ordinary service providing 501(c)(4)s and also maybe to
                                                             4 that's not true, you know.
 5 try to explain to those entities that there is a -- you
                                                                         MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, Commissioner
 6 know, that there are other concerns that they would
                                                             6 Paton, I think that's -- I think that's right. So what
 7 have that they would want to deal with, in terms of
                                                             7 I think -- what we anticipate doing in the first part
 8 their nonprofit status, long before they'd ever get to
                                                             8 of -- and we have done this on a one-on-one basis or
9 a place where Prop 211 implicates anything they would
                                                             9 small-group basis with groups already and lawyers
10 be doing. So we'll be working on that.
                                                            10 already, but what we anticipate doing, starting in the
11
             COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question.
                                                            11 first quarter, is we're going to -- we're going to do a
12
             MR. COLLINS: Sure.
                                                            12 form -- some form of sort of what we call a continuing
13
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Tom, can I just ask you one
                                                            13 legal education thing, which is really a seminar for
14 question about that?
                                                            14 folks who are in the industry, lawyers, but also more
             MR. COLLINS: Sure.
                                                            15 broadly I think we'll do outreach to different
15
16
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Is this a good faith lack
                                                            16 community organizations.
17 of understanding or is this an effort by someone to sow
                                                            17
                                                                          We've talked, in our public affairs
                                                            18 legislative meeting, about identifying organizations
18 confusion for their own needs or their own desires?
19
             MR. COLLINS: Mr. Chairman, I would answer
                                                            19 that we know are concerned or may be concerned or, you
20 that in this way. I think there is a
                                                            20 know, should hear from us first rather than hearing
                                                            21 from folks who might -- might be more interested in
21 less-than-good-faith effort to propagate doubt, but the
22 doubt is good faith, because the people who are hearing
                                                            22 raising concerns.
23 the message are not in a position yet where they -- you
                                                            23
                                                                         And then I do think, you're right, that there
24 know, their concerns are good faith. Some of the folks
                                                            24 will come a time here, once we're past -- and I want to
                                                            25 -- and this kind of allows me to transition, if I
25 propagating this may not be doing it in as good of
                                                 Page 11
```

1 faith as I would hope. 2 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question. 2 with. But I think that as the -- as we move past the 3 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman and Tom. 3 initial phase of litigation, as the Secretary of CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Chan. 4 4 State's -- we anticipate their filing system coming

COMMISSIONER CHAN: I think it sounds like 5 6 your thoughts on this and doing some education are 7 probably -- is a good issue to address. I think what 8 concerns me is that nonprofits that are just, as you 9 mentioned, just almost pure service organizations, you 10 know, doing their mission, rather than engaging in 11 political speech, are concerned that just by virtue of 11 12 that somehow they're going to be, you know, subject to 13 this campaign regulatory framework. So I think that's 14 the key, to my mind, is making sure that nonprofits

15 that aren't engaging in political speech are 16 comfortable with the fact that they don't -- they're 17 not subject to this kind of reporting.

18 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question. 19 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: So by -- oh, I'm sorry. 20

21 By taking all that, maybe you could do like a newspaper 22 interview or something on the TV news or something and 23 maybe that will help get the word out, because that's a

24 lot of ill will that gets churned up. And if we can 25 kind of nip that in the bud, then --

1 might, into the legal issues that we're still dealing

5 online sometime here in the near future, as those 6 things happen, I think we'll be in a stronger position

7 to do the kind of media outreach about this that --

8 that we ought to and have some -- some things -- a news

9 hook, for lack of a better way of putting it, for that

10 kind of outreach as well.

Mr. Chairman, I just have one other thing I 12 wanted to highlight. Yesterday we had -- this is the 13 second PI hearing we've had on a challenge to Prop 211. 14 This is the PI hearing in the legislative leadership's

15 lawsuit against the Act. And so we had that hearing

16 yesterday in Maricopa Superior -- Maricopa County

17 Superior Court. The judge presiding said that he would

18 have a ruling to -- anticipated having a ruling on --

19 there was a motion to dismiss filed by the Commission,

20 the Attorney General, the campaign committee for the --21 for the Proposition, and there's also the PI filed --

22 preliminary injunction motion filed by the -- by the

23 legislative leadership. The judge told us that he

24 anticipates ruling on those by the end of this year.

25 So that really brings us to the end of my

```
1 report. And so if anyone has any other questions,
                                                             1 have proactive training available, so folks get at
 2 obviously --
 3
             COMMISSIONER PATON: I have another question.
4
             MR. COLLINS: Sure.
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.
             COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay. So it says that
 6
7 there's -- 29 candidates have attended the workshops.
 8 Is that normal, average, or...
             MR. COLLINS: I mean, I would say --
10 Mr. Chairman, Commissioner Paton, I would say that's
11 about -- about normal at this point. You know, we
12 anticipate -- you know, for the -- in a year like this,
13 we're going to anticipate at least, counting both
14 parties, both parties that are likely to have
15 candidates in state races, I should say, six -- I think
16 six Corporation Commission candidates, maybe more. We
17 will have some legislative candidates. We've had
18 inquires from candidates running for Legislature; those
19 folks attending is a good sign.
20
             You know, I don't think it's any secret at
21 this point that the campaign -- you know, that the --
22 you know, the public campaign finance program, as
23 effective as it can be, you know, is one that folks are
```

24 especially -- even ones -- even folks who used it, got

25 elected, and then in their next election are less

Page 16

2 least a rundown on campaign finance, on what goes into 3 running a campaign early on in the -- earlier on in the 4 cycle than they might get it from -- otherwise. I 5 think that's a solid -- solid part of the program as 6 well. COMMISSIONER PATON: So it's effectively 7 8 turning into getting your foot in the door; and then 9 after that, it's not so necessary for you. 10 And by what you were saying, is it -- it's 11 hard for us to publicize the availability of this, of 12 the campaign financing? 13 MR. COLLINS: Yes. I mean, we had a -- we 14 have had a -- we had a litigation that resulted in some 15 legislative changes in 2012. So, you know, at the same 16 time that the -- that the Legislature made the decision 17 to take out two thirds of the funding voters intended 18 to be available to publicly financed candidates, they 19 -- in that same bill they curbed -- they put a 20 prohibition on the Commission being able to advertise 21 the benefits of the -- of the Clean Elections Act. COMMISSIONER PATON: Well, maybe we need to 22 23 think outside the box and figure out other ways to get 24 that information out so we'll get more candidates like 25 this.

Page 15

```
1 likely to use it again, and there's lots of different
 2 reasons why that's so.
             A major one is -- that's developed over time
4 is, candidates now see, in a sort of permanent 24/7,
 5 365 campaign, the need to have their campaign
 6 committees available for them to fund stuff, to have
7 money on hand. And Clean Elections is really -- you
 8 know, because it's a system that sort of limits -- you
 9 agree to campaign spending and fundraising limits, you
10 know, can put a crimp in your style if you're moving
11 your way up through leadership and you want to have
12 flexibility financially to do that. That's the
13 reality. So, you know, and obviously -- and
14 legislative changes about 10 years ago make it more
15 difficult for us to advertise and promote participation
16 in the public financing program itself.
17
             So, you know -- so, you know, so given all
18 that, I mean, this is about where we are. It's not a
19 precipitous decline, but we have sort of ended up with
20 a consistent set of candidates. And, you know, so
21 we'll probably have -- we'll probably have more
22 interest maybe than candidates who actually run, but --
             I think the other important thing is that,
24 even if you go through the training and you don't run
25 clean, I think it's -- I think it's the fact that we
```

Page 17

MR. COLLINS: Sure. I think -- I think, you

```
2 know, in the long haul, that may be -- that may be
 3 something. I think the other thing that's working in
 4 our advantage in the long haul is, changes that the
 5 Legislature made in a subsequent bill actually create a
 6 situation where clean candidates are in a better
7 position, one might say an optimal position, going into
 8 a general election because -- if they're not able to --
 9 not able to compete in fundraising, because the general
10 grant comes without additional fundraising time. And
11 as candidates, under Arizona's campaign finance law,
12 they are -- it's not a campaign contribution to work
13 with the political parties.
14
             One of the things we've tried to communicate
15 with folks who are involved in political campaigns is
16 exactly that principle. For example, there was a
17 candidate -- a losing candidate for a statewide office
18 who raised -- raised, so that -- not -- before even
19 accounting for his costs in that -- basically the exact
20 amount of money he would have gotten from Clean
21 Elections. And what is that an indicator of? It's an
22 indicator of the fact that the person made, I think,
23 probably an incorrect choice in terms of allocating
24 their resources. I think that -- I think that's a
25 message we have been trying to work on communicating.
```

It is -- the difficult problem is that the --2 that the -- the people who make money on fundraising 3 and on the mailhouse pieces are the campaign 4 consultants and the campaign -- you know, people 5 operating the campaigns. And Clean Elections does not 6 have the -- allow for the kind of pure overhead where 7 campaign consultants who work with candidates are going 8 to make enough money to make it worth their time, yeah. 9 And that's really a big -- a big problem. 10 You know, there's also always going to be a 11 headwind of why would you want to do something 12 regulated -- more regulated --13 COMMISSIONER PATON: Yeah. MR. COLLINS: -- when you can do something 15 that is -- that is less regulated. Our point of view 16 is more along the lines of, look, if you're the 17 candidate, you've got to take control of your own 18 destiny. The campaign consultant that you think is 19 your friend -- your campaign consultant is your -- is 20 your -- is your -- you're a client and that's about it. 21 I don't mean to be cynical about campaign consultants, 22 God forbid.

But when you're trying to go to a person and

24 say, look, you know, this is your future, this is your

25 campaign, this is -- what's your best way to get

23

Page 20

2 inclined to give you that \$5-, \$10-, \$20-a-month 3 donation, that's not evenly distributed. 4 And so what that means is that it's -- if 5 you're a below -- lower-level state candidate or a 6 legislative candidate, your ability -- you really 7 need -- what we encourage people to do, and we've tried 8 to run some numbers for folks on this, is look at the 9 delta between how much they're actually going to get 10 from Clean Elections versus how much they have to spend 11 to raise what they're going to get and where they're 12 putting their time. And if you -- and if you take 13 those things together, it becomes much more of a wash 14 for the candidate, but that -- but it still requires 15 that candidate to do something that in politics is hard 16 and in life is hard, which is to -- because there's 17 pressure on people to be -- I don't know. To put it 18 bluntly, in politics the rule is, it is worse to be 19 different than to be wrong and --20 COMMISSIONER PATON: Well, I would just say 21 that, I mean, the real -- the main reason we're here --22 MR. COLLINS: Yeah. 23 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- is to fund Clean 24 Elections. 25 MR. COLLINS: Sure.

1 the lists, control of the donors who are actually

Page 19

```
1 dollars in front of -- for you to get in front of
 2 voters in an effective way without having to compromise
 3 yourself. And then, you know -- but the -- but a more
 4 sophisticated person shows up and says, look, this
 5 is -- this is naive, this is pie in the sky stuff.
             But when you look at the numbers -- when you
7 look at the numbers and the way -- there's two numbers
8 that matter. One, inflation matters, right. So as
9 inflation impacts people's spending and ability to,
10 especially at the small dollar level, to give
11 donations, that hurts small dollar donors and -- but,
12 on the other hand, the Clean Elections funding is tied
13 to inflation. So there is a -- not ever going to be a
14 catch-up to what the Legislature got rid of, but there
15 is a little bit of a catch-up there.
             And then the other key, I think,
17 number related to that is that there was a belief, in
18 the -- post President Obama's 2008 election, that small
19 donors were going to take care of every candidate, that
20 small donors and your list -- you know, you were going
21 to send out your e-mail blast and everybody was going
22 to send you $5 a month for the rest of your life. That
23 -- those dollars are not getting distributed evenly.
```

24 So if you talk to political consultants, especially who

25 work in the area of online fundraising, the control of

Page 21

```
COMMISSIONER PATON: And there's got to be
 2 some way we can get some of this information to people
3 that don't even really know that we exist, basically.
4
             MR. COLLINS: Sure.
             COMMISSIONER PATON: And, I don't know, maybe
5
6 when Avery goes and does his stuff he can really push
7 that part of it or -- I'm sure there's other ways we
8 can do this --
9
             MR. COLLINS: Sure. Sure.
             COMMISSIONER PATON: -- that -- these laws
10
11 have boxed us in somehow.
             MR. COLLINS: No, I -- Mr. Chairman, if I
13 may, I just --
14
             COMMISSIONER PATON: We have enough brain
15 power, I think, on the staff. I think we could figure
16 out some way we could increase that.
17
             MR. COLLINS: And I can tell you, just as --
18 to use your example, if I may, Mr. Chairman, Avery and
19 I have gone out to events and that has been -- that is
20 part of -- definitely part of Avery's presentation.
21 And we had an opportunity at a Tempe event just this
22 fall to really have some pretty good conversations,
23 initial conversations with a couple of different
24 candidates, not all of whom are looking at this cycle,
25 but are looking at the future. And I think that those
```

Page 22

```
1 kind of -- that one-on-one-type outreach absolutely
 2 makes a difference and that is definitely part of
 3 what -- every time Avery does go out to talk to folks,
 4 that's part of the process. So I agree with you.
             COMMISSIONER PATON: Well, I just know, just
 6 meeting people day in, day out, and the subject will
7 come up and they have no clue what Clean Elections is.
8 And so usually I'm around people my age group or
9 whatever, my interests. And just think of the other
10 people, the younger people, they probably don't know
11 much about it. So I've gone off on a tangent.
12
             MR. COLLINS: No. No. No. No. No.
13
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton, I
14 appreciate your focusing on this issue. And I agree
15 with you, the trend that we're seeing is troubling of
16 fewer candidates willing to participate in what was our
17 signature program, why we were created. And it seems
18 reasonable that maybe sometime next year we ought to
```

19 devote some serious time to looking at a comprehensive

20 list of the problems and what we ought to do about it

21 instead of -- in the past it seems like we've kind of

25 that we've got to get more people to come on board as

23 deal with this problem.

22 taken a whack-a-mole thing that here's a problem, let's

But I agree with you, Commissioner Paton,

Page 24 1 on our website and available to all of the stakeholders

2 in our election process. Today, as our preview of our voter education 4 efforts, we have with us Mike Noble of Noble Predictive

5 Insights. Mike Noble is the founder and CEO of NPI,

6 the leading nonpartisan public opinion polling, market

7 research, and data analytics firm based in the

8 southwest. Mike is the thought leader in public

9 opinion tracking and analysis. Mike found a passion

10 for politics while working for an Arizona congressman

11 before starting NPI. Since then, he's been deemed a

12 preeminent pollster in the southwest by NBC News by 13 regularly conducting public and voter sentiment

14 throughout the region.

15 Mike, thank you for being with us today. 16 MR. NOBLE: Well, thank you for having me. 17 Is this thing on? Thank you for having me. Is this 18 thing on?

19 And normally -- if you're not here 20 physically, I'm 5'8", and normally I don't have an

21 issue of things not being tall enough for me, but I

22 might have to crouch a little bit --

23 COMMISSIONER PATON: No, we can hear you. MR. NOBLE: -- during this presentation. Is 24

25 this fine up here?

Page 23

```
1 clean candidates and get the word out there within the
 2 limitations that we have. And I think that's something
 3 that we ought to devote some time to in an upcoming
 4 meeting to look comprehensively at the problem and what
 5 we ought to be doing.
             Are there any other -- Tom, were you done
7 with your presentation on your Executive Director's
8 Report?
9
             MR. COLLINS: Yes. Yes.
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Are there any other
10
11 questions or comments from Commissioners?
12
             (No response.)
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none -- thank you,
13
14 Tom -- Item IV, discussion and possible action on Clean
15 Elections voter education survey.
16
             Beginning in 2022, the Commission performed
17 an issues survey of Arizona voters as part of our voter
18 education program. The purpose of the survey is to
19 enhance participation by voters, moderators,
20 candidates, and campaigns in our debate program by
21 providing a common set of data about the issues most
22 important to Arizonans. This will ultimately lead to a
```

COMMISSIONER PATON: Yeah.

MR. NOBLE: Okay. All right. Well, thanks 3 so much for having me, Mr. Chairman and the Board and 4 Gina and Tom. Thank you. And, yeah, so this is our 5 second time doing a survey and --Well, one other quick thing besides -- when I 7 founded the company seven years ago, one of the things 8 that -- Arizona didn't have really public opinion 9 research, I'd say, here in Arizona. They always kept 10 going out of state. And I think, you know, us folks 11 here in the southwest, I think we have a pretty unique 12 skill set and I think we can do pretty good work. And 13 so in founding it seven years ago, we actually ranked 14 Number 11 in the country for accuracy last year and 15 actually Number 1 in accuracy in the southwest region. 16 So we take a lot of pride in what we do, but --17 representing Arizona on the national stage. 18 So we did this project so -- and you had a 19 good summary overview, which was getting a pulse on 20 the -- Arizona's electorate, but really to help fuel 21 the debates. Because when the debates are going on, 22 especially when you have them -- more regional 23 localities, issues are different. I mean, issues

23 meaningful, issue-oriented, and informative dialogue

24 between the candidates and voters, as intended by the

25 Clean Elections Act. The survey results will be posted

24 overall with the statewide electorate compared to maybe

25 south Phoenix, for example, different.

```
And so basically we wanted to go through and dig into what were their key issues. I think we had a really unique approach of how we did it, but I have a nice little presentation put together for you all today.

Going to the next slide. Oh, yeah.
```

Going to the next slide. Oh, yeah,
commanding the slide changings, right? Are you doing
the -- what was your name?

MS. HERRING: I'm Cathy.

9 MS. HERRING: 1 m Catny
10 MR. NOBLE: Cathy?

11 MS. HERRING: It's just a little delayed, 12 so --

13 MR. NOBLE: Okay. Cathy, well, I'm going to 14 thank you in advance --

15 MS. HERRING: Sure.

16 MR. NOBLE: -- for the 50 times I'm going to 17 mention to switch slides. So thank you.

18 Anyways, so appreciate that. So these are 19 going to be our topics today. We did -- if you want

20 the research for it, it's probably over a thousand

21 pages of numbers. Feel free, if you want to go through

22 that. But we went through -- after going through all

23 the research, myself and our team of expert analysts

24 went through and basically put together the key
25 insights for you all and visually did it, so -- and we

3 misights for you are and visually did it, so and v

Page 28

Page 29

1 their issues in debate topics, which ones resonate with

2 Arizona voters, especially regionally and by party.

3 Because things that are important among, let's say,

4 Democrats may be a little bit different among

5 Republicans. And that's important, especially when

6 you're looking at our primaries.

7 And then finally, looking at discover the 8 specific issues on broader categories, so not just

9 maybe some of the most common ones people are talking

10 about. I mean, are there some more underlying issues $\,$

11 out there that maybe haven't been uncovered. And then

12 also, provide some actual recommendations for

13 consideration that will enhance strategic planning for

 $14\,$ voter education and debate discussions. So that's what

 $15\,\,$ we were sent out to do, or the premise of our research,

16 and here we'll jump into the findings.

17 So, next slide.

18 COMMISSIONER PATON: And the sample size is?
19 MR. NOBLE: Sample size is large, very large.

20 One second. It is 1,000 -- we run like 12 surveys a

21 week, so I wish I could have them all memorized. It

22 was 1,665 respondents, so incredibly large survey.

I mean, to put that in context, I know

24 there's probably not a lot of staff folks in here, is

25 that -- I would put it into context here is that --

Page 27

1 broke it up, and I find it made it more digestible 2 putting it into topics.

3 So, first, we're going to start off with our 4 big picture, that voters are restless and conflicted;

5 and then we'll talk about the key issues among

6 registered and likely voters; then key issues setting

7 local -- with the locals speaking in their own words;

 $8\,$ and then look at some regional breakdowns; and then the

9 right channels, you know, where people are watching

10 news and hearing about debates. So those are our

11 topics today. And I'm Mike, and you're going to hear

 $12\,\,$ the sweet sound of my voice for the next hour, so bear

13 with me here.

14 Briefly, now we have our project goals,

15 before we get into it, is that -- so with us it's

16 incredibly important, like when we go out and do this

17 research, okay, what is our objective, what are we

18 trying to accomplish, because that will guide how we

19 collect the sample, how we will write the survey, how

20 many minutes are the survey, then also, of course, what

21 the results -- or, in the analysis what are the type of

22 findings that we're looking for based on our

23 objectives. So we wanted to gauge those perceptions of

24 Arizona registered and likely voters on their

25 top issues, and then also learn a little bit more about

1 okay, 1,665 respondents we had in this panel that were

2 qualified as Arizona registered voters. What is that,

3 is that big? Is that small? Is that about right?

4 Well, if you wanted to do a statewide sample, so just

 ${\tt 5}\,$ get an overall look at the state of Arizona, you could

6 easily do a 400-sample survey and be confident in those

 $7\,$ results. So we're about three, four times that size,

8 so I think we're in good shape.

9 So basically we have a very large sample

10 size, and we specifically did that for a couple

11 reasons. One, we really want to be able to look deeper 12 into our, you know, subgroups, so those subgroups,

13 making sure that they are bigger so you can see some

14 bigger changes; but also, regionally, so making sure we

15 have statistical significance when we're looking at the

16 regions is the other important factor. So that's what

10 regions is the other important ractor. So that s wha

17 we have regarding our sample.

And we broke this survey -- when we get to

19 the regions, besides a statewide look, you're going to 20 see several looks from us today. One is a statewide

21 look, and then the second is a regional look, which we

22 had six regions we broke it into.

23 So let's get into the fun stuff, the results.

24 Next slide, please.

18

25

So -- but when we look at the big picture,

```
Page 30
                                                                                                             Page 32
1 voters are restless and conflicted, which probably
                                                            1 still slightly to the right.
 2 about sums up the electorate these days. So Arizona's
                                                                        And then trajectory of Arizona, we've seen
 3 -- so Arizona voters are restless, disconnected with
                                                             3 this in our other surveys, but then we also see it
 4 their current leaders, but they're also open to change.
                                                             4 here, that Arizonans overall -- you know, asking them
             So just looking at just some generic numbers
                                                             5 whether the state is going -- is on the right track or
                                                             6 it's going in the wrong direction. So this question
6 first, before we get into more specific items, the
7 chart on the left is our generic ballot, so asking
                                                            7 was asked almost on like every survey, and it's really
8 folks what political party that runs the state best, in
                                                            8 just gauging optimism and pessimism among your
9 their opinion. So this is kind of generically, you
                                                            9 audience. So overall, hey, do you think things are
10 know, who do they think is kind of doing a better job,
                                                           10 going in the right direction or wrong. They could be
11 the red team or the blue team. I like to call it red
                                                            11 viewing that from an economic lens, they could be
12 team and blue team because -- I'm trying to think of an
                                                           12 viewing it from an abortion lens, they could be viewing
13 independent third -- independent candidate that's
                                                            13 it from a myriad of ways, but overall, what's that
14 currently elected in Arizona. I don't think we have
                                                            14 general sense or feeling.
15 one. So it's red team and blue team, sadly.
                                                            15
                                                                         Currently, underwater by about 10 points. A
16
             COMMISSIONER PATON: Sinema.
                                                            16 majority actually think things are going in the wrong
17
             MR. NOBLE: Sinema, but she was already
                                                            17 direction right now. So voters are a little
18 elected --
                                                            18 pessimistic, a little anxious right now.
19
             COMMISSIONER PATON: Right.
                                                            19
                                                                         Next slide.
20
             MR. NOBLE: -- and switched teams. But, you
                                                            20
                                                                         COMMISSIONER PATON: So was that question
21 know, one actually elected at the ballot box. I can't
                                                           21 about Arizona itself or just things in general?
22 recall any in the last few decades. But also, I was
                                                            22
                                                                         MR. NOBLE: Arizona itself, not the country.
23 born in 1984, so --
                                                            23 The number would be worse.
                                                                        COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay. Thank you.
24
             COMMISSIONER PATON: I started voting before
                                                            24
25 that.
                                                            25
                                                                         MR. NOBLE: Yes, absolutely. In actuality,
                                                 Page 31
                                                                                                             Page 33
             MR. NOBLE: I just gave away a little too
                                                             1 yes, it's worse when you ask -- and when you ask --
```

2 much right there. And so what's interesting is -- so, first 4 off -- so it's kind of like, hey, who do you think is 5 running better -- and you hear a lot -- especially from 6 nationals they'll say, hey, Arizona is purple or 7 turning blue. They're right in one sense of with the 8 elected officials, but where the overall electorate, 9 where they're leaning, Arizona still has a lean to the 10 right. So if you were to color code Arizona, I would 11 say it's not purple. I would say it's magenta, the 12 lightest shade of red. So it is -- so Republicans are doing a little 14 bit better with the state. And then the 20 percent 15 that are -- that said neither, those are really your 16 people that aren't party loyal, which is so fascinating 17 about Arizona's electorate is that, you know, eight in 18 10 are party loyal, but really that 20 percent, they're 19 not a small group, but those are the ones that 20 ultimately really decide the general elections. 21 And if you notice, Arizona has been quite

22 popular these last four years in the national dynamics,

23 because we went from kind of a ruby red state to now a

24 bit more of a battleground state. And you can see that

25 actually in those numbers, so -- but, again, leans

2 when we ask, you know, how do you think that things are 3 going on the national level, it will usually be about 4 at least 5 to 10 points less compared to when asking 5 about the state of Arizona. So Arizonans actually see 6 us doing better than the nation as a whole. 7 COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay. Thank you. MR. NOBLE: Which is a -- which is a good 8 9 sign. 10 So, all right, next is --11 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman, I had a 12 quick question on that last slide, if I could. MR. NOBLE: Yeah. Oh, sorry. 13 14 COMMISSIONER MEYER: On the -- Commissioner 15 Kimble, is that okay? CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Of course. Yes, 16 17 Commissioner Meyer. 18 COMMISSIONER MEYER: If you could go back the 19 one slide on the 55/45 or 50 -- do you know how the 20 answer to that question compares to a year ago, two 21 years ago, five years ago, by chance? 22 MR. NOBLE: I do. I actually have -- and I 23 actually can send it to you all after this. We have 24 our Arizona Public Opinion Pulse, so it's our quarterly 25 statewide tracker. I think we've been running it for

1 five years now. And we polled Arizona more than anyone 2 else in the country. I actually have that whole trend

3 line for you.

But where it was a decade ago -- or, not a decade ago -- a year ago was actually worse. It was

6 actually minus 20 in disagreement. So actually things

 $7\,$ are trending upwards, so -- and probably three years

8 ago it was actually positive.

9 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Interesting. Okay.

10 Thank you.

16

11 MR. NOBLE: So it was positive, it hit a big 12 negative, and it's on the upswing right now.

13 COMMISSIONER PATON: That was during COVID --

MR. NOBLE: Correct.

15 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- it was positive.

MR. NOBLE: It was, well, just before COVID.

 $\,$ 17 $\,$ And when COVID hit, then, yes, everything went bad.

18 But I actually have a trend line. I could

19 send you the deck after that. It also has like Biden 20 job approval, other things that we tracked over time.

21 So I would be happy to share that trend line with you

22 after this little --

23 Next slide.

24 All right. So likely to vote in the upcoming

25 election. So we asked respondents --

Page 36

1 pretty good turnout, but, again, it's a presidential

2 year. There's just a lot more awareness compared to a

3 midterm year where turnout can very much vary depending

4 on the type of midterm.

5 But not -- and not all the respondents will

6 vote, but with the candidate field in flux it's

7 impossible to determine exact turnout levels. But this

8 is what it currently suggests, that enthusiasm is high

9 for both -- not only the primary and general elections

10 among Arizona's electorate.

11 Next slide.

12 COMMISSIONER PATON: And what did the

13 independents vote --

14 COMMISSIONER MEYER: So, Mr. Chairman, can I

15 ask another quick question on that last slide?

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer, yes.

17 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Noble, do you ask

18 independents if they're aware that they have the

19 ability to vote in the -- in the primaries?

20 MR. NOBLE: I don't know if we had that in

21 this particular survey, so, no, we did not here. I've

22 asked it, just not on this particular instrument.

23 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Just curious. Thank

24 you.

16

25 MR. NOBLE: No worries.

Page 35

And just note on our -- these slides here,

 $2\,$ we'll sometimes abbreviate. If, you know, the question

 $\ensuremath{\mathtt{3}}$ is, okay, how did you ask the question, who was this

 $4\,$ among, we always have our methodology notes in the

5 bottom middle of the slide so you can actually see the 6 exact question verbiage of what we asked, how we asked

7 it. So if it may not be clear to you, maybe some of

8 the -- you know, with some of the titling or some of

9 the abbreviations, just know that you can always read

10 the exact question verbiage below.

11 But so asking folks whether -- you know, how

12 likely they'll vote in the upcoming primary election in

13 August, it was interesting is that 70 percent of voters

14 said that they were likely to vote in -- or,

 $15\,\,$ respondents, 70 percent said they were likely to vote

16 in the primary election in 2024, then 78 percent said

17 they were likely to vote in the November 2024 general

18 election, which is interesting.

19 Last -- so we're in a presidential year

20 and -- compared to a midterm. And in a presidential

21 year -- last presidential election our turnout was

22 actually, I think, 79.8 percent. And right here in the

23 self-identification we have it at about 78 percent of

24 respondents, so pretty much in line. But you notice

25 that even with primaries we're going to see probably a

Page 37

COMMISSIONER PATON: What was the answer to

2 that?

3 MR. NOBLE: Well, all right. Well, I do have

4 the answer. So this is the curse of doing so many

5 different public opinion polls is that -- and knowing

the data.

16

7 So it's interesting. So independents, with

8 them voting in primaries, right, the thing -- at least

9 right now -- I mean, and there's a couple things on

10 the ballot this year that may change how the primary

11 process works, but we'll see how that is at that point.

12 But as of now, the process is -- is that independents

13 can vote in a primary, but they have to take one extra

 $14\,\,$ step compared to, you know, Democrats or Republicans,

15 which is they have to request the ballot.

Even though it's one step -- and yet, my

17 experience has been, you add more steps for voters,

18 you're just -- it's harder to get participation, you're

19 just going to see a drop in activity level. And just

20 even with that one step in there -- I would say for

21 Republicans, on average, they'll have about 15 percent 22 of independents. So of, let's say, a total vote in,

23 let's say, I don't know, a state ledge race or a

24 congressional -- or, any type of partisan race going on

25 in the primary, you would have about, I don't know, 12

1 to 17 percent of that total primary vote for $\,$

2 Republicans will be independents.

And then Democrats, it will probably be 4 closer to around like 10 percent, just less, mainly

5 because the breakdown -- the difference between the two

6 respective parties, why independents are a bit more

7 involved in Republican primaries than Democratic, is

8 really because, at least historically, Republicans have

9 way more competitive primaries than Democrats.

10 That's actually starting to change a little

11 bit since Arizona has been a battleground. Look at

12 Arizona's First Congressional District with incumbent

13 Republican Congressman David Schweikert. There's like,

14 I don't know, five, six Democrats lined up in that

15 primary, which you normally don't see very often here

16 in the state.

17 So it's mainly due to that Republicans almost

18 always have competitive primaries, and it's kind of

19 more of the -- I'd say the -- I'd say the cultural

 $20\,$ differences between the red team and blue team. Red

21 team is just a lot more competitive with each other,

22 compared to the blue team is much better about getting

23 behind one candidate and saying, hey, this is our

24 person and let them go ahead. So they're more

25 consensus compared to Republicans being more

Page 40

1 we're seeing out here.

It was actually only 10 percent said that, a

3 respondent -- hey, a candidate that is a member of the 4 same political party as me, so you have 10 percent that

5 are just hardliners, they're voting red team, blue team

6 no matter what. They don't care. But yet 54 percent,

7 or a majority of respondents, said that actually a

8 candidate that agrees with me on the issues that I care

9 about. So, again -- so the issues matter more than

10 partisanship. You'd have -- 26 percent said those

11 first two options both equally. But overall, a

12 majority of Arizona's electorate, you know, issues

13 matter more than partisanship. And 5 percent neither,

 $14\ \ 5$ percent unsure, but a lot of people had an opinion on

15 this, so I think that's interesting.

Next slide.

17 All right. Next is for compromise, so a

18 voter's desire for compromise amongst -- amongst the

19 parties. And the question was phrased, I want both

20 political parties to work together even if it means

21 compromising on some -- some important issues. Which I

22 don't know if we've all watched TV lately, I don't know

23 if you just look at Congress in the last few months,

24 they seem to not be able to compromise on anything

25 these days.

16

Page 39

1 competitive.

2 So that's roughly the percentage of

3 independents' -- their ability. So they have a big

 $4\,$ ability to impact it, but as a percentage-wise they're

5 about one tenth, roughly.

6 COMMISSIONER PATON: Thank you.

7 MR. NOBLE: Yeah. Hopefully that helps.

8 All right. Voter preferences. All right.

9 Fun. Sorry, I've got a lot of slides to go through, so

10 $\,$ I'm hoping to -- I want you all to make sure you get to

11 lunch on time.

12 COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll try to be quiet.

13 MR. NOBLE: No, it's okay.

14 COMMISSIONER PATON: No, this is interesting.

MR. NOBLE: Okay. Joking aside, I'm here at

16 your behest. So as long as you need me here, I will be

17 here, as long as you order me lunch.

18 And so -- so what we're looking at next is 19 the voter preferences for candidates. So this is one

20 of the ones -- most people, of these respondents we

21 asked is that -- most people report that they would

22 vote for a candidate who agrees with them on specific

23 issues they care about than someone from a specific

24 party. Which is interesting, right, because, you know,

25 this whole party loyalty, this hyperpolarization that

Page 41

But yet, when you ask voters what's their desire -- so you're seeing these partisans be

3 partisans, right. But when you're looking at the

4 voters -- and that's where you're seeing there's a lot

5 of this angst in the electorate these days is because

6 they're feeling very disconnected because these parties

7 are playing their politics is that, you know, overall

8 the majority -- 77 percent of Arizonans agree, with 48

9 percent of that being strongly agree, that, you know, 10 these parties should compromise on important issues,

11 you know, let's say, immigration and healthcare, some

12 of these more hot button issues, education. They want

13 them to do it.

14 And it's funny, it even goes across party

15 lines. A majority of Democrats, 81 percent of them, 16 Republicans, 73 percent, and then 78 percent of

10 Republicans, 75 percent, and chair 76 percent c

17 independents want to see compromise between the

18 parties. And even the groups least in favor of seeing

19 compromise, which are actually 18- to 34-year-olds and

20 high school graduates, they were actually

21 overwhelmingly in favor of it too.

22 And it's interesting because all these folks

23 that are elected, they all represent these people, and

24 these people are overwhelmingly saying like, hey, they

25 should really be compromising and working together on

```
1 these issues. So the electorate is hungry to see not
```

- $2\,\,$ only some debating on issues, but also, I would say
- 3 that to actually see folks, you know, talking about
- 4 these issues and finding results and not just kicking
- 5 the can down the road.
- 6 Next slide.
- 7 So -- and it's also -- what's also
- 8 interesting is how -- saying that, however, Arizonans
- 9 are not interested in seeing compromise on issues they
- 10 care about. Hey, there's always a catch, right.
- 11 COMMISSIONER PATON: That's the delusional
- 12 part about all of that.
- 13 MR. NOBLE: Correct. On one hand it sounds 14 great. It seems like a no-brainer. Then you're like,
- 15 all right, what if it's about a specific issue that,
- 16 you know, you really -- let's say, I don't know, you're
- 17 pro-choice or pro-life, you know, take whatever side of
- 18 the issue you want. So if you're picking either of
- 19 those two, you know, it's like, wait. When you see
- 20 it's more evergreen, obviously very positive. But then
- 21 when you get kind of more to the reality, that's when
- 22 things get a little bit more interesting. So they're
- 23 just not as interested in seeing compromises on issues
- 24 that they care about. And it was interesting that
- and the state of t
- 25 41 percent of Democrats and 52 percent of Republicans

Page 44

Page 45

- 1 probably degraded a little bit over the last few years.
- 2 So, anyways, asking, hey, how should these be -- these
- 3 electeds be working with each other, should there be
- 4 maybe a little higher level of decorum.
- Three fourths of Arizona voters agreed with
- 6 that, 75 percent. Democrats, Republicans actually are
- 7 both heavily in favor of that. So as much as you're
- 8 seeing out there where these kind of -- these little
- 9 clips or these little buzzy zingers of these folks kind
- 10 of burning each other, yeah, they make the news, but
- 11 when you look at the electorate, you know, that's not
- 12 what they're looking for. They're looking for a little
- 13 higher level of -- you know, them to be better with
- 14 their relationships with other elected officials. And
- 14 their relationships with other elected officials. And
- 15 so that was interesting.

16

- Next slide.
- 17 So importance of candidates' attitudes to
- 18 voters. So the question, a candidate's attitude and
- 19 temperament matters as much to me as their stance on
- 20 policy issues. And they very much overwhelmingly
- 21 agreed with that, that respondents are as interested in
- 22 candidate temperament as policy. 70 percent of
- 23 Democrats -- it was interesting. There was a
- 24 difference, though, between Republicans and Democrats.
- 25 Seven in 10 Democrats agreed that the candidate's

Page 43

- 1 are in favor of having representatives stand firm on
- 2 their issues.
- 3 So we saw that the folks that were really
- 4 driving that agreement overall was really driven by the 5 partisans, by the Democrats and Republicans, because
- 6 they have certain issues that they're a little bit dug
- 7 in on, like immigration is a perfect example. They
- 8 both have very different views of how they would tackle
- 9 that particular issue and they're very dug in on those
- 10 issues. But independents are obviously much more open
- 11 to it compared to the two parties.
- 12 And the net agreement for this question is
- 13 plus 17, which is notably low, despite respondents'
- 14 earlier desire to see compromise between the parties.
- 15 So, again, there's the devil in the details.
- 16 Next slide. And I'll wrap this all up at the
- 17 end.
- 18 The next is that -- voters' preferences --
- 19 preference for politicians' relationships with other
- 20 politicians. So the question was phrased, a politician
- 21 should work to maintain good relationships with their
- 22 fellow elected officials. There is no point in being
- 23 rude and hard to work with. Which we have seen, I
- 24 think, an uptick in fellow elected officials of -- the 25 decorum between each -- them and their colleagues has

- $1\,$ temperament was just as important as their policy.
- 2 Interestingly enough, Republicans, not as high.
- 3 They're about actually 20 -- 12 points less, at
- 4 58 percent of Republicans answered believing that. So
- 5 actually, Democrats hold that as actually a little bit
- 6 higher of a standard compared to Republicans.
- 7 And then other than Democrats, Hispanic
- 8 voters are the most interested in candidate temperament
- 9 at 68 percent. Which Hispanic voters, by the way, is
- 10 our largest demographic group outside of white or
- 11 Caucasian here in this state. And not only that, the
- 12 fastest growing not only in population size, but also
- 13 in their participation in the election. We actually
- $14\,$ have seen their rate increase -- or, actually double
- 15 from their previous standards in the last few
- 16 elections, so they've become bigger and a more
- 17 important part of the electorate, so -- but Hispanics
- 18 especially, the candidate temperament matters very
- 19 much.
- 20 Next
- 21 All right. This is fun. So this is some
- 22 information. I'm sure I'll get questions on this one.
- 23 Is that more people have changed their views about
- 24 Republicans than Democrats since 2022. So we have in
- 25 here -- so this is actually -- so a question that we

Page 49

Page 46 1 asked this time, but then also we asked in the 2022 2 survey, so we have a little tracking time. So we asked 3 voters, you know -- you know, the statement, you know, 4 Republicans are a danger to democracy. I cannot see 5 myself voting for a Republican. And then the same 6 question was asked of, you know, Democrats are a danger 7 to democracy. I couldn't see myself voting for a 8 Democrat. So not biasing it, asking it fairly both 9 ways to see folks --10 But back in 2022 it was -- you know, 11 Republicans are dangerous, they didn't really agree 12 with that statement. It was actually a negative 26 for 13 disagreement. By the way, that net on the right side, I 15 don't think I mentioned it yet, the net on the side is 16 basically among those that have an opinion, so among 17 those greens and reds, so the agreement or 18 disagreement, it's among those that have an opinion is 19 that overall positive or negative. 20 So negative -- so of those that have an 21 opinion, it was negative 26. So back in 2022, and this 22 was pre January 6th, mind you, they did not see 23 Republicans -- they very much disagreed Republicans 24 were dangerous. Well, that swung about 21 points after 25 January 6th, so recently it's actually at a net

COMMISSIONER MEYER: Do you have this 2 information for just independents? MR. NOBLE: Yes, I can do that. Sydney, my 4 colleague from the research company, is here and she is 5 taking a copious note right now to grab that and we can 6 send that to you after the presentation. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I think that would be 7 really interesting data. MR. NOBLE: Yeah, absolutely. And I suspect 10 you'll see that move more so --COMMISSIONER MEYER: Thank you. 12 MR. NOBLE: -- will be my suspicion. 13 Oh, thank you. Yeah. I'm going to be here 14 for a bit. 15 Great question. Appreciate it. Yes, we have 16 that. And if there's any other stuff too as we go, 17 we'll just make notes of it and we can circle back with 18 that extra data or extra analysis. 19 But anyway, so that last section of what we 20 went through, just looking at some of the overall 21 items -- okay, key takeaways. I went through a bunch 22 of data. What does this all digestively mean is that 23 Arizonans are restless and they're also ready to vote, 24 so that's good, but voters have conflicting emotions.

25 They're hungry for compromise in value ideas over

```
Page 47
1 negative 5 of total disagreement. So you saw a pretty
 2 decent uptick among the electorate seeing Republicans
 3 or viewing them as a little more dangerous. But, of
 4 course, that big event happened that I don't think any
 5 of us had on our bingo card for that year.
             But then Democrats dangerous, what was
7 interesting, even for Democrats you see them -- they've
8 actually -- the electorate overall disagree a little
9 bit more -- or, disagree more with that statement of --
10 actually Democrats too have moved actually 10 points to
11 the right as well. So it's interesting, both parties
12 are kind of being viewed as more extreme as we become
13 more hyperpolarized, which, frankly, is a concerning
14 sign.
15
             Next slide.
             COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman, a question
16
17 on this Slide 12.
18
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Sure.
19
             COMMISSIONER MEYER: I didn't want to let
20 Mr. Noble down. So this slide here, 12, is the data
21 for all people that you polled, right?
22
             MR. NOBLE: Correct.
23
             COMMISSIONER MEYER: Democrats, Republicans,
```

```
1 party, but they distrust -- the distrust for the other
 2 side of the aisle is high. Again, that's that
 3 hyperpartisanship. And they want leaders who will
 4 confront opponents, but not go too far. And a debate
 5 that lets candidates contrast their ideas and showcase
6 their character would benefit the electorate.
7
             And I thought that was interesting. It was
 8 kind of fortuitous, the results. Based on all those
 9 answers, the -- kind of the conclusions was like, well,
10 it's like they want to see a debate, but a debate done
11 that's not a bunch of like mudslinging and zippy
12 one-liners, where they're actually talking about the
13 issues and actually trying to find solutions. So I
14 thought that was fortuitous.
15
             COMMISSIONER PATON: But they've -- they've
16 not voted in any moderates on either side, so you're
17 not going to get much compromise.
18
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Excuse me. Someone is
19 speaking without a microphone on? I don't know who it
20 is.
21
             COMMISSIONER PATON: That was me, Paton.
22
             CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Commissioner Paton.
             COMMISSIONER PATON: I was just saying that
23
24 there's -- the electorate has eliminated moderates on
25 the right and the -- Republicans and Democrats, and
```

MR. NOBLE: Yes.

24 and independents?

25

those are the ones that would compromise. So I think
the public is delusional, because they want something
but then they don't want that, you know.

4 MR. NOBLE: Yep.

5 COMMISSIONER PATON: So that's the -- that's 6 the conundrum that we're all facing.

the conundrum that we're all facing.

7 MR. NOBLE: That's the current issue,

8 frankly, right now is the primary process. But that's

9 why you're going to have on the ballot this year the ${\mbox{\scriptsize --}}$

10 not only -- one option will be for open primaries,

11 there will also be another one for closed primaries.

 $12\,$ One goes one direction, one goes very much the other

13 direction, but that's the current systemic issue.

To give you a good idea why that is, frankly,

15 is that -- so like, for example, the Republican

16 electorate in the state, it's probably about 70 percent

17 of them are conservative, kind of more harder right

10 7 11' 7 11' 1 1 20 1 51'

18 Republicans. And then about 30 percent of them are

 $19\,$ moderate, so these are kind of more your

20 business-minded Republicans, your McCain Republicans,

21 kind of more that -- you know, more higher educated

22 affluent wing of the party, but they're only about

23 30 percent of them. And kind of -- it's not as

24 drastic, but on the Democratic side that's why -- at

25 least in the current primary system that's why you're

Page 52

1 wasn't an issue for four decades. And if you look

2 at -- if you look at Gallup's tracking of the issue

3 over the decades, pro-choice, pro-life people, their

4 opinions basically don't change. You'll see people

5 change on the economy, immigration, these other ones.

6 Pro-choice, pro-life didn't change because that was

7 just kind of the law of the land, it was accepted. And

Just kind of the law of the land, it was accepted. All

8 then Roe v. Wade came out of nowhere and goes, oh, by

9 the way, we're throwing this out. It's all going to go

 $10\,\,$ down to the states to go decide this. All of a sudden

11 abortion, which wasn't an issue for four decades,

12 became an issue.

13 So all these different issues, everything 14 else. So how we went about our multi-layered approach,

15 we wanted to allow people to select from 50 each -- 50

16 issues, each of which were slotted into larger

17 categories. For example, someone could select jobs and

18 the economy, taxes, or jobs and economy, gas prices.

19 Because when we say jobs and economy, that's pretty

20 broad, and you'll see that on surveys. So, again, not

21 just their overall bucket, so where they are, but then,

22 you know, that next tier down or that sublevel down to

23 see where that is to kind of get more granular into the

24 specific issues. Because, again, jobs and economy,

25 incredibly broad area.

Page 51

 $1\,\,$ seeing more hard right candidates come out, because on

2 a one-to-one basis the moderate candidate has a tougher $\ \ \,$

3 time to get elected unless there's like two or three 4 conservatives or two or three liberals and then there's

5 enough of a lane for a moderate to run through. That's

6 the issue I was seeing with the primaries.

7 COMMISSIONER PATON: Thank you.

8 MR. NOBLE: Yeah, if anyone was curious.

9 All right. Key issues, this is going to be

10 $\,$ fun. So this is great. Arizona Clean Elections, I

11 think, has the most robust and actually interesting

12 issue breakdown among Arizona voters than actually

13 anybody else in the state. And ${\rm I}\,{\rm 'm}$ on record right now

 $14\,\,$ saying that, so you can take that to the bank. So key

15 issues, let's go into basically why -- why that's the

16 case. So that's just not fluffery over here. This is

17 a fact.

18 So we did this really interesting way --

19 because, again, one of the objectives was like, okay,

20 we really want to understand the issues among voters,

21 right. But, okay, here is the thing about issues.

22 It's really tough because there's a lot of issues out 23 there. And another thing is, what issues are prevalent

24 at that time.

25 Perfect example, Roe v. Wade. Abortion

Page 53

1 So that multi-stage question we used, it 2 was -- allowed people to select as many issues as they

3 want at first. So we first started off with, all

4 right, what are all the things that you want to know

5 about, like what are they overall just curious about.

6 And then we require them to pick their top three issues

7 of what they want to know more about. So like, hey,

8 pick your top three. And then lastly, what's your

9 single most important issue, and this is kind of your

10 need to know. So want to know, want to know more, and

11 then, all right, this is $\ensuremath{\mathsf{my}}$ number one. And this one

12 I've got to know it, I've got to have it, I want to

13 hear about it.

14 So this allowed us to get a sense of what

15 people want to know about in general, so for -- when

16 picking your topics, everything else, we know about in

17 general, but then also what they want to know about

18 most. And we also broke this data down by likely

19 voters and likely primary voters from each party. And

20 this is truly unique, most surveys do not get this much 21 in detail, and we even took it one step further.

22 Besides the 50 buckets -- I'm like, okay, I

23 think we covered it all, but we even added an

24 open-ended section as well. So let's say there -- of

25 the 50, there was an issue that maybe we didn't grab or

1 put on there that would bubble up. You know, we'd put 2 that in there as well to make sure we captured it.

3 All right. Next slide.

So these were the -- so this next section
we're about to go through, these were the 12 categories
a respondent could choose issues from. Remember, these
are the 12 categories; each of them have subcategories.

8 Remember that previous example, like jobs and economy,

9 you have taxes, gas prices, inflation, et cetera. But 10 anyways, these are the 12 overall categories besides

11 their subcategories.

12 Next.

All right. So we'll start from the top of the cone, we'll work our way down. When asked to select any that apply, the top issue selected for

16 registered voters and likely voters were actually jobs 17 and economy, education, and healthcare were your top

18 three. When they're asking, hey, select all that apply

19 among these issues, where they ranked, but the top

20 three were jobs and economy, education, healthcare.

21 And you could probably even say at tier two there's

22 immigration and abortion, followed not too far away by

23 housing, government corruption and waste, and gun

 $\,$ 24 $\,$ policies and elections, elections is up there as well.

25 And the blue and yellow line basically

Page 56

Page 57

1 and third for likely voters.

2 So it's interesting. When we're talking

 $\ensuremath{\mathtt{3}}$ about some of these driving issues, abortion is going

 ${\tt 4}\,$ to be a pretty important issue and a very talked about

5 issue. It was already important last election, but

6 it's even more so now. And you notice there's a --

7 kind of a big drop with healthcare and education and

8 gun policies, housing compared to some of these --

9 those top three that we found.

10 Next slide.

11 So when we asked people about their single 12 most important issue, all right, what is the one that

13 you want to know about, and then -- and then the

14 question was phrased, finally, which is the most

15 important issue for you to know a candidate's position

16 when you are deciding how you will vote. Abortion and

17 immigration were actually tied in first, interesting,

18 because I would say those are kind of more social

19 issues, compared to jobs and economy, more fiscal

20 issues. Interesting how abortion and immigration, but

21 abortion kind of being driven a little bit more from

22 blue team side, where immigration kind of driven a

23 little bit more from the red team side. But then jobs

24 and economy, number three.

25 But you notice there some of these really

Page 55

1 delineate between blue is for likely voters, yellow is

2 for registered voters. And you're probably saying,

3 hey, there's not like a massive difference between the

4 red and blue. Well, you're right because -- if this

 ${\tt 5}\,$ was a midterm, I think you would see more of a change,

6 because with this election right now it's going to be

7 high turnout kind of no matter what we're seeing

8 because, again, it's a presidential year. So your

9 difference between your overall population and your

10 likely voters, remember, overall population, eight in

11 10 are going to be voting likely in this election. So

12 anyways, so you'll see some nuanced differences there.

13 Next.

14 All right. So top three. So when asked to

15 select your top three of these, registered voters 16 and -- registered voters and likely voters push

17 abortion to the top. So a good example of this -- of

18 why asking this and how the question is asked -- okay,

19 select all that apply. Yes, they're going to select a

20 lot of stuff. Okay. What are your top three, now, 21 respondents were asked. Abortion just pushed its

22 way -- it went from, what, fourth to now first.

23 Interesting. And primarily driven by females, by the

24 way, female demographics. And while jobs and economy

25 drops to second for registered voters and for the --

1 dropped off the list. Like, you know, when you have to

2 say, hey, pick one, like infrastructure, that drops

3 really far down on the list. Environment or public

4 safety, you know, when you're having to actually pick

5 with your -- you know, what's your main one, it's

 $\ensuremath{\text{6}}$ usually -- right now the two social issues are right up

7 there and then kind of your -- kind of more your needs $\,$

8 of jobs and economy and healthcare. So interesting.

9 But next slide. This gets fun.

10 All right. So registered voters and likely

11 voters have similar top issues; however, there's slight

12 variation in specifics. So I was showing kind of those

13 broad overall categories. Remember, we have those

14 subcategories. Well, interestingly, what were the top

ii baboacegories. Weir, interestingly, what were the top

 $15\,\,$ five amongst registered voters and likely voters. So

16 among registered voters it was immigration, but

17 specifically border security was number one. For

18 infrastructure, it was actually number two, but that's

19 broadband accessibility and cybersecurity. That was

20 number two. And then abortion, but whether the

21 candidate calls themselves pro-life or pro-choice. So

22 a candidate's position on abortion, very important to

23 Arizona's voting electorate. And then healthcare, but

24 more specific to drug addiction treatment programs.

25 And then jobs and economy, more specifically to taxes

1 than anything else. And that's among the registered 2 population.

But then when we look over at the likely 4 voters, you see a little bit of differencing in order

5 of prioritization. Yes, the top two are the same, but

6 for abortion it was laws regarding abortion access

7 compared to the candidate's stance. So, remember,

8 those folks that are potentially voting compared to the

9 ones that are definitely voting, you notice one wanted

10 to know more specifically regarding the policy compared 11 to, hey, probably more so of like, you know, maybe

12 overall where they're at on the issue, so they wanted

13 to know more pointedly where that was at. And then

14 jobs and economy among likely voters, state regulations

15 was actually a more important one. And then whether

16 the candidate calls themselves pro-life or pro-choice,

17 that actually was fifth in the numbers.

All right. Next slide. 18

19 COMMISSIONER MEYER: So, Mr. Chair, I have

20 another question.

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yes, Commissioner Meyer. 21

22 COMMISSIONER MEYER: So I'm trying to make

23 this data make sense. If I look at Slide 20, I see

24 infrastructure as the number two issue among these

25 voters. But if I go back to Slide 19, infrastructure

Page 60

1 by category for Democrats, and this is that -- their

2 most important issue, so them selecting one, Democrats

3 are concerned with abortion generally, but state

4 regulation, fraud/corruption are the next two, but then

5 a candidate calling themselves pro-life, pro-choice are

6 important individually to them as well.

So looking at just the 12 buckets that are

8 there -- remember, these are the 12 aggregated

9 buckets -- these are where they rank up. So abortion,

10 very much the most important issue among Democratic

11 voters in the state, and then healthcare, jobs and

12 economy, gun policies, number four, and then housing

13 and education, and then followed by environment.

And then when we look at their top ranking of 15 their top five, so what they're selecting individually,

16 so of the 50 options, jobs and economy or state

17 regulations was the highest individual one selected

18 among registered voters, and then government fraud and

19 corruption, abortion, whether a candidate calls

20 themselves pro-life, jobs and economy, so encouraging

21 businesses to come to Arizona, and then healthcare on

22 the behavioral and mental health programs were more

23 specific.

24 The next slide.

25 And this is one that -- and this is one that

Page 59

- 1 is at 2 percent and if I go back to Slide 18
- 2 infrastructure is at the bottom, although it looks like
- 3 it should maybe be second from the bottom at 7 percent.
- 4 So how does that data -- how does that shake out where
- 5 it polls so low on 18 and 19 and then it becomes the
- 6 second -- second-most-popular issue.

7 MR. NOBLE: That's a great question. I don't

8 have my sheets in front of me right now to deduce the

9 problem right there, but what I can do is look into it

10 and circle back with you all with an answer after this,

11 if that's all right.

12 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Sure.

MR. NOBLE: Yeah, but great question. And we 13 14 have a lot of data on these charts, but, yeah, I'll

15 look into that and come back to an answer with you,

16 because if not, I'd be -- I want to make sure I get you

18 COMMISSIONER MEYER: Yeah. And like the next

19 two slides as well I sort of have the same question. 20 MR. NOBLE: Yeah. No, definitely.

21 Absolutely.

17 the facts on it.

And there was one that -- so first off, this

23 next slide over here -- sorry, next. That one. All

24 right.

25 So Democrats are -- so looking at top issue Page 61

1 I have to look at afterwards, just a quick call out. 2 On the Rank 1, I'm almost positive that number is not a

3 hundred percent, because the highest of any one

4 selected was 70 percent between the three respective

5 parties. And so I just want to flag that. I wish I

6 would have caught that sooner. But I will be looking

7 at that one and make sure to get that updated, besides

8 looking at those previous slides.

9 So Republicans are concerned most with

10 immigration as a main topic; however,

11 broadband/accessibility/cybersecurity, border security,

12 and electric vehicle issues are important individually.

13 And so immigration, though, hands down number one.

14 Immigration we've seen last time, this time.

15 Immigration is the number one issue for Republicans.

16 Basically in the Republican primaries it's almost like

17 going to be a requirement that they have a border ad or

18 some border-type -- you know, tough on border security

19 issue or marketing material, because that is the

20 number one issue among Republicans driving them,

21 especially in the primaries, is immigration.

22 Number two is jobs and economy and then three is

23 abortion and then four is government waste --

24 corruption and waste. But you will predominantly hear

25 Republicans talk about immigration probably and then

Page 62 Page 64 1 mostly about jobs and the economy will probably be the 1 and where the map is for Democrats, they don't have a 2 top two. 2 lot of pickup opportunities and they need to hold the 3 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question. 3 current seats that they have, so Arizona is ground zero 4 MR. NOBLE: Yes. 4 for national. So the stuff we do in Arizona not only COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question. 5 affects us here directly, but I would argue that 6 Arizona has never been more important, their vote on 6 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Oh, yes, 7 these federal races. 7 Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: So this is about state Sorry, that's my -- I've looked at this stuff 9 a few times and, you know -- but it's crazy, yeah, 9 elections, correct? 10 MR. NOBLE: This is about -- for primary 10 Arizona is at its apex. So like the stuff we do -- so, 11 yeah, you're right, we have the statewides, sure, but, 11 statewide, yeah. 12 COMMISSIONER PATON: So it's not really a 12 you know -- okay, your statewides suffer, who's sitting 13 state -- it's a federal thing, immigration. 13 in the Oval Office or who's controlling the upper MR. NOBLE: Yeah, it's federal. 14 chamber in Washington, I think that's a pretty big 15 COMMISSIONER PATON: I mean, so what do they 15 deal. It's a pretty big responsibility. 16 want from these candidates? There's not much they can 16 So this next one, so on -- oh, lastly on the 17 do about immigration, I guess. 17 Republican one, just because of that one, because I MR. NOBLE: Yeah. I mean, on the U.S. Senate 18 caught it on the way here, was basically -- the 18 19 level, absolutely. 19 number one issue for them was immigration, border 20 COMMISSIONER PATON: Well, but I -- okay. So 20 security, it was like 70 percent of people, 21 it's about feds as well? 21 infrastructure, such as electric vehicles, charging 22 MR. NOBLE: Yeah. 22 stations, tax incentives was number two, abortion, 23 COMMISSIONER PATON: Okay. 23 whether the candidate calls himself pro-life, 24 pro-choice, education was teacher pay, and 24 MR. NOBLE: Well, everything that's going to 25 be on the ballot -- by the way, Arizona is arguably the 25 infrastructure, improving roads, bridges, utilities. Page 65 Page 63

1 most important state of the 50 states this year when it 2 comes to our elections coming up and what the national 3 implications are. Arizona is actually projected to be 4 number two in the country for most amount of political 5 broadcast dollars spent in the country, about 6 \$820 million, just behind California. And the only 7 reason California is ahead of us, their median market 8 is three times the price of our market to buy ads, and 9 they also have a U.S. Senate race. And given they're 10 one of the largest economies in the world, it's 11 basically like running a presidential race, and so 12 incredibly expensive. But Arizona is actually number two for 13 14 broadcast spend. Why? We're incredibly competitive. 15 Not only is the road to 270 likely to run through 16 Arizona, the map, Arizona is only one of four tossup 17 states on the presidential map since Florida has moved 18 a little bit to the right in recent years, and that has 19 moved that map to 270. Arizona may, in well fact, 20 actually decide who sits in the White House. Even with 21 as few electoral votes as we have, our 11, we actually $22\,$ will -- could actually decide who sits in that White 23 House.

And for U.S. Senate, with the balance of

25

25 power of the U.S. Senate 50/50 right now, it's tied,

2 it back to you all with all the other stuff that I owe 3 you. And then with independents now, so -- and by 5 the way, I'm going to say, independents, big air quotes 6 for independents, all right. Independents are -- they 7 are not truly independent. I would say that, based on 8 all the research we've done, it's about 32 percent of 9 Arizona's independent electorate are actually leaning 10 Republican and then there's about 27 percent that lean 11 Democrat. So roughly half of independents are actually 12 not really independents, they're actually a Republican 13 or a Democrat that just don't have the designation, but 14 they still lean to those respective parties. 15 So when you look at independents, or true 16 independents, I like to call them, it's basically 17 50 percent of that independent voting universe, or 18 roughly one sixth of the electorate. So true 19 independents, about 16, 18 percent of the total 20 electorate. But anyways, independents as a whole --21 just know that independents as a whole, they're not all 22 truly independent, so know that you have a quarter of 23 partisans and then actually half that are actually in 24 there.

1 But I will look at those and update the deck and send

Anyways, abortion is the most important issue

- $1\,$ category for independents; however, taxes and the
- 2 results of the 2020 election and drug addiction
- 3 treatment programs are topics of specific interest to
- 4 them. So that's pretty interesting. But you notice
- 5 that abortion, jobs and economy, much higher;
- 6 immigration lower among independents, but obviously
- 7 higher among the likely voting class. But when you
- 8 look at those direct more specific issues, results of
- 9 the 2020 election, that's important to voters. They
- 10 want to know about that, where people sit on that
- 11 issue. And then drug addiction treatment programs,
- 12 electric vehicle charging incentives, and then public
- 13 safety, body cameras for all departments of public
- 15 bareey, body camerab for all departments
- 14 safety officers, and then taxes.
- 15 Next.
- 16 All right. There's a lot of data there, got
- 17 to make it easier, right, so put it in here for ranking
- 18 of the items is that -- just to make it easier, so from
- 19 your left to right you've got your registered voters,
- 20 likely voters -- remember, not a big deviation between
- 21 the two -- and then you have your red team, blue team,
- 22 and then your, quote, unquote, independent team.
- 23 And so abortion and immigration may vary
- 24 between the first and second of their positioning;
- 25 however, jobs and economy remains third, and healthcare

Page 68

Page 69

- MR. NOBLE: I could -- I need to zip through
- 2 this. I have a -- I have a whole coordinated -- I have
- 3 a whole planning thing from noon to 5:00 today.
- $\ensuremath{\mathtt{4}}$ MR. COLLINS: Okay. Whatever you need to do,
- 5 is what I'm trying to say.
- 6 MR. NOBLE: I need to get through this.
- 7 And so -- sorry. Key issues. So this one,
- 8 policies in their own words, so we asked open-ended to
- 9 folks. And that Arizonans care most -- care about
- 10 water almost as much as other key issues. That just
- 11 wasn't one we had in our bucket, but, again, that's why
- 12 we have the open-ended question, for people to put it
- 13 into their own words.
- 14 And so when we did the count up of the values
- 15 -- so when asking them open-endedly, without giving
- 16 them 50 options and all this stuff to go through,
- 17 housing and rent was number one, economy, inflation
- 18 number two, border, immigration number three,
- 19 homelessness is number four, and then water, which is
- 20 crazy, water was right next there to taxes.
- 21 Interesting. Taxes is usually a more prevalent issue.
- 22 But when prompted to mention their primary concerns in
- 23 their own words, Arizonans predominantly mentioned
- 24 housing and economic issues, with border and
- 25 immigration being almost as important. But notably,

Page 67

- 1 is also a consistent issue, with gun policies,
- 2 government corruption, and housing varying between
- 3 demographic groups. So when you look at, hey, let's
- 4 list up our top five, this is where we're at with some
- 5 of the top issues.
- 6 All right. Next slide.
- 7 All right. Key takeaways here was that
- 8 abortion, jobs and economy, and immigration matter the
- 9 most to Arizona voters. So if you're going to pick
- $10\,\,$ your three, those appear to be your top three, but the
- $11\,$ top issue for each party varies. Immigration is the
- $12\,$ most important to Republicans and abortion is the most
- $13\,$ important to Democrats and independents, actually. And
- 14 so candidates who push messaging on the specific issues
- 15 selected with its broader category will fare well with
- 16 their respective electorates.
- 17 All right. Key issues.
- 18 Is it lunch yet? What are you ordering me,
- 19 Tommy?
- 20 MR. COLLINS: Well, I do want to -- do you --
- 21 THE COURT REPORTER: I'm okay. Thank you.
- 22 MR. COLLINS: I do want to make sure our
- 23 court reporter doesn't -- and if you do need to take a 24 break, with the Chairman's indulgence, we could do
- 25 that.

- 1 the common issue Arizonans mentioned that was not
- 2 included as an option in the key issues question is
- 3 water, with 78 mentions. And we do live in a desert,
- 4 so it makes sense.
- 5 Next slide, please.
 - So I was trying to show them, like water
- 7 issues, what were they saying in their own words, kind
- 8 of give a little demographic breakdown of their group
- 9 as well, so kind of give you a little -- so not just
- 10 hearing the words or the voice, seeing that, you know,
- 11 demographic persona to try to get an idea where this
- 12 person --
- 13 So a Maricopa County voter that was an
- 14 independent female, 65 years of age or older, said,
- 15 water shortage for the -- this area -- for this area in
- 16 the future. Can't afford all these big companies that
- $17\,\,$ need lots of water when they don't have enough for
- 18 people to use themselves. Her opinion.
- 19 In Yuma County, Democrat, male, younger age,
- 20 18 to 34, my area is an extremely hot climate, so it
- 21 will be one of the first hit and hardest by water
- 22 shortages. And then several others, yeah. One just, 23 water, water with it. So, anyways, water is an
- 24 important issue.
- 25 Next slide.

```
1 Immigration issues in respondents' own words,
2 probably stuff you expect. Immigration is out of
3 control and needs to be addressed immediately, that's
```

4 from a Republican, older male Republican down in Pima

5 County.

And then more of a middle-aged independent male in Maricopa County, immigration is the most

8 important thing in this country. It decides exactly

9 how we're going to live in the future.

And then a Mohave County Republican female
that's older mentioned that I want to know that they're
going to address border immigration for the safety of
our country.

14 Next slide.

15 All right. Housing and homelessness issues 16 in their own words is that housing costs are out of 17 control, forcing many people in the homeless category.

 $18\,\,$ We hear more about homeless encampments and then about

19 the costs or affordability of, you know, whether it's

20 $\,$ for an apartment or a home, and college graduates can't

21 afford to move out of their parents' homes.

22 Homelessness is increasing due to gap in pay versus

23 home costs. Home costs have risen well above normal

 $24\,$ inflation. Again, that person reads their news.

And so economy and inflation in their own

Page 72

Page 73

 $1\,$ you know, just as much as taxes, frankly, so pretty

2 important. So water, important issue to voters. And

3 then housing, rent, economic issues, and homelessness

4 matters to voters. And then national issues, such as

 ${\tt 5}$ $\,$ immigration, abortion, have a distinct local dimension

6 to Arizonans.

7 Next. We have two sections left and then 8 you're free.

9 All right. So we've got -- first we'll just 10 go through the regional breakdown and then we're going

11 to just chat about the -- finally, the right channels,12 so like messaging and where voters are getting their

13 information, the best way to kind of communicate with

14 them with that, and then we'll be wrapped up. But this

15 is the bulkier of this section.

16 So regional breakdown, we have six regions. 17 And I'm going to go a little quicker through this for

18 time sake. If you need me to slow down or go back, let

19 know. And so we broke Arizona down into six regions

20 using ZIP Code tabulation areas from the U.S. Census,

21 and here is what each region looked like and what key

22 issues came up in each.

23 So when we're talking about these, just kind

24 of give you a visualization, so we're talking north

25 Phoenix, the area that is encompassing that, so you

Page 71

1 words. Consumer/food prices being rather high, as well
2 as -- which is fueling higher inflation. So food cost

3 increase.

Wages, you know, wages not keeping up with inflation, another one from a Democrat female,

6 middle-aged, from Pima County said that.

7 And then gas prices are too high and hurting 8 everyone financially. Inflation is hurting everyone.

9 I ran this about a month or so ago. I hear 10 that we're about to hopefully cross and go under the \$3 11 threshold for gas.

12 COMMISSIONER PATON: In Tucson it is.

13 MR. NOBLE: Really?

14 COMMISSIONER PATON: Yeah.

MR. NOBLE: See, it's getting better.

16 So key takeaways on the open-ended portion is

17 that, when given a chance to write in a top issue,

18 Arizonans, for the most part, responded with issues

19 that were already included in the key issues questions,

20 so things we already kind of knew about; however,

21 again, that's the reason we ask it, we don't know

22 unequivocally or emphatically. So we caught one that 23 wasn't in that range of numbers -- or, range of options

24 given, so we wanted to make sure that we didn't miss

25 anything. So with water, which, again, was mentioned,

1 kind of have your Fountain Hills, Cave Creek, north

2 Scottsdale, part of your northeast urban -- suburban,

3 urban area of Phoenix.

4 And then south Phoenix, southeast Phoenix, so

5 kind of like -- basically took the Valley, broke it

 $\ensuremath{\mathsf{6}}$ into four parts. And again, making sure where you cut

7 some of those lines, because there's some affluency and

8 also demographic differences between, let's say, ethnic

9 populations as well. So I think we cut it probably

10 the -- probably the best way you can for four. So

11 north Phoenix, south Phoenix -- or, southeast or East

12 Valley, and then your west Phoenix. And then you've

13 got your Pima/Tucson area.

14 And frankly, rural, people ask me all the

15 time, well, what about northern rural, southern rural.16 In my experience, rural is kind of -- I don't really

io in my experience, ratar is kind or - radii c rearry

17 see much of a difference between northern and southern

18 rural. Geographic density matters most, not so much if

19 you're in the northern or southern part of the state.

20 If you're rural, that's what matters more, frankly.

21 So, anyways, our six regions, and they're all very

22 different.

23 All right. So top issue regarding them, so 24 starting from the top of the cone, what was their --

25 the most important issue for these candidates there.

1 So on these charts we're going to put that region, what

- 2 that number was on the region, so if that number is --
- 3 and this one in particular is in red for north Phoenix.
- 4 The yellow is registered voters, so that just gives
- 5 you, then, a comparison point so you can see like,
- 6 okay, is this above importance compared to the overall
- 7 electorate of the state or is it below importance, so
- 8 you can see which issues are driving outside the norm
- 9 of the electorate.
- 10 So abortion, more important here compared to
- 11 the overall electorate as a whole, but also
- 12 immigration. Jobs and economy, a little bit less
- 13 important compared to the electorate as a whole, and
- 14 followed by healthcare, education, and elections. But
- 15 mainly abortion, immigration, jobs and economy are the
- 15 mainly abortion, immigration, jobs and economy are th
- 16 top ones there.
- 17 Next slide.
- 18 You'll notice public safety is only 1 percent 19 over there.
- 20 So looking at this north Phoenix, the top
- 21 three needed. So when they picked their top three it
- 22 was abortion, whether the candidate calls himself
- 23 pro-life or pro-choice is going to be important for
- $24\,$ debates in that region. This is what the population
- 25 wanted to know about. Immigration, border security,

Page 76

- 1 south of the Valley. And then abortion, not as
- 2 important, a little less important than the electorate
- 3 as a whole. But also, education and housing, much more
- 4 important than the electorate as a whole, which --
- 5 again, these demographic or geographic differences,
- 6 again, very different compared to, let's say, north
- 7 Phoenix that we just looked at. So, again, very much
- 8 different issues that are driving them. These are more
- 9 pocketbook issues, less on the social issues.
- 10 Next.

11 Top three -- so back in 2022, gas prices was

12 number one. This time it's taxes, but still jobs and

13 economy. And then healthcare, that was number two back

14 in 2022, that's been replaced by abortion. And then in

15 south -- the folks in -- the voters in south Phoenix,

16 actually more curious about the laws regarding abortion

17 access, so more of the specifics on that. And

18 number three back in 2022 was education, more funding

19 for supplies and technology. It's still education, but

20 they're a little more concerned about teacher pay this

21 time around compared to the supplies and technology.

22 Next slide.

23 All right. Southeast Phoenix is a big area.

24 So southeast is kind of your Mesa, Chandler, Gilbert,

25 East Valley portion. It's pretty large. And so

Page 75

1 and jobs and economy more so on taxes.

2 And then compared -- how that compared to

3 2022, well, it changed a little bit. And this is why

 $4\,\,$ it's important we do this. It's not like these issues

5 stay monolithic in voters' minds is that -- remember,

 $\ensuremath{\mathsf{6}}$ jobs and economy was actually number one, and that was

7 gas prices. Remember, gas prices were going crazy at 8 that time. But now, you know, gas prices have gotten

9 better, but also abortion is still an outstanding

10 issue, right. So you notice where that -- where that

11 changed up. So abortion, very interesting, changing

12 that. Immigration is still number two, though, there,

 $13\,$ but then you also see that 2022 healthcare was higher

 $14\,$ up, and so, of course, affordability of prescription

15 drugs, which was talked about a lot during that

16 election, I think still talked about, because I still

17 don't think they've fixed it. They're close.

Next slide.

18

19 So, again, you see a little bit of a change.

20 So southeast Phoenix -- or, southeast -- south

21 Phoenix -- so south Phoenix, so this group, jobs and

22 economy is the most dominant or most important one.

23 You see it greatly outperforms the electorate as a

24 whole by about 4 whole percentage points. So jobs and

25 economy, much more important to the south Phoenix or

Page 77

1 basically what we have here is that -- immigration,

2 number one. So with this southeast Phoenix metro area,

3 immigration, number one, about 6 points higher than the

4 electorate as a whole. Abortion, about on par with the

5 state's electorate. Jobs and economy, same thing, and

6 not many changes there. Actually, housing was less of

7 an issue for the southeast Phoenix folks compared to

 $\ensuremath{\mathtt{8}}$ the electorate as a whole, so they're not feeling that

9 pain point as much or it's not as much of a concern to

10 them. But you can kind of see social issues really

11 driving that southeast Phoenix region, which is

12 interesting.

13 Next slide.

14 All right. Top three of needed topics. Last

15 time it was jobs and economy, gas prices; this time,

16 immigration, border security. Last time it was

17 education at number two for teacher pay; this time it's

18 abortion, whether the candidate calls him or herself

19 pro-life or pro-choice. And then finally, healthcare

20 was number three back in 2022, affordability of

21 prescription drugs; this time replaced with jobs and

22 economy and gas price. So a bit of changing of the

23 issues, a little bit of ordering of -- difference in

24 priorities.

25 Next.

West Phoenix. All right. This is our third 1 that environment clocks in at is actually this region 2 or fourth one. We're almost there. And top issue with 3 west Phoenix, so this is the whole West Valley area, so 4 you've got your Glendale, Peoria, you know, Surprise, 5 Sun City, Avondale, Glendale, so your whole West Valley 6 area. And basically, immigration, number one there, a 7 little bit higher than the electorate as a whole. 8 Abortion, but a little less than the electorate as a 9 whole, a few points under. But jobs and economy, a 10 little bit higher up. But healthcare and, what I 11 thought was very interesting, gun policies. I thought, 12 of the specific regions, the West Valley actually 13 scored the highest of gun policies compared to the 14 other regions. I know it's very suburban over there in 15 that West Valley, so interesting. Education, again, 16 not many other big differences from the electorate as a 17 whole. 18 Top three, next slide. 19 So last time it was jobs and economy and gas 20 prices was the top issue; this time, move over jobs and 21 economy, gas prices, say hello to immigration and 21 22 border security. And then last time it was healthcare, 22 23 affordability of prescription drugs; this time it was

Page 80

2 compared to the other five regions. Probably not as 3 big of a surprise. 4 Next slide. Again, just demographics, you know, how old a 6 population is, what's their ethnicity, what's their 7 country of origin, education level, you know, how --8 you know, college educated, non-college educated. I 9 mean, it makes a difference with these demographic 10 groups that -- they will have different priorities. So, looking at their top three, last time it 12 was jobs and economy, gas prices was number one for 13 them; this time, move over, hello abortion, and they're 14 more specifically interested in the laws regarding 15 abortion access. Number two was healthcare back in 16 2022, but now it's immigration, specifically border 17 security. And then this time, education -- or, last 18 time was education, teacher pay; this time was more 19 jobs and economy specific to unemployment, taxes, 20 minimum wage, and gas prices. So next slide. Rural. So rural is 13 of our 15 counties in 23 the state, but they make up roughly 24, 25 percent of

Page 79

1 teacher pay; this time, jobs and economy and taxes. 2 So, again, kind of a swapping out of the 3 things that were really important during COVID. You 4 know, COVID, you had a, what, a hundred-year pandemic 5 going on, and then you also had, oh, wait, we shut down 6 the economy, which I can't -- I don't -- that hasn't 7 happened in my lifetime. I didn't know you could do 8 that. And so when you had those two things going, 9 those were obviously very much driving those issues at 10 that point. It's been a few years since that's 11 happened, and people are kind of normalizing. So when 12 things get normal on certain ones, other issues take 13 their place, as we're seeing. 14 Next slide. 15 So, all right, Pima and Tucson area. As you 16 can expect -- and by the way, Pima/Tucson, of the 17 regions -- of all the regions we have, that's the most, 18 I'd say, Democrat or left-leaning of the six regions, 19 and knowing that composition a little bit explains a 20 little bit more why they picked their issue choice they 21 did. They had abortion, actually, as number one for 22 their issues. Immigration, number two. Jobs and 23 economy, number three. And then healthcare, 24 number four, with gun policies and then environment at

24 abortion, whether the candidate calls himself pro-life,

25 pro-choice. And then last time it was education,

Page 81

1 of the group. But this group typically leans a little

25 geographic area. They're about 25 percent of the size

24 our total electorate and like 80 percent of our

2 different. And so basically abortion was actually --

3 they were right on par with the state as a whole with

4 abortion. Immigration, a little more important. Jobs

5 and economy, more important to this group, but also

6 healthcare did strong. But what was interesting,

7 compared to some of the others, government corruption

8 and waste clocked in stronger here compared to the

9 other regions. And then also housing, a bit of an

10 issue as well.

11 Next slide. All right. Top three. Last time in that 13 area, jobs and economy, gas prices; this time, abortion 14 still leading the charge. And again, when that -- when 15 they select that option, whether the candidate calls 16 themself pro-life or pro-choice. Again, they could 17 lean either way on that issue, but, again, that's 18 something these voters really want to know about, about 19 where these candidates stand. And then healthcare, 20 last time it was affordability of prescription drugs; 21 this time, immigration, border security. And then last

22 time, immigration, border security, swapped out with

23 jobs and economy, gas prices. So, again, you see a bit

24 of a reordering there, basically the dropoff of the

25 COVID items, and you see these social issues,

25 six, which, by the way, I think that is the highest

1 immigration and abortion, but still economy remains 2 present.

3 Next slide.

4 So we went through a ton of stuff. All 5 right. Just to show it kind of more easily with the

6 rankings. Voters across Arizona are generally on the

7 same page when it comes to the top issues, probably no

8 surprise there, but abortion and immigration are

9 interchangeable for the top two, while jobs and economy

10 remain third among all regions. So jobs and economy

11 very much so, but that's where it kind of gets

12 interesting or changes is, again, especially when we

13 look at the fourth or fifth issues of the stuff that is

14 more nuanced to these regional localities.

15 So I think it gives the Commission a great 16 capability to customize their debate formats, to have

17 relevant questions to their audiences, to really get to

18 what these voters want to know about from these

19 candidates, and then for you all to be able to deliver

20 those answers to basically make sure we have a very

21 educated electorate and they know what they want to

22 know.

Next.

24 All right. Key takeaways. Voters across

25 Arizona are, broadly speaking, interested in the same

Page 84

Page 85

1 My favorite section, right channels. Who
2 here thinks that broadcast television is dead? Oh,
3 dang it, there's the result. It's okay. Who all
4 thinks that broadcast is dead or people don't watch TV
5 anymore? Anyone? At least three of you in this room
6 probably believe that, statistically speaking. Okay.
7 We won't put any on the record. All right. Fine.
8 Anyways, right channels, where people are watching the
9 news and hearing debate.
10 Next slide.
11 So there's a lot of this stuff you'll hear,
12 people -- okay, hey, I got -- I got TiVo or whatever,
13 so I can just -- you know, I just, you know, zoom
14 through the ads and this, this, that, and the other.

14 through the ads and this, this, that, and the other

15 Okay. Debate all you want. So the top news sources 16 where Arizona voters are getting their information, the

17 majority of Arizona voters, six in 10, still get their

18 news from television. So broadcast -- there's all

19 these other communication forms, right, they're all

20 effective. Still the number -- the strongest right now

21 or most effective is still television. So when it

22 comes to moving the needle, broadcast is still king.

 $23\,$ So television, number one, six in 10, so most voters

24 get it from television. But then you see that social

25 media and other online sources and official election

Page 83

18

 $1\,$ set of issues, abortion, immigration, jobs and economy,

2 but again, there's some nuanced differences there, but

3 immigration has become a top issue for Arizona voters

4 in 2023 compared to 2022.

5 Side note on that. So that's what we saw.

6 When like COVID made landfall, we saw -- like

7 immigration, before COVID made landfall in Arizona, one

8 out of every three Arizona voters said that was their

 $\, 9 \,$ most important issue in the state, one out of every

10 three. COVID made landfall, you saw that number drop

11 like a rock and you saw healthcare come up as more

 $12\,$ important because, again, we were dealing with a

13 hundred-year pandemic, so healthcare became, obviously,

14 much more of a priority. So, but as -- once we'd

15 gotten through the COVID portion, you notice that the

16 immigration issue not only has risen up, but is

17 currently one of the most important issues in the

18 state.

19 So targeting regions with messaging on their 20 respective specific issues, especially when we get into

21 the nuances within its category, would be advantageous

 $22\,\,$ not only for candidates, but also for debates because,

 $23\,$ last I checked, right message, right audience, that

25 Next slide.

 $1\,$ materials come the closest to television.

2 So if you basically look at it, television is

3 tier one, tier two would be your social media, your

4 Facebook, Twitter, you TikTockers in this room, and

5 then other online sources. Again, online sources are

6 all the myriad of news outlets and everything else that

 $7\,\,$ folks are able to get to online. But what's also

8 interesting in that tier two is, official election $\,$

9 materials in the mail or online, so such as voter

10 guides, state or county websites, so important places $\,$

11 where voters seek that news.

12 And then kind of your tier three is your 13 friends and family so a bit of your word of mouth

13 friends and family, so a bit of your word of mouth or 14 your social circles, and then streaming services like

15 Hulu or YouTube, and then radio, newspapers, and then

16 2 percent apparently get it somewhere else.
17 COMMISSIONER PATON: Osmosis.

MR. NOBLE: Yeah, it just comes to them.

19 So anyways, so there's that, but it gets more 20 interesting. Next slide.

21 So news media consumption by party. As much

22 as these parties like are at each other's throat,

23 they're not that different overall when it comes to

24 news media consumption, their behaviors. So news media

25 consumption does not vary much by party, but the

24 will put you in a really good position.

1 ordering of the options remain the same, there's just a

- 2 couple small nuanced differences. Arizonans, broken
- 3 down by party, get their news mostly from the same
- 4 sources, but deviate only in the radio and newspaper
- 5 category. You notice in the radio category Republicans
- 5 category. Tod notice in the radio category Republican
- 6 are more apt to consume their news or media through 7 radio than Democrats. And then it's the inverse of
- 8 that for newspapers, where Democrats are more likely to
- 9 get their information from a newspaper than
- 10 Republicans. But overall they're very much the same as
- 11 it comes to their -- where they consume their media.
- 12 So they've been pretty hyperpolarized on a lot of
- 13 stuff, but not too much on their news consumption
- 14 outside of the newspaper and radio deviation.
- 15 Next slide.

16 All right. I guess the million-dollar

17 question here, how should -- what are the various ways

- 18 that campaigns can communicate with voters, please
- 19 indicate which of the methods you most often use to
- 20 learn more about candidates. So these are all these
- 21 ways that candidates go and want to hear about voters,
- 22 right. Well, so we asked them -- we were asking these
- 23 voters like, okay, so instead of you just being -- you
- 24 know, all this stuff coming to you like, hey, how do
- 25 you -- how do you indicate that -- what methods you

Page 88

1 down.

Apparently, and this might be a sign of our

3 current society, the last way they want to be contacted

4 is via telephone call. I know, things have changed. I

5 love talking to people, as you can hear. And so via

6 telephone call, look at that, last one is speaking to

7 the volunteer, poor volunteer, 6 percent. Anyways, so

8 we look through that -- around that.

So anyways, so how they want to be contacted,

10 we were able to find out the best modes or ways that

11 are more effective than others.

12 Next.

13 And then the top 10 campaign contact methods

14 broken down by party, so this is just looking at the

15 same thing, we're just looking at it by Ds and Rs is

16 that -- it remains pretty consistent with the greater

17 electorate. Partisans receive messaging from campaigns

18 similar to the broader electorate. Conversations with

19 friends dropped down in ordering when broken down by 20 party. And the magnitudes of television and debate

20 Falor: 12m and magnitudes of objection and debate

 $21\,\,$ remain as strong for partisans as they are for the

22 general electorate.

23 But this was a question we kind of had going

24 into it is that, you know, hey, the communication app,

25 does that differ between the partisans, you know, like

Page 87

1 prefer to learn about these candidates.

Well, the top two were being on television,

3 57 percent, basically tied with that or statistically

4 tied with that is watching a candidate debate, hands

5 down the two. So imagine if they were watching a

 $\ensuremath{\text{6}}$ candidate debate on television, that would be like the

7 ultimate. And I feel like you guys might be doing

8 something like that coming up here this year. And

9 again, we didn't know the data results prior to this,

10 $\,$ right, so that decision -- that stuff was already, you

11 know, done and in the rearview mirror. So to see these

12 results, to see that decision, I think -- what, the

13 broadcasters, right. And so anyways, not bad. So

14 anyways, a debate on television? Oh, my gosh. That

15 would be almost like the thing voters would love to

is would be almost like the thing voters would love to

 $16\,\,$ know and probably the most educational thing for them.

17 Anyways, and then next down on the list is 18 like conversations with family, conversations with

19 friends, but also a physical piece of mail. You know

20 all those people that talk about, oh, the mail. Yeah,

21 no one reads those. They just go right in the trash.

22 Okay. Well, I don't know, we hear from voters,

23 25 percent, it actually ranks number five on the more

24 effective ways they want to be communicated with. And

25 then you have newspaper, radio, some of these others on

Page 89

1 what impacts does being a partisan -- what does that

2 have and is there a bigger difference in the

3 communication. Again, not so much, overall pretty

4 similar, just some small nuanced differences.

5 Next slide.

All right. Key takeaways. I don't care what

7 people tell you, television still dominates, not only

8 through this data, but plenty of other data out there.

9 Also, the majority of spending in Arizona will be on

7 A150, the majority of spending in Alizona will be on

10 broadcast, and broadcast still is very dominant and TV

11 is very dominant, you know, for news and campaigns
12 alike. So this trend remains true for Republicans and

13 independents alike as well.

14 And then other mediums are on the rise,

15 particularly online sources, word of mouth and print,

16 but it's increasingly important to create debates that

17 can work on TV, but also are going to reach people on

18 social media, streaming services, and other online

19 sources. You know, if they're not able to tune in at

20 that time, you know, being able to, you know, let's say

21 have it on YouTube. Having a live stream or something

22 where they can go pull it up after the fact I think

23 will help increase reach and penetration and overall

24 impact for your objectives.

25 Last slide.

Page 90 Page 92 Sorry. I'm good now, but I just had a -- you 1 incredibly detailed and really fascinating insights 2 into Arizona voters. I think it's going to be helpful 2 know, there was a cold going around a few weeks ago, so 3 I just have the residuals. I have identical twin boys 3 with the debates. I think the way you framed it was 4 that are 4 and a 1-year-old, so that could be something 4 important for us, so thank you. 5 to do it with it as well. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yeah, it's going to be very But key takeaways and actionable insights, 6 useful for us. 7 based off everything we went through, it was a lot of 7 Any other questions or comments from 8 information, I know I'm going to have some follow-up 8 Commissioners? 9 with you all after this, and I'll be available to 9 (No response.) 10 answer any of that, but our big key takeaways and 10 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Mike, thank you very much. 11 actionable insights are Arizonans are restless and 11 We appreciate your time and all the work you've put 12 ready to vote. So get ready, they're chomping at the 12 into this --13 bit, they're hungry for information, and they're going 13 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question. 14 to be coming out in droves, so let's meet that demand. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: -- and I'm sure we'll have 15 And abortion, jobs and economy, and immigration matter 15 some more feedback for you. 16 the most to Arizona voters. And then national issues, 16 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question. 17 such as immigration and abortion, have a distinct local 17 MR. COLLINS: We have one more question. 18 dimension to Arizonans. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Oh, we do? Who? 18 19 But a debate that lets candidates contrast 19 COMMISSIONER PATON: I have a question. 20 their ideas and showcase their character would benefit 20 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Who is that, 21 the electorate, especially if it was on TV. But 21 Commissioner Paton? 22 candidates who push messaging on specific issues 22 COMMISSIONER PATON: Yes. 23 selected within its broader category will fare well 23 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. 24 with their respective electorates, you know, by party COMMISSIONER PATON: So you said half the 24 25 and region. And it's increasingly important to create 25 independents don't really lean one way or the other. Page 93 Page 91 1 debates that can work on TV, but also can reach people MR. NOBLE: Yes. 2 on social media, streaming services, and other online COMMISSIONER PATON: What really -- is there 2 3 something in general that scratches their itch, I 3 sources. And most importantly, next slide, it's the 4 4 guess? 5 most important slide, thank you. MR. NOBLE: Gotcha. You know what? That's a And then there's methodology, stuff like 6 great question. I think I will put that down on one of 7 that, if you guys are interested in that. Anyways, how 7 my follow-up items to grab it. Because that's the 8 did we do? 8 thing is that when we go through, let's not kid 9 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Very good. Thank you, 9 ourself, it's a lot of data. We had a lot of 10 Mike. Very comprehensive. I know that you're going to 10 information that we had to concise down for you all. 11 get back to us with several questions that 11 And I think we can go and actually just give -- we'll 12 Commissioners asked. 12 actually get a couple slides broken out and probably 13 just do -- probably just in a grid format, just make it 13 Are there any other questions that Members of 14 the Commission have? 14 easier. We can just do that where we have true 15 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman. 15 independents, as I like to call it, so basically show, COMMISSIONER MEYER: Mr. Chairman. 16 you know, yes, you have your independents, the data 16 17 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Go ahead, 17 you've already seen, but I think you could have one 18 Commissioner Meyer. 18 specifically among that 50 percent, right, or the ones 19 COMMISSIONER MEYER: No further questions, 19 that don't lean ideologically to the left or to the 20 but thank you. Really fascinating information. Much 20 right. So we can break that down for you. 21 appreciated. Really great job. Thank you. 21 COMMISSIONER PATON: Like maybe they're 22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Yeah, I agree. 22 socially a little bit liberal, but conservative 23 Commissioner Chan. 23 economic-wise, you know, like is that a big majority of COMMISSIONER CHAN: That was what I was going 24 those 50 percent?

25

25 to say as well is just thank you to Mr. Noble for the

MR. NOBLE: My experience has been -- I mean,

1 I'll get you results. But $\mathfrak{m} y$ experience has been, with

2 that group, true independents, they're a mix between --

3 I'd say overall they're usually more like bottom line

4 driven, like things that affect them directly, so I

5 would say like housing affordability or, you know,

6 economic issues, things that kind of more directly

7 affect their livelihood. They're usually not as

8 concerned about social issues because they're, again,

9 not as caught up in the partisan sides. You know,

10 partisans are pretty -- they'll die on the hill for

11 their issues.

12 And also, they seem to just be a little bit

13 more moderate in general, like -- how do I say this a

14 nice way? They just seem much more sane compared to

15 the red team or blue team, basically, is the difference

16 between the two. They seem -- like I guess a better

17 word, they seem very normal. I don't know another way

18 to say it. But, yeah, they just seem a little bit more

18 to say it. But, year, they just seem a little bit more

19 normal on there.

20 And I will say that too is that we have two

21 more of these surveys coming up, and so we have

22 stuff -- again, doing this is that -- we're huge on

23 feedback, stuff like that. So, again, any input or

 $24\,$ items. So, again, I know there was a question asked

25 earlier today, if we asked a specific question, I think

Page 96

MR. NOBLE: Great question. I get that one a

 $2\,$ lot in the last few years, which is good. That means

3 it's at the top of mind, it's important. And so -- all

4 right. Well, two answers to that.

First answer is, on the next survey all we've

 $\ensuremath{\mathrm{G}}$ got to do is ask one simple question, how long have you

7 resided in Arizona, have you been here less than a

8 year, less than two years, three years, you know, has

9 it been five, 10 years, or you could be like my wife,

10 an Arizona native, right. You know, so like that

10 all All Zolia Hactive, Tight. Tou Mow, so like that

11 length of residency, literally we could just ask one

12 question on the next survey and you could actually ${\hbox{\scriptsize --}}$

13 you could actually get a glimpse into that.

But what I could tell you based on data,

15 other surveys -- all right. There's two things. One,

16 it's a common question asked because -- you're not

17 wrong, there are a lot of Californians moving here. So

18 the census -- the census only gets down to what states

19 they're either exiting or entering, right, but they

20 don't get down to like from where in the state you're

21 coming from.

22 So we saw the biggest exodus from California.

23 The main states they're going to are Texas, Nevada,

24 Arizona, Utah, and, interestingly, Oregon, number five,

25 are the main states they're going to. But Arizona has

Page 95

1 it was regarding -- it was voting, I know it was

2 regarding voting, whether it was like they cast

3 their ballot -- it happened in the beginning of the --

COMMISSIONER PATON: The primaries.

5 MR. NOBLE: The primaries, correct,

6 independents voting in the primaries, right. So but

7 like certain questions like -- if there's certain

 ${\tt 8}\$ specific issues, when asked about like maybe particular

9 things, like drilling down more on abortion or some of

10 these other issues -- anyways, we still have two more,

11 $\,$ and we could easily adjust, as long as it makes sense $\,$

12 in the script logic and survey format. Anyways, great,

13 because, again, we want to tailor this as we go and not

14 just make this model --

15 COMMISSIONER PATON: And I have a question

16 also --

21

17 MR. NOBLE: Yes.

18 COMMISSIONER PATON: -- about the people that

19 are coming here from out of state.

20 MR. NOBLE: Oh, yeah.

COMMISSIONER PATON: What -- do we have an

22 idea of what they generally think when they come here?

23 Are they bringing -- are conservatives coming here,

24 fleeing the coast, or are they people that are, you

25 know, not ideological or what do you think?

Page 97

1 just as much intake in the last, you know, like five

 $2\,\,$ years or whatever from the West Coast and East Coast as

3 they have from the Midwest, which I'm from Wisconsin $\,$

4 originally, so I'm one of those Midwesterners. So

5 anyway, so we actually have just as much from each.
6 And so the things we don't know is that --

7 people know that, yes, we are getting a lot of intake.

8 There's a lot of folks that, because of cost of living,

9 also with COVID, this whole remote working, especially

10 among white collar jobs where you can remote in,

11 compared to jobs you have to show up for -- and so,

12 yes, we have those folks here, and I think that's a

13 sense among a lot of Arizonans, and the fact is we

14 don't -- no one can tell you yes or no unequivocally

15 because we don't know where they're coming from in

16 California.

17

Because people go, oh, there's Californians

18 coming in. And I go, okay, are they coming from urban,

19 are they coming from L.A., or are they coming from, you

20 know, the rural part of California. Because I would
21 bet you, if they're coming from the rural part, they're

22 probably Republican. I bet you if they're coming from

23 an urban part, they're more likely to be Democrat.

24 So the reality is, we don't frankly -- the

25 data is not there. It's not granular enough to know

```
1 that. We get just as much from each -- but what I can
2 tell you, everyone keeps saying Arizona is -- you know,
3 because of all these Californians, Arizona is now very
```

4 blue. Well, if that's the case, in our public opinion

5 polling and stuff we do, why does Arizona still lean to

 $\ensuremath{\text{6}}$ the right? Like if all these Californians and all this

7 stuff was happening, right, like wouldn't -- why would 8 the electorate be leaning towards Republicans and not

9 Democrats?

10 You know, and so -- and so based on the 11 information that I've seen or know, basically I think 12 it's fear or a feeling, but I just don't think it's 13 substantiated. And I think it's actually more likely

14 there's actually a little bit more -- it's not as

15 overblown. If it is, it's like maybe a slight more

16 folks on the left, compared to the right, moving in.

17 But I honestly don't think --

And frankly, also too what you see from the research is that these folks that now have the option

 $20\,\,$ to work in whatever states that they want to, right,

21 they're not going -- moving to states that they

22 don't -- you know, a lot of them are moving to states

23 they ideologically agree with. Like, for example,

24 these Californians -- okay. I get Texas, I get Nevada,

25 I get Utah, I get Arizona, I get why they're moving

Page 100

1 highlight some key points, and he'll be available to 2 answer any questions that we have.

3 Mike.

4 MR. BECKER: Mr. Chairman, Commissioners, 5 thank you. I won't take a lot of your time. As you

6 said, before you is the proposed 2024 calendar year

7 budget. Couple areas I do want to make sure you're

8 aware of.

9 One, the funding cap has increased for 2024.

10 It's gone up roughly \$140,000, so that's a good sign

11 for us. Secondly, in terms of revenue for the

12 Commission, compared to where we were last year, we are

13 down a slight tick in revenue; however, I do anticipate

14 December being a good month in terms of revenue, so I

15 see us hitting our marks that we actually put in the

16 budget for 2023. So I think we're in a good stance

17 there.

18 However, as you can see in the proposal, we 19 do have the revenue projections low, roughly \$5 million

 $20\,\,$ from the 10 percent surcharge. The trend has been for

21 the revenue to be going down every year, so I wanted to

22 make sure we were conservative in that area. Hopefully

23 we will hit that and exceed it, as we are doing this 24 year. But, again, I wanted to make sure we were

25 conservative in that area.

Page 99

1 there, but why the heck are they moving to Oregon?

2 Oregon is very different. Oregon, policy-wise, for

3 folks that maybe like those type of policies, Oregon

 $4\,\,$ probably seems like a really great state that you'd

5 want to live in.

6 So anyways, that's my long answer to that, 7 but it's a fascinating topic, but I think we can get a

8 little insight on it on the next survey by just adding

9 that one question, because I think that would tease 10 some of that out.

11 COMMISSIONER PATON: Thanks.

12 MR. NOBLE: Yep.

13 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Any other questions or

14 comments from Commissioners?

15 (No response.)

16 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thanks again, Mike.

17 If we have no further discussion, we'll move 18 on to the next item on our Agenda, Item V, discussion

19 and possible action on the annual budgetary

20 calculations and 2024 spending plan.

21 Every year the Commission considers a

22 calendar year budget and must approve certain

23 calculations required by law. The memo in your

 $24\,$ materials in Item VII outlines those calculations and

25 the staff's plan for 2023. Mike Becker is going to

Page 101

1 Lastly, I want to point out, as you can see

 $2\,$ on the memo on the second page, we do have an area

3 referencing the Prop 211, the Voters' Right to Know

4 Act. That -- passage of that Act created a 1 percent

5 surcharge on civil and criminal penalties. That

 ${\bf 6}\ {\bf 1}$ percent surcharge has gone into effect at the

 $7\,$ beginning of 2023, and as of November 1st we do have

 $8\ \$238,472$ in that fund that would be -- that will be

9 available to use going into 2024 to offset any costs we

10 have for, whether it's with the Secretary of State's

11 creation of the -- their campaign finance site to allow

12 those using Prop 211 and have to -- required by law to

13 post their information, or whether it's going to be

 $14\,\,$ used for lawsuits or whatever. We do have that funding

15 available.

19

21

16 Those are the areas that I really wanted to

17 point out and make sure you're aware of and I'm happy

18 to answer any questions.

CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you, Mike.

20 Any questions from Members of the Commission?

(No response.)

22 CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Hearing none, is there a

23 motion to approve the memorandum in Item VII?

24 COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move that

25 we approve the memorandum in Item VII.

	inscript or Froceedings / Fublic Meeting	- 404		
	Page 102		Page 104	
1	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you,	1	public. Action taken as a result of public comment	
2	Commissioner Chan.	2	will be limited to directing staff to study the matter	
3	Is there a second?	3	or rescheduling the matter for further consideration	
4	COMMISSIONER PATON: I second.	4	and decision at a later date or responding to	
5	COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second.	5	criticism. Please limit your comment to no more than	
6	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: I think that was	6	two minutes.	
7	Commissioner Paton, second.	7	Does any member of the public wish to make	
8	It's been moved and seconded that we approve	8	comments at this time?	
9	the memorandum in Item VII. I'll call the roll.	9	(No response.)	
10	Commissioner Chan.	10	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Cathy and Paula, does	
11	COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.	11	anyone on Zoom want to make a comment? I don't see	
12	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.	12	anyone.	
13	COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.	13	MS. HERRING: There are no more members of	
14	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.	14	the public on the Zoom.	
15	COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.	15	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.	
16	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.	16	The public may also send comments to the	
17	It's approved 4-to-nothing.	17	Commission by e-mail at ccec@azcleanelections.gov.	
18	Thank you, Mike.	18	Item IX I think Item VIII, actually. At	
19	MR. BECKER: Thank you.	19	this time I would entertain a motion to adjourn.	
20	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Item VI, discussion and	20	COMMISSIONER PATON: I would make a motion to	
21		21		
	through March 2024. Commissioners, you all should have	22	COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second.	
	had a chance to review the dates Paula has proposed.	23	CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Motion to	
	Unless there's any discussion, I will entertain a	24	adjourn made by Commissioner Paton, seconded by	
25	motion and a second to approve the meeting dates of	25	Commissioner Meyer.	
		l .		
	Page 103		Page 105	
1	Page 103 January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse	1	Page 105 I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan.	
1 2	_	1 2		
	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse		I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan.	
2	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those	2	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye.	
2 3	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates?	2	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer.	
2 3 4	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we	2 3 4	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.	
2 3 4 5	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates.	2 3 4 5	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.	
2 3 4 5 6	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you.	2 3 4 5 6	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.	
2 3 4 5 6 7	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second?	2 3 4 5 6 7	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th. I'll call the roll. Commissioner Chan.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th. I'll call the roll. Commissioner Chan.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th. I'll call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th. I'll call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th. I'll call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th. I'll call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th. I'll call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The meeting dates are approved 4-to-nothing.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. COMMISSIONER MEYER: I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th. I'll call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The meeting dates are approved 4-to-nothing. Item VII, public comment. This is the time	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	January 25th, February 29th, and March 29th excuse me March 28th. Is there a motion to approve those three meeting dates? COMMISSIONER CHAN: Mr. Chairman, I move we approve the three meeting dates. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Thank you. Is there a second? COMMISSIONER PATON: This is Paton. I'll second. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Okay. I think I heard Commissioner Meyer second. So it's been moved by Commissioner Chan, seconded by Commissioner Meyer that we approve the meeting dates of January 25th, February 29th, and March 28th. I'll call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. The meeting dates are approved 4-to-nothing.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	I will call the roll. Commissioner Chan. COMMISSIONER CHAN: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Meyer. COMMISSIONER MEYER: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Commissioner Paton. COMMISSIONER PATON: Aye. CHAIRMAN KIMBLE: Chair votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you very much and happy seasons to all of you.	

```
Transcript of Proceedings / Public Meeting
                                                                                                                 106
                                                Page 106
 1 STATE OF ARIZONA )
                     ) ss.
 2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA )
            BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings
 5 were taken by me; that I was then and there a Certified
 6 Reporter of the State of Arizona; that the proceedings
 7 were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter
 8 transcribed into typewriting under my direction; that
 9 the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate
10 transcript of all proceedings had and adduced upon the
11 taking of said proceedings, all to the best of my skill
12 and ability.
14
             I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related
15 to nor employed by any of the parties hereto nor am I
16 in any way interested in the outcome hereof.
17
1.8
             DATED at Tempe, Arizona, this 17th day of
19 December, 2023.
20
21
22
23
                       Kathryn A. Blackwelder, RPR
                       Certified Reporter #50666
24
25
```

\$	2	4	79.8 35:22
\$10- 20:2	2 9:1 59:1 85:16	4 75:24 90:4	8
\$140,000 100:10	20 31:14,18 34:6 45:3	4-to-nothing 102:17	80 80:24
\$20-a-month 20:2	58:23	103:23	81 41:15
\$238,472 101:8	2008 19:18	400-sample 29:6	
\$25,000 9:23	2012 16:15	41 42:25	Α
\$3 71:10	2020 66:2,9	48 41:8	a.m. 105:10
\$5 19:22 100:19	2022 23:16 45:24 46:1, 10,21 75:3,13 76:11,14,	5	abbreviate 35:2
\$5- 20:2	18 77:20 80:16 83:4	-	abbreviations 35:9
\$820 63:6	2023 83:4 99:25 100:16 101:7	5 33:4 40:13,14 47:1 5'8" 24:20	ability 19:9 20:6 36:19 39:3,4
1	2024 35:16,17 99:20 100:6,9 101:9 102:22	50 26:16 33:19 52:15 53:22,25 60:16 63:1 65:17 68:16 93:18,24	abortion 32:12 51:25 52:11 54:22 55:17,21 56:3,16,20,21 57:20,2
1 25:15 61:2 74:18			
101:4,6	21 46:24	50/50 63:25	58:6 60:3,9,19 61:23 64:22 65:25 66:5,23
1,000 28:20	211 5:11 9:5,9,12 10:2,9 13:13 101:3,12	501(c)(4)s 10:4	67:8,12 72:5 74:10,15
1,665 28:22 29:1	24 80:23	52 42:25	22 75:9,11 76:1,14,16 77:4,18 78:8,24 79:21
1-year-old 90:4	24/7 15:4	54 40:6	80:13,15 81:2,4,13
10 15:14 31:18 32:15 33:4 38:4 40:2,4 44:25	25 80:23,25 87:23	55/45 33:19	82:1,8 83:1 90:15,17 95:9
47:10 55:11 84:17,23	25th 103:1,14	57 87:3	absolutely 22:1 32:2
88:13 96:9 100:20	26 40:10 46:12,21	58 45:4	48:9 59:21 62:19
11 25:14 63:21	26th 8:4,8	5:00 68:3	abstain 4:13
11:36 105:10	27 65:10 270 63:15,19 28th 103:2,15	6	accepted 52:7
12 28:20 37:25 45:3 47:17,20 54:5,7,10			access 58:6 76:17 80:15
60:7,8		6 77:3 88:7	
13 80:22	29 14:7	65 69:14	accessibility 57:19
15 37:21 80:22	29th 103:1,15	68 45:9	accomplish 27:18
16 65:19	·	6th 46:22,25	accomplished 5:1
17 38:1 43:13	3		accounting 17:19
18 8:5 59:1,5 65:19	3 9:1	7	accuracy 25:14,15
69:20	3-to-nothing 4:18	7 59:3	accurate 4:15
18- 41:19	30 50:18,23	70 35:13,15 44:22 50:16 61:4 64:20	Act 5:20,21 6:21,23 9:21 13:15 16:21 23:2
19 58:25 59:5	32 65:8	73 41:16	101:4
1984 30:23	34 69:20	75 44:6	action 4:19 9:16 23:1
1st 101:7	34-year-olds 41:19	77 41:8	99:19 102:21 104:1
	365 15:5	78 35:16,23 41:16 69:3	actionable 90:6,11

12-14-2023

Index: \$10-..activity

actual 28:12 41:8,9 46:11 91:22 approval 34:20 audiences 82:17 98:23 actuality 32:25 **approve** 4:1 99:22 **August** 35:13 agreed 44:5,21,25 101:23,25 102:8,25 ad 61:17 availability 16:11 103:2,5,14 agreement 43:4,12 add 37:17 average 14:8 37:21 46:17 approved 4:18 8:22 added 53:23 102:17 103:23 Avery 6:12 7:8 21:6,18 agrees 39:22 40:8 22:3 addiction 57:24 66:2, apt 86:6 ahead 38:24 63:7 91:17 Avery's 21:20 11 area 19:25 52:25 69:15, air 65:5 adding 99:8 20 72:25 73:3,13 76:23 Avondale 78:5 77:2 78:3,6 79:15 80:25 aisle 49:2 addition 5:25 aware 36:18 100:8 81:13 100:22,25 101:2 Alec 6:9 101:17 additional 8:24 17:10 areas 72:20 100:7 **alike** 89:12,13 awareness 36:2 additionally 6:5,11 101:16 allocating 17:23 aye 4:8,10,17 102:11, arguably 62:25 address 11:7 70:12 13,15,16 103:17,19,21, **allowed** 53:2,14 **argue** 64:5 addressed 70:3 22 105:2,4,6,7 amazing 8:12 arise 7:22 adjourn 104:19,21,24 Amendment 8:4,9 В **Arizona** 7:9 23:17 adjourned 105:8,10 24:10 25:8,9,17 27:24 amount 17:20 63:4 **back** 6:1,4 33:18 46:10, adjust 95:11 28:2 29:2,5 30:3,14 21 48:17 58:25 59:1,10, analysis 24:9 27:21 31:6,9,10,21 32:2,21,22 administrative 8:19 15 65:2 72:18 76:11,13, 48:18 33:5,24 34:1 38:11 44:5 18 77:20 80:15 91:11 ads 63:8 84:14 analysts 26:23 51:10,12 60:21 62:25 **bad** 34:17 87:13 63:3,13,16,19 64:3,4,6, advance 26:14 analytics 24:7 10 67:9 72:19 82:6,25 balance 63:24 advantage 17:4 83:3,7,8 84:16,17 89:9 angst 41:5 **ballot** 30:7,21 37:10,15 90:16 92:2 96:7,10,24, advantageous 83:21 annual 99:19 50:9 62:25 95:3 25 98:2,3,5,25 advertise 15:15 16:20 answers 49:9 82:20 **bank** 51:14 **Arizona's** 17:11 25:20 advisory 8:25 96:4 30:2 31:17 36:10 38:12 barring 4:23 40:12 57:23 65:9 anticipate 8:21 12:7,10 affairs 12:17 based 24:7 27:22 49:8 13:4 14:12,13 100:13 **Arizonans** 23:22 32:4 affect 94:4,7 65:7 90:7 96:14 98:10 33:5 41:8 42:8 48:23 anticipated 13:18 affects 64:5 **basically** 17:19 21:3 68:9,23 69:1 71:18 72:6 anticipates 13:24 26:1,24 29:9 46:16 86:2 90:11,18 97:13 affluency 73:7 51:15 52:4 54:25 61:16 **anxious** 32:18 aspects 12:3 affluent 50:22 63:11 64:18 65:16 73:5 anymore 84:5 77:1 78:6 81:2,24 82:20 assurances 5:22 **afford** 69:16 70:21 85:2 87:3 93:15 94:15 apartment 70:20 **ASU's** 8:2 affordability 70:19 98:11 75:14 77:20 78:23 apex 64:10 attended 14:7 basis 12:8,9 51:2 81:20 94:5 **app** 88:24 attending 14:19 battleground 31:24 age 8:5 22:8 69:14,19 apparently 85:16 88:2 38:11 attitude 44:18 agency 7:25 8:1,2 **apply** 54:15,18 55:19 **bear** 27:12 attitudes 44:17 agenda 5:13 99:18 appreciated 91:21 Becker 99:25 100:4 Attorney 8:20 13:20 aggregated 60:8 102:19 approach 26:3 52:14 audience 32:9 83:23 agree 15:9 22:4,14,24 beginning 23:16 95:3

12-14-2023

Index: actual..beginning

101:7 border-type 61:18 bunch 48:21 49:11 candidates 14:7,15,16, 17,18 15:4,20,22 16:18, behavioral 60:22 burning 44:10 **born** 30:23 24 17:6,11 18:7 21:24 behaviors 85:24 bottom 35:5 59:2,3 business-minded 22:16 23:1,20,24 39:19 49:5 51:1 62:16 67:14 94:3 50:20 **behest** 39:16 73:25 81:19 82:19 **box** 16:23 30:21 businesses 60:21 **belief** 19:17 83:22 86:20,21 87:1 **boxed** 21:11 **button** 41:12 90:19,22 believing 45:4 candidates' 44:17 buy 63:8 **boys** 90:3 benefit 49:6 90:20 **brain** 21:14 **buzzy** 44:9 cap 100:9 benefits 16:21 capability 82:16 break 67:24 93:20 bet 97:21.22 C captured 54:2 breakdown 38:5 51:12 biasing 46:8 69:8 72:10.16 **cabin** 5:18 card 47:5 **Biden** 34:19 breakdowns 27:8 calculations 99:20,23, care 19:19 39:23 40:6,8 big 10:2 18:9 27:4 29:3, 24 42:10,24 68:9 89:6 bridges 64:25 25 34:11 39:3 47:4 56:7 **calendar** 99:22 100:6 case 51:16 98:4 64:14,15 65:5 66:20 **Briefly** 27:14 69:16 76:23 78:16 80:3 California 63:6,7 96:22 bringing 6:4 95:23 **cases** 5:15 90:10 93:23 97:16,20 cast 95:2 **brings** 13:25 bigger 29:13,14 45:16 Californians 96:17 catch 42:10 89:2 **broad** 52:20,25 57:13 97:17 98:3,6,24 biggest 96:22 broadband 57:19 catch-up 19:14,15 **call** 4:7 9:14 12:12 30:11 61:1 65:16 88:4,6 **bill** 16:19 17:5 broadband/ **categories** 28:8 52:17 93:15 102:9 103:16 54:5,7,10 57:13 accessibility/ bingo 47:5 105:1 cybersecurity 61:11 category 60:1 66:1 **bit** 9:24 19:15 24:22 calling 60:5 67:15 70:17 83:21 86:5 broadcast 63:5,14 27:25 28:4 31:14,24 90:23 84:2,4,18,22 89:10 calls 57:21 58:16 60:19 38:6,11 42:22 43:6 44:1 64:23 74:22 77:18 **Cathy** 26:9,10,13 45:5 47:9 48:14 56:21, broadcasters 87:13 78:24 81:15 104:10 23 58:4 63:18 74:12 broader 9:9 28:8 67:15 75:3,19 77:22,23 78:7, cameras 66:13 Caucasian 45:11 88:18 90:23 10 79:19,20 81:9,23 campaign 9:12,20,21 85:13 90:13 93:22 caught 61:6 64:18 **broadly** 12:15 82:25 10:3 11:13 13:20 14:21, 71:22 94:9 94:12,18 98:14 **broke** 27:1 29:18,22 22 15:5,9 16:2,3,12 **blast** 19:21 Cave 73:1 53:18 72:19 73:5 17:11,12 18:3,4,7,18, 19,21,25 88:13 101:11 ccec@ **blue** 30:11,12,15 31:7 broken 86:2 88:14,19 38:20,22 40:5 54:25 azcleanelections. campaigns 17:15 18:5 93:12 55:1.4 56:22 66:21 23:20 86:18 88:17 gov. 104:17 bubble 54:1 94:15 98:4 89:11 census 72:20 96:18 bucket 52:21 68:11 **bluntly** 20:18 candidate 17:17 18:17 **CEO** 24:5 buckets 53:22 60:7,9 19:19 20:5,6,14,15 **board** 22:25 25:3 30:13 36:6 38:23 39:22 cetera 54:9 **bud** 11:25 **body** 66:13 40:3,8 44:22 45:8,18 **Chair** 58:19 102:16 **budget** 99:22 100:7,16 51:2 57:21 58:16 60:5, **border** 57:17 61:11,17, 103:22 105:7 19 64:23 74:22 77:18 18 64:19 68:18,24

70:12 74:25 77:16

78:22 80:16 81:21.22

budgetary 99:19

bulkier 72:15

Chairman 4:5,9,11,17,

21 8:11,13,17 10:13,16,

19 11:3,4,19 12:5 13:11

78:24 81:15 87:4,6

56:15 57:22 58:7

candidate's 44:18,25

12-14-2023 Index: Chairman's..confront

14:5,10 21:12,18 22:13 23:10,13 25:3 33:11,16 36:14,16 47:16,18 49:18,22 58:21 62:6 91:9,15,16,17,22 92:5, 10,14,18,20,23 99:13, 16 100:4 101:19,22,24 102:1,6,12,14,16,20 103:4,6,11,18,20,22 104:10,15,23 105:3,5,7

Chairman's 67:24

challenge 13:13

chamber 64:14

Chan 4:7,8 8:10 11:3,4, 5 91:15,23,24 101:24 102:2,10,11 103:4,13, 16,17 105:1,2

chance 33:21 71:17 102:23

Chandler 76:24

change 30:4 37:10 38:10 52:4,5,6 55:5 75:19

changed 45:23 75:3,11 88:4

changing 75:11 77:22

changings 26:7

channels 27:9 72:11 84:1,8

character 49:6 90:20

charge 81:14

charging 64:21 66:12

chart 30:7

charts 59:14 74:1

chat 72:11

checked 83:23

choice 17:23 79:20

chomping 90:12

choose 54:6

churned 11:24

circle 48:17 59:10

circles 85:14

circumstance 4:24

City 78:5

civil 101:5

class 66:7

clean 5:4 7:25 15:7,25 16:21 17:6,20 18:5 19:12 20:10,23 22:7 23:1,14,25 51:10

clear 35:7

client 18:20

climate 69:20

clips 44:9

clocked 81:8

clocks 80:1

close 8:18 75:17

closed 50:11

closer 38:4

closest 85:1

clue 22:7

coast 95:24 97:2

Coconino 7:12

code 31:10 72:20

cold 90:2

collar 97:10

colleague 48:4

colleagues 7:1 43:25

collect 27:19

college 70:20 80:8

COLLINS 4:21 7:16 8:8,14 10:12,15,19 12:1,5 14:4,9 16:13 17:1 18:14 20:22,25 21:4,9,12,17 22:12 23:9 67:20,22 68:4 92:17

color 31:10

comfortable 11:16

commanding 26:7

comment 9:1 103:24

104:1,5,11

comments 23:11 92:7 99:14 103:25 104:8,16

Commission 5:8,23 13:19 14:16 16:20 23:16 82:15 91:14 99:21 100:12 101:20 104:17

Commission's 5:18

Commissioner 4:3,6, 7,8,9,10,11,12,13 8:10 10:11 11:2,3,4,5,18,19, 20 12:2,5 14:3,5,6,10 16:7,22 18:13 20:20,23 21:1,5,10,14 22:5,13,24 24:23 25:1 28:18 30:16, 19,24 32:20,24 33:7,11, 14,17,18 34:9,13,15 36:12,14,16,17,23 37:1 39:6,12,14 42:11 47:16, 19,23 48:1,7,11 49:15, 21,22,23 50:5 51:7 58:19,21,22 59:12,18 62:3,5,7,8,12,15,20,23 71:12,14 85:17 91:15, 16,18,19,23,24 92:13, 16,19,21,22,24 93:2,21 95:4,15,18,21 99:11 101:24 102:2,4,5,7,10, 11,12,13,14,15 103:4,8, 10,12,13,16,17,18,19, 20,21 104:20,22,24,25 105:1,2,3,4,5,6

Commissioners 4:22 23:11 91:12 92:8 99:14 100:4 102:22

committee 13:20

committees 15:6

common 23:21 28:9 69:1 96:16

communicate 17:14 72:13 86:18

communicated 87:24

communicating 17:25

communication 84:19 88:24 89:3

community 5:16 6:16

9:18,25 12:16

companies 69:16

company 25:7 48:4

compared 25:24 33:4 35:20 36:2 37:14 38:22, 25 43:11 45:6 56:8,19 58:7,8,10 74:6,10,13 75:2 76:6,21 77:7 78:13 80:2 81:7,8 83:4 94:14 97:11 98:16 100:12

compares 33:20

comparison 74:5

compete 17:9

competition 7:14

competitive 38:9,18, 21 39:1 63:14

composition 79:19

comprehensive 6:23 22:19 91:10

comprehensively 23:4

compromise 19:2 40:17,18,24 41:10,17, 19 42:9 43:14 48:25 49:17 50:1

compromises 42:23

compromising 40:21 41:25

concern 77:9

concerned 11:11 12:19 60:3 61:9 76:20 94:8

concerns 10:6,24 11:8 12:22 68:22

concise 93:10

conclusions 49:9

conducting 24:13

cone 54:14 73:24

confident 29:6

conflicted 27:4 30:1

conflicting 48:24

confront 49:4

	confusion 10:18	Corporation 14:16	curious 36:23 51:8 53:5 76:16	11	
	Congress 40:23	correct 34:14 42:13 47:22 62:9 95:5	current 30:4 50:7,13,25 64:3 88:3	December 100:14	
	congressional 37:24 38:12			decent 47:2	
	congressman 24:10	corruption 54:23 60:19 61:24 67:2 81:7	curse 37:4	decide 31:20 52:10 63:20,22	
	38:13	cost 71:2 97:8	customize 82:16	decides 70:8	
	consensus 38:25	costs 17:19 70:16,19, 23 101:9	cut 73:6,9	deciding 56:16	
	conservative 50:17 93:22 100:22,25	count 68:14	cybersecurity 57:19 cycle 16:4 21:24	decision 5:18 16:16 87:10,12 104:4	
	conservatives 51:4	counties 80:22	cynical 18:21	deck 34:19 65:1	
	95:23	counting 14:13		decline 15:19	
	consideration 28:13 103:25 104:3	country 25:14 32:22 34:2 63:4,5 70:8,13 80:7	D	decorum 43:25 44:4	
	considers 99:21		dang 84:3	deduce 59:8	
	consistent 15:20 67:1	county 7:12 13:16	danger 46:4,6	deemed 24:11	
	88:16	69:13,19 70:5,7,10 71:6	dangerous 46:11,24		
	Constitution 7:15,17	85:10	47:3,6	deeper 29:11 degraded 44:1	
	consultant 18:18,19	couple 8:18 21:23 29:10 37:9 86:2 93:12	data 23:21 24:7 37:6	J	
	consultants 18:4,7,21	100:7	47:20 48:8,18,22 53:18 58:23 59:4,14 66:16	delayed 26:11	
	19:24	court 13:17 67:21,23	87:9 89:8 93:9,16 96:14	deliberate 5:23	
	consume 86:6,11	covered 53:23	97:25	delineate 55:1	
	Consumer/food 71:1	covers 9:6	date 104:4	deliver 82:19	
	consumption 85:21, 24,25 86:13	COVID 34:13,16,17	dates 102:21,23,25 103:3,5,14,23	delta 20:9	
	contact 88:13	79:3,4 81:25 83:6,7,10, 15 97:9	David 38:13	delusional 42:11 50:2	
		crazy 64:9 68:20 75:7	day 22:6	demand 90:14	
	contacted 88:3,9	create 17:5 89:16 90:25	days 30:2 40:25 41:5	democracy 46:4,7	
	context 28:23,25	created 22:17 101:4	dead 84:2,4	Democrat 46:8 65:11, 13 69:19 71:5 79:18	
	continued 6:19	creation 101:11	deal 10:7 12:2 22:23	97:23	
	continuing 12:12	credit 6:8	64:15	Democratic 38:7 50:24	
	contrast 49:5 90:19		dealing 13:1 83:12	60:10	
	contribution 17:12	Creek 73:1 criminal 101:5 crimp 15:10 criticism 104:5	debate 5:5,7 7:15,16 23:20 28:1,14 49:4,10 82:16 84:9,15 87:4,6,14 88:20 90:19	Democrats 28:4 37:14 38:3,9,14 41:15 42:25 43:5 44:6,23,24,25 45:5,7,24 46:6 47:6,7, 10,23 49:25 59:25 60:1, 2 64:1 67:13 86:7,8	
	control 18:17 19:25 20:1 70:3,17				
	controlling 64:13				
	conundrum 50:6		debates 25:21 27:10		
	conversations 21:22,	Cronkite 7:25 8:1	74:24 83:22 89:16 91:1 92:3	98:9	
	23 87:18 88:18	cross 71:10	debating 42:2	demographic 45:10 67:3 69:8,11 73:8 76:5	
	coordinated 68:2	crouch 24:22	decade 34:4,5	80:9	
	copious 48:5	cultural 38:19 curbed 16:19	decades 30:22 52:1,3,	demographics 55:24 80:5	
		Curbeu 10.19	, ,	00.0	
- 1					

density 73:18 Director 7:12 dropped 57:1 88:19 effect 5:18 101:6 departments 66:13 Director's 4:20 23:7 **effective** 14:23 19:2 drops 55:25 57:2 84:20,21 87:24 88:11 depending 36:3 disagree 47:8,9 **droves** 90:14 effectively 16:7 desert 69:3 disagreed 46:23 drug 57:24 66:2,11 effort 10:17,21 designation 65:13 disagreement 34:6 drugs 75:15 77:21 46:13,18 47:1 78:23 81:20 efforts 6:13,20 24:4 desire 40:18 41:2 43:14 disclosure 9:10 **Ds** 88:15 **elected** 14:25 30:14,18, **desires** 10:18 21 31:8 41:23 43:22,24 disconnected 30:3 due 6:8 38:17 70:22 destiny 18:18 44:14 51:3 41:6 duq 43:6,9 detail 53:21 electeds 44:3 discover 28:7 dynamics 31:22 detailed 92:1 **election** 7:11 8:19 discussion 4:19 23:14 14:25 17:8 19:18 24:2 99:17,18 102:20,24 **details** 43:15 Ε 34:25 35:12,16,18,21 determine 36:7 discussions 28:14 45:13 55:6,11 56:5 **e-mail** 19:21 104:17 66:2,9 75:16 84:25 85:8 **dismiss** 13:19 developed 15:3 earlier 16:3 43:14 **elections** 5:4 7:23,25 deviate 86:4 distinct 72:5 90:17 94:25 15:7 16:21 17:21 18:5 deviation 66:20 86:14 distributed 19:23 20:3 19:12 20:10,24 22:7 early 6:7 16:3 23:15,25 31:20 36:9 District 38:12 devil 43:15 easier 66:17,18 93:14 45:16 51:10 54:24 62:9 63:2 74:14 devote 22:19 23:3 distrust 49:1 easily 29:6 82:5 95:11 electoral 63:21 dialogue 23:23 dollar 19:10,11 East 73:11 76:25 97:2 electorate 25:20,24 die 94:10 dollars 19:1,23 63:5 economic 32:11 68:24 30:2 31:8,17 36:10 72:3 94:6 differ 88:25 dominant 75:22 89:10, 40:12 41:5 42:1 44:11 11 economic-wise 93:23 45:17 47:2,8 49:6,24 difference 22:2 38:5 50:16 57:23 65:9,18,20 dominates 89:7 44:24 55:3,9 73:17 economies 63:10 74:7,9,11,13 75:23 77:23 80:9 89:2 94:15 donation 20:3 economy 52:5,18,19, 76:2,4 77:4,5,8 78:7,8, differences 38:20 24 54:8,17,20 55:24 16 80:24 82:21 88:17, donations 19:11 55:12 73:8 76:5 78:16 56:19,24 57:8,25 58:14 18.22 90:21 98:8 83:2 86:2 89:4 donors 10:3 19:11,19, 60:12,16,20 61:22 62:1 **electorates** 67:16 20 20:1 66:5,25 67:8 68:17 differencing 58:4 90:24 70:25 74:12,15 75:1,6, door 16:8 difficult 15:15 18:1 22,25 76:13 77:5,15,22 **electric** 61:12 64:21 **double** 45:14 78:9,19,21 79:1,6,23 66:12 dig 26:2 80:12,19 81:5,13,23 doubt 4:15 10:21,22 eliminated 49:24 digestible 27:1 82:1,9,10 83:1 90:15 drastic 50:24 emotions 48:24 digestively 48:22 **educated** 50:21 80:8 drilling 95:9 82:21 emphatically 71:22 dimension 72:5 90:18 driven 43:4 55:23 **education** 7:7 8:3 11:6 encampments 70:18 direct 66:8 56:21,22 94:4 12:13 23:15,18 24:3 encompassing 72:25 directing 104:2 28:14 41:12 54:17,20 driving 43:4 56:3 61:20 56:7 60:13 64:24 74:14 encourage 20:7 direction 32:6,10,17 74:8 76:8 77:11 79:9 76:3,18,19 77:17 78:15, 50:12,13 encouraging 60:20 **drop** 37:19 56:7 83:10 25 80:7,17,18 directly 9:12 64:5 94:4, end 8:22 13:24,25 dropoff 81:24 educational 87:16 6 43:17

12-14-2023

Index: density..end

ended 15:19 extra 37:13 48:18 **fight** 8:16 **forbid** 18:22 engaged 9:16 extreme 47:12 figure 16:23 21:15 **Force** 5:7 6:10 engaging 11:10,15 extremely 69:20 **forcing** 70:17 **filed** 13:19,21,22 enhance 23:19 28:13 filing 13:4 form 12:12 F entering 96:19 final 5:7 format 93:13 95:12 Facebook 85:4 entertain 102:24 finally 28:7 56:14 72:11 **formats** 82:16 104:19 77:19 facing 50:6 forms 84:19 enthusiasm 36:8 finance 14:22 16:2 fact 11:16 15:25 17:22 **fortuitous** 49:8,14 17:11 101:11 51:17 63:19 89:22 entities 9:11,19 10:5 forward 9:3 97:13 financed 16:18 environment 57:3 found 24:9 56:9 **factor** 29:16 60:13 79:24 80:1 financially 15:12 71:8 founded 25:7 facts 59:17 equally 40:11 financing 6:20 15:16 16:12 founder 24:5 **fairly** 46:8 era 6:12 find 27:1 49:13 88:10 founding 25:13 faith 10:16,22,24 11:1 **essay** 7:14 finding 42:4 Fountain 73:1 **fall** 6:14 21:22 ethnic 73:8 findings 27:22 28:16 **fourth** 55:22 78:2 82:13 family 85:13 87:18 ethnicity 80:6 fine 24:25 84:7 fourths 44:5 fantastic 8:10 **evenly** 19:23 20:3 firm 24:7 43:1 framed 92:3 fare 67:15 90:23 event 21:21 47:4 fiscal 56:19 framework 11:13 fascinating 31:16 **events** 21:19 91:20 92:1 99:7 fixed 75:17 frankly 47:13 50:8,14 evergreen 42:20 72:1 73:14,20 97:24 fastest 45:12 flag 61:5 exact 17:19 35:6,10 98:18 favor 41:18,21 43:1 36:7 fleeing 95:24 fraud 60:18 44.7 **exceed** 100:23 flexibility 15:12 fraud/corruption 60:4 favorite 84:1 Florida 63:17 **exciting** 5:3 7:10 free 26:21 72:8 fear 98:12 excuse 49:18 103:1 fluffery 51:16 friend 18:19 **February** 103:1,15 **Executive** 4:20 23:7 flux 36:6 friends 85:13 87:19 federal 62:13,14 64:7 exercise 7:19 focused 9:12 88:19 feds 62:21 **exist** 21:3 focusing 22:14 front 19:1 59:8 feedback 92:15 94:23 fuel 25:20 exiting 96:19 **folks** 5:20,21 9:8,13 feel 26:21 87:7 10:24 12:14,21 14:19, **exodus** 96:22 fueling 71:2 23,24 16:1 17:15 20:8 feeling 32:14 41:6 77:8 expect 70:2 79:16 22:3 25:10 28:24 30:8 full 5:5 6:6,12 98:12 35:11 41:22 42:3 43:3 full-time 6:13 expensive 63:12 fellow 43:22.24 44:9 46:9 58:8 68:9 experience 37:17 76:15 77:7 85:7 97:8,12 fun 29:23 39:9 45:21 female 55:24 69:14 98:16,19 99:3 73:16 93:25 94:1 51:10 57:9 70:10 71:5 follow-up 90:8 93:7 **expert** 26:23 **fund** 15:6 20:23 101:8 females 55:23 **food** 71:2 explain 10:5 **funding** 16:17 19:12 fewer 22:16 76:18 100:9 101:14 explains 79:19 foot 16:8 field 36:6

12-14-2023

Index: ended..funding

fundraising 15:9 17:9, 10 18:2 19:25 funny 41:14 future 13:5 18:24 21:25 69:16 70:9 G Galen 4:4 Gallup's 52:2 gap 70:22 gas 52:18 54:9 71:7,11 75:7,8 76:11 77:15,22 78:19,21 80:12,20 81:13,23 gauge 27:23 gauging 32:8 gave 31:1 general 8:20 13:20 17:8,9 31:20 32:14,21 35:17 36:9 53:15,17 88:22 93:3 94:13 **generally** 60:3 82:6 95:22 generic 30:5,7 generically 30:9 **geographic** 73:18 76:5 80:25 Gilbert 76:24 Gina 6:9 7:13 25:4 qive 19:10 20:2 50:14 69:8,9 72:24 93:11 **giving** 68:15 Glendale 78:4,5 glimpse 96:13

good 6:3 8:13 10:16,22, 24,25 11:7 14:19 21:22 25:12,19 29:8 33:8 36:1 43:21 48:24 50:14

gosh 87:14 Gotcha 93:5 hands 61:13 87:4 government 54:23 happen 13:6 60:18 61:23 67:2 81:7 Governor 8:20 Governor's 6:10 happening 98:7 grab 48:5 53:25 93:7 happy 34:21 101:17 graduates 41:20 70:20 **grant** 17:10 granular 52:23 97:25 harder 37:18 50:17 grassroots 9:17 hardest 69:21 great 42:14 48:15 51:10 hardliners 40:5 59:7,13 82:15 91:21 93:6 95:12 96:1 99:4 hat 8:14,16 greater 88:16 haul 17:2,4 greatly 75:23 he'll 100:1 headwind 18:11 **greens** 46:17 health 60:22 grid 93:13 ground 64:3 healthcare 41:11 group 22:8 31:19 45:10 69:8 75:21 81:1,5 94:2 groups 12:9 41:18 67:3 80:10 **growing** 45:12 guarantee 5:21 guarantees 5:19 heard 103:11 guess 4:23 62:17 86:16 93:4 94:16 quidance 5:17 **guide** 27:18 **guides** 85:10

95:3

105:9

16 43:23 51:1

75:13 76:13 77:19

81:6,19 83:11,13

53:7 54:18 55:3 57:2

88:5

hearing 10:22 12:20 13:13,14,15 23:13 27:10 69:10 84:9 101:22 heavily 44:7 **gun** 54:23 56:8 60:12 heck 99:1 67:1 78:11,13 79:24 helpful 92:2 guys 87:7 91:7 **helps** 39:7 Н **HERRING** 26:9,11,15 104:13 half 65:11,23 92:24 **hev** 31:4,6 32:9 38:23 **hall** 7:9 40:3 41:24 42:10 44:2

hand 15:7 19:12 42:13 58:11 67:3 84:12 86:24 88:24 **high** 36:8 41:20 45:2 49:2 55:7 71:1,7 happened 47:4 79:7,11 **higher** 44:4.13 45:6 50:21 66:5,7 71:2 75:13 77:3 78:7,10 highest 60:17 61:3 78:13 79:25 hard 12:2 16:11 20:15, **highlight** 7:5,24 13:12 100:1 highlighting 8:4,18 **hill** 94:10 Hills 73:1 Hispanic 45:7,9 Hispanics 45:17 historically 38:8 **hit** 34:11,17 69:21 100:23 **hitting** 100:15 hold 45:5 64:2 54:17,20 56:7 57:8,23 60:11,21 66:25 74:14 home 70:20,23 homeless 70:17,18 78:10,22 79:23 80:15 homelessness 68:19 hear 12:20 24:23 27:11 70:15,22 72:3 31:5 53:13 61:24 70:18 homes 70:21 71:9 84:11 86:21 87:22 honestly 98:17 hook 13:9 hope 11:1 **hoping** 39:10 hot 41:12 69:20 hour 27:12 House 63:20,23 housing 54:23 56:8 60:12 67:2 68:17,24 70:15,16 72:3 76:3 77:6 81:9 94:5

goals 27:14

God 18:22

55:17 83:24 90:1 91:9

96:2 100:10,14,16

huge 94:22

Hulu 85:15

hundred 61:3

12-14-2023 Index: hundred-year..jobs

hundred-year 79:4 83:13 hungry 42:1 48:25 90:13 **hurting** 71:7,8 **hurts** 19:11 hybrid 6:2 hyperpartisanship 49:3 hyperpolarization 39:25 hyperpolarized 47:13 86:12 ı idea 50:14 69:11 95:22 ideas 48:25 49:5 90:20 identical 90:3 identifying 12:18 ideological 95:25 ideologically 93:19 98:23 **III** 4:19

ill 11:24

imagine 87:5 immediately 70:3

immigration 41:11 43:7 52:5 54:22 56:17, 20,22 57:16 61:10,13, 14,15,21,25 62:13,17 64:19 66:6,23 67:8,11 68:18,25 70:1,2,7,12 72:5 74:12,15,25 75:12 77:1,3,16 78:6,21 79:22 80:16 81:4,21,22 82:1,8 83:1,3,7,16 90:15,17

impact 39:4 89:24 impacts 19:9 89:1 implementing 5:9

implicates 10:9 implications 63:3 importance 44:17 74:6,7

important 15:23 23:22 27:16 28:3,5 29:16 40:21 41:10 45:1.17 53:9 56:4,5,12,15 57:22 58:15 60:2,6,10 61:12 63:1 64:6 65:25 66:9 67:12,13 68:25 69:24 70:8 72:2 73:25 74:10, 13,23 75:4,22,25 76:2,4 79:3 81:4,5 83:9,12,17 85:10 89:16 90:25 91:5 92:4 96:3

importantly 91:4 impossible 36:7 improving 64:25 incentives 64:22 66:12 inclined 20:2

included 69:2 71:19 incorrect 17:23

increase 21:16 45:14 71:3 89:23

increased 100:9 increasing 70:22

increasingly 89:16 90:25

incredibly 27:16 28:22 52:25 63:12,14 92:1

incumbent 38:12

independent 30:13 65:7,9,17,22 66:22 69:14 70:6

independents 36:13, 18 37:7,12,22 38:2,6 41:17 43:10 47:24 48:2 65:4,5,6,11,12,15,16, 19,20,21 66:1,6 67:13 89:13 92:25 93:15,16 94:2 95:6

independents' 39:3 indicator 17:21,22 individual 60:17 individually 60:6,15 61:12

indulgence 67:24

industry 12:14

inflation 19:8.9.13 54:9 68:17 70:24,25 71:2,5,8

information 16:24 21:2 45:22 48:2 72:13 84:16 86:9 90:8,13 91:20 93:10 98:11 101:13

informative 23:23

infrastructure 57:2.18 58:24,25 59:2 64:21,25

initial 13:3 21:23

injunction 13:22

input 94:23

inquires 14:18

inside 8:2

insight 99:8

insights 24:5 26:25 90:6,11 92:1

instrument 36:22

intake 97:1,7

intended 16:17 23:24

interchangeable 82:9

interest 5:16 15:22 66:3

interested 12:21 42:9, 23 44:21 45:8 80:14 82:25 91:7

interesting 31:3 34:9 35:13,18 37:7 39:14,24 40:15 41:22 42:8,22,24 44:15,23 47:7,11 48:8 49:7 51:11,18 55:23 56:2,17,20 57:8 66:4 68:21 75:11 77:12 78:11,15 81:6 82:12 85:8,20

interestingly 45:2 57:14 96:24

interests 22:9

interview 11:22

inverse 86:7

involved 9:17 17:15 38:7

issue 11:7 22:14 24:21 42:15,18 43:9 50:7,13 51:6,12 52:1,2,11,12 53:9,25 54:15 56:4,5, 12,15 58:12,24 59:6,25 60:2,10 61:15,19,20 64:19 65:25 66:11 67:1, 11 68:21 69:1,24 71:17 72:2 73:23,25 75:10 77:7 78:2,20 79:20 81:10,17 83:3,9,16

issue-oriented 23:23

issues 13:1 23:17,21 25:23 26:2 27:5,6,25 28:1,8,10 39:23 40:8,9, 12,21 41:10,12 42:1,2, 4,9,23 43:2,6,10 44:20 49:13 51:9,15,20,21,22, 23 52:13,16,24 53:2,6 54:6,19 56:3,19,20 57:6,11 61:12 66:8 67:5,14,17 68:7,10,24 69:2,7 70:1,15 71:18,19 72:3,4,22 74:8 75:4 76:8,9 77:10,23 79:9, 12,22 81:25 82:7,13 83:1,17,20 90:16,22 94:6,8,11 95:8,10

itch 93:3

item 4:19 23:14 99:18, 24 101:23,25 102:9,20 103:24 104:18

items 30:6 48:21 66:18 81:25 93:7 94:24

IV 23:14

IX 104:18

J

January 46:22,25 102:21 103:1,14

job 30:10 34:20 91:21

jobs 52:17,18,19,24 54:8,16,20 55:24 56:19, 23 57:8,25 58:14 60:11, 16,20 61:22 62:1 66:5, 25 67:8 74:12,15 75:1, 6,21,24 76:12 77:5,15, 21 78:9,19,20 79:1,22 80:12,19 81:4,13,23 82:9,10 83:1 90:15 97:10,11

Joking 39:15

journalism 8:2

judge 7:13 13:17,23

jump 28:16

June 5:6

Κ

keeping 71:4

key 11:14 19:16 26:2,24 27:5,6 48:21 51:9,14 67:7,17 68:7,10 69:2 71:16,19 72:21 82:24 89:6 90:6,10 100:1

kick 8:11

kicking 42:4

kid 8:14 93:8

Kimble 4:5,9,11,17 8:13 10:13,16 11:4,19 14:5 22:13 23:10,13 33:15,16 36:16 47:18 49:18,22 58:21 62:6 91:9,17,22 92:5,10,14, 18,20,23 99:13,16 101:19,22 102:1,6,12, 14,16,20 103:6,11,18, 20,22 104:10,15,23 105:3,5,7

kind 9:19 11:17,25 12:25 13:7,10 18:6 22:1,21 30:9,10 31:4,23 38:18 42:21 44:8,9 47:12 49:8,9 50:17,19, 21,23 52:7,23 53:9 55:7 56:7,18,21,22 57:7,12 69:7,9 71:20 72:13,23 73:1,5,16 76:24 77:10 79:2,11 82:5,11 85:12 88:23 94:6

king 84:22

knew 71:20

knowing 37:5 79:19

L

L.A. 97:19

lack 10:16 13:9

land 52:7

landfall 83:6,7,10

lane 51:5

large 28:19,22 29:9

76:25

larger 52:16

largest 45:10 63:10

lastly 53:8 64:16 101:1

law 17:11 52:7 99:23 101:12

laws 21:10 58:6 76:16 80:14

lawsuit 13:15

lawsuits 101:14

lawyers 12:9,14

lead 23:22

leader 24:8

leaders 30:4 49:3

leadership 13:23

15:11

leadership's 13:14

leading 24:6 81:14

lean 31:9 65:10,14 81:17 92:25 93:19 98:5

leaning 31:9 65:9 98:8

leans 31:25 81:1

learn 27:25 86:20 87:1

ledge 37:23

left 30:7 66:19 72:7

93:19 98:16

left-leaning 79:18

legal 12:13 13:1

legislative 12:18 13:14,23 14:17 15:14 16:15 20:6

Legislature 14:18 16:16 17:5 19:14

length 96:11

lens 32:11,12

less-than-good-faith

10:21

lets 49:5 90:19

level 19:10 33:3 37:19 44:4,13 62:19 80:7

levels 36:7

liberal 93:22

liberals 51:4

life 7:22 19:22 20:16

lifetime 79:7

lightest 31:12

limit 104:5

limitations 23:2

limited 104:2

limits 15:8,9

lined 38:14

lines 18:16 41:15 73:7

list 19:20 22:20 57:1,3 67:4 87:17

lists 20:1

literally 96:11

litigation 13:3 16:14

live 69:3 70:9 89:21

99:5

livelihood 94:7

living 97:8

lobbying 9:16,17

local 27:7 72:5 90:17

localities 25:23 82:14

locals 27:7

logic 95:12

long 10:8 17:2,4 39:16, 17 95:11 96:6 99:6

Index: Joking..make

12-14-2023

looked 64:8 72:21 76:7

losing 17:17

lot 4:25 11:24 25:16 28:24 31:5 36:2 38:21 39:9 40:14 41:4 51:22 55:20 59:14 64:2 66:16 75:15 84:11 86:12 90:7 93:9 96:2,17 97:7,8,13 98:22 100:5

lots 15:1 69:17

love 87:15 88:5

loved 8:12

low 43:13 59:5 100:19

lower 66:6

lower-level 20:5

lowered 8:4

loyal 31:16,18

loyalty 39:25

lunch 39:11,17 67:18

М

made 16:16 17:5,22 27:1 83:6,7,10 104:24

magenta 31:11

magnitudes 88:20

mail 85:9 87:19,20

mailhouse 18:3

main 20:21 57:5 61:10 96:23,25

maintain 43:21

major 10:3 15:3

majority 32:16 40:7,12 41:8,15 84:17 89:9

93:23

make 10:1 15:14 18:2,8 39:10 44:10 48:17 54:2 58:22,23 59:16 61:7 66:17,18 67:22 71:24 80:23 82:20 93:13 95:14 100:7,22,24

12-14-2023 Index: makes..non-college

101:17 104:7,11,20 memorandum 101:23, minimum 80:20 25 102:9 Ν minus 34:6 makes 22:2 69:4 80:9 memorized 28:21 95:11 **naive** 19:5 minutes 4:1,18 27:20 making 5:18 11:14 **mental** 60:22 104:6 narrowly 10:2 29:13.14 73:6 mention 26:17 68:22 mirror 87:11 nation 33:6 male 69:19 70:4,7 mentioned 11:9 46:15 mission 6:24 11:10 national 25:17 31:22 manner 5:24 68:23 69:1 70:11 71:25 33:3 63:2 64:4 72:4 mix 94:2 90:16 Manual 8:19 mentions 69:3 model 95:14 nationals 31:6 Mesa 76:24 **map** 63:16,17,19 64:1 moderate 50:19 51:2,5 nationwide 8:5 March 102:22 103:1,2, message 10:23 17:25 94:13 15 83:23 **native** 96:10 **moderates** 49:16,24 Maricopa 13:16 69:13 messaging 67:14 **NBC** 24:12 moderators 23:19 70.7 72:12 83:19 88:17 needed 74:21 77:14 90:22 modes 88:10 market 24:6 63:7,8 needle 84:22 methodology 35:4 **Mohave** 70:10 marketing 61:19 91:6 **negative** 34:12 46:12, moment 7:4 marks 100:15 19,20,21 47:1 methods 86:19,25 money 15:7 17:20 18:2, massive 55:3 88:13 **net** 43:12 46:14,15,25 8 material 61:19 metro 77:2 Nevada 96:23 98:24 monolithic 75:5 materials 85:1.9 99:24 **Meyer** 4:11,12,13 news 11:22 13:8 24:12 month 19:22 71:9 33:11,14,17,18 34:9 27:10 44:10 70:24 84:9, matter 19:8 40:6,9,13 100:14 36:14,16,17,23 39:12 15,18 85:6,11,21,24 55:7 67:8 90:15 104:2,3 47:16,19,23 48:1,7,11 months 40:23 86:3,6,13 89:11 58:19,21,22 59:12,18 matters 19:8 44:19 **motion** 13:19,22 newspaper 11:21 86:4, 45:18 72:4 73:18,20 91:16,18,19 102:5,12, 101:23 102:25 103:2 9.14 87:25 13 103:10,12,13,18,19 Mccain 50:20 104:19,20,23 104:22,25 105:3,4 newspapers 85:15 meaningful 23:23 mouth 85:13 89:15 86:8 microphone 49:19 means 20:4 40:20 96:2 move 13:2 48:10 70:21 nice 26:4 94:14 middle 35:5 78:20 80:13 99:17 media 9:13,20,21 13:7 **nip** 11:25 middle-aged 70:6 71:6 101:24 103:4 84:25 85:3,21,24 86:6, no-brainer 42:14 midterm 35:20 36:3,4 11 89:18 91:2 moved 47:10 63:17,19 55:5 102:8 103:12 **Noble** 24:4,5,16,24 median 63:7 25:2 26:10,13,16 28:19 Midwest 97:3 moving 15:10 84:22 **mediums** 89:14 30:17,20 31:1 32:22,25 96:17 98:16,21,22,25 Midwesterners 97:4 33:8,13,22 34:11,14,16 99:1 meet 90:14 36:17,20,25 37:3 39:7, **Mike** 6:19 24:4,5,8,9,15 mudslinging 49:11 meeting 4:24 6:2 12:18 13,15 42:13 47:20,22, 27:11 91:10 92:10 22:6 23:4 102:21,25 25 48:3,9,12 50:4,7 99:16,25 100:3 101:19 multi-layered 52:14 103:3,5,14,23 105:10 51:8 59:7,13,20 62:4, 102:18 multi-stage 53:1 10,14,18,22,24 68:1,6 meetings 5:11 6:1 million 63:6 100:19 71:13,15 85:18 91:25 **muted** 4:12 member 40:3 104:7 93:1,5,25 95:5,17,20 million-dollar 86:16 myriad 32:13 85:6 96:1 99:12 members 6:4.16 91:13 mind 11:14 46:22 96:3 101:20 104:13 non-college 80:8 **minds** 75:5

memo 99:23 101:2

non-state 9:23 68:16 71:23 86:1 23 O nonpartisan 24:6 order 9:20,23 39:17 participate 22:16 58:4 **Obama's** 19:18 nonprofit 10:8 participation 15:15 ordering 67:18 77:23 23:19 37:18 45:13 objective 27:17 **nonprofits** 9:15 11:8. 86:1 88:19 14 parties 14:14 17:13 objectives 27:23 51:19 ordinary 10:4 38:6 40:19,20 41:6,10, 89:24 noon 68:3 18 43:11,14 47:11 61:5 Oregon 96:24 99:1,2,3 off-year 5:4 65:14 85:22 norm 74:8 organizations 11:9 office 7:21 17:17 64:13 normal 14:8.11 70:23 partisan 37:24 89:1 12:16,18 94:9 79:12 94:17,19 officers 66:14 origin 80:7 partisans 41:2,3 43:5 normalizing 79:11 official 84:25 85:8 65:23 88:17,21,25 originally 97:4 **north** 72:24 73:1,11 officials 31:8 43:22,24 94:10 **Osmosis** 85:17 74:3.20 76:6 44:14 partisanship 40:10,13 other's 85:22 northeast 73:2 offset 101:9 **parts** 73:6 northern 7:9 73:15,17, ourself 93:9 older 69:14 70:4,11 party 28:2 30:8 31:16, 19 outlets 85:6 one-liners 49:12 18 39:24,25 40:4 41:14 **notably** 43:13 68:25 outlines 99:24 49:1 50:22 53:19 67:11 one-on-one 12:8 85:21,25 86:3 88:14,20 note 35:1 48:5 83:5 outperforms 75:23 one-on-one-type 22:1 90:24 notes 35:4 48:17 outreach 6:13 7:7 9:6 one-to-one 51:2 pass 5:15 notice 31:21 35:24 12:15 13:7,10 22:1 online 13:5 19:25 84:25 56:6,25 58:9 66:4 74:18 passage 101:4 outstanding 75:9 85:5,7,9 89:15,18 91:2 75:10 83:15 86:5 passed 5:13,17 **Oval** 64:13 open 30:4 43:10 50:10 November 35:17 101:7 passion 24:9 overblown 98:15 open-ended 53:24 **NPI** 24:5,11 past 12:24 13:2 22:21 68:8,12 71:16 overhead 18:6 nuanced 55:12 82:14 **Paton** 4:3,4,6,9,10 open-endedly 68:15 83:2 86:2 89:4 overview 25:19 10:11 11:2,18,19,20 operated 7:20 **nuances** 83:21 12:2,6 14:3,5,6,10 16:7, overwhelmingly 41:21,24 44:20 22 18:13 20:20,23 21:1, operating 5:20,21 18:5 number 5:1 19:17 5,10,14 22:5,13,24 25:14,15 32:23 53:11 owe 65:2 **opinion** 8:25 24:6,9 24:23 25:1 28:18 30:16, 56:24 57:17,18,20 25:8 30:9 33:24 37:5 19,24 32:20,24 33:7 58:24 60:12 61:2,13,15, 40:14 46:16,18,21 34:13,15 36:12 37:1 P 20,22 63:4,13 64:19,22 69:18 98:4 39:6,14 42:11 49:15,21, 68:17,18,19 74:2 75:6, pages 26:21 22,23 50:5 51:7 62:3,5, opinions 8:25 52:4 12 76:12,13,18 77:2,3, 7,8,12,15,20,23 71:12, pain 77:9 17,20 78:6 79:21,22,23, opponents 49:4 14 85:17 92:13,16,19, 24 80:12,15 83:10 pandemic 79:4 83:13 21,22,24 93:2,21 95:4, opportunities 64:2 84:20,23 87:23 96:24 15,18,21 99:11 102:4,7, **panel** 29:1 opportunity 21:21 14,15 103:8,20,21 **numbers** 19:6,7 20:8 26:21 30:5 31:25 58:17 par 77:4 81:3 104:20,21,24 105:5,6 optimal 17:7 71:23 parents' 70:21 Paula 102:23 104:10 optimism 32:8 numerous 6:15 pay 64:24 70:22 76:20 part 6:20,23,24 12:7 option 50:10 69:2 77:17 79:1 80:18 16:5 21:7,20 22:2,4 81:15 98:19 23:17 42:12 45:17 penalties 101:5

options 40:11 60:16

71:18 73:2,19 97:20,21,

12-14-2023 Index: pending..priority present 82:2 presentation 21:20 23:7 24:24 26:4 48:6 presented 5:7 7:8 President 19:18 presidential 35:19,20, 21 36:1 55:8 63:11,17 presiding 13:17 pressure 20:17 pretty 5:3 21:22 25:11, 12 35:24 36:1 47:1 52:19 56:4 64:14,15 66:4 72:1 76:25 86:12 88:16 89:3 94:10 prevalent 51:23 68:21 preview 24:3 previewed 6:6 previous 45:15 54:8 61:8 price 63:8 77:22 prices 52:18 54:9 71:1, 7 75:7,8 76:11 77:15 78:20,21 80:12,20 81:13,23 pride 25:16 **primaries** 28:6 35:25 36:19 37:8 38:7.9.18 50:10,11 51:6 61:16,21 95:4,5,6 primarily 55:23 **primary** 35:12,16 36:9 37:10,13,25 38:1,15 50:8,25 53:19 62:10 68:22 principally 9:16 principle 17:16 **print** 89:15 **prior** 87:9

pending 8:20
penetration 89:23
people 7:14 10:22 18:2 4 20:7,17 21:2 22:6,8, 10,25 27:9 28:9 31:16 39:20,21 40:14 41:23, 24 45:23 47:21 52:3,4, 15 53:2,15 56:11 64:20 66:10 68:12 69:18 70:17 73:14 79:11 84:4, 8,12 87:20 88:5 89:7,17 91:1 95:18,24 97:7,17
people's 19:9
Peoria 78:4
percent 31:14,18

35:13,15,16,22,23 37:21 38:1,4 40:2,4,6, 10,13,14 41:8,9,15,16 42:25 44:6,22 45:4,9 50:16,18,23 59:1,3 61:3,4 64:20 65:8,10, 17,19 74:18 80:23,24, 25 85:16 87:3,23 88:7 93:18,24 100:20 101:4, 6

percentage 39:2 75:24 percentage-wise 39:4 perception 9:8,9 perceptions 27:23 perfect 43:7 51:25 performed 23:16

permanent 15:4 person 17:22 18:23

19:4 38:24 69:12 70:24 persona 69:11

pessimism 32:8 pessimistic 32:18

phase 9:1 13:3

Phoenix 25:25 72:25 73:3,4,11,12 74:3,20 75:20,21,25 76:7,15,23 77:2,7,11 78:1,3

phrased 40:19 43:20 56:14

physical 87:19

physically 24:20

PI 13:13,14,21

pick 53:6,8 57:2,4 67:9

picked 74:21 79:20

picking 42:18 53:16

pickup 64:2

picture 27:4 29:25

pie 19:5

piece 87:19

pieces 18:3

Pima 70:4 71:6 79:15

Pima/tucson 73:13 79:16

place 10:9 79:13

places 85:10

plan 99:20,25

planning 28:13 68:3

playing 41:7

plays 8:7

plenty 89:8

pocketbook 76:9

point 8:22 14:11,21 18:15 37:11 43:22 74:5 77:9 79:10 101:1,17

pointedly 58:13

points 32:15 33:4 45:3 46:24 47:10 75:24 77:3 78:9 100:1

policies 54:24 56:8 60:12 67:1 68:8 78:11, 13 79:24 99:3

policy 9:16 44:20,22 45:1 58:10

policy-wise 99:2

political 11:11,15 17:13,15 19:24 30:8 40:4.20 63:4

politician 43:20

politicians 43:20

politicians' 43:19

politics 20:15,18 24:10 41:7

polled 34:1 47:21

polling 24:6 98:5

polls 37:5 59:5

pollster 24:12

poor 88:7

popular 31:22

population 45:12 55:9. 10 58:2 74:24 80:6

populations 73:9

portion 7:7 71:16 76:25 83:15

position 10:23 13:6 17:7 56:15 57:22 83:24

positioning 66:24

positive 34:8.11.15 42:20 46:19 61:2

post 19:18 101:13

post-covid 6:12

posted 23:25

potentially 58:8

power 21:15 63:25

pre 46:22

precipitous 15:19

Predictive 24:4

predominantly 61:24 68:23

preeminent 24:12

prefer 87:1

preference 43:19

preferences 39:8,19 43:18

preliminary 13:22

premise 28:15

prescription 75:14 77:21 78:23 81:20

priorities 77:24 80:10

prioritization 58:5 priority 83:14

pro-choice 42:17 52:3, 6 57:21 58:16 60:5 64:24 74:23 77:19 78:25 81:16 **pro-life** 42:17 52:3,6 57:21 58:16 60:5,20 64:23 74:23 77:19 78:24 81:16 proactive 16:1 problem 18:1,9 22:22, 23 23:4 59:9 problems 7:22 22:20 **Procedures** 8:19 proceed 5:23 process 5:5,19 22:4 24:2 37:11,12 50:8 program 14:22 15:16 16:5 22:17 23:18,20 **programs** 57:24 60:22 66:3.11 prohibition 16:20 project 25:18 27:14 projected 63:3 projections 100:19 projects 7:6 promote 15:15 prompted 68:22 **Prop** 9:5,9,12 10:2,9 13:13 101:3,12 propagate 10:21 propagating 9:9 10:25 proposal 100:18 proposed 100:6 102:21,23 **Proposition** 5:11 13:21 proud 6:25 **provide** 5:14,17 28:12 providing 9:18 10:4 23:21 **public** 5:17 6:20 8:1 9:1

12:17 14:22 15:16 24:6, 8,13 25:8 33:24 37:5 50:2 57:3 66:12,13 74:18 98:4 103:24 104:1,7,14,16 publicize 16:11 publicly 16:18 pull 89:22 pulse 25:19 33:24 pure 11:9 18:6 purple 31:6,11 purpose 23:18 push 21:6 55:16 67:14 90:22 pushed 55:21 put 15:10 16:19 20:17 26:4,24 28:23,25 54:1 66:17 68:12 74:1 83:24 84:7 92:11 93:6 100:15 **putting** 13:9 20:12 27:2 Q qualified 29:2 quarter 6:7 12:11 65:22 quarterly 33:24 question 10:11,14 11:2,18 14:3 32:6,20 33:12,20 35:2,3,6,10 36:15 40:19 43:12,20 44:18 45:25 46:6 47:16 48:15 53:1 55:18 56:14 58:20 59:7,13,19 62:3,5 68:12 69:2 86:17 88:23 92:13,16,17,19 93:6 94:24,25 95:15 96:1,6, 12,16 99:9 questions 14:1 23:11 45:22 71:19 82:17 91:11,13,19 92:7 95:7

99:13 100:2 101:18,20

quick 25:6 33:12 36:15

61:1

quicker 72:17

quickly 4:22,25

R race 9:23 37:23,24 63:9,11 races 14:15 64:7 87:25 raise 20:11 raised 17:18 raising 12:22 ran 71:9 range 71:23 rank 60:9 61:2 ranked 25:13 54:19 ranking 60:14 66:17 rankings 82:6 ranks 87:23 rate 45:14 reach 89:17,23 91:1 read 35:9 reads 70:24 87:21 ready 48:23 90:12 real 7:22 20:21 reality 15:13 42:21 97:24 rearview 87:11 71:21 reasonable 22:18 reasons 15:2 29:11 recall 5:6 30:22 **receive** 88:17 received 8:24 recent 63:18

quiet 39:12 recently 7:13 46:25 recommendations quote 66:22 28:12 quotes 65:5 record 51:13 84:7 **red** 30:11,15 31:12,23 38:20 40:5 55:4 56:23 66:21 74:3 94:15 reds 46:17 referencing 101:3 radio 85:15 86:4,5,7,14 region 24:14 25:15 72:21 74:1,2,24 77:11 80:1 90:25 regional 7:14 25:22 27:8 29:21 72:10,16 82:14 regionally 28:2 29:14 regions 29:16,19,22 72:16,19 73:21 78:12, 14 79:17,18 80:2 81:9 82:10 83:19 registered 27:6,24 29:2 54:16 55:2,15,16, 25 57:10,15,16 58:1 60:18 66:19 74:4 regular 7:4 regularly 24:13 regulated 5:16 18:12, 15 regulation 60:4 regulations 58:14 60:17 regulatory 5:12 11:13 related 19:17 reason 4:15 20:21 63:7 relations 8:1 relationships 43:19,21 44:14 relevant 82:17 remain 82:10 86:1 88:21 remains 66:25 82:1 88:16 89:12 remember 54:6,8 55:10 57:13 58:7 60:8

66:20 75:5,7 respective 38:6 61:4 roughly 39:2,5 65:11, **secret** 14:20 65:14 67:16 83:20 18 80:23 100:10,19 remote 97:9,10 **Secretary** 7:8,11,20 90:24 Rs 88:15 13:3 101:10 rent 68:17 72:3 responded 71:18 ruby 31:23 **section** 48:19 53:24 reordering 81:24 respondent 40:3 54:6 54:4 72:15 84:1 rude 43:23 replaced 76:14 77:21 respondents 28:22 sections 72:7 rule 20:18 report 4:20 5:7 6:10 29:1 34:25 35:15,24 **security** 7:19,22 57:17 36:5 39:20 40:7 44:21 7:4,8 8:18 14:1 23:8 rules 5:14,15,17 61:11,18 64:20 74:25 39:21 55:21 ruling 13:18,24 77:16 78:22 80:17 respondents' 43:13 81:21,22 reporter 67:21,23 run 4:25 5:10 9:14 70:1 seek 85:11 reporting 11:17 15:22,24 20:8 28:20 responding 104:4 51:5 63:15 seeks 5:20 reports 9:7 response 23:12 92:9 rundown 16:2 represent 41:23 **select** 52:15,17 53:2 99:15 101:21 104:9 running 5:6 14:18 16:3 54:15,18 55:15,19 representatives 43:1 responsibility 64:15 31:5 33:25 63:11 81:15 representing 25:17 selected 54:15 60:17 rest 19:22 runs 30:8 Republican 38:7,13 61:4 67:15 90:23 restless 27:4 30:1,3 rural 73:14,15,16,18,20 46:5 50:15 61:16 64:17 48:23 90:11 selecting 60:2,15 80:22 97:20,21 65:10,12 70:4,10 97:22 result 84:3 104:1 self-identification Republicans 28:5 S 35:23 resulted 16:14 31:13 37:14,21 38:2,8, 17,25 41:16 42:25 43:5 seminar 12:13 **sadly** 30:15 results 23:25 27:21 44:6,24 45:2,4,6,24 Senate 62:18 63:9,24, 29:7,23 42:4 49:8 66:2, safety 57:4 66:13,14 46:4,11,23 47:2,23 8 87:9,12 94:1 25 70:12 74:18 49:25 50:18,20 61:9,15, 20,25 67:12 86:5,10 return 6:13 7:3 **send** 19:21,22 33:23 **sake** 72:18 89:12 98:8 34:19 48:6 65:1 104:16 revenue 100:11,13,14, sample 27:19 28:18,19 sense 31:7 32:14 53:14 request 9:1 37:15 19,21 29:4,9,17 58:23 69:4 95:11 97:13 requests 8:24 9:2 review 102:23 sane 94:14 sentiment 24:13 require 53:6 reviewed 5:10 scenario 7:20 **service** 9:14 10:4 11:9 required 99:23 101:12 rid 19:14 school 8:2 41:20 **services** 9:18 85:14 requirement 61:17 rise 89:14 Schweikert 38:13 89:18 91:2 requires 5:14 9:10 risen 70:23 83:16 **scored** 78:13 **set** 5:13 15:20 23:21 20:14 road 42:5 63:15 25:12 83:1 Scottsdale 73:2 rescheduling 104:3 setting 27:6 roads 64:25 scratches 93:3 research 24:7 25:9 ROBERTS 7:15 **shade** 31:12 **script** 95:12 26:20.23 27:17 28:15 **shake** 59:4 48:4 65:8 98:19 robust 51:11 seasons 105:9 resided 96:7 **shape** 29:8 rock 83:11 **seats** 64:3 residency 96:11 Roe 51:25 52:8 **share** 34:21 second-most-popular 59:6 residuals 90:3 roll 4:7 102:9 103:16 sheets 59:8 105:1 seconded 4:5 102:8 resonate 28:1 shortage 69:15 103:13 104:24 room 84:5 85:4 resources 17:24 shortages 69:22

12-14-2023

Index: remote..shortages

show 7:6 8:6 69:6 82:5 59:19 61:8 93:12 16 93:18 statewides 64:11.12 93:15 97:11 **slight** 57:11 98:15 **specifics** 57:12 76:17 stations 64:22 **showcase** 49:5 90:20 100:13 statistical 29:15 **speech** 11:11,15 showing 57:12 slightly 32:1 **spend** 9:22 20:10 63:14 statistically 84:6 87:3 **shows** 19:4 slotted 52:16 **spenders** 9:20,21 10:3 **status** 10:8 **shut** 79:5 slow 72:18 spending 9:13 15:9 statute 5:14 19:9 89:9 99:20 side 42:17 46:14,15 **small** 19:10,11,18,20 **stay** 75:5 49:2,16 50:24 56:22,23 29:3 31:19 86:2 89:4 **spent** 63:5 83:5 **step** 37:14,16,20 53:21 small-group 12:9 **spring** 5:6,12 **sides** 94:9 **steps** 37:17 social 56:18 57:6 76:9 staff 6:3,25 7:1 21:15 **sign** 14:19 33:9 47:14 77:10 81:25 84:24 85:3, stepwise 5:24 28:24 104:2 88:2 100:10 14 89:18 91:2 94:8 strategic 28:13 staff's 99:25 signature 22:17 socially 93:22 **stream** 89:21 stage 25:17 significance 29:15 society 88:3 **streaming** 85:14 89:18 stakeholders 24:1 **solid** 5:13 16:5 **similar** 57:11 88:18 91:2 89:4 stance 44:19 58:7 solutions 49:13 **strong** 81:6 88:21 100:16 **simple** 96:6 sooner 61:6 **stronger** 13:6 81:8 stand 43:1 81:19 Sinema 30:16,17 sophisticated 19:4 strongest 84:20 standard 45:6 **single** 53:9 56:11 sort 6:12 7:3,20 9:14,25 strongly 41:9 standards 5:4 45:15 sit 66:10 12:12 15:4,8,19 59:19 student-driven 8:1 start 7:2 27:3 54:13 site 101:11 sound 27:12 **study** 104:2 started 6:19 30:24 53:3 sits 63:20,22 sounds 11:5 42:13 **stuff** 12:3 15:6 19:5 **starting** 12:10 24:11 **sitting** 64:12 **sources** 84:15,25 85:5 21:6 29:23 48:16 55:20 38:10 73:24 86:4 89:15,19 91:3 64:4,8,10 65:2 68:16 situation 17:6 **starts** 8:16 70:2 82:4,13 84:11 south 25:25 73:4,11 sixth 65:18 86:13,24 87:10 91:6 75:20,21,25 76:1,15 **state** 6:16 7:11 14:15 94:22,23 98:5,7 size 28:18,19 29:7,10 20:5 25:10 29:5 30:8 southeast 73:4.11 45:12 80:25 **style** 15:10 31:14,23,24 32:5 33:5 75:20 76:23,24 77:2,7, 37:23 38:16 45:11 **skill** 25:12 subcategories 54:7, 50:16 51:13 58:14 60:3, 11 57:14 **sky** 19:5 southern 73:15,17,19 11,16 62:8,13 63:1 73:19 74:7 80:23 81:3 subgroups 29:12 southwest 24:8.12 **slide** 26:6,7 28:17 83:9,18 85:10 95:19 25:11,15 subject 11:12,17 22:6 29:24 32:19 33:12,19 96:20 99:4 34:23 35:5 36:11,15 **sow** 10:17 sublevel 52:22 state's 7:9.21 13:4 77:5 40:16 42:6 43:16 44:16 101:10 speaking 27:7 49:19 subsequent 17:5 47:15,17,20 54:3 56:10 57:9 58:18,23,25 59:1, 82:25 84:6 88:6 statement 46:3,12 47:9 substantial 9:19,21 23 60:24 67:6 69:5,25 **specific** 10:2 28:8 30:6 70:14 74:17 75:18 **states** 52:10 63:1,17 substantiated 98:13 39:22,23 42:15 52:24 76:22 77:13 78:18 96:18,23,25 98:20,21, 57:24 60:23 66:3,8 **suburban** 73:2 78:14 79:14 80:4,21 81:11 22 67:14 78:12 80:19 82:3 83:25 84:10 85:20 successful 6:2 83:20 90:22 94:25 95:8 **statewide** 17:17 25:24 86:15 89:5.25 91:4.5 29:4,19,20 33:25 62:11 sudden 52:10 specifically 29:10 **slides** 26:17 35:1 39:9 57:17,25 58:10 80:14,

12-14-2023

Index: show..sudden

suffer 64:12 talk 9:25 19:24 22:3 things 5:1 8:19 9:4 tomorrow 7:18 27:5 61:25 87:20 13:6,8 17:14 20:13 suggestions 103:25 ton 82:4 24:21 25:7 28:3 32:9, talked 12:17 56:4 suggests 36:8 16,21 33:2 34:6,20 37:9 **top** 27:25 53:6,8 54:13, 75:15,16 42:22 53:4 71:20 79:3, 15,17,19 55:14,15,17, **summary** 25:19 talking 9:3,5 28:9 42:3 8,12 88:4 94:4,6 95:9 20 56:9 57:11,14 58:5 96:15 97:6 **sums** 30:2 49:12 56:2 72:23,24 59:25 60:14,15 62:2 88:5 67:4,5,10,11 71:17 **Sun** 78:5 thinks 84:2,4 73:23,24 74:16,20,21 tall 24:21 **thirds** 16:17 **Superior** 13:16,17 76:11 77:14 78:2,18,20 tangent 22:11 80:11 81:12 82:7,9 83:3 thought 24:8 49:7,14 **supplies** 76:19,21 84:15 87:2 88:13 96:3 78:11 targeted 10:2 surcharge 100:20 topic 61:10 99:7 thoughts 11:6 targeting 83:19 101:5,6 topics 26:19 27:2,11 surprise 78:4 80:3 82:8 Task 5:7 6:10 thousand 26:20 28:1 53:16 66:3 77:14 threshold 71:11 tax 64:22 **survey** 23:15,17,18,25 tossup 63:16 25:5 27:19,20 28:22 taxes 52:18 54:9 57:25 throat 85:22 total 37:22 38:1 47:1 29:6,18 32:7 36:21 46:2 66:1,14 68:20,21 72:1 throwing 52:9 65:19 80:24 95:12 96:5,12 99:8 75:1 76:12 79:1 80:19 tick 100:13 touching 6:23 **surveys** 28:20 32:3 teacher 64:24 76:20 52:20 53:20 94:21 77:17 79:1 80:18 tied 19:12 56:17 63:25 tough 51:22 61:18 96:15 87:3.4 tougher 51:2 team 8:3 26:23 30:11. suspect 48:9 12,15 38:20,21,22 40:5 tier 52:22 54:21 85:3,8, town 7:9 suspicion 48:12 56:22,23 66:21,22 12 94:15 track 32:5 Tiktockers 85:4 swapped 81:22 teams 30:20 tracked 34:20 swapping 79:2 time 12:24 15:3 16:16 tease 99:9 tracker 33:25 17:10 18:8 20:12 22:3, sweet 27:12 19 23:3 25:5 34:20 technology 76:19,21 tracking 24:9 46:2 52:2 **switch** 26:17 39:11 46:1,2 51:3,24 telephone 88:4,6 61:14 72:18 73:15 75:8 trademark 8:15 switched 30:20 76:12,21 77:15,16,17, television 84:2,18,21, training 15:24 16:1 21 78:19,20,22,23,25 swung 46:24 23,24 85:1,2 87:2,6,14 79:1 80:11,13,17,18 trajectory 32:2 **Sydney** 48:3 88:20 89:7 81:12,13,20,21,22 transition 12:25 89:20 92:11 100:5 system 13:4 15:8 50:25 **Tempe** 21:21 103:24 104:8,19 transitioned 6:1 temperament 44:19, systemic 50:13 times 26:16 29:7 63:8 22 45:1,8,18 transparent 5:19 64:9 tenth 39:5 Т trash 87:21 titling 35:8 terms 10:7 17:23 treatment 57:24 66:3, tabletop 7:19 **Tivo** 84:12 100:11,14 11 tabulation 72:20 today 24:3,15 26:5,19 Texas 96:23 98:24 trend 22:15 34:2,18,21 tackle 43:8 27:11 29:20 68:3 94:25 89:12 100:20 themself 81:16 tailor 95:13 told 13:23 trending 34:7 thing 6:2 12:13 13:11 takeaways 48:21 67:7 **Tom** 4:20 10:13 11:3 15:23 17:3 22:22 24:17, troubling 22:15 71:16 82:24 89:6 90:6, 23:6,14 25:4 18 25:6 37:8 51:21,23 true 12:4 65:15.18 10 62:13 68:3 70:8 77:5 **Tommy** 67:19 89:12 93:14 94:2 87:15,16 88:15 93:8 taking 11:21 48:5

12-14-2023

Index: suffer..true

12-14-2023 Index: Tucson..written

Tucson 71:12 79:15 tune 89:19 turning 16:8 31:7 turnout 35:21 36:1.3.7 55:7 TV 11:22 40:22 84:4 89:10,17 90:21 91:1 twin 90:3 Twitter 85:4 type 27:21 36:4 37:24 99:3 typically 9:19 81:1 U **U.S.** 62:18 63:9,24,25 72:20 ultimate 87:7 ultimately 23:22 31:20 uncovered 28:11 underlying 28:10 understand 10:1 51:20 understanding 10:17 underwater 32:15 unemployment 80:19 unequivocally 71:22 97:14 unforeseen 4:24 unique 25:11 26:3 53:20 universe 65:17

unique 25:11 26:3 53:20 universe 65:17 University 7:9 unquote 66:22 unsure 40:14 upcoming 23:3 34:24 35:12 update 65:1 updated 61:7 upper 64:13 upswing 34:12
uptick 43:24 47:2
upwards 34:7
urban 73:2,3 97:18,23
Utah 96:24 98:25
utilities 64:25

V
Valley 6:17 73:5,12
76:1,25 78:3,5,12,15
values 68:14
variation 57:12
varies 67:11

variation 57:12
varies 67:11
vary 36:3 66:23 85:25
varying 67:2
vehicle 61:12 66:12
vehicles 64:21
verbiage 35:6,10
verify 4:14
versus 20:10 70:22
VI 102:20
video 7:5 8:5,7
view 18:15
viewed 47:12
viewing 32:11,12 47:3
views 43:8 45:23

VII 99:24 101:23,25 102:9 103:24 VIII 104:18 virtue 11:11 visualization 72:24 visually 26:25 voice 27:12 69:10 volunteer 88:7

vote 4:17 8:14,16 34:24 35:12,14,15,17 36:6,13, 19 37:13,22 38:1 39:22 48:23 56:16 64:6 90:12

voted 49:16 voter 7:7 8:3 23:15,17 24:3,13 28:14 39:8,19 69:13 85:9 voter's 40:18

voters 16:17 19:2 23:17,19,24 27:4,6,24 28:2 29:2 30:1,3 32:17 35:13 37:17 41:1,4 44:5,18 45:8,9 46:3 48:24 51:12,20 53:19 54:16 55:1,2,10,15,16, 25 56:1 57:10,11,15,16 58:4,14,25 60:11,18 66:9,19,20 67:9 72:2,4, 12 74:4 76:15 81:18 82:6,18,24 83:3,8 84:16,17,23 85:11 86:18,21,23 87:15,22 90:16 92:2

voters' 43:18 75:5 101:3

votes 63:21 102:16 103:22 105:7

voting 8:5 30:24 37:8 40:5 46:5,7 55:11 57:23 58:8,9 65:17 66:7 95:1, 2,6

W

Wade 51:25 52:8

wage 80:20 wages 71:4 wait 42:19 79:5 wanted 4:22,25 6:22 7:2,4,24 8:17 13:12 26:1 27:23 29:4 52:15 58:9,12 71:24 74:25 100:21,24 101:16 wash 20:13

Washington 64:14
waste 54:23 61:23,24
81:8
watch 84:4
watched 40:22

watching 27:9 84:8 87:4,5

water 68:10,19,20 69:3, 6,15,17,21,23 71:25 72:2

ways 16:23 21:7 32:13 46:9 86:17,21 87:24 88:10

website 6:8,10 24:1
websites 85:10
week 28:21
weeks 90:2
west 73:12 78:1,3,5,

west 73:12 78:1,3,5,12, 15 97:2

whack-a-mole 22:22 white 45:10 63:20,22 97:10

wing 50:22 Wisconsin 97:3

wife 96:9

word 11:23 23:1 85:13 89:15 94:17

words 27:7 68:8,13,23 69:7,10 70:1,16 71:1

work 6:9,25 7:21 17:12, 25 18:7 19:25 25:12 40:20 43:21,23 54:14 89:17 91:1 92:11 98:20

working 8:3 10:10 17:3 24:10 41:25 44:3 97:9

workshops 14:7 world 63:10 worries 36:25

works 37:11

worse 20:18 32:23 33:1 34:5

worth 18:8 wrap 43:16 wrapped 72:14 write 27:19 71:17 written 4:1 Citizens Clean Elections Commision 12-14-2023 Transcript of Proceedings / Public Meeting Index: wrong..zoom wrong 20:19 32:6,10, 16 96:17 Υ **year** 4:25 5:2,4 6:23 7:6 8:23 9:4 13:24 14:12 22:18 25:14 33:20 34:5 35:19,21 36:2,3 37:10 47:5 50:9 55:8 63:1 87:8 96:8 99:21,22 100:6,12,21,24 **years** 15:14 25:7,13 31:22 33:21 34:1,7 44:1 63:18 69:14 79:10 96:2, 8,9 97:2 yellow 54:25 55:1 74:4 yesterday 13:12,16 younger 22:10 69:19 Youtube 85:15 89:21 **Yuma** 69:19 Ζ zingers 44:9 **zip** 68:1 72:20 **zippy** 49:11 **zoom** 84:13 104:11,14